# COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

## BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

In the Matter of:

ELECTRONIC JOINT APPLICATION OF KENTUCKY UTILITIES COMPANY AND LOUISVILLE GAS AND ELECTRIC COMPANY FOR CERTIFICATES OF PUBLIC CONVENIENCE AND NECESSITY AND SITE COMPATIBILITY CERTIFICATES AND APPROVAL OF A DEMAND SIDE MANAGEMENT PLAN AND APPROVAL OF FOSSIL FUEL-FIRED GENERATING UNIT RETIREMENTS

CASE NO. 2022-00402

## <u>ORDER</u>

On November 28, 2023, Metropolitan Housing Coalition, Kentuckians for the Commonwealth, Kentucky Solar Energy Society, and Mountain Association (collectively, Joint Intervenors) filed a corrected petition,<sup>1</sup> pursuant to KRS 278.400, requesting rehearing of the Order entered November 6, 2023, approving, among other things, Kentucky Utilities Company and Louisville Gas and Electric Company's (jointly, LG&E/KU) joint request to expand the eligibility requirement for a home weatherization demand side management-energy efficiency (DMS-EE) program known as Income Qualified Solutions, formerly known as WeCare. On December 1, 2023, LG&E/KU filed a response to Joint Intervenors' petition.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Joint Intervenors filed the initial petition on November 27, 2023. Pursuant to 807 KAR 5:001, Section 4(5), a filing that corrects a previous filing amends the original filing and the amendment does not relate back to the original date unless the Commission orders otherwise.

## LEGAL STANDARD

KRS 278.400, which establishes the standard of review for motions for rehearing, limits rehearing to new evidence not readily discoverable at the time of the original hearings, to correct any material errors or omissions, or to correct findings that are unreasonable or unlawful. A Commission Order is deemed unreasonable only when "the evidence presented leaves no room for difference of opinion among reasonable minds."<sup>2</sup> An order can only be unlawful if it violates a state or federal statute or constitutional provision.<sup>3</sup>

By limiting rehearing to correct material errors or omissions, and findings that are unreasonable or unlawful, or to weigh new evidence not readily discoverable at the time of the original hearings, KRS 278.400 is intended to provide closure to Commission proceedings. Rehearing does not present parties with the opportunity to relitigate a matter fully addressed in the original Order.

The program at issue is a low-income weatherization program offered as part of LG&E/KU's DSM-EE plan and is subject to KRS 278.285. The Commission considers the following factors set forth in KRS 278.285(1) in approving DSM-EE plans:

(a) The specific changes in customers' consumption patterns which a utility is attempting to influence;

(b) The cost and benefit analysis and other justification for specific demandside management programs and measures included in a utility's proposed plan;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Energy Regulatory Comm'n v. Kentucky Power Co., 605 S.W.2d 46 (Ky. App. 1980).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Public Service Comm'n v. Conway, 324 S.W.3d 373, 377 (Ky. 2010); Public Service Comm'n v. Jackson County Rural Elec. Coop. Corp., 50 S.W.3d 764, 766 (Ky. App. 2000); National Southwire Aluminum Co. v. Big Rivers Elec. Corp., 785 S.W.2d 503, 509 (Ky. App. 1990).

(c) A utility's proposal to recover in rates the full costs of demand-side management programs, any net revenues lost due to reduced sales resulting from demand-side management programs, and incentives designed to provide positive financial rewards to a utility to encourage implementation of cost-effective demand-side management programs;

(d) Whether a utility's proposed demand-side management programs are consistent with its most recent long-range integrated resource plan;

(e) Whether the plan results in any unreasonable prejudice or disadvantage to any class of customers;

(f) The extent to which customer representatives and the Office of the Attorney General have been involved in developing the plan, including program design, cost recovery mechanisms, and financial incentives, and if involved, the amount of support for the plan by each participant, provided however, that unanimity among the participants developing the plan shall not be required for the commission to approve the plan;

(g) The extent to which the plan provides programs which are available, affordable, and useful to all customers; and

(h) Next-generation residential utility meters that can provide residents with amount of current utility usage, its cost, and can be capable of being read by the utility either remotely or from the exterior of the home.

#### PETITION AND RESPONSE

LG&E/KU proposed to increase the eligibility threshold for the Income Qualified Solutions home weatherization program from 200 percent of the federal poverty level to

Case No. 2022-00402

-3-

300 percent of the federal poverty level. In the November 6, 2023 Order, the Commission approved LG&E/KU's DSM-EE plan as proposed.

