

## **Appraisal Report**

Herrington Haven Waste Water Herrington Haven Road Lancaster, Garrard County, Kentucky 40444

Report Date: 09-21-2022



#### FOR:

Central States Water Resources Mr. Todd Thomas Vice-President 1650 Des Peres Road, Suite 303 Des Peres, Missouri 63074

**Client Number:** 

#### Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans

2030 Dickory Avenue, Suite 200 New Orleans, LA 70123 504.541.5100 phone 504.541.5107 fax *valbridge.com* 

Valbridge File Number: LA01-20-0273

Case No. 2022-00432 Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8 Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 1 of 327



2030 Dickory Avenue, Suite 200 New Orleans, LA 70123 504.541.5100 phone 504.541.5107 fax valbridge.com

09-21-2022

Arthur L. Schwertz MAI 504.541.5101 aschwertz@valbridge.com

Mr. Todd Thomas Vice-President Central States Water Resources 1650 Des Peres Road, Suite 303 Des Peres, Missouri 63074

RE: Appraisal Report Herrington Haven Waste Water Herrington Haven Road Lancaster, Garrard County, Kentucky 40444

Dear Mr. Thomas:

In accordance with your request, we have performed an appraisal of the above referenced property. This appraisal report sets forth the pertinent data gathered, the techniques employed, and the reasoning leading to our value opinions. This letter of transmittal does not constitute an appraisal report and the rationale behind the value opinion(s) reported cannot be adequately understood without the accompanying appraisal report.

The subject property, as referenced above, is located in Herrington Haven Subdivision and includes tax parcel numbers 06E-01-001. The subject property consists of a total of 0.43-acres or 18,731-square-feet. Of the total, 0.41 acres are easements and 0.02 acres are fee simple area. The subject is the sewer system for Herrington Haven Subdivision.

We developed our analyses, opinions, and conclusions and prepared this report in conformity with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP) of the Appraisal Foundation; the Code of Professional Ethics and Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice of the Appraisal Institute; and the requirements of our client as we understand them.

The client in this assignment is Central States Water Resources and the intended users of this report are Central States Water Resources and/or their assigns and no others. The sole intended use is for regulatory Filings. The value opinions reported herein are subject to the definitions, assumptions, limiting conditions, and certifications contained in this report.



The findings and conclusions are further contingent upon the following extraordinary assumptions and/or hypothetical conditions, the use of which might have affected the assignment results:

#### **Extraordinary Assumptions:**

• The appraiser was unable to locate any documents definitively specifying the location or width of the utility easements. However, a visual inspection of the neighborhood indicates the presence of sewer lines near the street frontage and it has been assumed for purposes of this analysis that they lie within a 10' utility easement.

#### Hypothetical Conditions:

• This appraisal is predicated on the hypothetical condition that the property is unimproved and ready for development.

Based on the analysis contained in the following report, our value conclusions are summarized as follows:

Value Conclusions			
Component	As Is	As Is	
Value Type	Market Value	Market Value	
Property Rights Appraised	Easement	Fee Simple	
Effective Date of Value	September 21, 2022	September 21, 2022	
Value Conclusion	\$5,000	\$1,000	

Respectfully submitted, Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans

H 2 A.

Arthur L. Schwertz, MAI Senior Managing Director Kentucky Certified General Real Property Appraiser #5470



## **Table of Contents**

Cover Page	
Letter of Transmittal	
Table of Contents	i
Summary of Salient Facts	ii
Aerial and Front Views	iv
Location Map	v
Introduction	1
Scope of Work	4
City and Neighborhood Analysis	6
Site Description	10
Highest and Best Use	14
Land Valuation	15
Exposure Time and Marketing Period	21
General Assumptions and Limiting Conditions	22
Certification – Arthur L. Schwertz	27
Addenda	29
Glossary	30
Qualifications	
Qualifications of Arthur L. Schwertz, MAI	
Valbridge Property Advisors Information / Office Locations	46



# **Summary of Salient Facts**

## **Property Identification**

Property Name	Herrington Haven Waste Water
Property Address	Herrington Haven Road
	Lancaster, Garrard County, Kentucky 40444
Latitude & Longitude	37.662511, -84.690452
Tax Parcel Number	06E-01-001
Property Owner	Herrington Haven WasteWater Co.
Site	
Zoning	Not Zoned
FEMA Flood Map No.	21079C0065C
Flood Zone	Х
Easement Land Area	17,816 square feet
Fee Simple Land Area	915 square feet
Valuation Opinions	
Highest & Best Use - As Vacant	Residential
Reasonable Exposure Time	Six months or less
Reasonable Marketing Time	Six months or less

© 2022 VALBRIDGE PROPERTY ADVISORS | New Orleans



Value Conclusions			
Component	As Is	As Is	
Value Type	Market Value	Market Value	
Property Rights Appraised	Easement	Fee Simple	
Effective Date of Value	September 21, 2022	September 21, 2022	
Value Conclusion	\$5,000	\$1,000	



HERRINGTON HAVEN WASTE WATER AERIAL AND FRONT VIEWS

## **Aerial and Front Views**

**AERIAL VIEW** 



**FRONT VIEW** 



Page iv Case No. 2022-00432 Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8 Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 7 of 327



HERRINGTON HAVEN WASTE WATER LOCATION MAP

# **Location Map**





## Introduction

## Client and Intended Users of the Appraisal

The client in this assignment is Central States Water Resources and the sole intended users of this report are Central States Water Resources and/or their assigns. Under no circumstances shall any of the following parties be entitled to use or rely on the appraisal or this appraisal report:

- i. The borrower(s) on any loans or financing relating to or secured by the subject property,
- ii. Any guarantor(s) of such loans or financing; or
- iii. Principals, shareholders, investors, members or partners in such borrower(s) or guarantors.

### Intended Use of the Appraisal

The sole intended use of this report is for regulatory Filings.

#### Real Estate Identification

The subject property is located at Herrington Haven Road, Lancaster, Garrard County, Kentucky 40444. The subject property is further identified by the tax parcel number 06E-01-001.

#### Legal Description

Lot 25-A, Herrington Haven Subdivision, Garrard County, Lancaster, Kentucky and the easements for the sewer pipes

#### Use of Real Estate as of the Effective Date of Value

As of the effective date of value, the subject was a utility property.

### Use of Real Estate as Reflected in this Appraisal

The opinion of value for the subject as is reflects use as a utility property.

#### Ownership of the Property

According to Public Records, title to the subject property is vested in Herrington Haven WasteWater Co..

#### History of the Property

Ownership of the subject property has changed within the past three years.

### Analysis of Listings/Offers/Contracts

The subject is not currently listed for sale or under contract for sale..



## Type and Definition of Value

The appraisal problem is to develop an opinion of the market value of the subject property. "Market Value," as used in this appraisal, is defined as "the most probable price that a property should bring in a competitive and open market under all conditions requisite to a fair sale, the buyer and seller each acting prudently and knowledgeably, and assuming the price is not affected by undue stimulus." Implicit in this definition is the consummation of a sale as of a specified date and the passing of title from seller to buyer under conditions whereby:

- Buyer and seller are typically motivated.
- Both parties are well informed or well advised, each acting in what they consider their own best interests;
- A reasonable time is allowed for exposure in the open market;
- Payment is made in terms of cash in U.S. dollars or in terms of financial arrangements comparable thereto; and
- The price represents the normal consideration for the property sold unaffected by special or creative financing or sale concessions granted by anyone associated with the sale."1

The value conclusions apply to the value of the subject property under the market conditions presumed on the effective date of value. Please refer to the Glossary in the Addenda section for additional definitions of terms used in this report.

### Valuation Scenarios, Property Rights Appraised, and Effective Dates of Value

Per the scope of our assignment we developed opinions of value for the subject property under the following scenarios of value:

Valuation Scenario	Effective Date of Value
As Is Market Value of the Easement Interest	September 21, 2022
As Is Market Value of the Fee Simple Interest	September 21, 2022

### Date of Report

The date of this report is 09-21-2022.

#### List of Items Requested but Not Provided

• All information requested has been provided

### Assumptions and Conditions of the Appraisal

This appraisal assignment and the opinions reported herein are subject to the General Assumptions and Limiting Conditions contained in the report and the following extraordinary assumptions and/or hypothetical conditions, the use of which might have affected the assignment results.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Source: Code of Federal Regulations, Title 12, Banks and Banking, Part 722.2-Definitions

<sup>© 2022</sup> VALBRIDGE PROPERTY ADVISORS | New Orleans



#### **Extraordinary Assumptions**

• The appraiser was unable to locate any documents definitively specifying the location or width of the utility easements. However, a visual inspection of the neighborhood indicates the presence of sewer lines near the street frontage and it has been assumed for purposes of this analysis that they lie within a 10' utility easement.

#### Hypothetical Conditions

• This appraisal is predicated on the hypothetical condition that the property is unimproved and ready for development.



# Scope of Work

The elements addressed in the Scope of Work are (1) the extent to which the subject property is identified, (2) the extent to which the subject property is inspected, (3) the type and extent of data researched, (4) the type and extent of analysis applied, (5) the type of appraisal report prepared, and (6) the inclusion or exclusion of items of non-realty in the development of the value opinion. These items are discussed as below.

## Extent to Which the Property Was Identified

The three components of the property identification are summarized as follows:

- <u>Legal Characteristics</u> The subject was legally identified via a general inspection of the property by the appraiser, as well as a review of property maps, a legal description, and tax assessment maps.
- <u>Economic Characteristics</u> Economic characteristics of the subject property were identified via information provided by the client, public records, market surveys, discussions with market participants, and Valbridge Property Advisor's files, as well as a comparison to properties with similar locational and physical characteristics.
- <u>Physical Characteristics</u> The subject was physically identified via a general inspection of the property by the appraiser.

### Extent to Which the Property Was Inspected

We did not perform an appraisal inspection of the property.

### Type and Extent of Data Researched

We researched and analyzed: (1) market area data, (2) property-specific market data, (3) zoning and land-use data, and (4) current data on comparable listings and transactions. We also interviewed people familiar with the subject market/property type.

## Type and Extent of Analysis Applied (Valuation Methodology)

We observed surrounding land use trends, the condition of any improvements, demand for the subject property, and relevant legal limitations in concluding a highest and best use. We then valued the subject based on that highest and best use conclusion.

Appraisers develop an opinion of property value with specific appraisal procedures that reflect three distinct methods of data analysis: the Cost Approach, Sales Comparison Approach, and Income Capitalization Approach. One or more of these approaches are used in all estimations of value.

- <u>Sales Comparison Approach</u> In the Sales Comparison Approach, value is indicated by recent sales and/or listings of comparable properties in the market, with the appraiser analyzing the impact of material differences in both economic and physical elements between the subject and the comparables.
- <u>Direct Capitalization: Land Residual Method</u> The Land Residual Methodology involves estimating the residual net income to the land by deducting from total potential income the portion attributable to the improvements, assuming development of the site at its highest and



best use. The residual income is capitalized at an appropriate rate, resulting in an indication of land value.

- <u>Direct Capitalization: Ground Rent Capitalization</u> A market derived capitalization rate is applied to the net income resulting from a ground lease. This can represent the leased fee or fee simple interest, depending on whether the income potential is reflective of a lease in place or market rental rates.
- <u>Yield Capitalization: Subdivision Development Method</u> Also known as Discounted Cash Flow Analysis (DCF), the methodology is most appropriate for land having multiple lot development in the near term as the highest and best use. The current site value is represented by discounting the anticipated cash flow to a present value, taking into consideration all necessary costs of development, maintenance, administration, and sales throughout the absorption period.

All of these approaches to value were considered. We assessed the availability of data and applicability of each approach to value within the context of the characteristics of the subject property and the needs and requirements of the client. Based on this assessment, we relied upon the Sales Comparison Approach. Further discussion of the extent of our analysis and the methodology of each approach is provided later in the respective valuation sections.

## Appraisal Conformity and Report Type

We developed our analyses, opinions, and conclusions and prepared this report in conformity with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP) of the Appraisal Foundation; the Code of Professional Ethics and Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice of the Appraisal Institute; and the requirements of our client as we understand them. This is an Appraisal Report as defined by the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice under Standards Rule 2-2a.

## Personal Property/FF&E

All items of non-realty are excluded from this analysis. The opinion of market value developed herein is reflective of real estate only.



# **City and Neighborhood Analysis**



#### **NEIGHBORHOOD MAP**

## Overview

The subject is located in Lancaster in Garrard County, Kentucky. The area of Lancaster is characterized by being a rural area along the Dix River.



#### Neighborhood Location and Boundaries

The subject neighborhood is located in the Herrington Lake section of Lancaster. The area is rural in nature.

#### **Transportation Access**

Within the immediate area of the subject property, transportation access helps define the character of its development. Major travel and commuter routes within the area of the subject property include Herrington Haven Road. Access to the area is considered poor.

#### Neighborhood Land Use

The subject neighborhood is located in an area with primarily residential land uses. An approximate breakdown of the development in the area is as follows:

LAND	USLS
Developed	50%
Residential	90%
Retail	10%
Office	0%
Industrial	0%
Vacant	50%
Total	100%

### LAND USES

## Land Use Trends

The neighborhood is not experiencing a change in land use.



### Demographics

The following table depicts the area demographics in Lancaster within a one-, three-, and five-mile radius from the subject.

Neighborhood Demographics			
Radius (Miles)	1 Mile	3 Mile	5 Mile
Population Summary			
2010 Population	112	2,973	17,163
2020 Population Estimate	116	3,160	18,852
2025 Population Projection	122	3,274	18,895
Annual % Change (2020 - 2025)	1.0%	0.7%	0.1%
Housing Unit Summary			
2010 Housing Units	59	1,349	7,624
% Owner Occupied	78.0%	76.3%	62.5%
% Renter Occupied	8.5%	11.9%	25.6%
2020 Housing Units	60	1,382	7,897
% Owner Occupied	83.3%	82.7%	62.8%
% Renter Occupied	3.3%	6.9%	27.3%
2025 Housing Units	62	1,405	7,938
% Owner Occupied	85.5%	84.6%	63.1%
% Renter Occupied	3.2%	6.6%	26.6%
Annual % Change (2020 - 2025)	2.3%	0.4%	0.1%
Income Summary			
2020 Median Household Income Estimate	\$95,140	\$90,667	\$61,968
2025 Median Household Income Projection	\$106,316	\$101,548	\$73,369
Annual % Change	2.3%	2.3%	3.4%
2020 Per Capita Income Estimate	\$47,362	\$45,496	\$32,975
2025 Per Capita Income Projection	\$53,131	\$51,251	\$37,501
Annual % Change	2.3%	2.4%	2.6%
Source: ESRI (ArcGIS)		(Lat: 37.662511, L	on: -84.690452)

Within a three-mile radius, the reported population is 3,160 with a projected growth rate of approximately 0.7% annually. There are 1,382 housing units within that three-mile radius. The growth rate is expected to be 0.4% annually. Most of the housing is owner-occupied. Our research indicates that property values in the area are increasing.

Within a three-mile radius, the median household income is \$90,667. Looking ahead, annual household income growth is projected at **2.3**% per year. The average income figures suggest that the inhabitants are within the middle to upper income brackets.

### Nuisances & External Obsolescence

Neighborhood properties have adequate levels of maintenance. No adverse or unfavorable factors were observed.



### Neighborhood Life Cycle

Most neighborhoods are classified as being in four stages: **growth**, **stability**, **decline**, and **renewal**. Overall, the subject neighborhood is in the stable stage of its life cycle.

### Immediate Area Uses

The below aerial photo exhibits the uses located in the subject's immediate vicinity.



#### **IMMEDIATE AREA USES**

Source: Google Maps

Uses in the vicinity of the subject are primarily residential in nature. As shown above, the density of uses in the area is low.

## Analysis and Conclusions

The neighborhood is characterized by being a rural area along the Dix River.



## **Site Description**

The subject site is located in Herrington Haven Subdivision. The characteristics of the site are summarized as follows:

#### Site Characteristics

0.43 Acres or 18,731 SF
0.02 Acres or 915 SF
0.41 Acres or 17,816
Irregular
Level
Adequate
All are available

## Flood Zone Data

Flood Map Panel/Number:	21079C0065C
Flood Map Date:	04-18-2011
Portion in Flood Hazard Area:	100.00%
Flood Zone:	Х
	Flood Zone X is described as an area of minimal flood hazard, usually depicted on FIRMs as above the 500-year flood level. Flood Insurance is not considered mandatory in this Flood Zone.

#### Adjacent Land Uses

· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
North:	Residential
South:	Residential
East:	Residential
West:	Dix River

## **Zoning Designation**

Zoning Jurisdiction:	Not in Zoning
Zoning Classification:	Not Zoned,

## Analysis/Comments on Site

The subject is the sewer system for Herrington Haven Subdivision. It consists of 0.40 acres of easements and 0.021 acres of fee simple area.



HERRINGTON HAVEN WASTE WATER SITE DESCRIPTION

#### TAX/PLAT MAP







#### SERVICE AREA MAP





HERRINGTON HAVEN WASTE WATER SITE DESCRIPTION

#### **FLOOD MAP**



Page 13 Case No. 2022-00432 Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8 Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 21 of 327



## Highest and Best Use

The Highest and Best Use of a property is the use that is legally permissible, physically possible, and financially feasible which results in the highest value. An opinion of the highest and best use results from consideration of the criteria noted above under the market conditions or likely conditions as of the effective date of value. Determination of highest and best use results from the judgment and analytical skills of the appraiser. It represents an opinion, not a fact. In appraisal practice, the concept of highest and best use represents the premise upon which value is based.

## Analysis of Highest and Best Use As Though Vacant

The primary determinants of the highest and best use of the property As Though Vacant are the issues of (1) Legal permissibility, (2) Physical possibility, (3) Financial feasibility, and (4) Maximum productivity.

#### Legally Permissible

The subject site is Not Zoned, which controls the general nature of permissible uses but is appropriate for the location and physical elements of the subject property, providing for a consistency of use with the general neighborhood. The location of the subject property is appropriate for the uses allowed, as noted previously, and a change in zoning is unlikely. There are no known easements, encroachments, covenants or other use restrictions that would unduly limit or impede development.

#### Physically Possible

The physical attributes allow for a number of potential uses. Elements such as size, shape, availability of utilities, known hazards (flood, environmental, etc.), and other potential influences are described in the Site Description and have been considered. There are no items of a physical nature which would adversely impact development with the legal permitted uses.

#### **Financially Feasible**

The probable use of the site for residential development conforms to the pattern of land use in the market area. A review of published yield, rental and occupancy rates suggest that there is a balanced supply and demand is sufficient to support construction costs and ensure timely absorption of additional inventory in this market. Therefore, near-term speculative development of the subject site is financially feasible.

#### Maximally Productive

Among the financially feasible uses, the use that results in the highest value (the maximally productive use) is the highest and best use. Considering these factors, the maximally productive use as though vacant is for residential use.

## Conclusion of Highest and Best Use As Though Vacant

The conclusion of the highest and best use As Though Vacant is for residential use.

#### Most Probable Buyer

As of the date of value, the most probable buyer of the subject property is an owner user.



## **Land Valuation**

### Methodology

Site Value is most often estimated using the sales comparison approach. This approach develops an indication of market value by analyzing closed sales, listings, or pending sales of properties similar to the subject, focusing on the difference between the subject and the comparables using all appropriate elements of comparison. This approach is based on the principles of supply and demand, balance, externalities, and substitution, or the premise that a buyer would pay no more for a specific property than the cost of obtaining a property with the same quality, utility, and perceived benefits of ownership.

The process of developing the sales comparison approach consists of the following analyses: (1) researching and verifying transactional data, (2) selecting relevant units of comparison, (3) analyzing and adjusting the comparable sales for differences in various elements of comparison, and (4) reconciling the adjusted sales into a value indication for the subject site.

#### Unit of Comparison

The unit of comparison depends on land use economics and how buyers and sellers use the property. The unit of comparison in this analysis is per usable square foot.

#### Elements of Comparison

Elements of comparison are the characteristics or attributes of properties and transactions that cause the prices of real estate to vary. The primary elements of comparison considered in sales comparison analysis are as follows: (1) property rights conveyed, (2) financing terms, (3) conditions of sale, (4) expenditures made immediately after purchase, (5) market conditions, (6) location and (7) physical characteristics.

#### Comparable Sales Data

To obtain and verify comparable sales of vacant land properties, we conducted a search of public records, field surveys, interviews with knowledgeable real estate professionals in the area, and a review of our internal database.

We included six sales in our analysis, as these sales were judged to be the most comparable to develop an indication of market value for the subject property.

The following is a table summarizing each sale comparable and a map illustrating the location of each in relation to the subject.



#### HERRINGTON HAVEN WASTE WATER LAND VALUATION

	Sale # 1	Sale # 2	Sale # 3	Sale # 4	Sale # 5	Sale # 6
Sale ID	1613032	1613028	1613037	1613046	1613041	1613051
Property Name	Water Front Lot	Water Front Lot	Residential Lot with	Residential Lot	Residential Lot	Residential Lot
			water access			
Sale Status	Closed	Closed	Closed	Closed	Closed	
Location	109 Meadow Point	106 Meadow Point	99 Herrington Hills	33 Chenault Bridge	325 Meadow Lake	
	Drive	Drive		Lane	Drive	
	Lancaster, Kentucky	,	Lancaster, Kentucky	. ,	. ,	. ,
Tax ID	07-01-109	07-01.106	07-01.099	06-30-01-03.00	07-01.073	06-30-03-017.00
Sales Data						
Date of Sale	7/18/2022	6/8/2020	8/25/2022	2/5/2021	7/29/2020	9/1/2020
Sales Price	\$83,500	\$25,000	\$65,000	\$12,500	\$19,500	\$16,400
Price/Usable Square Foot	\$1.90	\$0.46	\$0.63	\$0.74	\$0.26	\$0.27
Grantor	Robert and		Ron Steinhauer and	Robert Lucas Ayres	Gary L and Donna	Harris Millerd
	Katherine Trapp		Linda Speck		Cook	
Grantee	Ellen Jean and Mark	Del and Vickie	Zachary and	Shawn Mitchell	James Craig and	Richard and Melissa
	Ј Норр	Brown	Breonna Jefferies		Andrea Marie Boyd	Elwood
Recording Number						
Book/Page Number						
Document Number						
Property Rights Conveyed	Fee Simple	Fee Simple	Fee Simple	Fee Simple	Fee Simple	Fee Simple
Financing	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller
Conditions of Sale	Arm's Length	Arm's Length	Arm's Length	Arm's Length	Arm's Length	Arm's Length
Physical Characteristics						
Usable Land Area (Sq. Ft.)	43,996	54,886	102,802	16,988	74,923	60,113
Gross Land Area (Sq. Ft.)	43,996	54,886	102.802	16,988	74,923	
Zoning	Not Zoned	Not Zoned	Not Zoned	. 375 00	Not Zoned	Not Zoned
Shape	Rectangular	Rectangular	Flag	Rectangular	Irregular	100 201100



HERRINGTON HAVEN WASTE WATER LAND VALUATION



**COMPARABLE SALES MAP** 



## Land Sales Comparison Analysis

When necessary, adjustments were made for differences in various elements of comparison, including property rights conveyed, financing terms, conditions of sale, expenditures made immediately after purchase, market conditions, location, and other physical characteristics. If the element in comparison is considered superior to that of the subject, we applied a negative adjustment. Conversely, a positive adjustment was applied if inferior. A summary of the elements of comparison follows.

	Elements of Comparison
Real Property Rights Conveyed	Adjustments for differences in property rights appraised.
Financing Terms	Comparable properties are adjusted for differences between a transaction's financing terms and those assumed in the valuation of the subject property - e.g. seller financing, loan assumption, non-market terms.
Conditions of Sale	Comparable properties are adjusted for differences in the motivations of either the buyer or a seller in the transaction. In the instant case, no adjustments are required.
Expenditures After Purchase	Comparable properties can be adjusted for any additional investment required to make the property salable – e. g. costs to cure deferred maintenance, costs to demolish and remove any portion of the improvements, costs to remediate environmental contamination and/or costs to occupy or stabilize the property.
Market Conditions	Comparable properties can be adjusted for changes in market conditions because of inflation, deflation, fluctuations in supply and demand, or other factors.
Location	Location adjustments may be required when the locational characteristics of a comparable are different from those of the subject.
Size	The size adjustment addresses variance in the physical size of the comparables and that of the subject, as a larger parcel typically commands a lower price per unit than a smaller parcel. As this is an estimate of the Across the Fence Value, it is assumed that the subject would be part of a lot similar in size to the comparables. As such, no positive adjustments for size are warranted.
Shape /Depth	This element address variance in utility due to shape and/or depth. No adjustments are warranted.
Corner Exposure	Tracts featuring corner influence typically command higher prices in the market place, as opposed to interior locations. As the subject includes both corner and interior lots, no adjustments are warranted.



## Summary of Adjustments

Presented on the following page is a summary of the adjustments made to the sale comparables. As noted earlier, these quantitative adjustments were based on our market research, best judgment, and experience in the appraisal of similar properties.



#### LAND SALES ADJUSTMENT GRID

	Subject	Sale # 1	Sale # 2	Sale # 3	Sale # 4	Sale # 5	Sale # 6
Sale ID		1613032	1613028	1613037	1613046	1613041	1613051
Date of Value & Sale	September-22	July-22	June-20	August-22	February-21	July-20	September-20
Unadjusted Sales Price		\$83,500	\$25,000	\$65,000	\$12,500	\$19,500	\$16,400
Usable Square Feet	915	43,996	54,886	102,802	16,988	74,923	60,113
Unadjusted Sales Price per U	sable Sq. Ft.	\$1.90	\$0.46	\$0.63	\$0.74	\$0.26	\$0.27
Transactional Adjustments							
Property Rights Conveyed	Easement	Fee Simple					
Adjusted Sales Price	_	\$1.90	\$0.46	\$0.63	\$0.74	\$0.26	\$0.27
Financing Terms	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller
Adjusted Sales Price		\$1.90	\$0.46	\$0.63	\$0.74	\$0.26	\$0.27
Conditions of Sale	Typical	Arm's Length					
Adjusted Sales Price	_	\$1.90	\$0.46	\$0.63	\$0.74	\$0.26	\$0.27
Expenditures after Sale							
Adjusted Sales Price	-	\$1.90	\$0.46	\$0.63	\$0.74	\$0.26	\$0.27
Market Conditions Adjustme	ents						
Elapsed Time from Date of	f Value	0.18 years	2.29 years	0.07 years	1.62 years	2.15 years	2.05 years
Market Trend Through	September-22	1.2%	16.0%	0.5%	11.4%	15.0%	14.4%
Analyzed Sales Price	_	\$1.92	\$0.53	\$0.64	\$0.82	\$0.30	\$0.31
Physical Adjustments							
Location	Herrington Haven	109 Meadow	106 Meadow	99 Herrington	33 Chenault	325 Meadow	124 Hard Drive
	Road	Point Drive	Point Drive	Hills	Bridge Lane	Lake Drive	
	Lancaster,	Lancaster,	Lancaster,	Lancaster,	Lancaster,	Lancaster,	Lancaster,
	Kentucky	Kentucky	Kentucky	Kentucky	Kentucky	Kentucky	Kentucky
Adjustment		-	-	-	-	-	-
Average lot Size	25000	43,996 sf	54,886 sf	102,802 sf	16,988 sf	74,923 sf	60,113 sf
Adjustment	_	4.0%	5.0%	10.0%	-3.0%	7.0%	6.0%
Net Physical Adjustment	_	4.0%	5.0%	10.0%	-3.0%	7.0%	6.0%
Adjusted Sales Price per Usa	hla Sauara Faat	\$2.00	\$0.55	\$0.70	\$0.79	\$0.32	\$0.33



#### Conclusion

From the market data available, we used six land sales in competitive market areas which were adjusted based on pertinent elements of comparison. The following table summarizes the unadjusted and adjusted unit prices:

#### Land Sale Statistics

Metric	Unadjusted	Analyzed	Adjusted
Min. Sales Price per Usable Square Foot	\$0.26	\$0.30	\$0.32
Max. Sales Price per Usable Square Foot	\$1.90	\$1.92	\$2.00
Median Sales Price per Usable Square Foot	\$0.54	\$0.58	\$0.63
Mean Sales Price per Usable Square Foot	\$0.71	\$0.75	\$0.78

Based on the adjusted prices and the most comparable sale, a unit value for the subject property is near the middle of the adjusted range, or \$0.75 per usable square foot. Thus, the estimated "Across the Fence Value" of the Fee Simple Interest in the subject easements is calculated to be \$13,000.

