### COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

### BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

In the Matter of:

NELDA C. BUSHART		)	
	COMPLAINANT	)	
V.		)	CASE NO. 2009-00070
AT&T, INC.		)	
	DEFENDANT	)	

#### ORDER

On June 16, 2009, the Commission issued an Order<sup>1</sup> ("June 16 Order") in this proceeding directing the complainants to supplement their formal complaints<sup>2</sup> by submitting written responses to the questions contained in the Appendix to that Order within 20 days of the date of that Order. The Commission also held that, if any person named in the June 16 Order failed to provide a response within the time frame provided,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Within that Order, the Commission also consolidated Case Nos. 2009-00085 and 2009-00086 with this proceeding, finding that the three cases "generally pertain to the same provider of the landline and cell service in question, AT&T, Inc., and pertain to interruptions in service in the far western counties of the state during and immediately after the occurrence of the 2009 Ice Storm . . . ." June 16 Order at 3. The complainants in all three cases were served with copies of the June 16 Order and were also served with a copy of the June 25, 2009 Order in this proceeding formally consolidating the service lists for the three cases into the service list for this proceeding only.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> As listed within the June 16 Order, eight separate complaints are consolidated within this proceeding.

that person's complaint would be dismissed without prejudice from the Commission's docket.

By the Commission's calculations, each of the complainants to this proceeding was obligated to respond to the June 16 Order no later than July 6, 2009. The Commission has reviewed the record for this proceeding and finds no evidence that any of the complainants submitted the supplemental information as directed in the June 16 Order. The only exception to that statement is the submission of Alan and Elizabeth Jones. The submission of Mr. and Mrs. Jones shall be addressed in a separate portion of this Order. The purpose of the June 16 Order and the supplemental questions in the Appendix was to allow the complainants to provide additional information to the Commission about the nature of the complaint and to supply sufficient specificity regarding their respective grievances against AT&T, Inc. so that the Commission could determine, pursuant to 807 KAR 5:001, Section 12(4)(a), whether each complaint establishes a prima facie case. Such specificity would have included provision of the account numbers associated with the telephone services alleged to have experienced service disruptions, as well as specifying whether the complainant maintained wireline services, wireless services, or both services with AT&T, Inc. The questions were listed by the Commission in the Appendix to the June 16 Order and are critically important in the Commission's investigation and resolution of each complaint. As no complainants except Mr. and Mrs. Jones have submitted the additional information ordered by the Commission, we find that each of the remaining complaints shall be dismissed without prejudice for failure to state a prima facie case.<sup>3</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> See 807 KAR 5:001, Section 12(4)(b).

#### **RESPONSE OF ALAN AND ELIZABETH JONES**

On August 13, 2009 ("August 13 submission"), complainants Alan W. and Elizabeth R. Jones filed their response to the Commission's June 16 Order. Their response is provided in Appendix A to this Order. The Jones' initial complaint, as filed on May 14, 2009, is provided in Appendix B to this Order. In their August 13 submission, the Joneses provide answers to each of the specific questions propounded by the Commission on June 16. Mr. and Mrs. Jones provide exact details regarding the dates upon which they experienced interruptions or loss of service and provide details about their prayer for relief. The Joneses also provide details about how their reliance on certain telecommunications services was impaired during the 2009 Ice Storm.

The Commission notes that the Jones' August 13 submission was filed over four weeks beyond the deadline set within the Commission's June 16 Order. As previously stated, the responses to that Order were due on July 6, 2009. The Commission's general procedure would require that the Jones' complaint be dismissed for failure to act timely in accordance with the Commission's instructions. However, the Commission is cognizant that the basis for the complaint is the 2009 Ice Storm, which had a tremendous impact on most Kentucky citizens, especially citizens within far western Kentucky. The Commission considers the loss of and interruptions to utility services to be crucial issues which must be addressed, particularly when those interruptions occur during times of natural disasters. Additionally, the Commission's June 16 Order and their response was thorough in explaining their experiences with telephone services during and after the 2009 Ice Storm. Although the Commission takes issue with the

-3-

timeliness of their response, the Commission shall act within its discretion and shall allow the Jones' complaint to move forward. The Commission strongly advises the Joneses to strictly comply with the timeline set forth for the submission of any documents that may be required within future Commission Orders in this proceeding.