In their request for rehearing, Joint Intervenors asserted that the Commission's decision to approve the increase in the eligibility threshold was unreasonable and failed to consider Joint Intervenors' claim that LG&E/KU's proposal to increase the eligibility threshold was unsupported by data and would result in fewer funds available for lower-income customers who, according to Joint Intervenors, have the greatest need for energy-savings programs. Joint Intervenors argued that evidence demonstrates there is more demand for the program than available funds for customers at or below 200 percent of the federal poverty level and the LG&E/KU did not provide evidence to rebut Joint Intervenors' concern that customers earning between 201 percent and 300 percent of the federal poverty level would adversely impact the availability of the program for customers who earn 200 percent or less of the federal poverty level.

Joint Intervenors argued that the November 6, 2023 Order did not make specific findings of fact regarding the increase in the eligibility threshold. Joint Intervenors noted that LG&E/KU did not refute Joint Intervenors' arguments against increasing the threshold and that LG&E/KU stated in briefing that LG&E/KU did not object to retaining the 200 percent eligibility threshold. Joint Intervenors argued that the eligibility expansion for Income Qualified Solutions was not supported by customer representatives, the Attorney General, or data.

Joint Intervenors requested that the Commission either restore the 200 percent eligibility threshold or find that program funds should be made available to customers in

-4-

the 200-300 percent Federal Poverty Level threshold only if funds remain after all customers with incomes at or below 200 percent have received assistance.

In their joint response, LG&E/KU argued that the November 6, 2023 Order adequately addressed the increase in the eligibility threshold for the Income Qualified Solutions program, and that LG&E/KU would not object to keeping the eligibility threshold at 200 percent. LG&E/KU emphasized that their goal in expanding the eligibility was to make the program available to more customers, and thus grow the number of participants, and to increase the budget per home.

#### **DISCUSSION AND FINDINGS**

The Commission notes that, in the November 6, 2023 Order, the Commission made a finding of fact that LG&E/KU's proposed DSM-EE plan in the aggregate satisfied the legal standard established KRS 278.285(1) and should be granted. The Commission further notes that the only evidence of record regarding the proposed increase in the program's eligibility threshold was provided by LG&E/KU and Joint Intervenors.<sup>4</sup>

To the degree that the November 6, 2023 Order did not make a specific finding of fact regarding the proposed eligibility increase and based upon the petition, response, November 6, 2023 Order, and case record, and being otherwise sufficiently advised, the Commission finds that rehearing should be granted. Furthermore, LG&E/KU does not object to retaining the current income eligibility threshold for the Income Qualified Solutions program. Additionally, retaining the Income Qualified Solutions eligibility threshold at 200 percent of the federal poverty level will not reduce or impact the DSM-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> The evidentiary record in this matter closed on September 15, 2023. The Attorney General did not file witness testimony in this matter. The Attorney General set forth its position on the proposed eligibility increase in briefing filed on September 22, 2023, after the evidentiary record was closed.

EE budget or DSM-EE rates proposed by LG&E/KU and approved by the Commission in the November 6, 2023 Order. For these reasons, the Commission further finds that the income eligibility threshold for LG&E/KU's Income Qualified Solutions program, formerly known as WeCare, should remain at 200 percent or less of the federal poverty level.

The Commission directs LG&E/KU to closely monitor the Income Qualified Solutions program and propose amendments as necessary, including whether to expand this DSM-EE program to more low-income customers.

IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that:

1. Joint Intervenors' petition for rehearing is granted.

2. The income eligibility threshold for LG&E/KU's Income Qualified Solutions program, formerly known as WeCare, shall be 200 percent or less of the federal poverty level.

The remainder of the November 6, 2023 Order, as amended by a November
14, 2023 Order, not in conflict with this Order remain in effect.

4. This case is closed and removed from the Commission's docket.

-6-

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

Chairman

Vice Chairman

Commissioner



ATTEST:

Michael !

Executive Director

Case No. 2022-00402

\*Angela M Goad Assistant Attorney General Office of the Attorney General Office of Rate 700 Capitol Avenue Suite 20 Frankfort, KENTUCKY 40601-8204

\*Ashley Wilmes Kentucky Resources Council, Inc. Post Office Box 1070 Frankfort, KENTUCKY 40602

\*Honorable Allyson K Sturgeon Managing Senior Counsel - Regulatory & LG&E and KU Energy LLC 220 West Main Street Louisville, KENTUCKY 40202

\*William H May, III Hurt, Deckard & May The Equus Building 127 West Main Street Lexington, KENTUCKY 40507

\*Byron Gary Kentucky Resources Council, Inc. Post Office Box 1070 Frankfort, KENTUCKY 40602