## Valuation of the Fee Simple Area

Based on the adjusted prices and the most comparable sale, a unit value for the subject property is near the middle of the adjusted range, or \$0.75 per usable square foot. Thus, based upon the assumptions, reasoning and comparable data discussed herein, the estimated "Market Value" of the subject Fee Simple area is calculated as follows:

### **Calculation of Fee Simple Value**

Site Area		Unit Value	Unit Value		
915 Square Feet	Х	\$0.75	=	\$1,000	

## Valuation of the Easement

The use to which the subject easements will be put to is for underground water and sewer pipes. As such, little or no surface improvements will be possible, but access across the surface will be allowed. It is my opinion, therefore, that such an easement will encumber approximately 40% of the ownership rights in the subject.

Thus, based upon the assumptions, reasoning and comparable data discussed herein, the estimated "Market Value" of the subject easements is calculated as follows:

#### **Calculation of Easement Value**

						Indicated Value of	
Site Area		Unit Value		Market Value of Fee		Easement Use	Easement
17,816 square feet	Х	\$0.75 PSF	=	\$13,000	Х	40%	\$5,000

## Exposure Time and Marketing Period

Based on statistical information about days on market, escrow length, and marketing times gathered through national investor surveys, sales verification, and interviews of market participants, marketing and exposure time estimates of and , respectively, are considered reasonable and appropriate for the subject property.

© 2022 VALBRIDGE PROPERTY ADVISORS | New Orleans



## **General Assumptions and Limiting Conditions**

This appraisal is subject to the following general assumptions and limiting conditions:

- 1. The legal description if furnished to us is assumed to be correct.
- 2. No responsibility is assumed for legal matters, questions of survey or title, soil or subsoil conditions, engineering, availability or capacity of utilities, or other similar technical matters. The appraisal does not constitute a survey of the property appraised. All existing liens and encumbrances have been disregarded and the property is appraised as though free and clear, under responsible ownership and competent management unless otherwise noted.
- 3. Unless otherwise noted, the appraisal will value the property as though free of contamination. Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans will conduct no hazardous materials or contamination inspection of any kind. It is recommended that the client hire an expert if the presence of hazardous materials or contamination poses any concern.
- 4. The stamps and/or consideration placed on deeds used to indicate sales are in correct relationship to the actual dollar amount of the transaction.
- 5. Unless otherwise noted, it is assumed there are no encroachments, zoning violations or restrictions existing in the subject property.
- 6. The appraiser is not required to give testimony or attendance in court by reason of this appraisal, unless previous arrangements have been made.
- 7. Unless expressly specified in the engagement letter, the fee for this appraisal does not include the attendance or giving of testimony by Appraiser at any court, regulatory or other proceedings, or any conferences or other work in preparation for such proceeding. If any partner or employee of Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans is asked or required to appear and/or testify at any deposition, trial, or other proceeding about the preparation, conclusions or any other aspect of this assignment, client shall compensate Appraiser for the time spent by the partner or employee in appearing and/or testifying and in preparing to testify according to the Appraiser's then current hourly rate plus reimbursement of expenses.
- 8. The values for land and/or improvements, as contained in this report, are constituent parts of the total value reported and neither is (or are) to be used in making a summation appraisal of a combination of values created by another appraiser. Either is invalidated if so used.
- 9. The dates of value to which the opinions expressed in this report apply are set forth in this report. We assume no responsibility for economic or physical factors occurring at some point at a later date, which may affect the opinions stated herein. The forecasts, projections, or operating estimates contained herein are based on current market conditions and anticipated short-term supply and demand factors and are subject to change with future conditions. Appraiser is not responsible for determining whether the date of value requested by Client is appropriate for Client's intended use.
- 10. The sketches, maps, plats and exhibits in this report are included to assist the reader in visualizing the property. The appraiser has made no survey of the property and assumed no responsibility in connection with such matters.
- 11. The information, estimates and opinions, which were obtained from sources outside of this office, are considered reliable. However, no liability for them can be assumed by the appraiser.



- 12. Possession of this report, or a copy thereof, does not carry with it the right of publication. Neither all, nor any part of the content of the report, or copy thereof (including conclusions as to property value, the identity of the appraisers, professional designations, reference to any professional appraisal organization or the firm with which the appraisers are connected), shall be disseminated to the public through advertising, public relations, news, sales, or other media without prior written consent and approval.
- 13. No claim is intended to be expressed for matters of expertise that would require specialized investigation or knowledge beyond that ordinarily employed by real estate appraisers. We claim no expertise in areas such as, but not limited to, legal, survey, structural, environmental, pest control, mechanical, etc.
- 14. This appraisal was prepared for the sole and exclusive use of the client for the function outlined herein. Any party who is not the client or intended user identified in the appraisal or engagement letter is not entitled to rely upon the contents of the appraisal without express written consent of Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans and Client. The Client shall not include partners, affiliates, or relatives of the party addressed herein. The appraiser assumes no obligation, liability or accountability to any third party.
- 15. Distribution of this report is at the sole discretion of the client, but third-parties not listed as an intended user on the face of the appraisal or the engagement letter may not rely upon the contents of the appraisal. In no event shall client give a third-party a partial copy of the appraisal report. We will make no distribution of the report without the specific direction of the client.
- 16. This appraisal shall be used only for the function outlined herein, unless expressly authorized by Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans.
- 17. This appraisal shall be considered in its entirety. No part thereof shall be used separately or out of context.
- 18. Unless otherwise noted in the body of this report, this appraisal assumes that the subject property does not fall within the areas where mandatory flood insurance is effective. Unless otherwise noted, we have not completed nor have we contracted to have completed an investigation to identify and/or quantify the presence of non-tidal wetland conditions on the subject property. Because the appraiser is not a surveyor, he or she makes no guarantees, express or implied, regarding this determination.
- 19. The flood maps are not site specific. We are not qualified to confirm the location of the subject property in relation to flood hazard areas based on the FEMA Flood Insurance Rate Maps or other surveying techniques. It is recommended that the client obtain a confirmation of the subject property's flood zone classification from a licensed surveyor.
- 20. If the appraisal is for mortgage loan purposes 1) we assume satisfactory completion of improvements if construction is not complete, 2) no consideration has been given for rent loss during rent-up unless noted in the body of this report, and 3) occupancy at levels consistent with our "Income and Expense Projection" are anticipated.
- 21. It is assumed that there are no hidden or unapparent conditions of the property, subsoil, or structures which would render it more or less valuable. No responsibility is assumed for such conditions or for engineering which may be required to discover them.



- 22. Our inspection included an observation of the land and improvements thereon only. It was not possible to observe conditions beneath the soil or hidden structural components within the improvements. We inspected the buildings involved, and reported damage (if any) by termites, dry rot, wet rot, or other infestations as a matter of information, and no guarantee of the amount or degree of damage (if any) is implied. Condition of heating, cooling, ventilation, electrical and plumbing equipment is considered to be commensurate with the condition of the balance of the improvements unless otherwise stated. Should the client have concerns in these areas, it is the client's responsibility to order the appropriate inspections. The appraiser does not have the skill or expertise to make such inspections and assumes no responsibility for these items.
- 23. This appraisal does not guarantee compliance with building code and life safety code requirements of the local jurisdiction. It is assumed that all required licenses, consents, certificates of occupancy or other legislative or administrative authority from any local, state or national governmental or private entity or organization have been or can be obtained or renewed for any use on which the value conclusion contained in this report is based unless specifically stated to the contrary.
- 24. When possible, we have relied upon building measurements provided by the client, owner, or associated agents of these parties. In the absence of a detailed rent roll, reliable public records, or "as-built" plans provided to us, we have relied upon our own measurements of the subject improvements. We follow typical appraisal industry methods; however, we recognize that some factors may limit our ability to obtain accurate measurements including, but not limited to, property access on the day of inspection, basements, fenced/gated areas, grade elevations, greenery/shrubbery, uneven surfaces, multiple story structures, obtuse or acute wall angles, immobile obstructions, etc. Professional building area measurements of the quality, level of detail, or accuracy of professional measurement services are beyond the scope of this appraisal assignment.
- 25. We have attempted to reconcile sources of data discovered or provided during the appraisal process, including assessment department data. Ultimately, the measurements that are deemed by us to be the most accurate and/or reliable are used within this report. While the measurements and any accompanying sketches are considered to be reasonably accurate and reliable, we cannot guarantee their accuracy. Should the client desire more precise measurement, they are urged to retain the measurement services of a qualified professional (space planner, architect or building engineer) as an alternative source. If this alternative measurement source reflects or reveals substantial differences with the measurements used within the report, upon request of the client, the appraiser will submit a revised report for an additional fee.
- 26. In the absence of being provided with a detailed land survey, we have used assessment department data to ascertain the physical dimensions and acreage of the property. Should a survey prove this information to be inaccurate, upon request of the client, the appraiser will submit a revised report for an additional fee.
- 27. If only preliminary plans and specifications were available for use in the preparation of this appraisal, and a review of the final plans and specifications reveals substantial differences upon request of the client the appraiser will submit a revised report for an additional fee.



- 28. Unless otherwise stated in this report, the value conclusion is predicated on the assumption that the property is free of contamination, environmental impairment or hazardous materials. Unless otherwise stated, the existence of hazardous material was not observed by the appraiser and the appraiser has no knowledge of the existence of such materials on or in the property. The appraiser, however, is not qualified to detect such substances. The presence of substances such as asbestos, urea-formaldehyde foam insulation or other potentially hazardous materials may affect the value of the property. No responsibility is assumed for any such conditions, or for any expertise or engineering knowledge required for discovery. The client is urged to retain an expert in this field, if desired.
- 29. The Americans with Disabilities Act ("ADA") became effective January 26, 1992. We have not made a specific compliance survey of the property to determine if it is in conformity with the various requirements of the ADA. It is possible that a compliance survey of the property, together with an analysis of the requirements of the ADA, could reveal that the property is not in compliance with one or more of the requirements of the Act. If so, this could have a negative effect on the value of the property. Since we have no direct evidence relating to this issue, we did not consider possible noncompliance with the requirements of ADA in developing an opinion of value.
- 30. This appraisal applies to the land and building improvements only. The value of trade fixtures, furnishings, and other equipment, or subsurface rights (minerals, gas, and oil) were not considered in this appraisal unless specifically stated to the contrary.
- 31. No changes in any federal, state or local laws, regulations or codes (including, without limitation, the Internal Revenue Code) are anticipated, unless specifically stated to the contrary.
- 32. Any income and expense estimates contained in the appraisal report are used only for the purpose of estimating value and do not constitute prediction of future operating results. Furthermore, it is inevitable that some assumptions will not materialize and that unanticipated events may occur that will likely affect actual performance.
- 33. Any estimate of insurable value, if included within the scope of work and presented herein, is based upon figures developed consistent with industry practices. However, actual local and regional construction costs may vary significantly from our estimate and individual insurance policies and underwriters have varied specifications, exclusions, and non-insurable items. As such, we strongly recommend that the Client obtain estimates from professionals experienced in establishing insurance coverage. This analysis should not be relied upon to determine insurance coverage and we make no warranties regarding the accuracy of this estimate.
- 34. The data gathered in the course of this assignment (except data furnished by the Client) shall remain the property of the Appraiser. The appraiser will not violate the confidential nature of the appraiserclient relationship by improperly disclosing any confidential information furnished to the appraiser. Notwithstanding the foregoing, the Appraiser is authorized by the client to disclose all or any portion of the appraisal and related appraisal data to appropriate representatives of the Appraisal Institute if such disclosure is required to enable the appraiser to comply with the Bylaws and Regulations of such Institute now or hereafter in effect.



- 35. You and Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans both agree that any dispute over matters in excess of \$5,000 will be submitted for resolution by arbitration. This includes fee disputes and any claim of malpractice. The arbitrator shall be mutually selected. If Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans and the client cannot agree on the arbitrator, the presiding head of the Local County Mediation & Arbitration panel shall select the arbitrator. Such arbitration shall be binding and final. In agreeing to arbitration, we both acknowledge that, by agreeing to binding arbitration, each of us is giving up the right to have the dispute decided in a court of law before a judge or jury. In the event that the client, or any other party, makes a claim against Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans or any of its employees in connections with or in any way relating to this assignment, the maximum damages recoverable by such claimant shall be the amount actually received by Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans for this assignment, and under no circumstances shall any claim for consequential damages be made.
- 36. Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans shall have no obligation, liability, or accountability to any third party. Any party who is not the "client" or intended user identified on the face of the appraisal or in the engagement letter is not entitled to rely upon the contents of the appraisal without the express written consent of Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans. "Client" shall not include partners, affiliates, or relatives of the party named in the engagement letter. Client shall hold Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans and its employees harmless in the event of any lawsuit brought by any third party, lender, partner, or part-owner in any form of ownership or any other party as a result of this assignment. The client also agrees that in case of lawsuit arising from or in any way involving these appraisal services, client will hold Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans harmless from and against any liability, loss, cost, or expense incurred or suffered by Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans in such action, regardless of its outcome.
- 37. The Valbridge Property Advisors office responsible for the preparation of this report is independently owned and operated by VPA of South Louisiana, Inc.. Neither Valbridge Property Advisors, Inc., nor any of its affiliates has been engaged to provide this report. Valbridge Property Advisors, Inc. does not provide valuation services, and has taken no part in the preparation of this report.
- 38. If any claim is filed against any of Valbridge Property Advisors, Inc., a Florida Corporation, its affiliates, officers or employees, or the firm providing this report, in connection with, or in any way arising out of, or relating to, this report, or the engagement of the firm providing this report, then (1) under no circumstances shall such claimant be entitled to consequential, special or other damages, except only for direct compensatory damages, and (2) the maximum amount of such compensatory damages recoverable by such claimant shall be the amount actually received by the firm engaged to provide this report.
- 39. This report and any associated work files may be subject to evaluation by Valbridge Property Advisors, Inc., or its affiliates, for quality control purposes.
- 40. Acceptance and/or use of this appraisal report constitutes acceptance of the foregoing general assumptions and limiting conditions.
- 41. The global outbreak of a "novel coronavirus" (known as COVID-19) was officially declared a pandemic by the World Health Organization (WHO). It is currently unknown what direct, or indirect, effect, if any, this event may have on the national economy, the local economy or the market in which the subject property is located. The reader is cautioned, and reminded that the conclusions presented in this appraisal report apply only as of the effective date(s) indicated. The appraiser makes no representation as to the effect on the subject property of this event, or any event, subsequent to the effective date of the appraisal.



## **Certification – Arthur L. Schwertz**

I certify that, to the best of my knowledge and belief:

- 1. The statements of fact contained in this report are true and correct.
- 2. The reported analyses, opinions, and conclusions are limited only by the reported assumptions and limiting conditions and are my personal, impartial, and unbiased professional analyses, opinions, and conclusions.
- 3. I have no present or prospective interest in the property that is the subject of this report and no personal interest with respect to the parties involved.
- 4. The undersigned Has not performed services regarding the property that is the subject of this report within the three-year period immediately preceding acceptance of this assignment.
- 5. I have no bias with respect to the property that is the subject of this report or to the parties involved with this assignment.
- 6. My engagement in this assignment was not contingent upon developing or reporting predetermined results.
- 7. My compensation for completing this assignment is not contingent upon the development or reporting of a predetermined value or direction in value that favors the cause of the client, the amount of value opinion, the attainment of a stipulated result, or the occurrence of a subsequent event directly related to the intended use of this appraisal.
- 8. My analyses, opinions and conclusions were developed, and this report has been prepared, in conformity with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice.
- 9. Arthur L. Schwertz did not personally inspected the subject property.
- 10. R. Carter Higdon provided significant real property appraisal assistance to the person signing this certification.
- 11. The reported analyses, opinions and conclusions were developed, and this report has been prepared, in conformity with the requirements of the Code of Professional Ethics and Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice of the Appraisal Institute.
- 12. The use of this report is subject to the requirements of the Appraisal Institute relating to review by its duly authorized representatives.
- 13. As of the date of this report, the undersigned has completed the continuing education program for Designated Members of the Appraisal Institute.

Arthur L. Schwertz, MAI Senior Managing Director Kentucky Certified General Real Property Appraiser #5470



HERRINGTON HAVEN WASTE WATER CERTIFICATION
HERRINGTON HAVEN WASTE WATER ADDENDA



# Addenda

Glossary

Qualifications

• Arthur L. Schwertz, MAI - Senior Managing Director

Information on Valbridge Property Advisors

Office Locations



# Glossary

Definitions are taken from The Dictionary of Real Estate Appraisal, 6<sup>th</sup> Edition (Dictionary), the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP), and Building Owners and Managers Association International (BOMA).

# Absolute Net Lease

A lease in which the tenant pays all expenses including structural maintenance, building reserves, and management; often a long-term lease to a credit tenant. (Dictionary)

# Amortization

The process of retiring a debt or recovering a capital investment, typically through scheduled, systematic repayment of the principal; a program of periodic contributions to a sinking fund or debt retirement fund. (Dictionary)

# As Is Market Value

The estimate of the market value of real property in its current physical condition, use, and zoning as of the appraisal date. (Dictionary)

#### Base Rent

The minimum rent stipulated in a lease. (Dictionary)

#### Base Year

The year on which escalation clauses in a lease are based. (Dictionary)

# **Building Common Area**

In office buildings, the areas of the building that provide services to building tenants but which are not included in the office area or store area of any specific tenant. These areas may include, but shall not be limited to, main and auxiliary lobbies, atrium spaces at the level of the finished floor, concierge areas or security desks, conference rooms, lounges or vending areas, food service facilities, health or fitness centers, daycare facilities, locker or shower facilities, mail rooms, fire control rooms, fully enclosed courtyards outside the exterior walls, and building core and service areas such as fully enclosed mechanical or equipment rooms. Specifically excluded from building common area are floor common areas, parking space, portions of loading docks outside the building line, and major vertical penetrations. (BOMA)

# **Building Rentable Area**

The sum of all floor rentable areas. Floor rentable area is the result of subtracting from the gross measured area of a floor the major vertical penetrations on that same floor. It is generally fixed for the life of the building and is rarely affected by changes in corridor size or configuration. (BOMA)

# **Bulk Value**

The value of multiple units, subdivided plots, or properties in a portfolio as though sold together in a single transaction.

# Certificate of Occupancy (COO)

A formal written acknowledgment by an appropriate unit of local government that a new construction or renovation project is at the stage where it meets applicable health and safety codes and is ready for commercial or residential occupancy. (Dictionary)

# Common Area Maintenance (CAM)

The expense of operating and maintaining common areas; may or may not include management charges and usually does not include capital expenditures on tenant improvements or other improvements to the property. (Dictionary)

The amount of money charged to tenants for their shares of maintaining a [shopping] center's common area. The charge that a tenant pays for shared services and facilities such as electricity, security, and maintenance of parking lots. Items charged to common area maintenance may include cleaning services, parking lot sweeping and maintenance, snow removal, security and upkeep. (ICSC – International Council of Shopping Centers, 4<sup>th</sup> Ed.)

# Condominium

A multiunit structure, or a unit within such a structure, with a condominium form of ownership. (Dictionary)

# **Conservation Easement**

An interest in real estate restricting future land use to preservation, conservation, wildlife habitat, or some combination of those uses. A conservation easement may permit farming, timber harvesting, or other uses of a rural nature as well as some types of conservation-oriented development to continue, subject to the easement. (Dictionary)

# Contributory Value

A type of value that reflects the amount a property or component of a property contributes to the value of another asset or to the property as a whole.

The change in the value of a property as a whole, whether positive or negative, resulting from the addition or deletion of a property component. Also called deprival value in some countries. (Dictionary)



# Debt Coverage Ratio (DCR)

The ratio of net operating income to annual debt service (DCR = NOI/Im), which measures the relative ability of a property to meet its debt service out of net operating income; also called *debt service coverage ratio (DSCR)*. A larger *DCR* typically indicates a greater ability for a property to withstand a reduction of income, providing an improved safety margin for a lender. (Dictionary)

# **Deed Restriction**

A provision written into a deed that limits the use of land. Deed restrictions usually remain in effect when title passes to subsequent owners. (Dictionary)

#### Depreciation

In appraisal, a loss in property value from any cause; the difference between the cost of an improvement on the effective date of the appraisal and the market value of the improvement on the same date.

In accounting, an allocation of the original cost of an asset, amortizing the cost over the asset's life; calculated using a variety of standard techniques. (Dictionary)

# **Disposition Value**

The most probable price that a specified interest in property should bring under the following conditions:

- Consummation of a sale within a specified time, which is shorter than the typical exposure time for such a property in that market.
- The property is subjected to market conditions prevailing as of the date of valuation;
- Both the buyer and seller are acting prudently and knowledgeably;
- The seller is under compulsion to sell;
- The buyer is typically motivated;
- Both parties are acting in what they consider to be their best interests;
- An adequate marketing effort will be made during the exposure time;
- Payment will be made in cash in U.S. dollars (or the local currency) or in terms of financial arrangements comparable thereto; and
- The price represents the normal consideration for the property sold, unaffected by special or creative financing or sales concessions granted by anyone associated with the sale. (Dictionary)

# Double Net (Net Net) Lease

An alternative term for a type of net lease. In some markets, a net net lease is defined as a lease in which the tenant is responsible to pay both property taxes and premiums for insuring the building(s). (Valbridge) (The market definition of a double net lease varies depending on the market)

# Easement

The right to use another's land for a stated purpose. (Dictionary)

# EIFS

Exterior Insulation Finishing System. This is a type of exterior wall cladding system. Sometimes referred to as dry-vit.

# Effective Date

The date on which the appraisal or review opinion applies. (SVP)

In a lease document, the date upon which the lease goes into effect. (Dictionary)

# Effective Gross Income (EGI)

The anticipated income from all operations of the real estate after an allowance is made for vacancy and collection losses and an addition is made for any other income. (Dictionary)

# **Effective Rent**

Total base rent, or minimum rent stipulated in a lease, over the specified lease term minus rent concessions; the rent that is effectively paid by a tenant net of financial concessions provided by a landlord. (TIs). (Dictionary)

# EPDM

Ethylene Propylene Diene Monomer Rubber. A type of synthetic rubber typically used for roof coverings. (Dictionary)

# **Escalation Clause**

A clause in an agreement that provides for the adjustment of a price or rent based on some event or index. e.g., a provision to increase rent if operating expenses increase; also called *escalator clause, expense recovery clause or stop clause.* (Dictionary)

# **Estoppel Certificate**

A signed statement by a party (such as a tenant or a mortgagee) certifying, for another's benefit, that certain facts are correct, such as that a lease exists, that there are no defaults, and that rent is paid to a certain date. (Black's) In real estate, a buyer of rental property typically requests estoppel certificates from existing tenants. Sometimes referred to as an *estoppel letter*. (Dictionary)

# **Excess Land**

Land that is not needed to serve or support the existing use. The highest and best use of the excess land may or may not be the same as the highest and best use of the improved parcel. Excess land has the potential to be sold separately and is valued separately. (Dictionary)



# **Excess Rent**

The amount by which contract rent exceeds market rent at the time of the appraisal; created by a lease favorable to the landlord (lessor) and may reflect unusual management, unknowledgeable or unusually motivated parties, a lease execution in an earlier, stronger rental market, or an agreement of the parties. (Dictionary)

#### **Expense Stop**

A clause in a lease that limits the landlord's expense obligation, which results in the lessee paying operating expenses above a stated level or amount. (Dictionary)

#### **Exposure Time**

The time a property remains on the market. The estimated length of time that the property interest being appraised would have been offered on the market prior to the hypothetical consummation of a sale at market value on the effective date of the appraisal;

**<u>Comment</u>:** Exposure time is a retrospective opinion based on an analysis of past events assuming a competitive and open market. (Dictionary)

# Extraordinary Assumption

An assignment-specific assumption as of the effective date regarding uncertain information used in an analysis which, if found to be false, could alter the appraiser's opinions or conclusions.

**Comment:** Uncertain information might include physical, legal, or economic characteristics of the subject property; or conditions external to the property, such as market conditions or trends; or the integrity of data used in an analysis. (USPAP)

# Fee Simple Estate

Absolute ownership unencumbered by any other interest or estate, subject only to the limitations imposed by the governmental powers of taxation, eminent domain, police power, and escheat. (Dictionary)

#### Floor Common Area

In an office building, the areas on a floor such as washrooms, janitorial closets, electrical rooms, telephone rooms, mechanical rooms, elevator lobbies, and public corridors which are available primarily for the use of tenants on that floor. (BOMA)

# Full Service (Gross) Lease

A lease in which the landlord receives stipulated rent and is obligated to pay all of the property's operating and fixed expenses; also called a *full service lease*. (Dictionary)

#### Furniture, Fixtures, and Equipment (FF&E)

Business trade fixtures and personal property, exclusive of inventory. (Dictionary)

# Going-Concern Value

An outdated label for the market value of all the tangible and intangible assets of an established and operating business with an indefinite life, as if sold in aggregate; more accurately termed the *market value of the going concern* or *market value of the total assets of the business*. (Dictionary)

# Gross Building Area (GBA)

Total floor area of a building, excluding unenclosed areas, measured from the exterior of the walls of the abovegrade area. This includes mezzanines and basements if and when typically included in the market area of the type of property involved.

#### Gross leasable area plus all common areas.

For residential space, the total area of all floor levels measured from the exterior of the walls and including the superstructure and substructure basement; typically does not include garage space. (Dictionary)

# Gross Measured Area

The total area of a building enclosed by the dominant portion (the portion of the inside finished surface of the permanent outer building wall which is 50 percent or more of the vertical floor-to-ceiling dimension, at the given point being measured as one moves horizontally along the wall), excluding parking areas and loading docks (or portions of same) outside the building line. It is generally not used for leasing purposes and is calculated on a floor by floor basis. (BOMA)

# Gross Up Method

A method of calculating variable operating expenses in income-producing properties when less than 100% occupancy is assumed. Expenses reimbursed based on the amount of occupied space, rather than on the total building area, are described as "grossed up." (Dictionary)

# **Gross Retail Sellout**

The sum of the separate and distinct market value opinions for each of the units in a condominium, subdivision development, or portfolio of properties, as of the date of valuation. The aggregate of retail values does not represent the value of all the units as though sold together in a single transaction; it is simply the total of the individual market value conclusions. Also called the aggregate of the retail values, aggregate retail selling price or sum of the retail values. (Dictionary)

#### Ground Lease

A lease that grants the right to use and occupy land. Improvements made by the ground lessee typically revert to the ground lessor at the end of the lease term. (Dictionary)



# Ground Rent

The rent paid for the right to use and occupy land according to the terms of a ground lease; the portion of the total rent allocated to the underlying land. (Dictionary)

# HVAC

Heating, ventilation, air conditioning (HVAC) system. A unit that regulates the temperature and distribution of heat and fresh air throughout a building. (Dictionary)

#### Highest and Best Use

The reasonably probable use of property that results in the highest value. The four criteria that the highest and best use must meet are legal permissibility, physical possibility, financial feasibility, and maximum productivity.