Having reviewed the August 13 submission, the Commission finds that the Joneses have established a prima facie case which entitles them to have their complaint move forward and be heard. Therefore, by this Order, AT&T, Inc. shall have 10 days from the date of service of this Order to either satisfy or answer the Jones' complaint.

Since the other complainants to this proceeding are being dismissed, the Commission finds that the style of this proceeding shall be changed to reflect that Mr. and Mrs. Jones are the sole complainants against the defendant, AT&T, Inc. The style is also changed to reflect the proper jurisdictional utilities providing the services which are the subject of the Jones' Complaint. The change to the style will be outlined within in the ordering paragraphs for this Order.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that:

1. With the exception of the complaint filed by Alan W. and Elizabeth R. Jones, each of the complaints contained within this proceeding is dismissed without prejudice.

2. The complaint filed by Alan W. and Elizabeth R. Jones is accepted for filing and shall move forward for resolution by the Commission.

-4-

3. The style for Case No. 2009-00070 shall be changed to the following: In the Matter of:

ALAN W. AND ELIZABETH R. JONES	)
COMPLAINANTS	)
V.	)
BELLSOUTH TELECOMMUNICATIONS, INC. DBA AT & T KENTUCKY	) CASE NO. ) 2009-00070
AND	)
NEW CINGULAR WIRELESS PSC, LLC	)
DEFENDANTS	)

4. All pleadings and Orders filed after the date of this Order shall reflect the new style for this proceeding.

5. The Executive Director shall serve a copy of this Order upon AT&T, Inc.

6. AT&T, Inc. shall have 10 days from the date of service of this Order to

either satisfy or answer the Jones' complaint.

By the Commission

**ENTERED** М AUG 2 4 2009 KENTUCKY PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

ATTEST: Executive Director

Case No. 2009-00070

# APPENDIX A

# APPENDIX TO AN ORDER OF THE KENTUCKY PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION IN CASE NO. 2009-00070 DATED AUG 2 4 2009

AUG 1 3 2009 PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

Commonwealth of Kentucky Public Service Commission 211 Sower Blvd. P.O. Box 615 Frankfort, Kentucky 40602-0615 August 15, 2009

Dear Mr. Derouen,

,

In reference to case no. 2009-00070 and your request for additional notarized information from my household, please find the enclosed response. I thank you for your time and attention to this matter. With any further questions or information needed, please feel free to contact me at the numbers below.

Sincerely,

Awalast Hang

Elizabeth R. Jones 408 Third Street Fulton, KY 42041 (270) 472-1514 (home) (270) 309-0446 (cell)

#### APPENDIX Case No. 2009-00070

#### Alan and Elizabeth R. Jones, Complainant

- Alan W. and Elizabeth R. Jones 408 Third Street Fulton, Kentucky 42041
- 2. Landline and cellular phone service as well as DSL internet service and satellite television coverage (all of which are bundled into one fee package with our AT&T service)
- 3. The services listed above are used in a 50/50 mix of personal and business nature. None are exclusively home use.
- 4. AT&T, INC.
- 5. (270) 472-1514, (270) 309-0446, (270) 994-3369, (270) 627-3179, (270) 627-4070, (270) 627-4233
- 6. The period without usage of the above named services stretches from January 27, 2009 February 24, 2009 consecutively and also encompasses a 6 week period of time thereafter (thorough April 15, 2009) during which there was only sporadic provision of services as generators were being installed and lines being rebuilt after the ice storm.
- 7. We are requesting consideration of restitution for the entire 12 week period of time (January April 2009) that no reliable service was available in our area from the provider, AT&T, as well as a prorating or reduction of continuing monthly service rates due to said disruption/unreliable service.
- 8. My husband and I are both employed in the medical field and live/practice in a geographically remote area. It is IMPERATIVE that our ability to communicate remains unimpeded AT ALL TIMES. We both serve as first responders on a county-wide emergency disaster relief committee and were responsible for the care of the rural populations of both Fulton and Hickman counties during the January 2009 ice storm. We were not able to be reached via normal modes of communication during that time frame, significantly hindering our ability to provide needed medical assistance, due to problems with our AT&T service.
- 9. We are both residents and employed within the state of Kentucky at this time.