\*Carrie H Grundmann Spilman Thomas & Battle, PLLC 110 Oakwood Drive, Suite 500 Winston-Salem, NORTH CAROLINA 27103

\*Cassandra McCrae Earthjustice 1617 JFK Boulevard, Suite 1675 Philadelphia, PENNSYLVANIA 19103 \*Honorable David J. Barberie Managing Attorney Lexington-Fayette Urban County Government Department Of Law 200 East Main Street Lexington, KENTUCKY 40507

\*Dennis G Howard II Howard Law PLLC 740 Emmett Creek Lane Lexington, KENTUCKY 40515

\*Tom Fitzgerald Kentucky Resources Council, Inc. Post Office Box 1070 Frankfort, KENTUCKY 40602

\*Glibert Zelaya Earthjustice 156 William Street, Suite 800 New York, NEW YORK 10038

\*James W Gardner Sturgill, Turner, Barker & Moloney, PLLC 333 West Vine Street Suite 1400 Lexington, KENTUCKY 40507

\*Jody Kyler Cohn Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry 36 East Seventh Street Suite 1510 Cincinnati, OHIO 45202

\*Jody M Kyler Cohn Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry 36 East Seventh Street Suite 1510 Cincinnati, OHIO 45202 \*Joe F. Childers Childers & Baxter PLLC 300 Lexington Building, 201 West Sho Lexington, KENTUCKY 40507

\*John G Horne, II Office of the Attorney General Office of Rate 700 Capitol Avenue Suite 20 Frankfort, KENTUCKY 40601-8204

\*Joshua Smith Sierra Club 2101 Webster St. , Suite 1300 Oakland, CALIFORNIA 94612

\*Kate Huddleston Sierra Club Environmental Law Program 2101 Webster Street Suite 1300 Oakland, CALIFORNIA 94612

\*Honorable Kurt J Boehm Attorney at Law Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry 36 East Seventh Street Suite 1510 Cincinnati, OHIO 45202

\*Honorable Kendrick R Riggs Attorney at Law Stoll Keenon Ogden, PLLC 2000 PNC Plaza 500 W Jefferson Street Louisville, KENTUCKY 40202-2828

\*Larry Cook Assistant Attorney General Office of the Attorney General Office of Rate 700 Capitol Avenue Suite 20 Frankfort, KENTUCKY 40601-8204 \*J. Michael West Office of the Attorney General Office of Rate 700 Capitol Avenue Suite 20 Frankfort, KENTUCKY 40601-8204

\*Honorable Michael L Kurtz Attorney at Law Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry 36 East Seventh Street Suite 1510 Cincinnati, OHIO 45202

\*Honorable Matthew R Malone Attorney at Law Hurt, Deckard & May The Equus Building 127 West Main Street Lexington, KENTUCKY 40507

\*Megan W. Mullins Spilman Thomas & Battle, PLLC 300 Kanawha Blvd, East Charleston, WEST VIRGINIA 25301

\*Quang Nguyen Assistant County Attorney Louisville/Jefferson County Metro Government First Trust Centre 200 South 5th Street, Suite 300N Louisville, KENTUCKY 40202

\*Rick LoveKamp Kentucky Utilities Company 220 W. Main Street P. O. Box 32010 Louisville, KY 40202

\*Robert Conroy Vice President, State Regulation and Rates LG&E and KU Energy LLC 220 West Main Street Louisville, KENTUCKY 40202 \*Rebecca C. Price Sturgill, Turner, Barker & Moloney 155 East Main Street Lexington, KENTUCKY 40507 \*M. Todd Osterloh Sturgill, Turner, Barker & Moloney, PLLC 333 West Vine Street Suite 1400 Lexington, KENTUCKY 40507

\*Steven W Lee Spilman Thomas & Battle, PLLC 1100 Brent Creek Blvd., Suite 101 Mechanicsburg, PENNSYLVANIA 17050

\*Susan Speckert Lexington-Fayette Urban County Government Department Of Law 200 East Main Street Lexington, KENTUCKY 40507

\*Kentucky Utilities Company 220 W. Main Street P. O. Box 32010 Louisville, KY 40232-2010

\*Louisville Gas and Electric Company 220 W. Main Street P. O. Box 32010 Louisville, KY 40232-2010

\*Sara Judd Senior Corporate Attorney LG&E and KU Energy LLC 220 West Main Street Louisville, KENTUCKY 40202

\*Thomas Cmar Earthjustice 6608 Wooster Pike Cincinnati, OHIO 45227