The use of an asset that maximizes its potential and that is possible, legally permissible, and financially feasible. The highest and best use may be for continuation of an asset's existing use of for some alternative use. This is determined by the use that a market participant would have in mind for the asset when formulating the price that it would be willing to bid. (IVS)

[The] highest and most profitable use for which the property is adaptable and needed or likely to be needed in the reasonably near future. (Uniform Appraisal Standards for Federal Land Acquisitions) (Dictionary)

# Hypothetical Condition

A condition, directly related to a specific assignment, which is contrary to what is known by the appraiser to exist on the effective date of the assignment results, but is used for the purpose of analysis.

**Comment:** Hypothetical conditions are contrary to known facts about physical, legal, or economic characteristics of the subject property; or about conditions external to the property, such as market conditions or trends; or about the integrity of data used in an analysis. (USPAP)

# Insurable Value

A type of value for insurance purposes. (Typically this includes replacement cost less basement excavation, foundation, underground piping and architect's fees). (Dictionary)

#### Investment Value

The value of a property to a particular investor or class of investors based on the investor's specific requirements. Investment value may be different from market value because it depends on a set of investment criteria that are not necessarily typical of the market. (Dictionary)

# Just Compensation

In condemnation, the amount of loss for which a property owner is compensated when his or her property is taken. Just compensation should put the owner in as good a position pecuniarily as he or she would have been if the property had not been taken. (Dictionary)

#### Leased Fee Interest

The ownership interest held by the lessor, which includes the right to receive the contract rent specified in the lease plus the reversionary right when the lease expires. (Dictionary)

#### Leasehold Interest

The right held by the lessee to use and occupy real estate for a stated term and under the conditions specified in the lease. (Dictionary)

See also Positive Leasehold and Negative Leasehold.

#### Lessee (Tenant)

One who has the right to occupancy and use of the property of another for a period of time according to a lease agreement. (Dictionary)

#### Lessor (Landlord)

One who conveys the rights of occupancy and use to others under a lease agreement. (Dictionary)

# Liquidation Value

The most probable price that a specified interest in property should bring under the following conditions:

- Consummation of a sale within a short time period.
- The property is subjected to market conditions prevailing as of the date of valuation.
- Both the buyer and seller are acting prudently and knowledgeably.
- The seller is under extreme compulsion to sell.
- The buyer is typically motivated.
- Both parties are acting in what they consider to be their best interests.
- A normal marketing effort is not possible due to the brief exposure time.
- Payment will be made in cash in U.S. dollars (or the local currency) or in terms of financial arrangements comparable thereto.

The price represents the normal consideration for the property sold, unaffected by special or creative financing or sales concessions granted by anyone associated with the sale. (Dictionary)



# Loan to Value Ratio (LTV)

The ratio between a mortgage loan and the value of the property pledged as security, usually expressed as a percentage. (Dictionary)

# **Major Vertical Penetrations**

Stairs, elevator shafts, flues, pipe shafts, vertical ducts, and the like, and their enclosing walls. Atria, lightwells and similar penetrations above the finished floor are included in this definition. Not included, however, are vertical penetrations built for the private use of a tenant occupying office areas on more than one floor. Structural columns, openings for vertical electric cable or telephone distribution, and openings for plumbing lines are not considered to be major vertical penetrations. (BOMA)

# Market Rent

The most probable rent that a property should bring in a competitive and open market under all the conditions requisite to a fair lease transaction, the lessee and the lessor each acting prudently and knowledgeably, and assuming the rent is not affected by undue stimulus. Implicit in this definition is the execution of a lease as of a specified date under conditions whereby:

Lessee and lessor are typically motivated;

Both parties are well informed or well advised, and acting in what they consider their best interests;

Payment is made in terms of cash or in terms of financial arrangements comparable thereto; and

The rent reflects specified terms and conditions, such as permitted uses, use restrictions, expense obligations, duration, concessions, rental adjustments and revaluations, renewal and purchase options, and tenant improvements (TIs). (Appraisal Institute)

# Market Value

The most probable price that a property should bring in a competitive and open market under all conditions requisite to a fair sale, the buyer and seller each acting prudently and knowledgeably, and assuming the price is not affected by undue stimulus. Implicit in this definition is the consummation of a sale as of a specified date and the passing of title from seller to buyer under conditions whereby:

- Buyer and seller are typically motivated;
- Both parties are well informed or well advised, and acting in what they consider their own best interests;
- A reasonable time is allowed for exposure in the open market;
- Payment is made in terms of cash in United States dollars or in terms of financial arrangements comparable thereto; and
- The price represents the normal consideration for the property sold unaffected by special or creative

financing or sales concessions granted by anyone associated with the sale. (Dictionary)

# Marketing Time

An opinion of the amount of time it might take to sell a real or personal property interest at the concluded market value level during the period immediately after the effective date of an appraisal. Marketing time differs from exposure time, which is always presumed to precede the effective date of an appraisal. (Advisory Opinion 7 of the Appraisal Standards Board of the Appraisal Foundation)

# Master Lease

A lease in which the fee owner leases a part or the entire property to a single entity (the master lease) in return for a stipulated rent. The master lessee then leases the property to multiple tenants. (Dictionary)

# **Modified Gross Lease**

A lease in which the landlord receives stipulated rent and is obligated to pay some, but not all, of the property's operating and fixed expenses. Since assignment of expenses varies among modified gross leases, expense responsibility must always be specified. In some markets, a modified gross lease may be called a *double net lease*, *net net lease*, *partial net lease*, *or semi-gross lease*. (Dictionary)

# Negative Leasehold

A lease situation in which the market rent is less than the contract rent. (Dictionary)

# **Operating Expense Ratio**

The ratio of total operating expenses to effective gross income (TOE/EGI); the complement of the net income ratio, i.e., OER = 1 - NIR (Dictionary)

# Option

A legal contract, typically purchased for a stated consideration, that permits but does not require the holder of the option (known as the *optionee*) to buy, sell, or lease real estate for a stipulated period of time in accordance with specified terms; a unilateral right to exercise a privilege. (Dictionary)

# **Partial Interest**

Divided or undivided rights in real estate that represent less than the whole, i.e., a fractional interest such as a tenancy in common, easement, or life interest. (Dictionary)

# Pass Through

A tenant's portion of operating expenses that may be composed of common area maintenance (CAM), real property taxes, property insurance, and any other expenses determined in the lease agreement to be paid by the tenant. (Dictionary)



#### Percentage Lease

A lease in which the rent or some portion of the rent represents a specified percentage of the volume of business, productivity, or use achieved by the tenant. (Dictionary)

# **Positive Leasehold**

A lease situation in which the market rent is greater than the contract rent. (Dictionary)

#### Potential Gross Income (PGI)

The total income attributable to property at full occupancy before vacancy and operating expenses are deducted. (Dictionary)

# Prospective Future Value Upon Completion

A prospective market value may be appropriate for the valuation of a property interest related to a credit decision for a proposed development or renovation project. According to USPAP, an appraisal with a prospective market value reflects an effective date that is subsequent to the date of the appraisal report. ... The prospective market value –as completed- reflects the property's market value as of the time that development is expected to be complete. (Dictionary)

#### Prospective Future Value Upon Stabilization

A prospective market value may be appropriate for the valuation of a property interest related to a credit decision for a proposed development or renovation project. According to USPAP, an appraisal with a prospective market value reflects an effective date that is subsequent to the date of the appraisal report ...The prospective market value – as stabilized – reflects the property's market value as of the time the property is projected to achieve stabilized occupancy. For an income-producing property, stabilized occupancy is the occupancy level that a property is expected to achieve after the property is exposed to the market for lease over a reasonable period of time and at comparable terms and conditions to other similar properties. (Dictionary)

#### Replacement Cost

The estimated cost to construct, at current prices as of a specific date, a substitute for a building or other improvements, using modern materials and current standards, design, and layout. (Dictionary)

#### **Reproduction Cost**

The estimated cost to construct, at current prices as of the effective date of the appraisal, an exact duplicate or replica of the building being appraised, using the same materials, construction standards, design, layout, and quality of workmanship and embodying all of the deficiencies, superadequacies, and obsolescence of the subject building. (Dictionary)

# **Retrospective Value Opinion**

A value opinion effective as of a specified historical date. The term *retrospective* does not define a type of value. Instead, it identifies a value opinion as being effective at some specific prior date. Value as of a historical date is frequently sought in connection with property tax appeals, damage models, lease renegotiation, deficiency judgments, estate tax, and condemnation. Inclusion of the type of value with this term is appropriate, e.g., "retrospective market value opinion." (Dictionary)

# Sandwich Leasehold Estate

The interest held by the sandwich leaseholder when the property is subleased to another party; a type of leasehold estate. (Dictionary)

# Sublease

An agreement in which the lessee in a prior lease conveys the right of use and occupancy of a property to another, the sublessee, for a specific period of time, which may or may not be coterminous with the underlying lease term. (Dictionary)

# Subordination

A contractual arrangement in which a party with a claim to certain assets agrees to make his or her claim junior, or subordinate, to the claims of another party. (Dictionary)

#### Surplus Land

Land that is not currently needed to support the existing use but cannot be separated from the property and sold off for another use. Surplus land does not have an independent highest and best use and may or may not contribute value to the improved parcel. (Dictionary)

# TPO

Thermoplastic polyolefin, a resilient synthetic roof covering.

#### Triple Net (Net Net Net) Lease

An alternative term for a type of net lease. In some markets, a net net net lease is defined as a lease in which the tenant assumes all expenses (fixed and variable) of operating a property except that the landlord is responsible for structural maintenance, building reserves, and management; also called *NNN lease, net net net lease, or fully net lease.* (Dictionary)

(The market definition of a triple net lease varies; in some cases tenants pay for items such as roof repairs, parking lot repairs, and other similar items.)

# Usable Area

The measured area of an office area, store area, or building common area on a floor. The total of all the usable areas for a floor shall equal floor usable area of that same floor. (BOMA)



# Value-in-Use

The value of a property assuming a specific use, which may or may not be the property's highest and best use on the effective date of the appraisal. Value in use may or may not be equal to market value but is different conceptually. (Dictionary)

# VTAB

Value of the Total Assets of a Business. The value of a going concern (i.e. the business enterprise). (Dictionary)



HERRINGTON HAVEN WASTE WATER ADDENDA



Qualifications

HERRINGTON HAVEN WASTE WATER ADDENDA



# HERRINGTON HAVEN WASTE WATER ADDENDA

# Qualifications of Arthur L. Schwertz, MAI Senior Managing Director Valbridge Property Advisors | South Louisiana

# Independent Valuations for a Variable World

State Certifications
Certified General in:
Louisiana
Mississippi
Alabama
Texas
Virginia
California
Arizona
Kentucky
Tennessee
North Carolina
Maryland

# Education

Bachelor of Arts History Louisiana State University

# **Contact Details**

504-541-5101 (p) 504-541-5107 (f) <u>aschwertz@valbridge.com</u> (e)

Valbridge Property Advisors | South Louisiana 2030 Dickory Avenue Suite 200 New Orleans, LA 70123

www.valbridge.com/south-louisiana

	a man	
	-	
	1×	
	27	
1		11

	Membership/Affiliations
	Member: Appraisal Institute – MAI Designation
	Louisiana Chapter President, 2017
	Member: Celebration Church Administrative Team (Corporate Secretary)
	Appraisal Institute & Related Courses Continuing education courses taken through the Appraisal Institute and other real estate organizations.
	Publications, Seminars Presented, etc.
	"Contract or Effective Rent: Finding the Real Rent", Appraisal Institute, Austin, Texas, 2019.
	"Contract or Effective Rent: Finding the Real Rent", Appraisal Institute, Baton Rouge, Louisiana, 2016.
	"Appraising Commercial and Complex Properties in an Historic Area", Webinar for the Appraisal Institute, 2015.
	"The Unique Appraisal: Case Studies in Appraising Special Purpose Properties", Al Connect 2014 (Appraisal Institute's National Meeting), Austin, Texas, 2014.
ty	Schwertz, Arthur L. 2014. "History Lesson", <i>Valuation Magazine 2<sup>nd</sup> Quarter, 2014</i> , 12 – 13.
	Huso, Deborah R. 2013. "On the Waterfront", <i>Valuation Magazine 2<sup>nd</sup> Quarter, 2013,</i> 22 – 27. (Contributor)
	Experience

Senior Managing Director Valbridge Property Advisors | South Louisiana (2013-Present)

Vice-President Argote, Derbes, Graham, Shuffield & Tatje, Inc. (1992-2013)

Appraisal/valuation and consulting assignments include (but not limited to): Single-family, condominium, apartments, vacant land, funeral homes, amphitheaters, live performance theaters, office buildings, hospitals, nursing homes, specialized healthcare, hotels/motels, service stations, retail, industrial plants, warehouses, fractional interest valuations, contaminated properties, special purpose properties (port facilities, nuclear reactor simulator facility, shipyards, etc.), senior residential and healthcare facilities, feasibility studies, market studies, condemnation, construction defects, litigation support, mediations, and review appraisals.

Mr. Schwertz has provided valuation services in a wide variety of complex civil litigation including real estate, land use cases, condemnation, estate matters, property taxation, construction defect, and bankruptcy/creditors matters.

Qualified as an expert witness in Terrebonne, Jefferson, Orleans, and St. Tammany Parishes, Dallas County, Texas, Indiana Board of Tax Review, United States Court of Federal Claims, United States Court for the Eastern District of Louisiana and the United States Bankruptcy Court for the Middle District of Louisiana.



# ARTHUR L. SCHWERTZ, MAI

# Designations, Associations and Professional Awards

- Louisiana Certified General Real Estate Appraiser; License No. G-0932
- Mississippi Certified General Real Estate Appraiser; License No. GA-633
- Alabama Certified General Real Estate Appraiser; License No. G00937
- Texas Certified General Real Estate Appraiser, License No. TX-1337393-G
- California Certified General Real Estate Appraiser, License No. 3005682
- Virginia Certified General Real Estate Appraiser, License No. 400101572
- Arizona Certified General Real Estate Appraiser, License No. 1003038
- North Carolina Certified General Real Estate Appraiser, License No. A8506
- Tennessee Certified General Real Estate Appraiser, License No. 5810
- Kentucky Certified General Real Estate Appraiser, License No. 5470
- Maryland Certified General Real Estate Appraiser, License No. 40034070
- Member of the Appraisal Institute, MAI Certificate No. 12678
- Instructor of the Appraisal Institute
- Secretary, Louisiana Chapter of the Appraisal Institute, 2014
- Treasurer, Louisiana Chapter of the Appraisal Institute, 2015
- Vice-President, Louisiana Chapter of the Appraisal Institute, 2016
- President, Louisiana Chapter of the Appraisal Institute, 2017

#### **Civic Organizations**

- 1982 Eagle Scout, Boy Scouts of America
- 1983 Vigil Honor Member, Order of the Arrow, Boy Scouts of America
- 1999 2001 Board of Directors, Berean Bible Church, New Orleans, Louisiana
- 2000 2001 Treasurer, Berean Bible Church, New Orleans, Louisiana
- 2008 2010 School Board Chairman, Crescent City Christian School, Metairie, Louisiana.
- 2008 Present Board of Directors, Celebration Church, Metairie, Louisiana
- 2010 Present Corporate Secretary, Celebration Church, Metairie, Louisiana



# ARTHUR L. SCHWERTZ, MAI

# Expert Witness Experience

- Expert Witness, United States Court of Federal Claims
- Expert Witness, United States Bankruptcy Court, Middle and Eastern Districts of Louisiana
- Expert Witness, United States Federal Court, Eastern District of Louisiana
- Expert Witness, Civil District Court for the Parish of Orleans, State of Louisiana.
- Expert Witness, State Civil District Court, Dallas County, State of Texas.
- Expert Witness, Louisiana Tax Commission
- Expert Witness, Circuit Court for the City of Norfolk, Virginia
- Expert Witness, 9<sup>th</sup> JDC, 23<sup>rd</sup> JDC and 32<sup>nd</sup> JDC, State of Louisiana
- Expert Witness, Indiana Board of Tax Review, State of Indiana

# **Court Testimony**

2020	GIV Green Tree Mall Investor, LLC v. Clark County Assessor, Petition Nos. 10-011-17-1-4-02088-17, 10-011-18-1-4-00149-20 and 10-011-19-1-4-00150-20, Indiana Board of Tax Review, State of Indiana.
2020	Low Land Investors, LLC, Low Land Construction Co., Inc. v. New Generation Shipbuilding, LLC, Case No. 180743, 32 <sup>nd</sup> Judicial District for Terrebonne Parish, State of Louisiana (Deposition/Testimony)
2020	Cella III, LLC v. Jefferson Parish Hospital District No. 2, Civil Action No. EDLA 19-11528, Bankruptcy No. 19-01145, United States District Court for the Eastern District of Louisiana (Deposition/Testimony)
2020	Elizabeth Sewell, et al v. Sewerage & Water Board of New Orleans, Docket No. 15-4501, Division D- 12, Civil District Court, Parish of Orleans, State of Louisiana (Deposition)
2019	Virginia Natural Gas, Inc. v. Colonna's Ship Yard, Incorporated, Case No. CL18-2169, Circuit Court for the City of Norfolk, State of Virginia (Deposition)
2018	Jeannette C. Liebman, Wife of/and Paul E. Ramoni, Jr. v. The United States, Docket No. 14-1165, United States Court of Federal Claims (Testimony)
2016	Appeal of Filmore Parc Apartments v. Orleans Parish Board of Review, Docket Nos. 16-22173-001 and 16-22173-002, Louisiana Tax Commission, State of Louisiana. (Testimony)
2016	Appeal of Fulton Development (Harrah's Hotel) v. Orleans Parish Board of Review, Docket No. 16- 22171-002, Louisiana Tax Commission, State of Louisiana (Testimony)
2016	Jeannette C. Liebman and Paul E. Ramoni, Jr. v. United States of America, Case No. 14-1165 L, United States Court of Federal Claims (Deposition)
2016	State of Louisiana, Department of Transportation & Development v. Northport Properties Partnership, Et Al, Docket No. 233,894, 9 <sup>th</sup> Judicial District, Parish of Rapides, State of Louisiana (Deposition)
2015	Appeal of Filmore Parc Apartments v. Orleans Parish Board of Review, Docket Nos. 15-22173-018 and 15-22173-019, Louisiana Tax Commission, State of Louisiana. (Testimony)



# ARTHUR L. SCHWERTZ, MAI

# Court Testimony (Continued)

2015 Doretha Z. Walker et al vs. AMID/Metro Partnership, LLC and City of New Orleans, Docket No. 07-14794, Division H-14, Civil District Court for the Parish of Orleans, State of Louisiana. (Testimony) Sandra Oubre Sotile, Et Al vs Dooley Oubre, Et Al, Docket No. 110,622, 23rd Judicial District Court, 2015 Ascension Parish, Louisiana (Deposition) 2014 North Shore Lodging, LLC vs Commonwealth Land Title Insurance Company, Case No. 2:2013cv06070, United States Court for the Eastern District of Louisiana (Deposition) 2014 Appeal of Filmore Parc Apartments v. Orleans Parish Board of Review, Docket Nos. 14-22173-003 and 14-22173-004, Louisiana Tax Commission, State of Louisiana. (Testimony) 2014 State Bank of Texas vs. Granbury Hospitality Inc., et al, Cause No. DC-12-06398, 44th State Civil District Court, Dallas County, State of Texas. (Testimony) 2013 Bruce L. Feingerts v Succession of Doris Feingerts, et al, Adversary Proceeding No. 2011-9918, Civil District Court for the Parish of Orleans, State of Louisiana. (Testimony) 2012 Consolidated Cases of Percy J. Marchand versus Entergy New Orleans, Inc., Docket No. 2009-12695 AND Omar Duncan, Et Al, vs. Entergy New Orleans, Inc., Docket No. 2010-0714 AND Leroy Anthony Vignaud versus Entergy New Orleans, Inc. Docket No. 2010-5566, Division "C" of the Civil District Court for the Parish of Orleans, State of Louisiana. (Deposition) 2011 Pleasant View Development, LLC v Charles Anthony Bonaventure, Gina Bonaventure Porciau, Charles R. St. Romain, and Patin Engineers and Surveyors, Inc., Adversary Proceeding No. 10-1024, United States Bankruptcy Court, Middle District of Louisiana (Testimony) 2011 1522 R.E. Lee Blvd., LLC v. Bank of New Orleans, Civil District Court for the Parish of Orleans, State of Louisiana (Deposition)

# Partial List of Appraisal Assignments Completed

#### Water and Wastewater Systems

Resolve Water, Slidell, LA

Coast Water, Slidell, LA

H20 Water and Wastewater, St. Tammany Parish, LA

Mo-Dad Utilities, Tangipahoa, Livingston, West Baton Rouge, East Baton Rouge and West Feliciana Parishes, LA

Scientific System, Jacksonville, NC

Center Ridge System, Murray, KY

Blue Creek Utilities, Jacksonville, NC

Delaplain Utilities, Georgetown, KY

River Bluff Wastewater System, River Bluff, KY

#### <u>Major Retail</u>

Green Tree Mall (±443,933 square feet), Clarksville, IN Northshore Square Mall (±621,192 square feet), Slidell, LA The Shoppes at Fremaux (±600,000 square feet), Slidell, LA Slidell Factory Outlet Mall, Slidell, LA Southland Mall (±600,000 square feet), Houma, LA The Plaza (±1,200,000 square feet), New Orleans, LA Belle Promenade (±750,000 square feet), Marrero, LA Jax Brewery, New Orleans, LA River Marketplace Shopping Center, Lafayette, LA Natchez Mall (±268,857 square feet), Natchez, MS Bradley Square Mall (568,508 square feet), Cleveland, TN



# ARTHUR L. SCHWERTZ, MAI

# Partial List of Appraisal Assignments Completed (Continued)

#### **Healthcare**

Gilchrist at Stadium Place, Baltimore, MD Savoy Medical Center, Mamou, LA Methodist Hospital, New Orleans, LA Lakeland Hospital, New Orleans, LA Shriner's Hospital, New Orleans, LA Fairway Surgical Hospital, Covington, LA Southpark Hospital, Lafayette, LA St. James Parish Hospital, St. James, LA Green Clinic and Surgery Center, Ruston, LA Numerous Nursing Homes throughout Louisiana Lambeth House Assisted Living, New Orleans, LA O'Connor Hospital, San Jose, CA St. Louise Regional Medical Center, Gilroy, CA St. Vincent Medical Center, Los Angeles, CA Rosewood Assisted Living Facility, Charlottesville, VA

#### Industrial

Colonna's Shipyard, Norfolk, VA Signal International Shipyard, Orange, TX Signal International Shipyard, Mobile, AL Signal International Shipyard, Port Arthur, TX Signal International Shipyard, Pascagoula, MS Bender Shipyard, Mobile, AL Plastic Infusion Plant, Hammond, LA UBT Coal Transfer Facility, Davant, LA Trinity Yachts, Gulfport, MS Trinity Yachts, New Orleans, LA Coca-Cola Facility, Thibodaux, LA LaShip Shipyard, Houma, LA Dow Chemical Plant, Norco, LA Port of St. Bernard, St. Bernard, LA Owensboro Riverport, Owensboro, KY Toulouse Street Wharf, Port of New Orleans, LA Mississippi River Dock, Venice, LA Port of Iberia, New Iberia, LA. Kaiser Site, Port of Greater Baton Rouge, LA

Proposed Port of Cameron, Cameron, LA Union Tank Car Plant, Alexandria, LA

#### Entertainment/Leisure

Dixie Landing Amusement Park, Baton Rouge, LA Blue Bayou Water Park, Baton Rouge, LA Proposed Aqualand Water Park, Dayton, TX Saenger Theatre, New Orleans, LA Orpheum Theatre, New Orleans, LA Vina Robles Amphitheatre, Paso Robles, CA House of Blues, New Orleans, LA The Oaks Golf Course, Pass Christian, MS Money Hill Golf Course, Abita Springs, LA Pelican Pointe Golf Course, Gonzales, LA Colonial Country Club, Harahan, LA O'Neal Theatres, Louisiana/Mississippi Antoine's Restaurant, New Orleans, LA AMC Theatres, Metairie/Hammond/Houma, LA Southern Belle Casino, St. Francisville, LA Bayou Marina, Casino and Hotel, Chalmette, LA Lucky Deuces Casino, Greensburg, LA Lafitte Harbor Marina, Lafitte, LA Vinot Marina, New Orleans, LA River Highlands Marina, Ascension Parish, LA Kemper Marina, Gulfport, MS C and M Marina, Lafitte, LA Cypress Cove Marina, Venice, LA Starlight Movie Studios, New Orleans, LA Schools Clifton L. Ganus Academy, New Orleans, LA Mt. Carmel Academy, New Orleans, LA Israel Augustine School, New Orleans, LA Millerville Academy, Baton Rouge, LA Louise S. McGhee School, New Orleans, LA Stuart Hall Academy, New Orleans, LA

Believer's Life Academy, Marrero, LA

© 2022 VALBRIDGE PROPERTY ADVISORS | New Orleans



#### ARTHUR L. SCHWERTZ, MAI

#### Partial List of Appraisal Assignments Completed (Continued)

#### Special Purpose Properties

Nuclear Reactor Simulator Facility, St. Francisville, LA Statewide Economic Obsolescence Study for Hibernia Bank, State of Louisiana Mitigation Bank, St. James Parish, LA Mitigation Bank, Livingston Parish, LA Mitigation Bank, East Baton Rouge Parish, LA Elmer's Island, Jefferson Parish, LA USPS Facilities throughout Louisiana and Mississippi Multi-Family Shadowlake Apartments, Harvey, LA Citrus Creek Apartments, Harahan, LA Palmetto Creek Apartments, Harahan, LA The Reserve at Acadiana, Lafayette, LA Gravier Place Apartments, New Orleans, LA The Saulet Apartments, New Orleans, LA Town Oaks Apartments, Shreveport, LA

University Edge Apartments, Hattiesburg, MS Legacy Condominiums Phase I, Gulfport, MS Legacy Condominiums Phase II, Gulfport, MS South Beach Condominiums, Biloxi, MS

#### <u>Hotels</u>

Super 7 Motel, Lafayette, LA Harrah's Hotel, New Orleans, LA Candlewoods Suites Hotel, Houma, LA Candlewoods Suites Hotel, Lafayette, LA Hyatt House Hotel, Columbus, MS Hampton Inn, Harahan, LA Hampton Inn, Metairie, LA Hampton Inn Convention Center, New Orleans, LA Hampton Inn Uptown, New Orleans, LA Hampton Inn, Mobile, AL Courtyard by Marriott, Metairie, LA, Baton Rouge, Residence Inn, Metairie, LA Quality Inn, Opelousas, LA LaQuinta, Slidell, LA Historic French Market Inn, New Orleans, LA Wyndham Hotel, Metairie, LA Holiday Inn Superdome, New Orleans, LA Hilton Garden Inn, Kenner, LA Hilton Garden Inn LA Office Buildings Xerox Centre, Kenner, LA Park Tower, Lafayette, LA Former Stewart Enterprises Building, Metairie, LA First NBC Building, New Orleans, LA Executive Plaza, New Orleans, LA Chase Tower, Houma, LA Maison Blanche Building, New Orleans, LA Yenni Office Building, Harahan, LA Dominion Tower, New Orleans, LA Elmwood Tower, Harahan, LA Freeport-McMoran Building, New Orleans, LA Entergy Building, New Orleans, LA 1250 Poydras Building, New Orleans, LA **Subdivisions** Ashton Plantation, Luling, LA Acadiana Subdivision, Marrero, LA Acadian Villas, Marrero, LA The Arbors at English Turn, New Orleans, LA Plantation Acres, Thibodaux, LA Woodstone Subdivision, Mandeville, LA Southlake Villages, Kenner, LA Village Green Subdivision, Harvey, LA Oak Island Subdivision, New Orleans, LA

© 2022 VALBRIDGE PROPERTY ADVISORS | New Orleans



HERRINGTON HAVEN WASTE WATER ADDENDA



# FAST FACTS

# COMPANY INFORMATION

- Valbridge is the largest independent national commercial real estate valuation and advisory services firm in North America.
  - o Total number of MAI-designated appraisers: 200+ on staff
  - o Total number of office locations: 70+ across U.S.
  - Total number of staff: 675+ strong
- Valbridge covers the entire U.S. from coast to coast.
- Valbridge services all property types, including special-purpose properties.
- Valbridge provides independent valuation services. We are not owned by a brokerage firm or investment company.
- Every Valbridge office is led by a senior managing director who holds the MAI designation of the Appraisal Institute.
- Valbridge is owned by our local office leaders.
- Valbridge welcomes single-property assignments as well as portfolio, multi-market and other bulk-property engagements.

