Steven L. Beshear Governor

Leonard K. Peters Secretary Energy and Environment Cabinet



Commonwealth of Kentucky
Public Service Commission
211 Sower Blvd.
P.O. Box 615

Frankfort, Kentucky 40602-0615 Telephone: (502) 564-3940 Fax: (502) 564-3460 psc.ky.gov

June 6, 2014

David L. Armstrong Chairman

James W. Gardner Vice Chairman

> Linda Breathitt Commissioner

Mr. Michael Early Corporate Energy Director Century Aluminum Company One South Wacker Drive Suite 1000 Chicago, Illinois 60606-4616

Dear Mr. Early:

Enclosed is a copy of the Commission's Order on the joint rehearing request of Kentucky Industrial Utility Customers, the Attorney General and Ben Taylor and Sierra Club ("Joint Parties"). The Order is responsive to their request for clarification on the use of the RER and ER funds and participation in the planned focused management audit ("focused audit"). The Order also addresses the request of Century Aluminum Company ("Century") to participate in the focused audit as set forth in your letter of May 28, 2014.

Please note the discussion regarding participation of the Joint Parties beginning on page 3 of the enclosed Order and participation of Century beginning on page 5 of the enclosed Order. Although the Commission has not approved the requests of the Joint Parties and Century to participate in the focused audit as if they were the utility being audited, the Commission has granted them the right to participate in the focused audit to ensure that their respective views and positions are known. The Commission, therefore, will direct the selected consultant to interview representatives of the Joint Parties and Century. As the Order states, the Joint Parties and Century may also submit comments and documents to the selected consultant at any time. Also, the Commission will make available to the selected consultant the record of relevant proceedings in which Century and the Joint Parties have expressed their concerns.

The Commission recognizes the concerns set forth by Century not only in your letter but also in prior formal proceedings before the Commission. It is our intention that all relevant concerns of the Joint Parties and Century be brought to the attention of the selected consultant for review and consideration.



Michael Early Century Aluminum Company June 6, 2014 Page 2 of 2

If I may be of further assistance, feel free to contact me at 502-564-3940.

1/1/1/80

Executive Director

Enclosure



COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

In the Matter of:

APPLICATION OF BIG RIVERS ELECTRIC)	
CORPORATION FOR A GENERAL	j	CASE NO.
ADJUSTMENT IN RATES SUPPORTED BY)	2013-00199
FULLY FORECASTED TEST PERIOD	j	

ORDER

By Order issued April 25, 2014 ("Rate Order"), the Commission granted Big Rivers Electric Corporation ("Big Rivers") a base rate increase to generate additional annual revenues of \$36,159,928. On May 19, 2014, Ben Taylor and Sierra Club ("Sierra Club"), Kentucky Industrial Utility Customers, Inc. ("KIUC"), and the Attorney General for the Commonwealth of Kentucky ("AG"), (collectively "Intervenors") filed a request for rehearing to: (1) clarify when Big Rivers would begin to use its Rural Economic Reserve ("RER") fund, and (2) request that the Intervenors be permitted to participate in the management audit process. On May 23, 2014, Big Rivers filed a response in opposition to the Intervenors' request for rehearing. With this Order, the Commission provides clarification on Big Rivers' use of the RER fund and authorizes a limited role for the Intervenors' in the management audit process. Descriptions of the issues raised by the Intervenors and our decisions thereon are discussed as follows.

INTERVENORS' REHEARING REQUESTS

RER Fund

The Rate Order approved Big Rivers' request to use its Economic Reserve ("ER") fund and RER fund to offset 100 percent of the rate increase awarded in this

proceeding. In addition, the Rate Order provided background information regarding the prior establishment of the ER and RER funds and explained that "[u]pon exhaustion of the ER, the MRSM will utilize the RER, a separate fund which was also created at the closing of the Unwind Transaction." The Rate Order also directed Big Rivers to deposit into the ER fund the transmission revenues it receives from Century Aluminum of Kentucky General Partnership's ("Century") Hawesville smelter. In seeking rehearing, the Intervenors state that the ER fund will not be exhausted as long as transmission revenues are deposited into it and, therefore, the Rate Order should be clarified to explain that the RER fund will be drawn upon once the ER funds are insufficient to offset 100 percent of the rate increase awarded in this matter.

