

1 COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
2 BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION OF KENTUCKY
3
4

RECEIVED

APR 24 2015

PUBLIC SERVICE
COMMISSION

5 In the Matter of:

6
7 A REVIEW OF THE ADEQUACY OF)
8 KENTUCKY'S GENERATION CAPACITY) ADMINISTRATIVE
9 AND TRANSMISSION SYSTEM) CASE NO. 387
10

11
12 **PETITION OF BIG RIVERS ELECTRIC CORPORATION FOR CONFIDENTIAL**
13 **PROTECTION**
14

15 1. Big Rivers Electric Corporation ("Big Rivers") hereby petitions the Kentucky
16 Public Service Commission ("Commission"), pursuant to 807 KAR 5:001 Section 13 and KRS
17 61.878, to grant confidential protection to portions of its response to Item 11 and to the
18 attachment to its response to Item 14 of the supplemental information to Big Rivers' annual
19 Financial and Statistical Report required by the Commission's orders in Administrative Case
20 387. The information contained in the response to Item 11 that Big Rivers seeks to protect as
21 confidential is a list of scheduled outages from 2015 through 2019 and related information. The
22 attachment to Item 14 contains a list of planned transmission system additions from 2015-2024.
23 The information Big Rivers seeks to protect as confidential is hereinafter referred to as the
24 "Confidential Information."

25 2. One (1) sealed copy of the response to Item 11 with the Confidential Information
26 highlighted with transparent ink is filed with this petition. Ten (10) copies of the response to
27 Item 11 with the Confidential Information redacted are also filed with this petition.

28 3. The entirety of the attachment to the response to Item 14 is confidential. One (1)
29 sealed copy of that attachment is filed with this petition. A page noting that the attachment is

1 filed under a petition for confidential treatment is attached to the response to Item 14 filed with
2 this petition. 807 KAR 5:001 Sections 13(2)(a)(3) and 13(2)(b).

3 4. There are no other parties who are entitled to be served with a copy of the petition
4 or a copy of the redacted response.

5 5. The Confidential Information is not publicly available, is not disseminated within
6 Big Rivers except to those employees and professionals with a legitimate business need to know
7 and act upon the information, and is not disseminated to others without a legitimate need to
8 know and act upon the information.

9 6. If and to the extent the Confidential Information becomes generally available to
10 the public, whether through filings required by other agencies or otherwise, Big Rivers will
11 notify the Commission and have the information's confidential status removed. 807 KAR 5:001
12 Section 13(10)(b).

13 7. As discussed below, the Confidential Information is entitled to confidential
14 protection based upon KRS 61.878(1)(c)(1), which protects "records confidentially disclosed to
15 an agency or required by an agency to be disclosed to it, generally recognized as confidential or
16 proprietary, which if openly disclosed would permit an unfair commercial advantage to
17 competitors of the entity that disclosed the records." KRS 61.878(1)(c)(1); 807 KAR 5:001
18 Section 13(2)(a)(1).

19 **I. Big Rivers Faces Actual Competition.**

20 8. Big Rivers, as a participant in the credit markets and the wholesale power
21 markets, faces economic competition from other entities.

22 9. Big Rivers competes in the wholesale power market to sell energy it produces in
23 excess of its members' needs. Big Rivers' ability to successfully compete in the wholesale

1 power market is dependent upon a combination of its ability to negotiate the maximum price for
2 the power sold and its ability to keep its cost of production as low as possible. If Big Rivers'
3 cost of producing a kilowatt-hour of energy increases, its ability to sell that kilowatt-hour in
4 competition with other utilities is adversely affected.

5 10. Big Rivers also competes for reasonably priced credit in the credit markets, and
6 its ability to compete is directly impacted by its financial results. Any event that adversely
7 affects Big Rivers' margins will adversely affect its financial results and potentially impact the
8 price it pays for credit. As was described in the proceeding before this Commission in the Big
9 Rivers Unwind Transaction, Big Rivers expects to be in the credit markets on a regular basis in
10 the future.¹

11 11. As is evidenced by these economic pressures, Big Rivers has "competitors" as is
12 contemplated under the statute and faces actual competition from other market participants.

13 **II. The Confidential Information is Generally Recognized as Confidential or**
14 **Proprietary.**
15

16 12. The Confidential Information for which Big Rivers seeks confidential treatment
17 under KRS 61.878(1)(c)(1) is generally recognized as confidential or proprietary under Kentucky
18 law. The Confidential Information contains a list of scheduled outages from 2013 through 2017
19 and related information.