Valbridge Property Advisors, Inc. 2240 Venetian Court • Naples, FL 34109 • Phone: (888) 981-2029 www.valbridge.com





#### ALABAMA

4732 Woodmere Bou ulevard Montgomery, AL 36106 334.277.5077

200 Cahaba Park Circle Suite 213 Birmingham, AL 35242 205.440.2998

ARIZONA 6061 E. Grant Road Suite 121 Tucson, AZ 85712 520.321.0000

CALIFORNIA 4915 Calloway Drive Suite 101 Bakersfield CA 93312 661.587.1010

1370 N. Brea Boulevard Suite 255 Fullerton, CA 92835 714.449.0852

2813 Coffee Road Suite E-2 Modesto, CA 95355 209.569.0450

99 S. Lake Avenue Suite 21 Pasadena CA 91101 626.744.0428

3090 Fite Circle Suite 202 Sacramento, CA 95827 916.361.2509

55 South Market Street Suite 1210 San Jose, CA 95113 408.279.1520

1306 Higuera Street San Luis Obispo, CA 93401 805,544.2472

3160 Crow Canyon Place Suite 245 San Ramon, CA 94583 925.327.1660

COLORADO 7445 E. Peakview Av Centennial, CO 80111 303.443.9600

5345 Arapahoe Avenue Suite 7 Boulder, CO 80303 303 443 9600

23272 Two Rivers Road Unit 101 Basalt CO 81621 970.340,1016

1099 Main Avenue Suite 311 Durango, CO 81301 970.340.1016

CONNECTICUT 15 Concord Street Glastonbury, CT 06033 860,246,4606

17 Covewood Drive Norwalk, CT 06853 203.286.6520

CORPORATE OFFICE

FLORIDA 2240 Venetian Court Naples, FL 34109 239.514.4646

301 Almeria Avenue, Suite 350 Coral Gables, FL 33134 305,639,8029

10950 San Jose Boulevard

Jacksonville, FL 32223 844.822.7825 734 Rugby Street Orlando, FL 32804

2601 W Horatio Street Unit 6 Tampa, FL 33609 844.822.7825

844.822.7825

2711 Poinsettia Avenue West Palm Beach, FL 33407 561.833.5331

GEORGIA 2675 Paces Ferry Road Suite 145 Atlanta, GA 30339 678.644.4853

IDAHO 1459 Tyrell Lane Suite B Boise, ID 83706 208.336.1097

1875 N. Lakewood Drive Suite 100 Coeur d'Alene, ID 83814 208.292.2965

ILLINOIS 566 W. Lake Street Suite 240 Chicago, IL 60661 312.288.8687

INDIANA 820 Fort Wayne Avenue Indianapolis, IN 46204 317.687.2747

KANSAS 10990 Quivira Road Suite 100 Overland Park, KS 66210 913.451.1451

KENTUCKY 9000 Wessex Place Suite 306 Louisville, KY 40222 502.585.3651

LOUISIANA 2030 Dickory Avenue Suite 200 New Orleans, LA 70123 504.541.5100

MARYLAND 11100 Dovedale Court Marriottsville, MD 21104 443.333.5522

MASSACHUSETTS 260 Bear Hill Road Suite 106 Waltham MA 02451 781.790.5645

2240 Venetian Court Naples, FL 34109

MICHIGAN 1420 Washington Blvd. Suite 301 Detroit, MI 48226 313.986.3313.

MICHIGAN (cont'd) 2127 University Park Drive Suite 390 Okemos, MI 48864 517.336.0001

MINNESOTA 255 East Kellogg Boule Suite 102A St. Paul, MN 55101 651.370.1475

MISSISSIPPI 1010 Ford Street Gulfport, MS 39507

228.604.1900 737 Highway 51

Suite 1C Madison, MS 39110 601.853.0736

501 Highway 12 West Suite 150-M Starkville, MS 39759 662.617.2350

MISSOURI 1118 Hampton Aven

Suite 208 St Louis, MO 63139 314.255-1323

10990 Quivira Road Suite 100 Overland Park, KS 66210 913.451.1451

NEVADA 3034 S. Durango Drive Suite 100 Las Vegas, NV 89117 702 242 9369

6490 S McCarran Blvd #51 Reno, NV 89509 775.204.4100

NEW JERSEY 2740 Route 10 West, Suite 204 Morris Plains, NJ 07950 973.970.9333

3500 Route 9 South, Suite 202 Howell, NJ 07731 732.807.3113

NEW YORK 424 West 33rd Street Suite 630 New York, NY 10001 212.268.1113

NORTH CAROLINA 412 E. Chatham Street Cary, NC 27511 919.859.2666

5950 Fairview Road, Suite 405 Charlotte, NC 28210 704 376 5400

OHIO 1655 W, Market Street Suite 130 Akron, OH 44313 330,899,9900

239-325-8234 phone 239-325-8356 fax

OHIO (cont'd) 8291 Beechmont Ave. Suite B Cincinnati, OH 45255 513,785,0820

1422 Euclid Avenue Suite 616 Cleveland, OH 44115 216.367.9690

OKLAHOMA

5909 NW Expressway Suite 104 Oklahoma City, OK 73132 405.603.1553

6666 South Sheridan Road Suite 104 Tulsa, OK 74133 918.712.9992

PENNSYLVANIA 150 S. Warner Road Suite 440

King of Prussia, PA 19406 215.545.1900

4701 Baptist Road Suite 304 Pittsburgh, PA 15227 412.881.6080

SOUTH CAROLINA 11 Cleveland Court Greenville, SC 29607 864,233,6277

920 Bay Street Suite 26 Beaufort SC 29902 843.342.2302

1250 Fairmont Avenue ML Pleasant, SC 29464 843.881.1266

TENNESSEE 5205 Maryland Way Suite 300 Brentwood, TN 37027 615.369.0670

701 Broad Street Suite 209 Chattanooga, TN 37402

213 Fox Road Knoxville, TN 37922 865.522.2424

423.285.8435

756 Ridge Lake Blvd Suite 225

TEXAS 901 Mopac Expressway South Building 1, Suite 300 Austin TX 78746 737.242.8585

10210 North Central Expressway Suite 115 Dallas, TX 75231 214,446,1611

974 Campbell Road Suite 204 Houston, TX 77024 713.467.5858

2731 81st Street Lubbock, TX 79423 806.744.1188

TEXAS (cont'd) 9901 IH-10 West Suite 1035 San Antonio, TX 78230 210.227.6229

UTAH 321 North County Boulevard Unit D American Fork, UT 84003 801.492.9328

1100 East 6600 South Suite 201 Salt Lake City, UT 84121 801.262.3388

20 North Main Suite 304 St. George, UT 84770 435.773.6300

VIRGINIA Parkway 656 Indepe Suite 220 Chesapeake, VA 23320 757.410.1222

4914 Fitzhugh Avenue Suite 102 Richmond, VA 23230 757-345-0010

5107 Center Street Unit 2B Williamsburg, VA 23188 757.345.0010

#### WASHINGTON

8378 W. Grandridge Be Suite 110-D Kennewick, WA 99336 509.221.1540

25923 Washingon Blvd, NE Suite 300 Kingston, WA 98346 360.649.7300

324 N. Mullan Road Spokane Valley, WA 99206 509.747.0999

WISCONSIN 12660 W. North Avenue Brookfield, WI 53005

262.782.7990

Memphis, TN 38120 901.753.6977

Each Valbridge office is independently owned and operated. Case No. 2022-00432 Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8 Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 55 of 327

Spring 2021



# **Appraisal Report**

Darlington Creek HOA Darlington Creek Road and 12847 Sycamore Creek Drive Alexandria, Campbell County, Kentucky 41001

Report Date: 12-06-2021



# FOR:

Central States Water Resources Mr. Todd Thomas Vice-President 500 Northwest Plaza Drive, Suite 500 St. Ann, Missouri 63074

**Client Number:** 

# Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans

2030 Dickory Avenue, Suite 200 New Orleans, LA 70123 504.541.5100 phone 504.541.5107 fax *valbridge.com* 

Valbridge File Number: LA01-21-0352.000

Case No. 2022-00432 Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8 Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 56 of 327



2030 Dickory Avenue, Suite 200 New Orleans, LA 70123 504.541.5100 phone 504.541.5107 fax valbridge.com

12-06-2021

Arthur L. Schwertz MAI 504.541.5101 aschwertz@valbridge.com

Mr. Todd Thomas Vice-President Central States Water Resources 500 Northwest Plaza Drive, Suite 500 St. Ann, Missouri 63074

RE: Appraisal Report Darlington Creek HOA Darlington Creek Road and 12847 Sycamore Creek Drive Alexandria, Campbell County, Kentucky 41001

Dear Mr. Thomas:

In accordance with your request, we have performed an appraisal of the above referenced property. This appraisal report sets forth the pertinent data gathered, the techniques employed, and the reasoning leading to our value opinions. This letter of transmittal does not constitute an appraisal report and the rationale behind the value opinion(s) reported cannot be adequately understood without the accompanying appraisal report.

The subject property, as referenced above, is located in Darlington Creek Subdivision and is further identified as tax parcel numbers 999-99-30-086.98. The subject property consists of a total of 2.01-acres or 87,556-square-feet. Of the total, 1.16 acres are easements and 0.85 acres are fee simple area. The subject is the sewer system for Darlington Creek Subdivision.

We developed our analyses, opinions, and conclusions and prepared this report in conformity with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP) of the Appraisal Foundation; the Code of Professional Ethics and Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice of the Appraisal Institute; and the requirements of our client as we understand them.

The client in this assignment is Central States Water Resources and the intended user of this report is Central State Water Resources and no others. The sole intended use is for regulatory filings. The value opinions reported herein are subject to the definitions, assumptions, limiting conditions, and certifications contained in this report.



Mr. Todd Thomas Central States Water Resources Page 2

The findings and conclusions are further contingent upon the following extraordinary assumptions and/or hypothetical conditions, the use of which might have affected the assignment results:

# **Extraordinary Assumptions:**

• The appraiser was unable to locate any documents definitively specifying the location or width of the utility easements. However, a visual inspection of the neighborhood indicates the presence of sewer lines near the street frontage and it has been assumed for purposes of this analysis that they lie within a 10' utility easement.

# Hypothetical Conditions:

• This appraisal is predicated on the hypothetical condition that the property is unimproved and ready for development.

Based on the analysis contained in the following report, our value conclusions are summarized as follows:

Value Conclusions			
Component	As Is	As Is	
Value Type	Market Value	Market Value	
Property Rights Appraised	Easement	Fee Simple	
Effective Date of Value	December 2, 2021	December 2, 2021	
Value Conclusion	\$54,000	\$100,000	

Respectfully submitted, Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans

2

Arthur L. Schwertz, MAI Senior Managing Director Kentucky Certified General Real Property Appraiser #5470



# **Table of Contents**

Cover Page	
Letter of Transmittal	
Table of Contents	i
Summary of Salient Facts	ii
Aerial and Front Views	iv
Location Map	V
Introduction	1
Scope of Work	4
City and Neighborhood Analysis	6
Site Description	10
Subject Photographs	15
Highest and Best Use	17
Land Valuation	
Exposure Time and Marketing Period	24
General Assumptions and Limiting Conditions	25
Certification – Arthur L. Schwertz	
Addenda	31
Glossary	
Qualifications	
Qualifications of Arthur L. Schwertz, MAI	40
Valbridge Property Advisors Information / Office Locations	46



# **Summary of Salient Facts**

# **Property Identification**

Draw anti-Mana a	Dealizates Carely LICA
Property Name	Darlington Creek HOA
Property Address	Darlington Creek Road and 12847 Sycamore Creek Drive
	Alexandria, Campbell County, Kentucky 41001
Latitude & Longitude	38.851988, -84.388579
Tax Parcel Number	999-99-30-086.98
Property Owner	Darlington Creek Developers, LLC
Site	
Zoning	Residential One-C Zone (R-1C(RCD))
FEMA Flood Map No.	21037C0157E
Flood Zone	Х
Easement Land Area	50,530 square feet
Fee Simple Land Area	37,026 square feet
Valuation Opinions	
Highest & Best Use - As Vacant	Residential
Reasonable Exposure Time	Six months or less
Reasonable Marketing Time	Six months or less

© 2021 VALBRIDGE PROPERTY ADVISORS | New Orleans



Value Conclusions		
Component	As Is	As Is
Value Type	Market Value	Market Value
Property Rights Appraised	Easement	Fee Simple
Effective Date of Value	December 2, 2021	December 2, 2021
Value Conclusion	\$54,000	\$100,000



DARLINGTON CREEK HOA AERIAL AND FRONT VIEWS

# **Aerial and Front Views**

**AERIAL VIEW** 



**FRONT VIEW** 



© 2021 VALBRIDGE PROPERTY ADVISORS | New Orleans

Page iv Case No. 2022-00432 Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8 Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 62 of 327



DARLINGTON CREEK HOA LOCATION MAP

# **Location Map**





# Introduction

# Client and Intended Users of the Appraisal

The client in this assignment is Central States Water Resources and the sole intended user of this report is Central State Water Resources. Under no circumstances shall any of the following parties be entitled to use or rely on the appraisal or this appraisal report:

- i. The borrower(s) on any loans or financing relating to or secured by the subject property,
- ii. Any guarantor(s) of such loans or financing; or
- iii. Principals, shareholders, investors, members or partners in such borrower(s) or guarantors.

# Intended Use of the Appraisal

The sole intended use of this report is for regulatory filings.

# Real Estate Identification

The subject property is located at Darlington Creek Road and 12847 Sycamore Creek Drive, Alexandria, Campbell County, Kentucky 41001. The subject property is further identified by the tax parcel number 999-99-30-086.98.

# Legal Description

Open Space Lot F, Darlington Creek Subdivision, Section 3, Campbell County, City of Alexandria, Kentucky

# Use of Real Estate as of the Effective Date of Value

As of the effective date of value, the subject was a utility property.

# Use of Real Estate as Reflected in this Appraisal

The opinion of value for the subject as is reflects use as a utility property.

# Ownership of the Property

According to Public Records, title to the subject property is vested in Darlington Creek Developers, LLC.

# History of the Property

Ownership of the subject property has not changed within the past three years.

# Analysis of Listings/Offers/Contracts

The subject is not currently listed for sale or under contract for sale..



# Type and Definition of Value

The appraisal problem is to develop an opinion of the market value of the subject property. "Market Value," as used in this appraisal, is defined as "the most probable price that a property should bring in a competitive and open market under all conditions requisite to a fair sale, the buyer and seller each acting prudently and knowledgeably, and assuming the price is not affected by undue stimulus." Implicit in this definition is the consummation of a sale as of a specified date and the passing of title from seller to buyer under conditions whereby:

- Buyer and seller are typically motivated.
- Both parties are well informed or well advised, each acting in what they consider their own best interests;
- A reasonable time is allowed for exposure in the open market;
- Payment is made in terms of cash in U.S. dollars or in terms of financial arrangements comparable thereto; and
- The price represents the normal consideration for the property sold unaffected by special or creative financing or sale concessions granted by anyone associated with the sale."1

The value conclusions apply to the value of the subject property under the market conditions presumed on the effective date of value. Please refer to the Glossary in the Addenda section for additional definitions of terms used in this report.

# Valuation Scenarios, Property Rights Appraised, and Effective Dates of Value

Per the scope of our assignment we developed opinions of value for the subject property under the following scenarios of value:

Valuation Scenario	Effective Date of Value
As Is Market Value of the Easement Interest	December 2, 2021
As Is Market Value of the Fee Simple Interest	December 2, 2021

We completed an appraisal inspection of the subject property on 12-02-2021.

# Date of Report

The date of this report is 12-06-2021.

# List of Items Requested but Not Provided

• All information requested has been provided

© 2021 VALBRIDGE PROPERTY ADVISORS | New Orleans

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Source: Code of Federal Regulations, Title 12, Banks and Banking, Part 722.2-Definitions



# Assumptions and Conditions of the Appraisal

This appraisal assignment and the opinions reported herein are subject to the General Assumptions and Limiting Conditions contained in the report and the following extraordinary assumptions and/or hypothetical conditions, the use of which might have affected the assignment results.

**Extraordinary Assumptions** 

• The appraiser was unable to locate any documents definitively specifying the location or width of the utility easements. However, a visual inspection of the neighborhood indicates the presence of sewer lines near the street frontage and it has been assumed for purposes of this analysis that they lie within a 10' utility easement.

# **Hypothetical Conditions**

• This appraisal is predicated on the hypothetical condition that the property is unimproved and ready for development.



# Scope of Work

The elements addressed in the Scope of Work are (1) the extent to which the subject property is identified, (2) the extent to which the subject property is inspected, (3) the type and extent of data researched, (4) the type and extent of analysis applied, (5) the type of appraisal report prepared, and (6) the inclusion or exclusion of items of non-realty in the development of the value opinion. These items are discussed as below.

# Extent to Which the Property Was Identified

The three components of the property identification are summarized as follows:

- <u>Legal Characteristics</u> The subject was legally identified via public Records and information provided by the client.
- <u>Economic Characteristics</u> Economic characteristics of the subject property were identified via information provided by the client, public records, market surveys, discussions with market participants, and the files of Valbridge Property Advisors, as well as a comparison to properties with similar locational and physical characteristics.
- <u>Physical Characteristics</u> The subject was physically identified via documentation noted earlier in this report. No physical inspection was made.

# Extent to Which the Property Was Inspected

We inspected the subject on 12-02-2021.

# Type and Extent of Data Researched

We researched and analyzed: (1) market area data, (2) property-specific market data, (3) zoning and land-use data, and (4) current data on comparable listings and transactions. We also interviewed people familiar with the subject market/property type.

# Type and Extent of Analysis Applied (Valuation Methodology)

We observed surrounding land use trends, the condition of any improvements, demand for the subject property, and relevant legal limitations in concluding a highest and best use. We then valued the subject based on that highest and best use conclusion.

Appraisers develop an opinion of property value with specific appraisal procedures that reflect three distinct methods of data analysis: the Cost Approach, Sales Comparison Approach, and Income Capitalization Approach. One or more of these approaches are used in all estimations of value.

- <u>Sales Comparison Approach</u> In the Sales Comparison Approach, value is indicated by recent sales and/or listings of comparable properties in the market, with the appraiser analyzing the impact of material differences in both economic and physical elements between the subject and the comparables.
- <u>Direct Capitalization: Land Residual Method</u> The Land Residual Methodology involves estimating the residual net income to the land by deducting from total potential income the portion attributable to the improvements, assuming development of the site at its highest and



best use. The residual income is capitalized at an appropriate rate, resulting in an indication of land value.

- <u>Direct Capitalization: Ground Rent Capitalization</u> A market derived capitalization rate is applied to the net income resulting from a ground lease. This can represent the leased fee or fee simple interest, depending on whether the income potential is reflective of a lease in place or market rental rates.
- <u>Yield Capitalization: Subdivision Development Method</u> Also known as Discounted Cash Flow Analysis (DCF), the methodology is most appropriate for land having multiple lot development in the near term as the highest and best use. The current site value is represented by discounting the anticipated cash flow to a present value, taking into consideration all necessary costs of development, maintenance, administration, and sales throughout the absorption period.

All of these approaches to value were considered. We assessed the availability of data and applicability of each approach to value within the context of the characteristics of the subject property and the needs and requirements of the client. Based on this assessment, we relied upon the Sales Comparison Approach. Further discussion of the extent of our analysis and the methodology of each approach is provided later in the respective valuation sections.

# Appraisal Conformity and Report Type

We developed our analyses, opinions, and conclusions and prepared this report in conformity with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP) of the Appraisal Foundation; the Code of Professional Ethics and Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice of the Appraisal Institute; and the requirements of our client as we understand them. This is an Appraisal Report as defined by the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice under Standards Rule 2-2a.

# Personal Property/FF&E

All items of non-realty are excluded from this analysis. The opinion of market value developed herein is reflective of real estate only.



# **City and Neighborhood Analysis**



# Overview

The subject is located in Alexandria in Campbell County, Kentucky. It is characterized by being a rural suburban area of Covington, KY in the Cincinnati MSA.

# Neighborhood Location and Boundaries

The subject neighborhood is on the southern edge of the Alexandria area in a community named Grants Lick. The area is rural in nature.

The neighborhood is bounded by State Route 9 to the north, the Ohio River to the east, Licking River to the south, and to the west.



# **Transportation Access**

Within the immediate area of the subject property, transportation access helps define the character of its development. Major travel and commuter routes within the area of the subject property include Highway 27. Access to the area is considered average.

# Neighborhood Land Use

The subject neighborhood is located in an area with primarily rural land uses. An approximate breakdown of the development in the area is as follows:

LAND USES		
Developed	30%	
Residential	80%	
Retail	10%	
Office	0%	
Industrial	0%	
Vacant	70%	
Total	100%	

# Land Use Trends

The neighborhood is not experiencing a change in land use.





# **Demographics**

The following table depicts the area demographics in Alexandria within a one-, three-, and five-mile radius from the subject.

Radius (Miles)	1 Mile	3 Mile	5 Mile
Population Summary			
2010 Population	630	3,049	9,653
2020 Population Estimate	677	3,200	10,128
2025 Population Projection	696	3,264	10,322
Annual % Change (2020 - 2025)	0.6%	0.4%	0.4%
Housing Unit Summary			
2010 Housing Units	251	1,131	3,736
% Owner Occupied	86.5%	84.4%	79.4%
% Renter Occupied	9.6%	10.9%	13.1%
2020 Housing Units	264	1,170	3,876
% Owner Occupied	91.3%	89.0%	82.8%
% Renter Occupied	6.8%	7.8%	10.9%
2025 Housing Units	271	1,192	3,949
% Owner Occupied	91.9%	89.6%	83.3%
% Renter Occupied	6.3%	7.3%	10.4%
Annual % Change (2020 - 2025)	0.9%	0.5%	0.4%
Income Summary			
2020 Median Household Income Estimate	\$83,440	\$85,047	\$81,831
2025 Median Household Income Projection	\$94,407	\$97,908	\$94,355
Annual % Change	2.5%	2.9%	2.9%
2020 Per Capita Income Estimate	\$34,818	\$37,994	\$36,111
2025 Per Capita Income Projection	\$40,458	\$43,871	\$41,260
Annual % Change	3.1%	2.9%	2.7%

Source: ESRI (ArcGIS)

(Lat: 38.851988, Lon: -84.388579)

Within a three-mile radius, the reported population is 3,200 with a projected growth rate of approximately 0.4% annually. There are 1,170 housing units within that three-mile radius. The growth rate is expected to be 0.5% annually. Most of the housing is owner-occupied. Our research indicates that property values in the area are stable to increasing.

Within a three-mile radius, the median household income is \$85,047. Looking ahead, annual household income growth is projected at **2.9**% per year. The average income figures suggest that the inhabitants are within the middle to upper income brackets.

# Nuisances & External Obsolescence

Neighborhood properties have adequate levels of maintenance. No adverse or unfavorable factors were observed.



# Neighborhood Life Cycle

Most neighborhoods are classified as being in four stages: **growth**, **stability**, **decline**, and **renewal**. Overall, the subject neighborhood is in the Growing stage of its life cycle.

# Immediate Area Uses

The below aerial photo exhibits the uses located in the subject's immediate vicinity.



# **IMMEDIATE AREA USES**

Source: Google Maps

Uses in the vicinity of the subject are primarily residential in nature. Recognized uses in the immediate area of the subject include single family housing, religious facilities, a dollar general and café. As shown above, the density of uses in the area is very low.

# Analysis and Conclusions

The neighborhood is characterized by being a rural area on the outskirts of the Cincinnati MSA.


# **Site Description**

The subject site is located in Darlington Creek Subdivision. The characteristics of the site are summarized as follows:

## Site Characteristics

Gross Land Area:	2.01 Acres or 87,556 SF
Fee Simple Land Area:	0.85 Acres or 37,026 SF
Easement Land Area:	1.16 Acres or 50,530
Shape:	Irregular
Topography:	Varies
Drainage:	Adequate
Utilities:	All are available

# Flood Zone Data

Flood Map Panel/Number:	21037C0157E
Flood Map Date:	03-03-2014
Portion in Flood Hazard Area:	100.00%
Flood Zone:	Х
	Flood Zone X is described as an area of minimal flood hazard, usually depicted on FIRMs as above the 500-year flood level. Flood Insurance is not considered mandatory in this Flood Zone.

## Adjacent Land Uses

North:	Residential
South:	Land
East:	Land
West:	Residential

# **Zoning Designation**

Zoning Jurisdiction:	Campbell County
Zoning Classification:	R-1C(RCD), Residential One-C Zone
General Plan Designation:	Residential
Permitted Uses:	Single-family dwelling

# Analysis/Comments on Site

The subject is the sewer system for Darlington Creek Subdivision. It consists of 1.16 acres of easements and 0.85 acres of fee simple area.



DARLINGTON CREEK HOA SITE DESCRIPTION

## **TAX/PLAT MAP**





DARLINGTON CREEK HOA SITE DESCRIPTION

## **SERVICE AREA MAP**





DARLINGTON CREEK HOA SITE DESCRIPTION

## **FLOOD MAP**









Page 14 Case No. 2022-00432 Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8 Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 77 of 327



DARLINGTON CREEK HOA SUBJECT PHOTOGRAPHS

# Subject Photographs



Subject Site View



Subject View







Subject View



Subject View



# Highest and Best Use

The Highest and Best Use of a property is the use that is legally permissible, physically possible, and financially feasible which results in the highest value. An opinion of the highest and best use results from consideration of the criteria noted above under the market conditions or likely conditions as of the effective date of value. Determination of highest and best use results from the judgment and analytical skills of the appraiser. It represents an opinion, not a fact. In appraisal practice, the concept of highest and best use represents the premise upon which value is based.

# Analysis of Highest and Best Use As Though Vacant

The primary determinants of the highest and best use of the property As Though Vacant are the issues of (1) Legal permissibility, (2) Physical possibility, (3) Financial feasibility, and (4) Maximum productivity.

## Legally Permissible

The subject site is zoned R-1C(RCD), Residential One-C Zone which controls the general nature of permissible uses but is appropriate for the location and physical elements of the subject property, providing for a consistency of use with the general neighborhood. The location of the subject property is appropriate for the uses allowed, as noted previously, and a change in zoning is unlikely. There are no known easements, encroachments, covenants or other use restrictions that would unduly limit or impede development.