In its response to the Intervenors' request, Big Rivers states that its RER Rider tariff specifies that the RER Rider will be effective in the month in which the ER funds are no longer sufficient to fully fund the credit provided under its Member Rate Stability Mechanism ("MRSM") tariff. Big Rivers states that it does not believe the Commission intended its statement that the MRSM would utilize the RER funds "[u]pon exhaustion of the ER" to require a change in the MRSM and RER Rider tariffs already on file with the Commission. Big Rivers argues that its tariff already provides the relief requested by the Intervenors and that rehearing on this issue should be denied.

Based on a review of the record, the Commission finds that Big Rivers' tariff already provides that the RER Rider will become effective in the month in which the ER fund is insufficient to fully fund the MRSM. Our discussion in the Rate Order of when the RER fund will be drawn upon was not intended to modify the language of the tariff

on this issue. We now clarify that there was no intent to change those tariff provisions and, thus, we grant the Intervenors' request to the extent of this clarification.

Management Audit Process

In the Rate Order, the Commission decided to conduct a focused management audit of Big Rivers' efforts to mitigate the impact of losing more than 800 megawatts of load due to the departure from its system of the two aluminum smelters owned by Century. In their rehearing request, the Intervenors request that they be allowed to participate in the management audit in the same manner that 807 KAR 5:013, Section 4, permits for the utility being audited. Pursuant to this regulation, the utility may comment on: (1) the draft request for proposals ("RFP"); (2) the proposals received in response to the RFP; (3) the consultant's preliminary draft report; and (4) the final draft report. Citing the deviation provision in Section 6 of the regulation, the Intervenors request that the Commission deviate from the strictures of Section 4 and allow them to comment on the same documents upon which the utility is permitted to comment.

In its response to the Intervenors' request, Big Rivers asserts that granting that request would transform the audit into an adversarial process and allow the Intervenors to re-litigate issues regarding its mitigation plan. Big Rivers claims that permitting the Intervenors to comment at various stages of the audit process would unduly disrupt and complicate the audit, increase the audit's length and cost, and distract Big Rivers from pursuing its mitigation plan. Giving the Intervenors the relief they seek, according to Big Rivers, would cause the consultant performing the audit to take on the role of an adjudicator, as the consultant would be required to consider the comments of the

parties, Big Rivers and the Intervenors, who had opposed each other in this rate proceeding.

Based on a review of the record, the Commission finds that the Intervenors and other interested persons should be afforded an opportunity to participate in the management audit process. The Rate Order stated that an independent consultant, who will be chosen to perform a focused audit of Big Rivers' efforts to mitigate the impact of losing the smelter loads, will review the strategic planning, management, and decision-making of Big Rivers regarding its mitigation efforts. The views and positions of the intervenors on the mitigation efforts will be important contributions to be considered by the consultant in preparing the audit report. Consequently, we will ensure that the consultant selected to perform the audit conducts interviews of the Intervenors and other interested parties, including but not limited to, the two smelter customers who are no longer buying power from Big Rivers' generating units. The consultant will also be directed to be familiar with the relevant issues in this proceeding, as well as those in prior Big Rivers' proceedings, wherein the views of the Intervenors and other interested parties on Big Rivers' mitigation plan have been expressed.

The Commission further finds that a management audit must not be an adversarial proceeding. Granting the Intervenors' request to participate and file comments as the regulation allows the utility to do would create an unreasonable risk of the audit's becoming adversarial in nature. This could unduly complicate and disrupt the audit and also increase its length and cost. Accordingly, we will allow the Intervenors and other interested parties to participate by being interviewed and by submitting to the auditor written comments and documents as often as they choose.

We will deny the Intervenors' request for a deviation from the provisions of 807 KAR 5:013, Section 4, to allow them to participate in the audit process as the utility is permitted pursuant to that section on the regulation.

OTHER ISSUES

Big Rivers' Participation

The Commission considers the forthcoming audits, with its genesis being this contested proceeding, to be atypical in some respects, including the Commission's independence in choosing a consultant for the audit. To guard against any claims of bias or preference, the Commission on its own motion finds that it should deviate from 807 KAR 5:013, Section 4, with respect to affording Big Rivers an opportunity to comment on the proposals received in response to our RFP. In selecting a consultant to perform the audit, only the Commission and Commission Staff will review the proposals received in response to the Commission's RFP. This will ensure that the Commission's selection of a consultant will be entirely independent, thereby eliminating any potential claim that the consultant selection process was unduly influenced by a party to this proceeding. This will be the only deviation from the management audit regulation, meaning that Big Rivers will have an opportunity to provide comments on the chosen consultant's initial work plan as provided by KRS 278.255(4), and on all other matters, at the prescribed intervals, as set out in that regulation.