20 13. Public disclosure of the Confidential Information will allow Big Rivers' suppliers
21 and competitors to know Big Rivers' future maintenance plans and will give them insight into
22 Big Rivers' wholesale power needs. Information about a company's detailed inner workings is
23 generally recognized as confidential or proprietary. *See, e.g., Hoy v. Kentucky Indus.*

¹ See Order dated March 6, 2009, in *In the Matter of: Joint Application of Big Rivers, E.ON, LG&E Energy Marketing, Inc., and Western Kentucky Energy Corporation for Approval to Unwind Lease and Power Purchase Transactions*, PSC Case No. 2007-00455, pages 27-30 and 37-39.

1 *Revitalization Authority*, 907 S.W.2d 766, 768 (Ky. 1995) (“It does not take a degree in finance
2 to recognize that such information concerning the inner workings of a corporation is ‘generally
3 recognized as confidential or proprietary’”); *Marina Management Servs. v. Cabinet for Tourism,*
4 *Dep’t of Parks*, 906 S.W.2d 318, 319 (Ky. 1995) (unfair commercial advantage arises simply
5 from “the ability to ascertain the economic status of the entities without the hurdles systemically
6 associated with the acquisition of such information about privately owned organizations”).
7 Moreover, the Commission previously granted confidential treatment to this type of information.
8 *See, e.g.*, letter from the Commission dated July 20, 2010, in Administrative Case No. 387
9 (granting confidential treatment to a list of future scheduled outages that Big Rivers filed as part
10 of the supplement to its annual report); order dated April 25, 2013, in Case No. 2012-00535²
11 (granting confidential treatment to a list of future construction projects).

12 14. Accordingly, the information for which Big Rivers seeks confidential treatment is
13 recognized as confidential or proprietary under Kentucky law and is entitled to confidential
14 protection as further discussed below.

15 **III. Disclosure of the Confidential Information Would Permit an Unfair Commercial**
16 **Advantage to Big Rivers’ Competitors.**
17

18 15. Disclosure of the Confidential Information would permit an unfair commercial
19 advantage to Big Rivers’ competitors. As discussed above, Big Rivers faces actual competition
20 in the wholesale power market and in the credit market. It is likely that Big Rivers would suffer
21 competitive injury if that Confidential Information was publicly disclosed, and the information
22 should therefore be subject to confidential treatment.

23 16. If the Confidential Information is publicly disclosed, Big Rivers’ competitors
24 would have insight into when Big Rivers’ generation levels will drop due to maintenance and

² *In the Matter of: Application of Big Rivers Electric Corporation for a General Adjustment in Rates.*

1 construction and thus know a crucial input into Big Rivers' generating costs and need for power
2 and energy during those periods. With that information, potential suppliers to Big Rivers will be
3 able to manipulate the price of power bid to Big Rivers in order to maximize their revenues,
4 thereby driving up Big Rivers' costs and impairing Big Rivers' ability to compete in the
5 wholesale power and credit markets. Additionally, Big Rivers' competitors in the wholesale
6 power market could use the information to potentially underbid Big Rivers to Big Rivers'
7 competitive disadvantage in competing for wholesale sales.

8 **IV. Time Period**

9 1. Big Rivers requests that the Confidential Information remain confidential until
10 January 1, 2020, at which time the scheduled outages will have passed and will no longer be
11 confidential, and the list of projected transmission projects will be sufficiently outdated so that it
12 could not be used to competitively disadvantage Big Rivers. 807 KAR 5:001 Section
13 13(2)(a)(2).

14 **V. Conclusion**

15 2. Based on the foregoing, the Confidential Information is entitled to confidential
16 protection. If the Commission disagrees that Big Rivers is entitled to confidential protection, due
17 process requires the Commission to hold an evidentiary hearing. *Utility Regulatory Comm'n v.*
18 *Kentucky Water Serv. Co., Inc.*, 642 S.W.2d 591 (Ky. App. 1982).

19 WHEREFORE, Big Rivers respectfully requests that the Commission classify and protect
20 as confidential the Confidential Information.

21

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

On this the 23rd day of April, 2015.

Respectfully submitted,



James M. Miller
Tyson Kamuf
SULLIVAN, MOUNTJOY, STAINBACK
& MILLER, P.S.C.
100 St. Ann Street
P. O. Box 727
Owensboro, Kentucky 42302-0727
Phone: (270) 926-4000
Facsimile: (270) 683-6694
jmiller@smsmlaw.com
tkamuf@smsmlaw.com

Counsel for Big Rivers Electric Corporation