Aponda Wilson My Commission expires March 28, 2013.

### APPENDIX B

# APPENDIX TO AN ORDER OF THE KENTUCKY PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION IN CASE NO. 2009-00070 DATED AUG 2 4 2009

•

Kentucky Public Service Commission

P.O. Box 615

Frankfort, KY 40602-0615

May 11, 2009

Enclosed please find ten (10) copies of formal complaint per rules of procedure of 807 KAR5:001 that my husband and I wish to have considered by the Public Service Commission after experiencing disruption of service with our cellular and land line phone through AT & T during the January 2009 ice storm.

We will respectfully await your findings.

Budgetufors

Elizabeth R. Jones

408 Third Street

Fulton, KY 42041

,



#### COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

20040010

BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

In the matter of:

RECEIVED

MAY 1 4 2009 Alan & Elizabeth R Janes, (Your Full Name) ) COMPLAINANT ) PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION VS. AT " T (Name of Utility) DEFENDANT COMPLAINT The complaint of Alan ! Elizabeth & Tanes (Your Full Name) (a) <u>Alan: Elizabet 2 pe Jenes</u> (Your Full Name) 400 Third Street= Fulton, 14 (Your Address) (b) AT <sup>e</sup> 4 (Name of Utility) POBOX 105503 Atlanta GA 30348-5503 (Address of Utility) (c) That: <u>Communication via cell phone</u> (Describe here, attaching additional sheets if necessary, sorvice during the period of time 012709 the specific act, fully and clearly, or facts that are the reason to 022409 Unavailable due to ice & winter storm damas for the complaint.) to above grand lines

Continued on Next Page

Formal Complaint Alan? Elizabetz R Janes vs. 9-

Page 2 of 2 The complainants are both employ in the medical field making ce an indispensab phanes communica: 525 ma Wherefore, complainant asks (Specifically state the relief desired.) thatar Commications company e tar re5 es in 5000 riods VAV 15 IM Dated at , Kentucky, this \_ day our City) , 200 of \_ (Month

(Your Signature)

timeliness of their response, the Commission shall act within its discretion and shall allow the Jones' complaint to move forward. The Commission strongly advises the Joneses to strictly comply with the timeline set forth for the submission of any documents that may be required within future Commission Orders in this proceeding.

Having reviewed the August 13 submission, the Commission finds that the Joneses have established a prima facie case which entitles them to have their complaint move forward and be heard. Therefore, by this Order, AT&T, Inc. shall have 10 days from the date of service of this Order to either satisfy or answer the Jones' complaint.

Since the other complainants to this proceeding are being dismissed, the Commission finds that the style of this proceeding shall be changed to reflect that Mr. and Mrs. Jones are the sole complainants against the defendant, AT&T, Inc. The style is also changed to reflect the paper jurisdictional utilities providing the services which are the subject of the Jones' Complaint. The change to the style will be outlined within in the ordering paragraphs for this Order.

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that:

1. With the exception of the complaint filed by Alan W. and Elizabeth R. Jones, each of the complaints contained within this proceeding is dismissed without prejudice.

2. The complaint filed by Alan W. and Elizabeth R. Jones is accepted for filing and shall move forward for resolution by the Commission.

-4-

J. H. & Melanie Atwill 1677 St. Rte. 781 South Fulton, KY 42041 Kymberly J Kane 4331 Mercedes Drive South Fulton, TN 38257

Ward and Nelda Bushart 5645 Country Club Road South Fulton, TN 38257

NCB Realtors 312 Lake Street Fulton, KY 42041

Robert W Bushart, II 5645 Country Club Road South Fulton, TN 38257

Joan Coleman President - Kentucky AT&T Communications of the South Central 601 W. Chestnut St. Room 408 Louisville, KY 40203

Tiffany L Hobbs 1308 Diuguid Drive Murray, KY 42071

Kimberly Dawn Jackson 1011 West State Line Road South Fulton, TN 38257

Alan & Elizabeth R Jones 408 Third St Fulton, KY 42041