## Physically Possible

The physical attributes allow for a number of potential uses. Elements such as size, shape, availability of utilities, known hazards (flood, environmental, etc.), and other potential influences are described in the Site Description and have been considered. There are no items of a physical nature which would adversely impact development with the legal permitted uses.

## **Financially Feasible**

The probable use of the site for residential development conforms to the pattern of land use in the market area. A review of published yield, rental and occupancy rates suggest that there is a balanced supply and demand is sufficient to support construction costs and ensure timely absorption of additional inventory in this market. Therefore, near-term speculative development of the subject site is financially feasible.

## **Maximally Productive**

Among the financially feasible uses, the use that results in the highest value (the maximally productive use) is the highest and best use. Considering these factors, the maximally productive use as though vacant is for residential use.

# Conclusion of Highest and Best Use As Though Vacant

The conclusion of the highest and best use As Though Vacant is for residential use.

# Most Probable Buyer

As of the date of value, the most probable buyer of the subject property is an owner user.



# Land Valuation

# Methodology

Site Value is most often estimated using the sales comparison approach. This approach develops an indication of market value by analyzing closed sales, listings, or pending sales of properties similar to the subject, focusing on the difference between the subject and the comparables using all appropriate elements of comparison. This approach is based on the principles of supply and demand, balance, externalities, and substitution, or the premise that a buyer would pay no more for a specific property than the cost of obtaining a property with the same quality, utility, and perceived benefits of ownership.

The process of developing the sales comparison approach consists of the following analyses: (1) researching and verifying transactional data, (2) selecting relevant units of comparison, (3) analyzing and adjusting the comparable sales for differences in various elements of comparison, and (4) reconciling the adjusted sales into a value indication for the subject site.

## Unit of Comparison

The unit of comparison depends on land use economics and how buyers and sellers use the property. The unit of comparison in this analysis is per usable square foot.

## **Elements of Comparison**

Elements of comparison are the characteristics or attributes of properties and transactions that cause the prices of real estate to vary. The primary elements of comparison considered in sales comparison analysis are as follows: (1) property rights conveyed, (2) financing terms, (3) conditions of sale, (4) expenditures made immediately after purchase, (5) market conditions, (6) location and (7) physical characteristics.

## Comparable Sales Data

To obtain and verify comparable sales of vacant land properties, we conducted a search of public records, field surveys, interviews with knowledgeable real estate professionals in the area, and a review of our internal database.

We included four sales in our analysis, as these sales were judged to be the most comparable to develop an indication of market value for the subject property.

The following is a table summarizing each sale comparable and a map illustrating the location of each in relation to the subject.



## Land Sales Summary

	Sale # 1	Sale # 2	Sale # 3	Sale # 4
Sale ID	1566749	1566752	1566633	1566755
Property Name	Residential Lot	Residential Lot	Residential Lot	Residential Lot
Sale Status	Closed	Closed	Closed	Closed
Location	612 Mallard Drive	8868 Constable Drive	749 Coot Ct	119 Jefferson Street
	Alexandria, Kentucky	Alexandria, Kentucky	Alexandria, Kentucky	Alexandria, Kentucky
Tax ID	999-99-37-576.66	999-99-24-915.06	999-99-31-337.71	999-99-24-187.11
Sales Data				
Date of Sale	4/24/2021	8/18/2020	6/24/2020	9/24/2020
Sales Price	\$42,500	\$35,000	\$35,000	\$55,000
Price/Usable Square Foot	\$2.87	\$2.86	\$2.43	\$3.32
Grantor	Jameson	Molly Michelle	Ponde Creek LLC	Reynolds
	INvestments LLC	Mcdermott		Investments LLC
Grantee	Ashley N Wood	Thomas Darrell and	Shawn and Amanda	David Graff and
		Toni Sue Schneller	Foster	Carolyn Graff
Recording Number				
Book/Page Number	346/397/A	341/482/A	340/567/A	342/191/N,
				344/89/A
Document Number	F C: 1	F (; )	F C' I	F C' I
Property Rights Conveyed	Fee Simple	Fee Simple	Fee Simple	Fee Simple
Financing	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller
Conditions of Sale	Arm's Length	Arm's Length	Arm's Length	Arm's Length
Physical Characteristics				
Usable Land Area (Sq. Ft.)	14,810	12,240	14,375	16,553
Gross Land Area (Sq. Ft.)	14,810	12,240	14,375	16,553
Zoning	R-1C	R-1D		R-1D
Flood Zone	Х	Х		Х
Topography	Hilly, uneven land -	Level	Level	Gently sloping
	slopes from 16% to			
	30%			
Shape	Irregular	Rectangular	Slightly Irregular	Slightly Irregular
Access/Visibility	Average/Average	Average/Average	Average/Average	Average/Average



DARLINGTON CREEK HOA LAND VALUATION



## **COMPARABLE SALES MAP**



## Land Sales Comparison Analysis

When necessary, adjustments were made for differences in various elements of comparison, including property rights conveyed, financing terms, conditions of sale, expenditures made immediately after purchase, market conditions, location, and other physical characteristics. If the element in comparison is considered superior to that of the subject, we applied a negative adjustment. Conversely, a positive adjustment was applied if inferior. A summary of the elements of comparison follows.

	Elements of Comparison
Real Property Rights Conveyed	Adjustments for differences in property rights appraised.
Financing Terms	Comparable properties are adjusted for differences between a transaction's financing terms and those assumed in the valuation of the subject property - e.g. seller financing, loan assumption, non-market terms.
Conditions of Sale	Comparable properties are adjusted for differences in the motivations of either the buyer or a seller in the transaction. In the instant case, no adjustments are required.
Expenditures After Purchase	Comparable properties can be adjusted for any additional investment required to make the property salable – e. g. costs to cure deferred maintenance, costs to demolish and remove any portion of the improvements, costs to remediate environmental contamination and/or costs to occupy or stabilize the property.
Market Conditions	Comparable properties can be adjusted for changes in market conditions because of inflation, deflation, fluctuations in supply and demand, or other factors.
Location	Location adjustments may be required when the locational characteristics of a comparable are different from those of the subject.
Size	The size adjustment addresses variance in the physical size of the comparables and that of the subject, as a larger parcel typically commands a lower price per unit than a smaller parcel. As this is an estimate of the Across the Fence Value, it is assumed that the subject would be part of a lot similar in size to the comparables. As such, no positive adjustments for size are warranted.
Shape /Depth	This element address variance in utility due to shape and/or depth. No adjustments are warranted.
Corner Exposure	Tracts featuring corner influence typically command higher prices in the market place, as opposed to interior locations. As the subject includes both corner and interior lots, no adjustments are warranted.



DARLINGTON CREEK HOA LAND VALUATION

# Summary of Adjustments

Presented on the following page is a summary of the adjustments made to the sale comparables. As noted earlier, these quantitative adjustments were based on our market research, best judgment, and experience in the appraisal of similar properties.



## LAND SALES ADJUSTMENT GRID

	Subject	Sale # 1	Sale # 2	Sale # 3	Sale # 4
Sale ID		1566749	1566752	1566633	1566755
Date of Value & Sale	December-21	April-21	August-20	June-20	September-20
Unadjusted Sales Price		\$42,500	\$35,000	\$35,000	\$55,000
Usable Square Feet	37,026	14,810	12,240	14,375	16,553
Unadjusted Sales Price per U	sable Sq. Ft.	\$2.87	\$2.86	\$2.43	\$3.32
Transactional Adjustments					
Property Rights Conveyed	Easement	Fee Simple	Fee Simple	Fee Simple	Fee Simple
Adjusted Sales Price	_	\$2.87	\$2.86	\$2.43	\$3.32
Financing Terms	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller
Adjusted Sales Price	_	\$2.87	\$2.86	\$2.43	\$3.32
Conditions of Sale	Typical	Arm's Length	Arm's Length	Arm's Length	Arm's Length
Adjusted Sales Price	_	\$2.87	\$2.86	\$2.43	\$3.32
Expenditures after Sale					
Adjusted Sales Price	-	\$2.87	\$2.86	\$2.43	\$3.32
Market Conditions Adjustme	nts				
Elapsed Time from Date of	f Value	0.61 years	1.29 years	1.44 years	1.19 years
Market Trend Through	December-21	-	-	-	-
Analyzed Sales Price		\$2.87	\$2.86	\$2.43	\$3.32
Physical Adjustments					
Location	Darlington Creek	612 Mallard	8868 Constable	749 Coot Ct	119 Jefferson
	Road and 12847	Drive	Drive		Street
	Sycamore Creek				
	Drive				
	Alexandria,	Alexandria,	Alexandria,	Alexandria,	Alexandria,
	Kentucky	Kentucky	Kentucky	Kentucky	Kentucky
Adjustment		-	-10.0%	-	-15.0%
Size	37,026 sf	14,810 sf	12,240 sf	14,375 sf	16,553 sf
Adjustment	_	-	-	-	-
Net Physical Adjustment		-	-10.0%	-	-15.0%
Adjusted Sales Price per Usal	hla Causana Falat	\$2.87	\$2.57	\$2.43	\$2.82



## Conclusion

From the market data available, we used four land sales in competitive market areas which were adjusted based on pertinent elements of comparison. The following table summarizes the unadjusted and adjusted unit prices:

## Land Sale Statistics

Metric	Unadjusted	Analyzed	Adjusted
Min. Sales Price per Usable Square Foot	\$2.43	\$2.43	\$2.43
Max. Sales Price per Usable Square Foot	\$3.32	\$3.32	\$2.87
Median Sales Price per Usable Square Foot	\$2.86	\$2.86	\$2.70
Mean Sales Price per Usable Square Foot	\$2.87	\$2.87	\$2.68

Based on the adjusted prices and the most comparable sale, a unit value for the subject property is near the middle of the adjusted range, or \$2.70 per usable square foot. Thus, the estimated "Across the Fence Value" of the Fee Simple Interest in the subject easements is calculated to be \$136,000.

# Valuation of the Fee Simple Area

Based on the adjusted prices and the most comparable sale, a unit value for the subject property is near the middle of the adjusted range, or \$2.70 per usable square foot. Thus, based upon the assumptions, reasoning and comparable data discussed herein, the estimated "Market Value" of the subject Fee Simple area is calculated as follows:

# **Calculation of Fee Simple Value**

Site Area		Unit Value		Market Value
37,026 Square Feet	Х	\$2.70	=	\$100,000

# Valuation of the Easement

The use to which the subject easements will be put to is for underground water and sewer pipes. As such, little or no surface improvements will be possible, but access across the surface will be allowed. It is my opinion, therefore, that such an easement will encumber approximately 40% of the ownership rights in the subject.

Thus, based upon the assumptions, reasoning and comparable data discussed herein, the estimated "Market Value" of the subject easements is calculated as follows:

## **Calculation of Easement Value**

							Indicated Value of
Site Area		Unit Value		Market Value of Fee	l l	Easement Use	Easement
50,530 square feet	Х	\$2.70 PSF	=	\$136,000	Х	40%	\$54,000

# Exposure Time and Marketing Period

Based on statistical information about days on market, escrow length, and marketing times gathered through national investor surveys, sales verification, and interviews of market participants, marketing and exposure time estimates of six months or less and six months or less, respectively, are considered reasonable and appropriate for the subject property.

© 2021 VALBRIDGE PROPERTY ADVISORS | New Orleans



# **General Assumptions and Limiting Conditions**

This appraisal is subject to the following general assumptions and limiting conditions:

- 1. The legal description if furnished to us is assumed to be correct.
- 2. No responsibility is assumed for legal matters, questions of survey or title, soil or subsoil conditions, engineering, availability or capacity of utilities, or other similar technical matters. The appraisal does not constitute a survey of the property appraised. All existing liens and encumbrances have been disregarded and the property is appraised as though free and clear, under responsible ownership and competent management unless otherwise noted.
- 3. Unless otherwise noted, the appraisal will value the property as though free of contamination. Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans will conduct no hazardous materials or contamination inspection of any kind. It is recommended that the client hire an expert if the presence of hazardous materials or contamination poses any concern.
- 4. The stamps and/or consideration placed on deeds used to indicate sales are in correct relationship to the actual dollar amount of the transaction.
- 5. Unless otherwise noted, it is assumed there are no encroachments, zoning violations or restrictions existing in the subject property.
- 6. The appraiser is not required to give testimony or attendance in court by reason of this appraisal, unless previous arrangements have been made.
- 7. Unless expressly specified in the engagement letter, the fee for this appraisal does not include the attendance or giving of testimony by Appraiser at any court, regulatory or other proceedings, or any conferences or other work in preparation for such proceeding. If any partner or employee of Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans is asked or required to appear and/or testify at any deposition, trial, or other proceeding about the preparation, conclusions or any other aspect of this assignment, client shall compensate Appraiser for the time spent by the partner or employee in appearing and/or testifying and in preparing to testify according to the Appraiser's then current hourly rate plus reimbursement of expenses.
- 8. The values for land and/or improvements, as contained in this report, are constituent parts of the total value reported and neither is (or are) to be used in making a summation appraisal of a combination of values created by another appraiser. Either is invalidated if so used.
- 9. The dates of value to which the opinions expressed in this report apply are set forth in this report. We assume no responsibility for economic or physical factors occurring at some point at a later date, which may affect the opinions stated herein. The forecasts, projections, or operating estimates contained herein are based on current market conditions and anticipated short-term supply and demand factors and are subject to change with future conditions. Appraiser is not responsible for determining whether the date of value requested by Client is appropriate for Client's intended use.
- 10. The sketches, maps, plats and exhibits in this report are included to assist the reader in visualizing the property. The appraiser has made no survey of the property and assumed no responsibility in connection with such matters.
- 11. The information, estimates and opinions, which were obtained from sources outside of this office, are considered reliable. However, no liability for them can be assumed by the appraiser.



- 12. Possession of this report, or a copy thereof, does not carry with it the right of publication. Neither all, nor any part of the content of the report, or copy thereof (including conclusions as to property value, the identity of the appraisers, professional designations, reference to any professional appraisal organization or the firm with which the appraisers are connected), shall be disseminated to the public through advertising, public relations, news, sales, or other media without prior written consent and approval.
- 13. No claim is intended to be expressed for matters of expertise that would require specialized investigation or knowledge beyond that ordinarily employed by real estate appraisers. We claim no expertise in areas such as, but not limited to, legal, survey, structural, environmental, pest control, mechanical, etc.
- 14. This appraisal was prepared for the sole and exclusive use of the client for the function outlined herein. Any party who is not the client or intended user identified in the appraisal or engagement letter is not entitled to rely upon the contents of the appraisal without express written consent of Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans and Client. The Client shall not include partners, affiliates, or relatives of the party addressed herein. The appraiser assumes no obligation, liability or accountability to any third party.
- 15. Distribution of this report is at the sole discretion of the client, but third-parties not listed as an intended user on the face of the appraisal or the engagement letter may not rely upon the contents of the appraisal. In no event shall client give a third-party a partial copy of the appraisal report. We will make no distribution of the report without the specific direction of the client.
- 16. This appraisal shall be used only for the function outlined herein, unless expressly authorized by Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans.
- 17. This appraisal shall be considered in its entirety. No part thereof shall be used separately or out of context.
- 18. Unless otherwise noted in the body of this report, this appraisal assumes that the subject property does not fall within the areas where mandatory flood insurance is effective. Unless otherwise noted, we have not completed nor have we contracted to have completed an investigation to identify and/or quantify the presence of non-tidal wetland conditions on the subject property. Because the appraiser is not a surveyor, he or she makes no guarantees, express or implied, regarding this determination.
- 19. The flood maps are not site specific. We are not qualified to confirm the location of the subject property in relation to flood hazard areas based on the FEMA Flood Insurance Rate Maps or other surveying techniques. It is recommended that the client obtain a confirmation of the subject property's flood zone classification from a licensed surveyor.
- 20. If the appraisal is for mortgage loan purposes 1) we assume satisfactory completion of improvements if construction is not complete, 2) no consideration has been given for rent loss during rent-up unless noted in the body of this report, and 3) occupancy at levels consistent with our "Income and Expense Projection" are anticipated.
- 21. It is assumed that there are no hidden or unapparent conditions of the property, subsoil, or structures which would render it more or less valuable. No responsibility is assumed for such conditions or for engineering which may be required to discover them.



- 22. Our inspection included an observation of the land and improvements thereon only. It was not possible to observe conditions beneath the soil or hidden structural components within the improvements. We inspected the buildings involved, and reported damage (if any) by termites, dry rot, wet rot, or other infestations as a matter of information, and no guarantee of the amount or degree of damage (if any) is implied. Condition of heating, cooling, ventilation, electrical and plumbing equipment is considered to be commensurate with the condition of the balance of the improvements unless otherwise stated. Should the client have concerns in these areas, it is the client's responsibility to order the appropriate inspections. The appraiser does not have the skill or expertise to make such inspections and assumes no responsibility for these items.
- 23. This appraisal does not guarantee compliance with building code and life safety code requirements of the local jurisdiction. It is assumed that all required licenses, consents, certificates of occupancy or other legislative or administrative authority from any local, state or national governmental or private entity or organization have been or can be obtained or renewed for any use on which the value conclusion contained in this report is based unless specifically stated to the contrary.
- 24. When possible, we have relied upon building measurements provided by the client, owner, or associated agents of these parties. In the absence of a detailed rent roll, reliable public records, or "as-built" plans provided to us, we have relied upon our own measurements of the subject improvements. We follow typical appraisal industry methods; however, we recognize that some factors may limit our ability to obtain accurate measurements including, but not limited to, property access on the day of inspection, basements, fenced/gated areas, grade elevations, greenery/shrubbery, uneven surfaces, multiple story structures, obtuse or acute wall angles, immobile obstructions, etc. Professional building area measurements of the quality, level of detail, or accuracy of professional measurement services are beyond the scope of this appraisal assignment.
- 25. We have attempted to reconcile sources of data discovered or provided during the appraisal process, including assessment department data. Ultimately, the measurements that are deemed by us to be the most accurate and/or reliable are used within this report. While the measurements and any accompanying sketches are considered to be reasonably accurate and reliable, we cannot guarantee their accuracy. Should the client desire more precise measurement, they are urged to retain the measurement services of a qualified professional (space planner, architect or building engineer) as an alternative source. If this alternative measurement source reflects or reveals substantial differences with the measurements used within the report, upon request of the client, the appraiser will submit a revised report for an additional fee.
- 26. In the absence of being provided with a detailed land survey, we have used assessment department data to ascertain the physical dimensions and acreage of the property. Should a survey prove this information to be inaccurate, upon request of the client, the appraiser will submit a revised report for an additional fee.
- 27. If only preliminary plans and specifications were available for use in the preparation of this appraisal, and a review of the final plans and specifications reveals substantial differences upon request of the client the appraiser will submit a revised report for an additional fee.





- 28. Unless otherwise stated in this report, the value conclusion is predicated on the assumption that the property is free of contamination, environmental impairment or hazardous materials. Unless otherwise stated, the existence of hazardous material was not observed by the appraiser and the appraiser has no knowledge of the existence of such materials on or in the property. The appraiser, however, is not qualified to detect such substances. The presence of substances such as asbestos, urea-formaldehyde foam insulation or other potentially hazardous materials may affect the value of the property. No responsibility is assumed for any such conditions, or for any expertise or engineering knowledge required for discovery. The client is urged to retain an expert in this field, if desired.
- 29. The Americans with Disabilities Act ("ADA") became effective January 26, 1992. We have not made a specific compliance survey of the property to determine if it is in conformity with the various requirements of the ADA. It is possible that a compliance survey of the property, together with an analysis of the requirements of the ADA, could reveal that the property is not in compliance with one or more of the requirements of the Act. If so, this could have a negative effect on the value of the property. Since we have no direct evidence relating to this issue, we did not consider possible noncompliance with the requirements of ADA in developing an opinion of value.
- 30. This appraisal applies to the land and building improvements only. The value of trade fixtures, furnishings, and other equipment, or subsurface rights (minerals, gas, and oil) were not considered in this appraisal unless specifically stated to the contrary.
- 31. No changes in any federal, state or local laws, regulations or codes (including, without limitation, the Internal Revenue Code) are anticipated, unless specifically stated to the contrary.
- 32. Any income and expense estimates contained in the appraisal report are used only for the purpose of estimating value and do not constitute prediction of future operating results. Furthermore, it is inevitable that some assumptions will not materialize and that unanticipated events may occur that will likely affect actual performance.
- 33. Any estimate of insurable value, if included within the scope of work and presented herein, is based upon figures developed consistent with industry practices. However, actual local and regional construction costs may vary significantly from our estimate and individual insurance policies and underwriters have varied specifications, exclusions, and non-insurable items. As such, we strongly recommend that the Client obtain estimates from professionals experienced in establishing insurance coverage. This analysis should not be relied upon to determine insurance coverage and we make no warranties regarding the accuracy of this estimate.
- 34. The data gathered in the course of this assignment (except data furnished by the Client) shall remain the property of the Appraiser. The appraiser will not violate the confidential nature of the appraiserclient relationship by improperly disclosing any confidential information furnished to the appraiser. Notwithstanding the foregoing, the Appraiser is authorized by the client to disclose all or any portion of the appraisal and related appraisal data to appropriate representatives of the Appraisal Institute if such disclosure is required to enable the appraiser to comply with the Bylaws and Regulations of such Institute now or hereafter in effect.



- 35. You and Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans both agree that any dispute over matters in excess of \$5,000 will be submitted for resolution by arbitration. This includes fee disputes and any claim of malpractice. The arbitrator shall be mutually selected. If Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans and the client cannot agree on the arbitrator, the presiding head of the Local County Mediation & Arbitration panel shall select the arbitrator. Such arbitration shall be binding and final. In agreeing to arbitration, we both acknowledge that, by agreeing to binding arbitration, each of us is giving up the right to have the dispute decided in a court of law before a judge or jury. In the event that the client, or any other party, makes a claim against Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans or any of its employees in connections with or in any way relating to this assignment, the maximum damages recoverable by such claimant shall be the amount actually received by Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans for this assignment, and under no circumstances shall any claim for consequential damages be made.
- 36. Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans shall have no obligation, liability, or accountability to any third party. Any party who is not the "client" or intended user identified on the face of the appraisal or in the engagement letter is not entitled to rely upon the contents of the appraisal without the express written consent of Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans. "Client" shall not include partners, affiliates, or relatives of the party named in the engagement letter. Client shall hold Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans and its employees harmless in the event of any lawsuit brought by any third party, lender, partner, or part-owner in any form of ownership or any other party as a result of this assignment. The client also agrees that in case of lawsuit arising from or in any way involving these appraisal services, client will hold Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans harmless from and against any liability, loss, cost, or expense incurred or suffered by Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans in such action, regardless of its outcome.
- 37. The Valbridge Property Advisors office responsible for the preparation of this report is independently owned and operated by VPA of South Louisiana, Inc.. Neither Valbridge Property Advisors, Inc., nor any of its affiliates has been engaged to provide this report. Valbridge Property Advisors, Inc. does not provide valuation services, and has taken no part in the preparation of this report.
- 38. If any claim is filed against any of Valbridge Property Advisors, Inc., a Florida Corporation, its affiliates, officers or employees, or the firm providing this report, in connection with, or in any way arising out of, or relating to, this report, or the engagement of the firm providing this report, then (1) under no circumstances shall such claimant be entitled to consequential, special or other damages, except only for direct compensatory damages, and (2) the maximum amount of such compensatory damages recoverable by such claimant shall be the amount actually received by the firm engaged to provide this report.
- 39. This report and any associated work files may be subject to evaluation by Valbridge Property Advisors, Inc., or its affiliates, for quality control purposes.
- 40. Acceptance and/or use of this appraisal report constitutes acceptance of the foregoing general assumptions and limiting conditions.
- 41. The global outbreak of a "novel coronavirus" (known as COVID-19) was officially declared a pandemic by the World Health Organization (WHO). It is currently unknown what direct, or indirect, effect, if any, this event may have on the national economy, the local economy or the market in which the subject property is located. The reader is cautioned, and reminded that the conclusions presented in this appraisal report apply only as of the effective date(s) indicated. The appraiser makes no representation as to the effect on the subject property of this event, or any event, subsequent to the effective date of the appraisal.

# **Certification – Arthur L. Schwertz**

I certify that, to the best of my knowledge and belief:

- 1. The statements of fact contained in this report are true and correct.
- 2. The reported analyses, opinions, and conclusions are limited only by the reported assumptions and limiting conditions and are my personal, impartial, and unbiased professional analyses, opinions, and conclusions.
- 3. I have no present or prospective interest in the property that is the subject of this report and no personal interest with respect to the parties involved.
- 4. The undersigned has not performed services regarding the property that is the subject of this report within the three-year period immediately preceding acceptance of this assignment.
- 5. I have no bias with respect to the property that is the subject of this report or to the parties involved with this assignment.
- 6. My engagement in this assignment was not contingent upon developing or reporting predetermined results.
- 7. My compensation for completing this assignment is not contingent upon the development or reporting of a predetermined value or direction in value that favors the cause of the client, the amount of value opinion, the attainment of a stipulated result, or the occurrence of a subsequent event directly related to the intended use of this appraisal.
- 8. My analyses, opinions and conclusions were developed, and this report has been prepared, in conformity with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice.
- 9. Arthur L. Schwertz did not personally inspected the subject property.
- 10. R. Carter Higdon provided significant real property appraisal assistance to the person signing this certification.
- 11. The reported analyses, opinions and conclusions were developed, and this report has been prepared, in conformity with the requirements of the Code of Professional Ethics and Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice of the Appraisal Institute.
- 12. The use of this report is subject to the requirements of the Appraisal Institute relating to review by its duly authorized representatives.
- 13. As of the date of this report, the undersigned has completed the continuing education program for Designated Members of the Appraisal Institute.

Arthur L. Schwertz, MAI Senior Managing Director Kentucky Certified General Real Property Appraiser #5470



# Addenda

Glossary

Qualifications

Arthur L. Schwertz, MAI - Senior Managing Director

Information on Valbridge Property Advisors

Office Locations



## Glossary

Definitions are taken from The Dictionary of Real Estate Appraisal, 6<sup>th</sup> Edition (Dictionary), the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP), and Building Owners and Managers Association International (BOMA).

## Absolute Net Lease

A lease in which the tenant pays all expenses including structural maintenance, building reserves, and management; often a long-term lease to a credit tenant. (Dictionary)

#### Amortization

The process of retiring a debt or recovering a capital investment, typically through scheduled, systematic repayment of the principal; a program of periodic contributions to a sinking fund or debt retirement fund. (Dictionary)

#### As Is Market Value

The estimate of the market value of real property in its current physical condition, use, and zoning as of the appraisal date. (Dictionary)

#### **Base Rent**

The minimum rent stipulated in a lease. (Dictionary)

#### Base Year

The year on which escalation clauses in a lease are based. (Dictionary)

#### **Building Common Area**

In office buildings, the areas of the building that provide services to building tenants but which are not included in the office area or store area of any specific tenant. These areas may include, but shall not be limited to, main and auxiliary lobbies, atrium spaces at the level of the finished floor, concierge areas or security desks, conference rooms, lounges or vending areas, food service facilities, health or fitness centers, daycare facilities, locker or shower facilities, mail rooms, fire control rooms, fully enclosed courtyards outside the exterior walls, and building core and service areas such as fully enclosed mechanical or equipment rooms. Specifically excluded from building common area are floor common areas, parking space, portions of loading docks outside the building line, and major vertical penetrations. (BOMA)

#### **Building Rentable Area**

The sum of all floor rentable areas. Floor rentable area is the result of subtracting from the gross measured area of a floor the major vertical penetrations on that same floor. It is generally fixed for the life of the building and is rarely affected by changes in corridor size or configuration. (BOMA)

#### **Bulk Value**

The value of multiple units, subdivided plots, or properties in a portfolio as though sold together in a single transaction.