Letter from Century

On May 29, 2014, Century submitted a letter to the Executive Director of the Commission stating that it "has a substantial interest in both past actions regarding the smelters leaving the system...as well as any actions Big Rivers may take going forward

that may impact Century as an energy or transmission customer and as a potential purchaser of the Coleman Generating Station." Due to this interest, Century requests to participate in the management audit by being allowed to comment on the draft RFP and the proposals received in response to the RFP, participate in interviews, and provide information to the consultant.¹

Century, which no longer takes power from Big Rivers' generation, is not a party to this proceeding and lacks standing to seek rehearing or clarification of the Rate Order. However, in recognition of the interest that it has expressed, we will ensure that it is afforded the same opportunity as other interested persons to be interviewed and submit written comments and documents to the auditor.

IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that:

- 1. The intervenors' request for rehearing is granted to the limited extent that the Rate Order is clarified to state that Big Rivers shall begin to draw upon the RER fund when the ER fund is insufficient to fully fund the MRSM.
- 2. The Intervenors and other interested persons, including but not limited to Century, shall be afforded an opportunity to participate in the management audit by being interviewed and submitting written comments and documents to the auditor. The Intervenors' request for rehearing for the granting of a deviation from 807 KAR 5:013, Section 4, to participate in the management audit as if they were the utility is denied.
- 3. The management audit required by our Rate Order shall deviate from 807 KAR 5:013, Section 4, to the limited extent that for this audit Big Rivers shall not be

¹ Century's request, which is similar to the Intervenors' request to participate in the management audit, was upon its receipt filed in the record of this proceeding as public comment.

permitted to review and comment on the proposals received in response to the Commission's RFP.

4. All other findings and provisions of the Commission's April 25, 2014 Order shall remain in full force and effect.

By the Commission

ENTERED

JUN 06 2014

KENTUCKY PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

ATTEST

Executive Director

Case No. 2013-00199

Mark A Bailey President CEO Big Rivers Electric Corporation 201 Third Street P. O. Box 24 Henderson, KY 42420 Honorable Michael L Kurtz Attorney at Law Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry 36 East Seventh Street Suite 1510 Cincinnati, OHIO 45202

Honorable Thomas C Brite Attorney At Law Brite & Hopkins, PLLC 83 Ballpark Road P.O. Box 309 Hardinsburg, KENTUCKY 40143

Burns E Mercer Manager Meade County R.E.C.C. P. O. Box 489 Brandenburg, KY 40108-0489

Thomas J Cmar 5042 North Leavitt Street, Suite 1 Chlcago, ILLINOIS 60625 Honorable James M Miller Attorney at Law Suilivan, Mountjoy, Stalnback & Miller, PSC 100 St. Ann Street P.O. Box 727 Owensboro, KENTUCKY 42302-0727

Shannon Fisk Earthjustice 1617 JFK Boulevard, Suite 1675 Philadelphia, PENNSYLVANIA 19103 Ruben Mojica Sierra Club Environmental Law Program 85 2nd Street, 2nd Fioor San Francisco, CALIFORNIA 94105

Jennifer Black Hans Assistant Attorney General Office of the Attorney General Utility & Rate 1024 Capital Center Drive Suite 200 Frankfort, KENTUCKY 40601-8204 G. Keily Nuckols President & Ceo Jackson Purchase Energy Corporation 2900 Irvin Cobb Drive P. O. Box 4030 Paducah, KY 42002-4030

Kristin Henry Staff Attorney Sierra Club 85 Second Street San Francisco, CALIFORNIA 94105 Billie J Richert
Vice President Accounting, Rates & CFO
Big Rivers Electric Corporation
201 Third Street
P. O. Box 24
Henderson, KY 42420

J. Christopher Hopgood Dorsey, King, Gray, Norment & Hopgood 318 Second Street Henderson, KENTUCKY 42420 Melissa D Yates Attorney Denton & Keuler, LLP 555 Jefferson Street P. O. Box 929 Paducah, KENTUCKY 42002-0929