## Certificate of Occupancy (COO)

A formal written acknowledgment by an appropriate unit of local government that a new construction or renovation project is at the stage where it meets applicable health and safety codes and is ready for commercial or residential occupancy. (Dictionary)

### Common Area Maintenance (CAM)

The expense of operating and maintaining common areas; may or may not include management charges and usually does not include capital expenditures on tenant improvements or other improvements to the property. (Dictionary)

The amount of money charged to tenants for their shares of maintaining a [shopping] center's common area. The charge that a tenant pays for shared services and facilities such as electricity, security, and maintenance of parking lots. Items charged to common area maintenance may include cleaning services, parking lot sweeping and maintenance, snow removal, security and upkeep. (ICSC – International Council of Shopping Centers, 4<sup>th</sup> Ed.)

## Condominium

A multiunit structure, or a unit within such a structure, with a condominium form of ownership. (Dictionary)

## **Conservation Easement**

An interest in real estate restricting future land use to preservation, conservation, wildlife habitat, or some combination of those uses. A conservation easement may permit farming, timber harvesting, or other uses of a rural nature as well as some types of conservation-oriented development to continue, subject to the easement. (Dictionary)

## **Contributory Value**

A type of value that reflects the amount a property or component of a property contributes to the value of another asset or to the property as a whole.

The change in the value of a property as a whole, whether positive or negative, resulting from the addition or deletion of a property component. Also called deprival value in some countries. (Dictionary)



## Debt Coverage Ratio (DCR)

The ratio of net operating income to annual debt service (DCR = NOI/Im), which measures the relative ability of a property to meet its debt service out of net operating income; also called *debt service coverage ratio (DSCR)*. A larger *DCR* typically indicates a greater ability for a property to withstand a reduction of income, providing an improved safety margin for a lender. (Dictionary)

#### **Deed Restriction**

A provision written into a deed that limits the use of land. Deed restrictions usually remain in effect when title passes to subsequent owners. (Dictionary)

#### Depreciation

In appraisal, a loss in property value from any cause; the difference between the cost of an improvement on the effective date of the appraisal and the market value of the improvement on the same date.

In accounting, an allocation of the original cost of an asset, amortizing the cost over the asset's life; calculated using a variety of standard techniques. (Dictionary)

#### **Disposition Value**

The most probable price that a specified interest in property should bring under the following conditions:

- Consummation of a sale within a specified time, which is shorter than the typical exposure time for such a property in that market.
- The property is subjected to market conditions prevailing as of the date of valuation;
- Both the buyer and seller are acting prudently and knowledgeably;
- The seller is under compulsion to sell;
- The buyer is typically motivated;
- Both parties are acting in what they consider to be their best interests;
- An adequate marketing effort will be made during the exposure time;
- Payment will be made in cash in U.S. dollars (or the local currency) or in terms of financial arrangements comparable thereto; and
- The price represents the normal consideration for the property sold, unaffected by special or creative financing or sales concessions granted by anyone associated with the sale. (Dictionary)

#### Double Net (Net Net) Lease

An alternative term for a type of net lease. In some markets, a net net lease is defined as a lease in which the tenant is responsible to pay both property taxes and premiums for insuring the building(s). (Valbridge)

(The market definition of a double net lease varies depending on the market)

#### Easement

The right to use another's land for a stated purpose. (Dictionary)

#### EIFS

Exterior Insulation Finishing System. This is a type of exterior wall cladding system. Sometimes referred to as dry-vit.

## Effective Date

The date on which the appraisal or review opinion applies. (SVP)

In a lease document, the date upon which the lease goes into effect. (Dictionary)

### Effective Gross Income (EGI)

The anticipated income from all operations of the real estate after an allowance is made for vacancy and collection losses and an addition is made for any other income. (Dictionary)

#### **Effective Rent**

Total base rent, or minimum rent stipulated in a lease, over the specified lease term minus rent concessions; the rent that is effectively paid by a tenant net of financial concessions provided by a landlord. (TIs). (Dictionary)

#### EPDM

Ethylene Propylene Diene Monomer Rubber. A type of synthetic rubber typically used for roof coverings. (Dictionary)

#### **Escalation Clause**

A clause in an agreement that provides for the adjustment of a price or rent based on some event or index. e.g., a provision to increase rent if operating expenses increase; also called *escalator clause, expense recovery clause or stop clause.* (Dictionary)

#### **Estoppel Certificate**

A signed statement by a party (such as a tenant or a mortgagee) certifying, for another's benefit, that certain facts are correct, such as that a lease exists, that there are no defaults, and that rent is paid to a certain date. (Black's) In real estate, a buyer of rental property typically requests estoppel certificates from existing tenants. Sometimes referred to as an *estoppel letter*. (Dictionary)

#### **Excess Land**

Land that is not needed to serve or support the existing use. The highest and best use of the excess land may or may not be the same as the highest and best use of the improved parcel. Excess land has the potential to be sold separately and is valued separately. (Dictionary)



#### Excess Rent

The amount by which contract rent exceeds market rent at the time of the appraisal; created by a lease favorable to the landlord (lessor) and may reflect unusual management, unknowledgeable or unusually motivated parties, a lease execution in an earlier, stronger rental market, or an agreement of the parties. (Dictionary)

#### **Expense Stop**

A clause in a lease that limits the landlord's expense obligation, which results in the lessee paying operating expenses above a stated level or amount. (Dictionary)

### **Exposure Time**

The time a property remains on the market. The estimated length of time that the property interest being appraised would have been offered on the market prior to the hypothetical consummation of a sale at market value on the effective date of the appraisal;

**<u>Comment</u>**: Exposure time is a retrospective opinion based on an analysis of past events assuming a competitive and open market. (Dictionary)

### Extraordinary Assumption

An assignment-specific assumption as of the effective date regarding uncertain information used in an analysis which, if found to be false, could alter the appraiser's opinions or conclusions.

**<u>Comment</u>:** Uncertain information might include physical, legal, or economic characteristics of the subject property; or conditions external to the property, such as market conditions or trends; or the integrity of data used in an analysis. (USPAP)

#### Fee Simple Estate

Absolute ownership unencumbered by any other interest or estate, subject only to the limitations imposed by the governmental powers of taxation, eminent domain, police power, and escheat. (Dictionary)

#### Floor Common Area

In an office building, the areas on a floor such as washrooms, janitorial closets, electrical rooms, telephone rooms, mechanical rooms, elevator lobbies, and public corridors which are available primarily for the use of tenants on that floor. (BOMA)

#### Full Service (Gross) Lease

A lease in which the landlord receives stipulated rent and is obligated to pay all of the property's operating and fixed expenses; also called a *full service lease*. (Dictionary)

## Furniture, Fixtures, and Equipment (FF&E)

Business trade fixtures and personal property, exclusive of inventory. (Dictionary)

## Going-Concern Value

An outdated label for the market value of all the tangible and intangible assets of an established and operating business with an indefinite life, as if sold in aggregate; more accurately termed the *market value of the going concern* or *market value of the total assets of the business*. (Dictionary)

## Gross Building Area (GBA)

Total floor area of a building, excluding unenclosed areas, measured from the exterior of the walls of the abovegrade area. This includes mezzanines and basements if and when typically included in the market area of the type of property involved.

## Gross leasable area plus all common areas.

For residential space, the total area of all floor levels measured from the exterior of the walls and including the superstructure and substructure basement; typically does not include garage space. (Dictionary)

### Gross Measured Area

The total area of a building enclosed by the dominant portion (the portion of the inside finished surface of the permanent outer building wall which is 50 percent or more of the vertical floor-to-ceiling dimension, at the given point being measured as one moves horizontally along the wall), excluding parking areas and loading docks (or portions of same) outside the building line. It is generally not used for leasing purposes and is calculated on a floor by floor basis. (BOMA)

## Gross Up Method

A method of calculating variable operating expenses in income-producing properties when less than 100% occupancy is assumed. Expenses reimbursed based on the amount of occupied space, rather than on the total building area, are described as "grossed up." (Dictionary)

## **Gross Retail Sellout**

The sum of the separate and distinct market value opinions for each of the units in a condominium, subdivision development, or portfolio of properties, as of the date of valuation. The aggregate of retail values does not represent the value of all the units as though sold together in a single transaction; it is simply the total of the individual market value conclusions. Also called the *aggregate of the retail values, aggregate retail selling price or sum of the retail values.* (Dictionary)

#### Ground Lease

A lease that grants the right to use and occupy land. Improvements made by the ground lessee typically revert to the ground lessor at the end of the lease term. (Dictionary)



## Ground Rent

The rent paid for the right to use and occupy land according to the terms of a ground lease; the portion of the total rent allocated to the underlying land. (Dictionary)

## HVAC

Heating, ventilation, air conditioning (HVAC) system. A unit that regulates the temperature and distribution of heat and fresh air throughout a building. (Dictionary)

#### Highest and Best Use

The reasonably probable use of property that results in the highest value. The four criteria that the highest and best use must meet are legal permissibility, physical possibility, financial feasibility, and maximum productivity.

The use of an asset that maximizes its potential and that is possible, legally permissible, and financially feasible. The highest and best use may be for continuation of an asset's existing use of for some alternative use. This is determined by the use that a market participant would have in mind for the asset when formulating the price that it would be willing to bid. (IVS)

[The] highest and most profitable use for which the property is adaptable and needed or likely to be needed in the reasonably near future. (Uniform Appraisal Standards for Federal Land Acquisitions) (Dictionary)

## Hypothetical Condition

A condition, directly related to a specific assignment, which is contrary to what is known by the appraiser to exist on the effective date of the assignment results, but is used for the purpose of analysis.

**Comment:** Hypothetical conditions are contrary to known facts about physical, legal, or economic characteristics of the subject property; or about conditions external to the property, such as market conditions or trends; or about the integrity of data used in an analysis. (USPAP)

#### Insurable Value

A type of value for insurance purposes. (Typically this includes replacement cost less basement excavation, foundation, underground piping and architect's fees). (Dictionary)

#### Investment Value

The value of a property to a particular investor or class of investors based on the investor's specific requirements. Investment value may be different from market value because it depends on a set of investment criteria that are not necessarily typical of the market. (Dictionary)

## Just Compensation

In condemnation, the amount of loss for which a property owner is compensated when his or her property is taken. Just compensation should put the owner in as good a position pecuniarily as he or she would have been if the property had not been taken. (Dictionary)

#### Leased Fee Interest

The ownership interest held by the lessor, which includes the right to receive the contract rent specified in the lease plus the reversionary right when the lease expires. (Dictionary)

#### Leasehold Interest

The right held by the lessee to use and occupy real estate for a stated term and under the conditions specified in the lease. (Dictionary)

See also Positive Leasehold and Negative Leasehold.

### Lessee (Tenant)

One who has the right to occupancy and use of the property of another for a period of time according to a lease agreement. (Dictionary)

### Lessor (Landlord)

One who conveys the rights of occupancy and use to others under a lease agreement. (Dictionary)

## Liquidation Value

The most probable price that a specified interest in property should bring under the following conditions:

- Consummation of a sale within a short time period.
- The property is subjected to market conditions prevailing as of the date of valuation.
- Both the buyer and seller are acting prudently and knowledgeably.
- The seller is under extreme compulsion to sell.
- The buyer is typically motivated.
- Both parties are acting in what they consider to be their best interests.
- A normal marketing effort is not possible due to the brief exposure time.
- Payment will be made in cash in U.S. dollars (or the local currency) or in terms of financial arrangements comparable thereto.

The price represents the normal consideration for the property sold, unaffected by special or creative financing or sales concessions granted by anyone associated with the sale. (Dictionary)



#### Loan to Value Ratio (LTV)

The ratio between a mortgage loan and the value of the property pledged as security, usually expressed as a percentage. (Dictionary)

## **Major Vertical Penetrations**

Stairs, elevator shafts, flues, pipe shafts, vertical ducts, and the like, and their enclosing walls. Atria, lightwells and similar penetrations above the finished floor are included in this definition. Not included, however, are vertical penetrations built for the private use of a tenant occupying office areas on more than one floor. Structural columns, openings for vertical electric cable or telephone distribution, and openings for plumbing lines are not considered to be major vertical penetrations. (BOMA)

### Market Rent

The most probable rent that a property should bring in a competitive and open market under all the conditions requisite to a fair lease transaction, the lessee and the lessor each acting prudently and knowledgeably, and assuming the rent is not affected by undue stimulus. Implicit in this definition is the execution of a lease as of a specified date under conditions whereby:

Lessee and lessor are typically motivated;

Both parties are well informed or well advised, and acting in what they consider their best interests;

Payment is made in terms of cash or in terms of financial arrangements comparable thereto; and

The rent reflects specified terms and conditions, such as permitted uses, use restrictions, expense obligations, duration, concessions, rental adjustments and revaluations, renewal and purchase options, and tenant improvements (TIs). (Appraisal Institute)

#### Market Value

The most probable price that a property should bring in a competitive and open market under all conditions requisite to a fair sale, the buyer and seller each acting prudently and knowledgeably, and assuming the price is not affected by undue stimulus. Implicit in this definition is the consummation of a sale as of a specified date and the passing of title from seller to buyer under conditions whereby:

- Buyer and seller are typically motivated;
- Both parties are well informed or well advised, and acting in what they consider their own best interests;
- A reasonable time is allowed for exposure in the open market;
- Payment is made in terms of cash in United States dollars or in terms of financial arrangements comparable thereto; and
- The price represents the normal consideration for the property sold unaffected by special or creative

financing or sales concessions granted by anyone associated with the sale. (Dictionary)

## Marketing Time

An opinion of the amount of time it might take to sell a real or personal property interest at the concluded market value level during the period immediately after the effective date of an appraisal. Marketing time differs from exposure time, which is always presumed to precede the effective date of an appraisal. (Advisory Opinion 7 of the Appraisal Standards Board of the Appraisal Foundation)

#### Master Lease

A lease in which the fee owner leases a part or the entire property to a single entity (the master lease) in return for a stipulated rent. The master lessee then leases the property to multiple tenants. (Dictionary)

#### Modified Gross Lease

A lease in which the landlord receives stipulated rent and is obligated to pay some, but not all, of the property's operating and fixed expenses. Since assignment of expenses varies among modified gross leases, expense responsibility must always be specified. In some markets, a modified gross lease may be called a *double net lease*, *net net lease*, *partial net lease*, *or semi-gross lease*. (Dictionary)

## Negative Leasehold

A lease situation in which the market rent is less than the contract rent. (Dictionary)

## Operating Expense Ratio

The ratio of total operating expenses to effective gross income (TOE/EGI); the complement of the net income ratio, i.e., OER = 1 - NIR (Dictionary)

## Option

A legal contract, typically purchased for a stated consideration, that permits but does not require the holder of the option (known as the *optionee*) to buy, sell, or lease real estate for a stipulated period of time in accordance with specified terms; a unilateral right to exercise a privilege. (Dictionary)

#### **Partial Interest**

Divided or undivided rights in real estate that represent less than the whole, i.e., a fractional interest such as a tenancy in common, easement, or life interest. (Dictionary)

#### Pass Through

A tenant's portion of operating expenses that may be composed of common area maintenance (CAM), real property taxes, property insurance, and any other expenses determined in the lease agreement to be paid by the tenant. (Dictionary)



## Percentage Lease

A lease in which the rent or some portion of the rent represents a specified percentage of the volume of business, productivity, or use achieved by the tenant. (Dictionary)

#### **Positive Leasehold**

A lease situation in which the market rent is greater than the contract rent. (Dictionary)

#### Potential Gross Income (PGI)

The total income attributable to property at full occupancy before vacancy and operating expenses are deducted. (Dictionary)

#### Prospective Future Value Upon Completion

A prospective market value may be appropriate for the valuation of a property interest related to a credit decision for a proposed development or renovation project. According to USPAP, an appraisal with a prospective market value reflects an effective date that is subsequent to the date of the appraisal report. ... The prospective market value –as completed- reflects the property's market value as of the time that development is expected to be complete. (Dictionary)

#### Prospective Future Value Upon Stabilization

A prospective market value may be appropriate for the valuation of a property interest related to a credit decision for a proposed development or renovation project. According to USPAP, an appraisal with a prospective market value reflects an effective date that is subsequent to the date of the appraisal report ...The prospective market value – as stabilized – reflects the property's market value as of the time the property is projected to achieve stabilized occupancy. For an income-producing property, stabilized occupancy is the occupancy level that a property is expected to achieve after the property is exposed to the market for lease over a reasonable period of time and at comparable terms and conditions to other similar properties. (Dictionary)

#### Replacement Cost

The estimated cost to construct, at current prices as of a specific date, a substitute for a building or other improvements, using modern materials and current standards, design, and layout. (Dictionary)

#### **Reproduction Cost**

The estimated cost to construct, at current prices as of the effective date of the appraisal, an exact duplicate or replica of the building being appraised, using the same materials, construction standards, design, layout, and quality of workmanship and embodying all of the deficiencies, superadequacies, and obsolescence of the subject building. (Dictionary)

#### **Retrospective Value Opinion**

A value opinion effective as of a specified historical date. The term *retrospective* does not define a type of value. Instead, it identifies a value opinion as being effective at some specific prior date. Value as of a historical date is frequently sought in connection with property tax appeals, damage models, lease renegotiation, deficiency judgments, estate tax, and condemnation. Inclusion of the type of value with this term is appropriate, e.g., "retrospective market value opinion." (Dictionary)

#### Sandwich Leasehold Estate

The interest held by the sandwich leaseholder when the property is subleased to another party; a type of leasehold estate. (Dictionary)

#### Sublease

An agreement in which the lessee in a prior lease conveys the right of use and occupancy of a property to another, the sublessee, for a specific period of time, which may or may not be coterminous with the underlying lease term. (Dictionary)

## Subordination

A contractual arrangement in which a party with a claim to certain assets agrees to make his or her claim junior, or subordinate, to the claims of another party. (Dictionary)

#### Surplus Land

Land that is not currently needed to support the existing use but cannot be separated from the property and sold off for another use. Surplus land does not have an independent highest and best use and may or may not contribute value to the improved parcel. (Dictionary)

## TPO

Thermoplastic polyolefin, a resilient synthetic roof covering.

#### Triple Net (Net Net Net) Lease

An alternative term for a type of net lease. In some markets, a net net net lease is defined as a lease in which the tenant assumes all expenses (fixed and variable) of operating a property except that the landlord is responsible for structural maintenance, building reserves, and management; also called *NNN lease, net net net lease, or fully net lease.* (Dictionary)

(The market definition of a triple net lease varies; in some cases tenants pay for items such as roof repairs, parking lot repairs, and other similar items.)

#### Usable Area

The measured area of an office area, store area, or building common area on a floor. The total of all the usable areas for a floor shall equal floor usable area of that same floor. (BOMA)



## Value-in-Use

The value of a property assuming a specific use, which may or may not be the property's highest and best use on the effective date of the appraisal. Value in use may or may not be equal to market value but is different conceptually. (Dictionary)

## VTAB

Value of the Total Assets of a Business. The value of a going concern (i.e. the business enterprise). (Dictionary)



Qualifications



## Qualifications of Arthur L. Schwertz, MAI Senior Managing Director Valbridge Property Advisors | South Louisiana

## Independent Valuations for a Variable World

State Certifications
Certified General in:
Louisiana
Mississippi
Alabama
Texas
Virginia
California
Arizona
Kentucky
Tennessee
North Carolina
Maryland

## Education

Bachelor of Arts History Louisiana State University

## **Contact Details**

504-541-5101 (p) 504-541-5107 (f) <u>aschwertz@valbridge.com</u> (e)

Valbridge Property Advisors | South Louisiana 2030 Dickory Avenue Suite 200 New Orleans, LA 70123

www.valbridge.com/south-louisiana



	Membership/Affiliations
	Member: Appraisal Institute – MAI Designation Louisiana Chapter President, 2017
	Member: Celebration Church Administrative Team (Corporate Secretary)
	Appraisal Institute & Related Courses Continuing education courses taken through the Appraisal Institute and other real estate organizations.
	Publications, Seminars Presented, etc. "Contract or Effective Rent: Finding the Real Rent", Appraisal Institute, Austin, Texas, 2019.
	"Contract or Effective Rent: Finding the Real Rent", Appraisal Institute, Baton Rouge, Louisiana, 2016.
	"Appraising Commercial and Complex Properties in an Historic Area", Webinar for the Appraisal Institute, 2015.
	"The Unique Appraisal: Case Studies in Appraising Special Purpose Properties", Al Connect 2014 (Appraisal Institute's National Meeting), Austin, Texas, 2014.
/	Schwertz, Arthur L. 2014. "History Lesson", <i>Valuation Magazine 2<sup>nd</sup> Quarter, 2014</i> , 12 – 13.
	Huso, Deborah R. 2013. "On the Waterfront", <i>Valuation Magazine 2<sup>nd</sup> Quarter, 2013,</i> 22 – 27. (Contributor)
<u>n</u> (e)	<u>Experience</u> Senior Managing Director Valbridge Property Advisors   South Louisiana (2013-Present)
ors	Vice-President Argote, Derbes, Graham, Shuffield & Tatje, Inc. (1992-2013)

Appraisal/valuation and consulting assignments include (but not limited to): Single-family, condominium, apartments, vacant land, funeral homes, amphitheaters, live performance theaters, office buildings, hospitals, nursing homes, specialized healthcare, hotels/motels, service stations, retail, industrial plants, warehouses, fractional interest valuations, contaminated properties, special purpose properties (port facilities, nuclear reactor simulator facility, shipyards, etc.), senior residential and healthcare facilities, feasibility studies, market studies, condemnation, construction defects, litigation support, mediations, and review appraisals.

Mr. Schwertz has provided valuation services in a wide variety of complex civil litigation including real estate, land use cases, condemnation, estate matters, property taxation, construction defect, and bankruptcy/creditors matters.

Qualified as an expert witness in Terrebonne, Jefferson, Orleans, and St. Tammany Parishes, Dallas County, Texas, Indiana Board of Tax Review, United States Court of Federal Claims, United States Court for the Eastern District of Louisiana and the United States Bankruptcy Court for the Middle District of Louisiana.



## ARTHUR L. SCHWERTZ, MAI

#### Designations, Associations and Professional Awards

- Louisiana Certified General Real Estate Appraiser; License No. G-0932
- Mississippi Certified General Real Estate Appraiser; License No. GA-633
- Alabama Certified General Real Estate Appraiser; License No. G00937
- Texas Certified General Real Estate Appraiser, License No. TX-1337393-G
- California Certified General Real Estate Appraiser, License No. 3005682
- Virginia Certified General Real Estate Appraiser, License No. 400101572
- Arizona Certified General Real Estate Appraiser, License No. 1003038
- North Carolina Certified General Real Estate Appraiser, License No. A8506
- Tennessee Certified General Real Estate Appraiser, License No. 5810
- Kentucky Certified General Real Estate Appraiser, License No. 5470
- Maryland Certified General Real Estate Appraiser, License No. 40034070
- Member of the Appraisal Institute, MAI Certificate No. 12678
- Instructor of the Appraisal Institute
- Secretary, Louisiana Chapter of the Appraisal Institute, 2014
- Treasurer, Louisiana Chapter of the Appraisal Institute, 2015
- Vice-President, Louisiana Chapter of the Appraisal Institute, 2016
- President, Louisiana Chapter of the Appraisal Institute, 2017

#### Civic Organizations

- 1982 Eagle Scout, Boy Scouts of America
- 1983 Vigil Honor Member, Order of the Arrow, Boy Scouts of America
- 1999 2001 Board of Directors, Berean Bible Church, New Orleans, Louisiana
- 2000 2001 Treasurer, Berean Bible Church, New Orleans, Louisiana
- 2008 2010 School Board Chairman, Crescent City Christian School, Metairie, Louisiana.
- 2008 Present Board of Directors, Celebration Church, Metairie, Louisiana
- 2010 Present Corporate Secretary, Celebration Church, Metairie, Louisiana



## ARTHUR L. SCHWERTZ, MAI

## Expert Witness Experience

- Expert Witness, United States Court of Federal Claims
- Expert Witness, United States Bankruptcy Court, Middle and Eastern Districts of Louisiana
- Expert Witness, United States Federal Court, Eastern District of Louisiana
- Expert Witness, Civil District Court for the Parish of Orleans, State of Louisiana.
- Expert Witness, State Civil District Court, Dallas County, State of Texas.
- Expert Witness, Louisiana Tax Commission
- Expert Witness, Circuit Court for the City of Norfolk, Virginia
- Expert Witness, 9<sup>th</sup> JDC, 23<sup>rd</sup> JDC and 32<sup>nd</sup> JDC, State of Louisiana
- Expert Witness, Indiana Board of Tax Review, State of Indiana

## **Court Testimony**

2020	GIV Green Tree Mall Investor, LLC v. Clark County Assessor, Petition Nos. 10-011-17-1-4-02088-17, 10-011-18-1-4-00149-20 and 10-011-19-1-4-00150-20, Indiana Board of Tax Review, State of Indiana.
2020	Low Land Investors, LLC, Low Land Construction Co., Inc. v. New Generation Shipbuilding, LLC, Case No. 180743, 32 <sup>nd</sup> Judicial District for Terrebonne Parish, State of Louisiana (Deposition/Testimony)
2020	Cella III, LLC v. Jefferson Parish Hospital District No. 2, Civil Action No. EDLA 19-11528, Bankruptcy No. 19-01145, United States District Court for the Eastern District of Louisiana (Deposition/Testimony)
2020	Elizabeth Sewell, et al v. Sewerage & Water Board of New Orleans, Docket No. 15-4501, Division D- 12, Civil District Court, Parish of Orleans, State of Louisiana (Deposition)
2019	Virginia Natural Gas, Inc. v. Colonna's Ship Yard, Incorporated, Case No. CL18-2169, Circuit Court for the City of Norfolk, State of Virginia (Deposition)
2018	Jeannette C. Liebman, Wife of/and Paul E. Ramoni, Jr. v. The United States, Docket No. 14-1165, United States Court of Federal Claims (Testimony)
2016	Appeal of Filmore Parc Apartments v. Orleans Parish Board of Review, Docket Nos. 16-22173-001 and 16-22173-002, Louisiana Tax Commission, State of Louisiana. (Testimony)
2016	Appeal of Fulton Development (Harrah's Hotel) v. Orleans Parish Board of Review, Docket No. 16- 22171-002, Louisiana Tax Commission, State of Louisiana (Testimony)
2016	Jeannette C. Liebman and Paul E. Ramoni, Jr. v. United States of America, Case No. 14-1165 L, United States Court of Federal Claims (Deposition)
2016	State of Louisiana, Department of Transportation & Development v. Northport Properties Partnership, Et Al, Docket No. 233,894, 9 <sup>th</sup> Judicial District, Parish of Rapides, State of Louisiana (Deposition)
2015	Appeal of Filmore Parc Apartments v. Orleans Parish Board of Review, Docket Nos. 15-22173-018 and 15-22173-019, Louisiana Tax Commission, State of Louisiana. (Testimony)



### ARTHUR L. SCHWERTZ, MAI

### Court Testimony (Continued)

- 2015 Doretha Z. Walker et al vs. AMID/Metro Partnership, LLC and City of New Orleans, Docket No. 07-14794, Division H-14, Civil District Court for the Parish of Orleans, State of Louisiana. (Testimony)
- 2015 Sandra Oubre Sotile, Et Al vs Dooley Oubre, Et Al, Docket No. 110,622, 23<sup>rd</sup> Judicial District Court, Ascension Parish, Louisiana (Deposition)
- 2014 North Shore Lodging, LLC vs Commonwealth Land Title Insurance Company, Case No. 2:2013cv06070, United States Court for the Eastern District of Louisiana (Deposition)
- 2014 Appeal of Filmore Parc Apartments v. Orleans Parish Board of Review, Docket Nos. 14-22173-003 and 14-22173-004, Louisiana Tax Commission, State of Louisiana. (Testimony)
- 2014 State Bank of Texas vs. Granbury Hospitality Inc., et al, Cause No. DC-12-06398, 44<sup>th</sup> State Civil District Court, Dallas County, State of Texas. (Testimony)
- 2013 Bruce L. Feingerts v Succession of Doris Feingerts, et al, Adversary Proceeding No. 2011-9918, Civil District Court for the Parish of Orleans, State of Louisiana. (Testimony)
- 2012 Consolidated Cases of Percy J. Marchand versus Entergy New Orleans, Inc., Docket No. 2009-12695 AND Omar Duncan, Et Al, vs. Entergy New Orleans, Inc., Docket No. 2010-0714 AND Leroy Anthony Vignaud versus Entergy New Orleans, Inc. Docket No. 2010-5566, Division "C" of the Civil District Court for the Parish of Orleans, State of Louisiana. (Deposition)
- 2011 Pleasant View Development, LLC v Charles Anthony Bonaventure, Gina Bonaventure Porciau, Charles R. St. Romain, and Patin Engineers and Surveyors, Inc., Adversary Proceeding No. 10-1024, United States Bankruptcy Court, Middle District of Louisiana (Testimony)
- 2011 1522 R.E. Lee Blvd., LLC v. Bank of New Orleans, Civil District Court for the Parish of Orleans, State of Louisiana (Deposition)

## Partial List of Appraisal Assignments Completed

#### Water and Wastewater Systems

Resolve Water, Slidell, LA

Coast Water, Slidell, LA

H20 Water and Wastewater, St. Tammany Parish, LA

Mo-Dad Utilities, Tangipahoa, Livingston, West Baton Rouge, East Baton Rouge and West Feliciana Parishes, LA

Scientific System, Jacksonville, NC

Center Ridge System, Murray, KY

Blue Creek Utilities, Jacksonville, NC

Delaplain Utilities, Georgetown, KY

River Bluff Wastewater System, River Bluff, KY

#### <u>Major Retail</u>

Green Tree Mall (±443,933 square feet), Clarksville, IN

Northshore Square Mall (±621,192 square feet), Slidell, LA

The Shoppes at Fremaux (±600,000 square feet), Slidell, LA Slidell Factory Outlet Mall, Slidell, LA Southland Mall (±600,000 square feet), Houma, LA The Plaza (±1,200,000 square feet), New Orleans, LA Belle Promenade (±750,000 square feet), Marrero, LA Jax Brewery, New Orleans, LA River Marketplace Shopping Center, Lafayette, LA Natchez Mall (±268,857 square feet), Natchez, MS Bradley Square Mall (568,508 square feet), Cleveland, TN



#### ARTHUR L. SCHWERTZ, MAI

## Partial List of Appraisal Assignments Completed (Continued)

#### **Healthcare**

Gilchrist at Stadium Place, Baltimore, MD Savoy Medical Center, Mamou, LA Methodist Hospital, New Orleans, LA Lakeland Hospital, New Orleans, LA Shriner's Hospital, New Orleans, LA Fairway Surgical Hospital, Covington, LA Southpark Hospital, Lafayette, LA St. James Parish Hospital, St. James, LA Green Clinic and Surgery Center, Ruston, LA Numerous Nursing Homes throughout Louisiana Lambeth House Assisted Living, New Orleans, LA O'Connor Hospital, San Jose, CA St. Louise Regional Medical Center, Gilroy, CA St. Vincent Medical Center, Los Angeles, CA Rosewood Assisted Living Facility, Charlottesville, VA

#### Industrial

Colonna's Shipyard, Norfolk, VA Signal International Shipyard, Orange, TX Signal International Shipyard, Mobile, AL Signal International Shipyard, Port Arthur, TX Signal International Shipyard, Pascagoula, MS Bender Shipyard, Mobile, AL Plastic Infusion Plant, Hammond, LA UBT Coal Transfer Facility, Davant, LA Trinity Yachts, Gulfport, MS Trinity Yachts, New Orleans, LA Coca-Cola Facility, Thibodaux, LA LaShip Shipyard, Houma, LA Dow Chemical Plant, Norco, LA Port of St. Bernard, St. Bernard, LA Owensboro Riverport, Owensboro, KY Toulouse Street Wharf, Port of New Orleans, LA Mississippi River Dock, Venice, LA Port of Iberia, New Iberia, LA. Kaiser Site, Port of Greater Baton Rouge, LA

Proposed Port of Cameron, Cameron, LA Union Tank Car Plant, Alexandria, LA

#### Entertainment/Leisure

Dixie Landing Amusement Park, Baton Rouge, LA Blue Bayou Water Park, Baton Rouge, LA Proposed Aqualand Water Park, Dayton, TX Saenger Theatre, New Orleans, LA Orpheum Theatre, New Orleans, LA Vina Robles Amphitheatre, Paso Robles, CA House of Blues, New Orleans, LA The Oaks Golf Course, Pass Christian, MS Money Hill Golf Course, Abita Springs, LA Pelican Pointe Golf Course, Gonzales, LA Colonial Country Club, Harahan, LA O'Neal Theatres, Louisiana/Mississippi Antoine's Restaurant, New Orleans, LA AMC Theatres, Metairie/Hammond/Houma, LA Southern Belle Casino, St. Francisville, LA Bayou Marina, Casino and Hotel, Chalmette, LA Lucky Deuces Casino, Greensburg, LA Lafitte Harbor Marina, Lafitte, LA Vinot Marina, New Orleans, LA River Highlands Marina, Ascension Parish, LA Kemper Marina, Gulfport, MS C and M Marina, Lafitte, LA Cypress Cove Marina, Venice, LA Starlight Movie Studios, New Orleans, LA **Schools** 

Clifton L. Ganus Academy, New Orleans, LA Mt. Carmel Academy, New Orleans, LA Israel Augustine School, New Orleans, LA Millerville Academy, Baton Rouge, LA Louise S. McGhee School, New Orleans, LA Stuart Hall Academy, New Orleans, LA Believer's Life Academy, Marrero, LA

© 2021 VALBRIDGE PROPERTY ADVISORS | New Orleans

Page 44 Case No. 2022-00432 Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8 Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 107 of 327



#### ARTHUR L. SCHWERTZ, MAI

#### Partial List of Appraisal Assignments Completed (Continued)

#### Special Purpose Properties

Nuclear Reactor Simulator Facility, St. Francisville, LA Statewide Economic Obsolescence Study for Hibernia Bank, State of Louisiana Mitigation Bank, St. James Parish, LA Mitigation Bank, Livingston Parish, LA Mitigation Bank, East Baton Rouge Parish, LA Elmer's Island, Jefferson Parish, LA USPS Facilities throughout Louisiana and Mississippi Multi-Family Shadowlake Apartments, Harvey, LA Citrus Creek Apartments, Harahan, LA Palmetto Creek Apartments, Harahan, LA The Reserve at Acadiana, Lafayette, LA Gravier Place Apartments, New Orleans, LA The Saulet Apartments, New Orleans, LA Town Oaks Apartments, Shreveport, LA University Edge Apartments, Hattiesburg, MS Legacy Condominiums Phase I, Gulfport, MS Legacy Condominiums Phase II, Gulfport, MS

South Beach Condominiums, Biloxi, MS

#### <u>Hotels</u>

Super 7 Motel, Lafayette, LA Harrah's Hotel, New Orleans, LA Candlewoods Suites Hotel, Houma, LA Candlewoods Suites Hotel, Lafayette, LA Hyatt House Hotel, Columbus, MS Hampton Inn, Harahan, LA Hampton Inn, Metairie, LA Hampton Inn Convention Center, New Orleans, LA Hampton Inn Uptown, New Orleans, LA Hampton Inn, Mobile, AL Courtyard by Marriott, Metairie, LA, Baton Rouge, Residence Inn, Metairie, LA Quality Inn, Opelousas, LA LaQuinta, Slidell, LA Historic French Market Inn, New Orleans, LA Wyndham Hotel, Metairie, LA Holiday Inn Superdome, New Orleans, LA Hilton Garden Inn, Kenner, LA Hilton Garden Inn LA **Office Buildings** Xerox Centre, Kenner, LA Park Tower, Lafayette, LA Former Stewart Enterprises Building, Metairie, LA First NBC Building, New Orleans, LA Executive Plaza, New Orleans, LA Chase Tower, Houma, LA Maison Blanche Building, New Orleans, LA Yenni Office Building, Harahan, LA Dominion Tower, New Orleans, LA Elmwood Tower, Harahan, LA Freeport-McMoran Building, New Orleans, LA Entergy Building, New Orleans, LA 1250 Poydras Building, New Orleans, LA **Subdivisions** Ashton Plantation, Luling, LA Acadiana Subdivision, Marrero, LA Acadian Villas, Marrero, LA The Arbors at English Turn, New Orleans, LA Plantation Acres, Thibodaux, LA Woodstone Subdivision, Mandeville, LA Southlake Villages, Kenner, LA Village Green Subdivision, Harvey, LA Oak Island Subdivision, New Orleans, LA


# FAST FACTS

## COMPANY INFORMATION

- Valbridge is the largest independent national commercial real estate valuation and advisory services firm in North America.
  - o Total number of MAI-designated appraisers: 200+ on staff
  - o Total number of office locations: 70+ across U.S.
  - o Total number of staff: 675+ strong
- Valbridge covers the entire U.S. from coast to coast.
- Valbridge services all property types, including special-purpose properties.
- Valbridge provides independent valuation services. We are not owned by a brokerage firm or investment company.
- Every Valbridge office is led by a senior managing director who holds the MAI designation of the Appraisal Institute.
- Valbridge is owned by our local office leaders.
- Valbridge welcomes single-property assignments as well as portfolio, multi-market and other bulk-property engagements.

Valbridge Property Advisors, Inc. 2240 Venetian Court • Naples, FL 34109 • Phone: (888) 981-2029 www.valbridge.com





ALABAMA

4732 Woodmere Bo levard Montgomery, AL 36106 334.277.5077

200 Cahaba Park Circle Suite 213 Birmingham, AL 35242 205.440.2998

ARIZONA 6061 E. Grant Road Suite 121 Tucson, AZ 85712 520.321.0000

CALIFORNIA 4915 Calloway Drive Suite 101 Bakersfield CA 93312 661.587 1010

1370 N. Brea Boulevard Suite 255 Fulierton, CA 92835 714.449.0852

2813 Coffee Road Suite E-2 Modesto, CA 95355 209.569.0450

99 S. Lake Avenue Suite 21 Pasadena, CA 91101 626.744.0428

3090 Fite Circle Suite 202 Sacramento, CA 95827 916.361.2509

55 South Market Street Suite 1210 San Jose, CA 95113 408.279.1520

1306 Higuera Street San Luis Obispo, CA 93401 805.544.2472

3160 Crow Canyon Place Suite 245 San Ramon, CA 94583 925.327.1660

COLORADO 7445 E. Peakview Aver Centennial, CO 80111 303.443.9600

5345 Arapahoe Avenue Suite 7 Boulder, CO 80303 303 443 9600

23272 Two Rivers Road Unit 101 Basalt CO 81621 970.340,1016

1099 Main Avenue Suite 311 Durango, CO 81301 970.340.1016

CONNECTICUT 15 Concord Street Glastonbury, CT 06033 860,246,4606

17 Covewood Drive Norwalk, CT 06853 203.288.6520

CORPORATE OFFICE

FLORIDA 2240 Venetian Court Naples, FL 34109 239.514.4646

301 Almeria Avenue Suite 350 Coral Gables, FL 33134 305.639.8029

10950 San Jose Boulevard

Jacksonville, FL 32223 844.822.7825 734 Rugby Street Orlando, FL 32804 844.822.7825

2601 W Horatio Street Unit 6 Tampa, FL 33609 844.822.7825

2711 Poinsettia Avenue West Palm Beach, FL 33407 561.833.5331

GEORGIA 2675 Paces Ferry Road Suite 145 Atlanta, GA 30339 678.644.4853

IDAHO 1459 Tyrell Lane Suite B Boise, ID 83706 208.336.1097

1875 N. Lakewood Drive Suite 100 Coeur d'Alene. ID 83814 208.292.2965

ILLINOIS 566 W. Lake Street Suite 240 Chicago, IL 60661 312.288.8687

INDIANA 820 Fort Wayne Avenue Indianapolis, IN 46204 317.687.2747

KANSAS 10990 Quivira Road Suite 100 Overland Park, KS 66210 913.451.1451

KENTUCKY 9000 Wessex Place Suite 306 Louisville, KY 40222 502.585.3651

I OUISIANA 2030 Dickory Avenue Suite 200 New Orleans, LA 70123 504.541.5100

MARYLAND 11100 Dovedale Court Marriottsville, MD 21104 443,333,5522

MASSACHUSETTS 260 Bear Hill Road Suite 106 Waltham MA 02451 781.790.5645

2240 Venetian Court Naples, FL 34109

MICHIGAN 1420 Washington Blvd. Suite 301 Detroit, MI 48226 313.986.3313.

MICHIGAN (cont'd) 2127 University Park Drive Suite 390 Okemos, MI 48864 517.336.0001

MINNESOTA 255 East Kellogg Bo Suite 102A St. Paul, MN 55101 651.370.1475

MISSISSIPPI 1010 Ford Street Gulfport, MS 39507 228,604,1900

737 Highway 51 Suite 1C Madison, MS 39110 601.853.0736

501 Highway 12 West Suite 150-M Starkville, MS 39759 662.617.2350

MISSOURI 1118 Hampton Av Suite 208 St Louis, MO 63139 314.255-1323

10990 Quivira Road Suite 100 Overland Park, KS 66210

NEVADA 3034 S. Durango Drive Suite 100 Las Vegas, NV 89117 702 242 9369

913.451.1451

6490 S McCarran Blvd #51 Reno, NV 89509 775.204.4100

NEW JERSEY 2740 Route 10 West, Suite 204 Morris Plains, NJ 07950 973.970.9333

3500 Route 9 South, Suite 202 Howell, NJ 07731 732.807.3113

NEW YORK 424 West 33rd Street Suite 630 New York, NY 10001 212.268.1113

NORTH CAROLINA 412 E. Chatham Street Cary, NC 27511 919.859.2666

5950 Fairview Road, Suite 405 Charlotte, NC 28210 704 376 5400

OHIO 1655 W. Market Street Suite 130 Akron, OH 44313 330,899,9900

239-325-8234 phone 239-325-8356 fax

OHIO (cont'd) 8291 Beechmont Ave. Suite B Cincinnali, OH 45255 513,785,0820

1422 Euclid Avenue Suite 616 Cleveland, OH 44115 216.367.9690

OKLAHOMA 5909 NW Expressway Suite 104

Oklahoma City, OK 73132 405.603.1553 6666 South Sheridan Road

Suite 104 Tulsa, OK 74133 918.712.9992

PENNSYLVANIA 150 S. Warner Road Suite 440 King of Prussia, PA 19406 215.545.1900

4701 Baptist Road Suite 304 Pittsburgh, PA 15227 412.881.6080

SOUTH CAROLINA 11 Cleveland Court Greenville, SC 29607 864.233.6277

920 Bay Street Suite 26 Beaufort, SC 29902 843.342.2302

1250 Fairmont Avenue Mt. Pleasant, SC 29464 843.881.1266

TENNESSEE 5205 Maryland Way Suite 300 Brentwood, TN 37027 615.369.0670

701 Broad Street Suite 209 Chattanooga, TN 37402

213 Fox Road Knoxville, TN 37922 865.522.2424

423.285.8435

756 Ridge Lake Blvd Suite 225 Memphis, TN 38120 901.753.6977

TEXAS 901 Mopac Expressway South Building 1, Suite 300 Austin TX 78746 737.242.8585

10210 North Central Expressway Suite 115 Dallas, TX 75231 214.446.1611

974 Campbell Road Suite 204 Houston, TX 77024 713.467.5858

2731 81st Street Lubbock, TX 79423 806.744.1188

TEXAS (cont'd) 9901 IH-10 West Suite 1035 San Antonio, TX 78230 210.227.6229

UTAH 321 North County Boulevard Unit D American Fork, UT 84003 801.492.9328

1100 East 6600 South Suite 201 Salt Lake City, UT 84121 801.262.3388

20 North Main Suite 304 St. George, UT 84770 435.773.6300

VIRGINIA 656 Indepe Suite 220 Chesapeake, VA 23320 757,410.1222

4914 Fitzhugh Avenue Suite 102 Richmond, VA 23230 757-345-0010

5107 Center Street Unit 2B Williamsburg, VA 23188 757,345.0010

#### WASHINGTON

8378 W. Grandridge Boulevard Suite 110-D Kennewick WA 99336 509.221.1540

25923 Washingon Blvd, NE Suite 300 Kingston, WA 98346 360 649 7300

324 N, Mullan Road Spokane Valley, WA 99206 509,747,0999

WISCONSIN 12660 W. North Avenue Brookfield, WI 53005 262.782.7990

Each Valbridge office is independently owned and operated. Case No. 2022-00432 Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8 Exhibit PSC 3-8

Page 110 of 327

Spring 2021



## **Appraisal Report**

Delaplain Disposal Company W Yusen Way Georgetown, Scott County, Kentucky 40324

Report Date: 08-12-2019



#### FOR:

Central States Water Resource Ms. Sandy Neal Regional Director of Utility Acquisitions 500 Northwest Plaza Drive, Suite 500 St. Ann, Missouri 63074

## Valbridge Property Advisors

2030 Dickory Avenue, Suite 200 New Orleans, LA 70123 504.541.5100 phone 504.541.5107 fax *valbridge.com* 

Valbridge File Number: LA01-19-0166.000

Case No. 2022-00432 Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8 Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 111 of 327



2030 Dickory Avenue, Suite 200 New Orleans, LA 70123 504.541.5100 phone 504.541.5107 fax valbridge.com

08-12-2019

Arthur L. Schwertz MAI 504.541.5101 aschwertz@valbridge.com

Ms. Sandy Neal Regional Director of Utility Acquisitions Central States Water Resource 500 Northwest Plaza Drive, Suite 500 St. Ann, Missouri 63074

RE: Appraisal Report Delaplain Disposal Company W Yusen Way Georgetown, Scott County, Kentucky 40324

Dear Ms. Neal:

In accordance with your request, we have performed an appraisal of the above referenced property. This appraisal report sets forth the pertinent data gathered, the techniques employed, and the reasoning leading to our value opinions. This letter of transmittal is not valid if separated from the appraisal report.

The subject property, as referenced above, is located in the residential subdivisions of Deer Run, Moonlake Estates, Shuttle Run and Riffton Meadows as well as the Delaplain Industrial Park and is further identified as tax parcel numbers 161-20-002.000. The appraised property is comprised of a fee simple site (sewer plant site) which contains 1.5014 Acres. In addition, to the Fee Simple site, the appraised properties include approximately 23,469 LF of utility easements through the Residential Subdivisions of Deer Run, Moonlake Estates, Shuttle Run and Riffton Meadows and approximately 12,000 LF of utility easements through the Industrial Park. Said easements contain a total of approximately 387,765 square feet of Residential land and 180,012 square feet of Industrial Land.

We developed our analyses, opinions, and conclusions and prepared this report in conformity with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP) of the Appraisal Foundation; the Code of Professional Ethics and Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice of the Appraisal Institute; and the requirements of our client as we understand them.

© 2019 VALBRIDGE PROPERTY ADVISORS



Ms. Sandy Neal Central States Water Resource Page 2

The client in this assignment is Central States Water Resource and the intended user of this report is Central States Water Resources and no others. The sole intended use is for regulatory filings. The value opinions reported herein are subject to the definitions, assumptions, limiting conditions, and certifications contained in this report.

The findings and conclusions are further contingent upon the following extraordinary assumptions and/or hypothetical conditions, the use of which might have affected the assignment results:

### Extraordinary Assumptions:

• None

## Hypothetical Conditions:

• This report is predicated upon the hypothetical condition that the property is vacant land unencumbered by the existing improvements. In other words, this appraisal is of the underlying land as if vacant and ready for development.

Based on the analysis contained in the following report, our value conclusions are summarized as follows:

Value Conclusions					
Component	As Is	As Is			
Value Type	Market Value	Market Value			
Property Rights Appraised	Easement	Fee Simple			
Effective Date of Value	July 23, 2019	July 23, 2019			
Value Conclusion	\$681,500	\$195,000			
	\$1.28 psf	\$2.98 psf			

Respectfully submitted, Valbridge Property Advisors

H 2,

Arthur L. Schwertz, MAI Senior Managing Director Kentucky Certified General Real Property Appraiser #5470



## **Table of Contents**

Cover Page	
Letter of Transmittal	
Table of Contents	i
Summary of Salient Facts	ii
Aerial and Front Views	iii
Location Map	iv
Introduction	1
Scope of Work	4
Regional and Market Area Analysis	6
Site Description	9
Subject Photos	14
Highest and Best Use	16
Land Valuation	17
Valuation Summary	23
General Assumptions and Limiting Conditions	24
Certification – Arthur L. Schwertz	29
Addenda	30
Glossary	31
Qualifications of Arthur L. Schwertz, MAI	39
Valbridge Property Advisors Information / Office Locations	40



## Summary of Salient Facts

# Property Identification Property Name Delaplain Disposal Company

Property Address	W Yusen Way
	Georgetown, Scott County, Kentucky 40324
Latitude & Longitude	38.28586, -84.555967
Tax Parcel Number	161-20-002.000
Property Owner	Delaplain Disposal Company
Site	
Zoning	Residential and Industrial (R-1, R-1B and I-1)
FEMA Flood Map No.	0
Flood Zone	0
Fee Simple Site Area	1.501 acres
Residential Easement Area	8.902 acres
Industrial Easement Area	4.133 acres
Valuation Opinions	
Highest & Best Use - As Vacant	Residential Easement Land - Single Family Residential;
	Industrial Easement Land - Industrial
Reasonable Exposure Time	Less than 12 months
Reasonable Marketing Time	Less than 12 months

Value Indications					
Approach to Value	As Is	As Is			
Sales Comparison	\$681,500	\$195,000			
Cost	Not Developed	Not Developed			
Income Capitalization	Not Developed				
Value Conclusions					
Component	As Is	As Is			
Value Type	Market Value	Market Value			
Property Rights Appraised	Easement	Fee Simple			
Effective Date of Value	July 23, 2019	July 23, 2019			
Value Conclusion	\$681,500	\$195,000			
	\$1.28 psf	\$2.98 psf			



DELAPLAIN DISPOSAL COMPANY AERIAL AND FRONT VIEWS

## **Aerial and Front Views**

**AERIAL VIEW** 



**FRONT VIEW** 



Page iii Case No. 2022-00432 Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8 Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 116 of 327



DELAPLAIN DISPOSAL COMPANY LOCATION MAP

## **Location Map**



Page iv Case No. 2022-00432 Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8 Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 117 of 327



## Introduction

## Client and Intended Users of the Appraisal

The client in this assignment is Central States Water Resource and the sole intended user of this report is Central States Water Resources. Under no circumstances shall any of the following parties be entitled to use or rely on the appraisal or this appraisal report:

- i. The borrower(s) on any loans or financing relating to or secured by the subject property,
- ii. Any guarantor(s) of such loans or financing; or
- iii. Principals, shareholders, investors, members or partners in such borrower(s) or guarantors.

## Intended Use of the Appraisal

The sole intended use of this report is for regulatory filings.

### Real Estate Identification

The subject property is located at W Yusen Way, Georgetown, Scott County, Kentucky 40324. The subject property is further identified by the tax parcel number 161-20-002.000. The appraised property is comprised of a fee simple site (sewer plant site) which contains 1.5014 Acres. In addition, to the Fee Simple site, the appraised properties include approximately 23,469 LF of utility easements through the Residential Subdivisions of Deer Run, Moonlake Estates, Shuttle Run and Riffton Meadows and approximately 12,000 LF of utility easements through the Industrial Park. Said easements contain a total of approximately 387,765 square feet of Residential land and 180,012 square feet of Industrial Land.

### Legal Description

Fee Simple - 1.5014 Acre Parcel in Delaplain Industrial Park; Easements - In addition to the Fee Simple site, the appraised properties include approximately 23,469 LF of utility easements through the Residential Subdivisions of Deer Run, Moonlake Estates, Shuttle Run and Riffton Meadows and approximately 12,000 LF of utility easements through the Industrial Park. Said easements contain a total of approximately 387,765 square feet of Residential land and 180,012 square feet of Industrial Land.

## Use of Real Estate as of the Effective Date of Value

As of the effective date of value, the subject was a utility property.

## Use of Real Estate as Reflected in this Appraisal

The opinion of value for the subject as is reflects use as a utility property.

## Ownership of the Property

According to County Records, title to the subject property is vested in Delaplain Disposal Company.



## History of the Property

Ownership of the subject property has not changed within the past three years.

## Listings/Offers/Contracts

The subject is not currently listed for sale or under contract for sale.

## Type and Definition of Value

The appraisal problem is to develop an opinion of the market value of the subject property. "Market Value," as used in this appraisal, is defined as "the most probable price that a property should bring in a competitive and open market under all conditions requisite to a fair sale, the buyer and seller each acting prudently and knowledgeably, and assuming the price is not affected by undue stimulus." Implicit in this definition is the consummation of a sale as of a specified date and the passing of title from seller to buyer under conditions whereby:

- Buyer and seller are typically motivated.
- Both parties are well informed or well advised, each acting in what they consider their own best interests;
- A reasonable time is allowed for exposure in the open market;
- Payment is made in terms of cash in U.S. dollars or in terms of financial arrangements comparable thereto; and
- The price represents the normal consideration for the property sold unaffected by special or creative financing or sale concessions granted by anyone associated with the sale."1

The value conclusions apply to the value of the subject property under the market conditions presumed on the effective date of value.

Please refer to the Glossary in the Addenda section for additional definitions of terms used in this report.

## Valuation Scenarios, Property Rights Appraised, and Effective Dates of Value

Per the scope of our assignment we developed opinions of value for the subject property under the following scenarios of value:

Valuation Scenario	Effective Date of Value
As Is Market Value of the Easement Interest	July 23, 2019
As Is Market Value of the Fee Simple Interest	July 23, 2019

We completed an appraisal inspection of the subject property on 07-23-2019.

## Date of Report

The date of this report is 08-12-2019.

© 2019 VALBRIDGE PROPERTY ADVISORS | New Orleans

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Source: Code of Federal Regulations, Title 12, Banks and Banking, Part 722.2-Definitions



## List of Items Requested but Not Provided

None

## Assumptions and Conditions of the Appraisal

This appraisal assignment and the opinions reported herein are subject to the General Assumptions and Limiting Conditions contained in the report and the following extraordinary assumptions and/or hypothetical conditions, the use of which might have affected the assignment results.

### Extraordinary Assumptions

• None

### Hypothetical Conditions

• This report is predicated upon the hypothetical condition that the property is vacant land unencumbered by the existing improvements. In other words, this appraisal is of the underlying land as if vacant and ready for development.



## Scope of Work

The elements addressed in the Scope of Work are (1) the extent to which the subject property is identified, (2) the extent to which the subject property is inspected, (3) the type and extent of data researched, (4) the type and extent of analysis applied, (5) the type of appraisal report prepared, and (6) the inclusion or exclusion of items of non-realty in the development of the value opinion. These items are discussed as below.

## Extent to Which the Property Was Identified

The three components of the property identification are summarized as follows:

- Legal Characteristics The subject was legally identified via public Records.
- <u>Economic Characteristics</u> Economic characteristics of the subject property were identified via information provided by the client, market surveys, discussions with market participants, and our database, as well as a comparison to properties with similar locational and physical characteristics.
- <u>Physical Characteristics</u> The subject was physically identified via a general inspection of the property by the appraiser.

## Extent to Which the Property Was Inspected

We inspected the subject on 07-23-2019.

## Type and Extent of Data Researched

We researched and analyzed: (1) market area data, (2) property-specific market data, (3) zoning and land-use data, and (4) current data on comparable listings and transactions. We also interviewed people familiar with the subject market/property type.

## Type and Extent of Analysis Applied (Valuation Methodology)

We observed surrounding land use trends, the condition of any improvements, demand for the subject property, and relevant legal limitations in concluding a highest and best use. We then valued the subject based on that highest and best use conclusion.

Appraisers develop an opinion of property value with specific appraisal procedures that reflect three distinct methods of data analysis: the cost approach, sales comparison approach, and income capitalization approach. One or more of these approaches are used in all estimations of value.

- <u>Sales Comparison Approach</u> In the sales comparison approach, value is indicated by recent sales and/or listings of comparable properties in the market, with the appraiser analyzing the impact of material differences in both economic and physical elements between the subject and the comparables.
- <u>Direct Capitalization: Land Residual Method</u> The land residual methodology involves estimating the residual net income to the land by deducting from total potential income the portion attributable to the improvements, assuming development of the site at its highest and best use. The residual income is capitalized at an appropriate rate, resulting in an indication of land value.



- <u>Direct Capitalization: Ground Rent Capitalization</u> A market derived capitalization rate is applied to the net income resulting from a ground lease. This can represent the leased fee or fee simple interest, depending on whether the income potential is reflective of a lease in place or market rental rates.
- <u>Yield Capitalization: Subdivision Development Method</u> Also known as Discounted Cash Flow Analysis (DCF), the methodology is most appropriate for land having multiple lot development in the near term as the highest and best use. The current site value is represented by discounting the anticipated cash flow to a present value, taking into consideration all necessary costs of development, maintenance, administration, and sales throughout the absorption period.

All of these approaches to value were considered. We assessed the availability of data and applicability of each approach to value within the context of the characteristics of the subject property and the needs and requirements of the client. Based on this assessment, we relied upon the sales comparison approach. Further discussion of the extent of our analysis and the methodology of each approach is provided later in the respective valuation sections.

## Appraisal Conformity and Report Type

We developed our analyses, opinions, and conclusions and prepared this report in conformity with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP) of the Appraisal Foundation; the Code of Professional Ethics and Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice of the Appraisal Institute; and the requirements of our client as we understand them. This is an Appraisal Report as defined by the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice under Standards Rule 2-2a.

## Personal Property/FF&E

All items of non-realty are excluded from this analysis. The opinion of market value developed herein is reflective of real estate only.



## **Regional and Market Area Analysis**



### **REGIONAL MAP**

## Overview

The subject is located in Georgetown, in Scott County. It is part of the Lexington MSA. The Lexington MSA is home to several large corporations. Sizable employment is generated by four Fortune 500 companies: Xerox (which acquired Affiliated Computer Services), Lexmark International, Lockheed-Martin, and IBM, employing 3,000, 2,800, 1,705, and 552, respectively. United Parcel Service, Trane, and Amazon.com, Inc. have large operations in the MSA, and Toyota Motor Manufacturing Kentucky is located in adjoining Georgetown. A Jif peanut butter plant located here produces more peanut butter than any other factory in the world.



## Population

Population characteristics relative to the subject property are presented in the following table.

		Annual %			Annual %
		Change	Estimated	Projected	Change
2000	2010	2000 - 10	2019	2024	2019 - 24
281,421,906	308,745,538	1.0%	332,417,793	345,487,602	0.8%
4,041,769	4,339,367	0.7%	4,582,010	4,699,576	0.5%
408,327	472,099	1.6%	522,484	552,118	1.1%
19,084	29,013	5.2%	36,527	40,659	2.3%
	281,421,906 4,041,769 408,327	281,421,906308,745,5384,041,7694,339,367408,327472,099	Change           2000         2010         2000 - 10           281,421,906         308,745,538         1.0%           4,041,769         4,339,367         0.7%           408,327         472,099         1.6%	ChangeEstimated200020102000 - 102019281,421,906308,745,5381.0%332,417,7934,041,7694,339,3670.7%4,582,010408,327472,0991.6%522,484	Change         Estimated         Projected           2000         2010         2000 - 10         2019         2024           281,421,906         308,745,538         1.0%         332,417,793         345,487,602           4,041,769         4,339,367         0.7%         4,582,010         4,699,576           408,327         472,099         1.6%         522,484         552,118

## Transportation

Major transportation routes in the larger area include Interstates 64 and 75 which intersect in Lexington, Kentucky.

### Employment

The largest employments sectors in Lexington MSA include Services, Retail Trade and Manufacturing.

#### 2019 Percent of Industry Estimate **Employment** Agriculture/Mining 5,797 2.20% Construction 14,493 5.50% 31,094 11.80% Manufacturing Wholesale trade 6,851 2.60% Retail trade 31,621 12.00% Transportation/Utilities 10,277 3.90% Information 3,689 1.40% Finance/Insurance/Real Estate Services 12,385 4.70% Services 136,760 51.90% **Public Administration** 10,277 3.90% Total 263,507 100.0% Source: Site-to-Do-Business (STDB Online)

## **Employment by Industry - Lexington-Fayette, KY MSA**

### Unemployment

The following table exhibits current and past unemployment rates as obtained from the Bureau of Labor Statistics. Overall, the Region boasts one of the lowest unemployment rates for metropolitan statistical areas in the country at 3.6 percent.



#### **Unemployment Rates**

Area	YE 2012	YE 2013	YE 2014	YE 2015	YE 2016	YE 2017	YE 2018	YTD 2019
United States	7.9%	6.7%	5.6%	5.0%	4.7%	4.1%	3.9%	3.6%
Kentucky	8.1%	7.7%	5.5%	5.3%	5.2%	4.4%	4.3%	4.0%
Lexington-Fayette, KY MSA	5.8%	5.2%	3.6%	3.6%	3.5%	3.0%	3.0%	3.9%
Georgetown City, KY	5.5%	4.8%	3.4%	4.1%	3.7%	3.2%	3.0%	3.6%

Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics - Year End - National & State Seasonally Adjusted

## Median Household Income

Total median household income for the region is presented in the following table. Overall, the subject's MSA and county compare favorably to the state and the country.

### Median Household Income

	Estimated	Projected	Annual % Change			
Area	2019	2024	2019 - 24			
United States	\$60,548	\$69,180	2.9%			
Kentucky	\$49,381	\$54,938	2.3%			
Lexington-Fayette, KY MSA	\$58,200	\$67,818	3.3%			
Georgetown City, KY	\$64,164	\$74,880	3.3%			
Source: Site-to-Do-Business (STDB Online)						



## **Site Description**

The subject site is located in the residential subdivisions of Deer Run, Moonlake Estates, Shuttle Run and Riffton Meadows as well as the Delaplain Industrial Park. The characteristics of the site are summarized as follows:

## Site Characteristics

Gross Land Area:	1.50 Acres or 65,401 SF
Usable Land Area:	1.50 Acres or 65,401 SF
Usable Land %:	100.0%
Shape:	Irregular
Average Depth:	feet
Topography:	Level to Rolling
Drainage:	Typical of the Area
Grade:	At street grade
Utilities:	Typical of the Area
Off-Site Improvements:	None
Interior or Corner:	Interior
Signalized Intersection:	No:
Excess or Surplus Land:	None

## Street Frontage / Access

Sileer Honiage / Access	
Frontage Road	Primary
Street Name:	West Yusen Way
Street Type:	Access Easement
Frontage (Linear Ft.):	20.00
Additional Access	
Alley Access:	No
Water or Port Access:	No
Rail Access:	No
Flood Zone Data	
Flood Zone:	The subject is not in a flood zone.
Other Site Conditions	
Soil Type:	Typical of the Area
Environmental Issues:	The appraiser did not note any known environmental hazards during his inspection.
Easements/Encroachments:	None



## Site Ratings

Access: Visibility: Good Average

## **Zoning Designation**

Zoning Jurisdiction: Zoning Classification: Permitted Uses: Zoning Comments: Scott County R-1, R-1B and I-1, Residential and Industrial Residential and Industrial The fee simple site is zoned I-1, Industrial along with the easement land in the Industrial Park. The easement land in the residential subdivisions is zoned R-1 and R-1B.



**SURVEY** 



Page 11 Case No. 2022-00432 Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8 Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 128 of 327





**SITE SURVEY** 



© 2019 VALBRIDGE PROPERTY ADVISORS | New Orleans

Page 12 Case No. 2022-00432 Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8 Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 129 of 327



DELAPLAIN DISPOSAL COMPANY SITE DESCRIPTION

**ZONING MAP** 





DELAPLAIN DISPOSAL COMPANY SUBJECT PHOTOS

## Subject Photos



Typical Servitude



Typical Servitude

© 2019 VALBRIDGE PROPERTY ADVISORS | New Orleans

Page 14 Case No. 2022-00432 Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8 Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 131 of 327

DELAPLAIN DISPOSAL COMPANY SUBJECT PHOTOS





Typical Servitude Area

Page 15 Case No. 2022-00432 Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8 Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 132 of 327



## **Highest and Best Use**

The Highest and Best Use of a property is the use that is legally permissible, physically possible, and financially feasible which results in the highest value. An opinion of the highest and best use results from consideration of the criteria noted above under the market conditions or likely conditions as of the effective date of value. Determination of highest and best use results from the judgment and analytical skills of the appraiser. It represents an opinion, not a fact. In appraisal practice, the concept of highest and best use represents the premise upon which value is based.

## Analysis of Highest and Best Use As If Vacant

The primary determinants of the highest and best use of the property as if vacant are the issues of (1) Legal permissibility, (2) Physical possibility, (3) Financial feasibility, and (4) Maximum productivity.

### Legally Permissible

The subject site is zoned R-1, R-1B and I-1, Residential and Industrial which controls the general nature of permissible uses but is appropriate for the location and physical elements of the subject property, providing for a consistency of use with the general neighborhood. The location of the subject property is appropriate for the uses allowed, as noted previously, and a change in zoning is unlikely. There are no known easements, encroachments, covenants or other use restrictions that would unduly limit or impede development.

### Physically Possible

The physical attributes allow for a number of potential uses. Elements such as size, shape, availability of utilities, known hazards (flood, environmental, etc.), and other potential influences are described in the Site Description and have been considered. There are no items of a physical nature that would materially limit appropriate and likely development.

### **Financially Feasible**

The probable use of the site for residential and industrial development conforms to the pattern of land use in the market area. A review of published yield, rental and occupancy rates suggest that there is a balanced supply and demand is sufficient to support construction costs and ensure timely absorption of additional inventory in this market. Therefore, near-term speculative development of the subject site is marginally financially feasible.

### Maximally Productive

Among the financially feasible uses, the use that results in the highest value (the maximally productive use) is the highest and best use. Considering these factors, the maximally productive use as though vacant is for residential easement land - single family residential; industrial easement land - industrial use.

### Conclusion of Highest and Best Use As If Vacant

The conclusion of the highest and best use as if vacant is for residential easement land - single family residential; industrial easement land - industrial use.

## Most Probable Buyer

As of the date of value, the most probable buyer of the subject property is owner-user.



## Land Valuation

## Methodology

Site Value is most often estimated using the sales comparison approach. This approach develops an indication of market value by analyzing closed sales, listings, or pending sales of properties similar to the subject, focusing on the difference between the subject and the comparables using all appropriate elements of comparison. This approach is based on the principles of supply and demand, balance, externalities, and substitution, or the premise that a buyer would pay no more for a specific property than the cost of obtaining a property with the same quality, utility, and perceived benefits of ownership.

The process of developing the sales comparison approach consists of the following analyses: (1) researching and verifying transactional data, (2) selecting relevant units of comparison, (3) analyzing and adjusting the comparable sales for differences in various elements of comparison, and (4) reconciling the adjusted sales into a value indication for the subject site.

### Unit of Comparison

The unit of comparison depends on land use economics and how buyers and sellers use the property. The unit of comparison in this analysis is per usable square foot.

### Elements of Comparison

Elements of comparison are the characteristics or attributes of properties and transactions that cause the prices of real estate to vary. The primary elements of comparison considered in sales comparison analysis are as follows: (1) property rights conveyed, (2) financing terms, (3) conditions of sale, (4) expenditures made immediately after purchase, (5) market conditions, (6) location and (7) physical characteristics.

### Comparable Sales Data

To obtain and verify comparable sales of vacant land properties, we conducted a search of public records, field surveys, interviews with knowledgeable real estate professionals in the area, and a review of our internal database.

We included three sales in our analysis, as these sales were judged to be the most comparable to develop an indication of market value for the subject property.

The following is a table summarizing each sale comparable and a map illustrating the location of each in relation to the subject. Details of each comparable follow the location map.



Land Sales Summary				
	Subject	Sale # 1	Sale # 2	Sale # 3
Sale ID				
Sale Status				
Location	W Yusen Way	331 E Yusen Way	411 Triport Road	Etter Lane
	Georgetown,	Georgetown,	Georgetown,	Georgetown
	Kentucky	Kentucky	Kentucky	Kentucky
Tax ID	161-20-002.000	161-40-018.001	161-20-011.000	168-30-069.00 <sup>°</sup>
Sales Data				
Date of Sale	July-19	5/13/2016	6/14/2016	1/11/2018
Sales Price	-	\$215,000	\$120,000	\$195,00
Price/Usable Square Foot		\$2.08	\$1.10	\$3.5
Grantor		Santa Barbara Land	Gary and Richard	Grace and Edmone
		Corp.	Kirschner	Karan
Grantee		United Property	Hiserbob, LLC	American Mini
		Holdings, LLC		Storage o
				Kentucky, Ind
Book/Page Number		377/524	379/557	394/284
Property Rights Conveyed	Fee Simple	Fee Simple	Fee Simple	Fee Simple
Financing		Typical	Typical	Туріса
Conditions of Sale		Typical	Typical	Туріса
Physical Characteristics				
Usable Land Area (Sq. Ft.)		103,237	108,850	54,880
Gross Land Area (Sq. Ft.)		103,237	130,244	54,880
Zoning		Industrial	Industrial	Industria
Shape		Irregular	Irregular	Pie-Shaped
Corner Exposure		Interior	Interior	Interio
Access/Visibility		Average/Average	Average/Average	Average/Average



### Land Sales Comparison Analysis

When necessary, adjustments were made for differences in various elements of comparison, including property rights conveyed, financing terms, conditions of sale, expenditures made immediately after purchase, market conditions, location, and other physical characteristics. If the element in comparison is considered superior to that of the subject, we applied a negative adjustment. Conversely, a positive adjustment was applied if inferior. A summary of the elements of comparison follows.

### Transaction Adjustments

Transaction adjustments include (1) real property rights conveyed, (2) financing terms, (3) conditions of sale and (4) expenditures made immediately after purchase. These items, which are applied prior to the market conditions and property adjustments, are discussed as follows:

### Real Property Rights Conveyed

Real property rights conveyed influence sale prices and must be considered when analyzing a sale comparable. The appraised value and sale comparables all reflect the fee simple interest with no adjustments required.

### Financing Terms

The transaction price of one property may differ from that of an identical property due to different financial arrangements. Sales involving financing terms that are not at or near market terms require adjustments for cash equivalency to reflect typical market terms. A cash equivalency procedure discounts the atypical mortgage terms to provide an indication of value at cash equivalent terms. All of the sale comparables involved typical market terms by which the sellers received cash or its equivalent and the buyers paid cash or tendered typical down payments and obtained conventional financing at market terms for the balance. Therefore, no adjustments for this category were required.

### Conditions of Sale

When the conditions of sale are atypical, the result may be a price that is higher or lower than that of a normal transaction. Adjustments for conditions of sale usually reflect the motivations of either a buyer or a seller who is under duress to complete the transaction. Another more typical condition of sale involves the downward adjustment required to a comparable property's for-sale listing price, which usually reflects the upper limit of value. The sale comparables do not indicate any condition of sale adjustments were warranted for atypical conditions or for-sale listings.

### Expenditures Made Immediately After Purchase

A knowledgeable buyer considers expenditures required upon purchase of a property, as these costs affect the price the buyer agrees to pay. Such expenditures may include: costs to demolish and remove any portion of the improvements, costs to petition for a zoning change, and/or costs to remediate environmental contamination.

The relevant figure is not the actual cost incurred, but the cost anticipated by both the buyer and seller. Unless the sales involved expenditures anticipated upon the purchase date, no adjustments to the comparable sales are required for this element of comparison. The parties to these transactions did not anticipate expenditures were required immediately after purchase; therefore, no adjustments were warranted.

© 2019 VALBRIDGE PROPERTY ADVISORS



## Market Conditions Adjustment

Market conditions change over time because of inflation, deflation, fluctuations in supply and demand, or other factors. Changing market conditions may create a need for adjustment to comparable sale transactions completed during periods of dissimilar market conditions.

The sale comparables represent recent sale transactions and current listings near the date of value with no market conditions adjustments necessary.

### Property Adjustments

Property adjustments are usually expressed quantitatively as percentages or dollar amounts that reflect the differences in value attributable to the various characteristics of the property. In some instances, however, qualitative adjustments are used. These adjustments are based on locational and physical characteristics and are applied after transaction and market conditions adjustments.

Our reasoning for the property adjustments made to each sale comparable follows. The discussion analyzes each adjustment category deemed applicable to the subject property.

#### **Location**

Location adjustments may be required when the locational characteristics of a comparable property are different from those of the subject property. These include, but are not limited to, general neighborhood characteristics, freeway accessibility, street exposure, corner versus interior lot location, neighboring properties, view amenities, and other factors.

The subject property is located along West Yusen Way with good access and average visibility. Land Sale 3 has been adjusted downward for its superior location.

### <u>Size</u>

The size adjustment addresses variance in the physical size of the comparables and that of the subject, as a larger parcel typically commands a lower price per unit than a smaller parcel. This inverse relationship is due, in part, to the principle of "economies of scale."

The subject property consists of 1.50 gross acres (65,401 gross square feet), and 1.50 acres (65,401 square feet) of useable land area. The sales range in size from 54,886 to 108,850 square feet and required size adjustments. We applied an adjustment factor of approximately 5% per doubling to each sale, resulting in total adjustments ranging from -2.0% to 3.0%.

### Corner Exposure

Tracts with major street influence tend to bring higher prices than otherwise comparable secondary street locations. Additionally, tracts featuring corner influence typically command higher prices in the market place, as opposed to interior locations. For retail users, the hard corner of an intersection may be marketed to a fairly large pool of small users (e.g. service stations, fast food restaurants, etc.) for sale. No adjustments appear warranted.

## Summary of Adjustments

Presented on the following page is a summary of the adjustments made to the sale comparables. As noted earlier, these quantitative adjustments were based on our market research, best judgment, and experience in the appraisal of similar properties.



#### LAND SALES ADJUSTMENT GRID

			~ • • • •		
	Subject	Sale # 1	Sale # 2		Sale # 3
Sale ID					
Date of Value & Sale	July-19	February-19	February-19	February-19	May-19
Unadjusted Sales Price		\$214,900	\$245,000	\$167,000	\$275,000
Residual Land Value		\$53,725	\$61,250	\$41,750	\$68,750
Usable Square Feet	387,765	45,302	27,443	18,060	21,344
Unadjusted Sales Price per Usat	ole Sq. Ft.	\$1.19	\$2.23	\$2.31	\$3.22
Transactional Adjustments					
Property Rights Conveyed	Fee Simple	Fee Simple	Fee Simple	Fee Simple	Fee Simple
Adjusted Sales Price	_	\$1.19	\$2.23	\$2.31	\$3.22
Financing Terms	Cash to Seller	Typical	Typical	Typical	Typical
Adjusted Sales Price	_	\$1.19	\$2.23	\$2.31	\$3.22
Conditions of Sale	Typical	Typical	Typical	Typical	Typical
Adjusted Sales Price	_	\$1.19	\$2.23	\$2.31	\$3.22
Expenditures after Sale Adjustment	_		\$2.23	\$2.31	\$3.22
Adjusted Sales Price		\$1.19	\$2.23	\$2.31	\$3.22
Market Conditions Adjustments Elapsed Time from Date of	Value	0.40 years	0.40 years	0.42 years	0.18 years
Market Trend Through Analyzed Sales Price	July-19	\$1.19	\$2.23	\$2.31	\$3.22
Physical Adjustments					
Location	W Yusen Way	100 Agena Drive	240 Gemini Trail	104 Sheppard	101 New Forest
	Georgetown, Kentuck	Georgetown,	Georgetown,	Georgetown,	Georgetown,
	5	Kentucky	Kentucky	Kentucky	Kentucky
Adjustment		-	-	10.0%	-
Size		45,302 sf	27,443 sf	18,060 sf	21,344 sf
Adjustment		-	-	-	-
Corner Exposure	Interior	Interior	Interior	Interior	Interior
Adjustment	_	-	-	-	
Net Physical Adjustment	_	-	-	10.0%	-
Overall Net Relative Co	mparison	Superior	Superior	Similar	Superior

Case No. 2022-00432



### Conclusion - Sewer Plant Site

From the market data available, we used land sales in competitive market areas which were adjusted based on pertinent elements of comparison. The following table summarizes the unadjusted and adjusted unit prices:

### Land Sale Statistics

Metric	Unadjusted	Analyzed	Adjusted
Minimum Sales Price per Usable Square Foot	\$1.19	\$1.19	\$1.19
Maximum Sales Price per Usable Square Foot	\$3.22	\$3.22	\$3.22
Median Sales Price per Usable Square Foot	\$2.27	\$2.27	\$2.39
Mean Sales Price per Usable Square Foot	\$2.24	\$2.24	\$2.30

Based on the adjusted prices and the most comparable sale, a unit value for the subject property is near the upper end of the adjusted range, or \$3.00 per usable square foot. This indicates a market value of \$195,000 for the fee simple interest in the sewer plant site.

## Conclusion - Market Value of the Easements

The subject easements will be valued herein utilizing only the Sales Comparison Approach to Value. They will be valued based upon a comparison with sales of comparably located sites in the immediate area of the subject sites which are more functionally useable in size and shape. This will give an Across the Fence or ATF value from which the market value of the corridor interest can be determined.

Based on the foregoing analysis, the estimated unit value for the subject property is approximately \$3.00 per usable square foot. Thus, the estimated "Across the Fence Value" of the Fee Simple Interest in the subject servitudes is calculated to be \$1,703,500.

## Valuation of the Servitude

The use to which the subject servitudes will be put to is for underground water and sewer pipes. As such, little or no surface improvements will be possible, but access across the surface will be allowed. It is my opinion, therefore, that such a servitude will encumber approximately 40% of the ownership rights in the subject properties.

Thus, based upon the assumptions, reasoning and comparable data discussed herein, the estimated "Market Value" of the subject servitudes is calculated as follows:

Calculation of Easement Value									
	Site Area		Unit Value		Market Value of Fee	E	asement Use	Value of	
Residential Easements	387,765 square feet	Х	\$3.00 PSF	=	\$1,163,500	Х	40%	\$465,500	
Industrial Easements	180,012 square feet	Х	\$3.00 PSF	=	\$540,000	Х	40%	\$216,000	
Total Market Value of Easements								\$681,500	



## **Valuation Summary**

The indicated values from the approaches used and our concluded market values for the subject property are summarized in the following table.

Value Indications						
Approach to Value	As Is	As Is				
Sales Comparison	\$681,500	\$195,000				
Cost	Not Developed	Not Developed				
Income Capitalization	Not Developed					
Value Conclusions						
Component	As Is	As Is				
Value Type	Market Value	Market Value				
Property Rights Appraised	Easement	Fee Simple				
Effective Date of Value	July 23, 2019	July 23, 2019				
Value Conclusion	\$681,500	\$195,000				
	\$1.28 psf	\$2.98 psf				

To reach a final opinion of value, we considered the reliability and relevance of each value indication based upon the quality of the data and applicability of the assumptions underlying each approach. Given the availability and reliability of data within the Sales Comparison Approach, we gave this approach primary weight in arriving at our final value conclusions. Furthermore, land properties such as the subject property are typically purchased by owner-users, who primarily rely upon the methods employed by the Sales Comparison Approach.

Our findings and conclusions are further contingent upon the following extraordinary assumptions and/or hypothetical conditions which might have affected the assignment results:

## Extraordinary Assumptions:

None

## Hypothetical Conditions:

• This report is predicated upon the hypothetical condition that the property is vacant land unencumbered by the existing improvements. In other words, this appraisal is of the underlying land as if vacant and ready for development.

## Exposure Time and Marketing Periods

Based on statistical information about days on market, escrow length, and marketing times gathered through national investor surveys, sales verification, and interviews of market participants, marketing and exposure time estimates of less than 12 months and less than 12 months, respectively, are considered reasonable and appropriate for the subject property.



## **General Assumptions and Limiting Conditions**

This appraisal is subject to the following general assumptions and limiting conditions:

- 1. The legal description if furnished to us is assumed to be correct.
- 2. No responsibility is assumed for legal matters, questions of survey or title, soil or subsoil conditions, engineering, availability or capacity of utilities, or other similar technical matters. The appraisal does not constitute a survey of the property appraised. All existing liens and encumbrances have been disregarded and the property is appraised as though free and clear, under responsible ownership and competent management unless otherwise noted.
- 3. Unless otherwise noted, the appraisal will value the property as though free of contamination. Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans will conduct no hazardous materials or contamination inspection of any kind. It is recommended that the client hire an expert if the presence of hazardous materials or contamination poses any concern.
- 4. The stamps and/or consideration placed on deeds used to indicate sales are in correct relationship to the actual dollar amount of the transaction.
- 5. Unless otherwise noted, it is assumed there are no encroachments, zoning violations or restrictions existing in the subject property.
- 6. The appraiser is not required to give testimony or attendance in court by reason of this appraisal, unless previous arrangements have been made.
- 7. Unless expressly specified in the engagement letter, the fee for this appraisal does not include the attendance or giving of testimony by Appraiser at any court, regulatory or other proceedings, or any conferences or other work in preparation for such proceeding. If any partner or employee of Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans is asked or required to appear and/or testify at any deposition, trial, or other proceeding about the preparation, conclusions or any other aspect of this assignment, client shall compensate Appraiser for the time spent by the partner or employee in appearing and/or testifying and in preparing to testify according to the Appraiser's then current hourly rate plus reimbursement of expenses.
- 8. The values for land and/or improvements, as contained in this report, are constituent parts of the total value reported and neither is (or are) to be used in making a summation appraisal of a combination of values created by another appraiser. Either is invalidated if so used.
- 9. The dates of value to which the opinions expressed in this report apply are set forth in this report. We assume no responsibility for economic or physical factors occurring at some point at a later date, which may affect the opinions stated herein. The forecasts, projections, or operating estimates contained herein are based on current market conditions and anticipated short-term supply and demand factors and are subject to change with future conditions. Appraiser is not responsible for determining whether the date of value requested by Client is appropriate for Client's intended use.
- 10. The sketches, maps, plats and exhibits in this report are included to assist the reader in visualizing the property. The appraiser has made no survey of the property and assumed no responsibility in connection with such matters.



- 11. The information, estimates and opinions, which were obtained from sources outside of this office, are considered reliable. However, no liability for them can be assumed by the appraiser.
- 12. Possession of this report, or a copy thereof, does not carry with it the right of publication. Neither all, nor any part of the content of the report, or copy thereof (including conclusions as to property value, the identity of the appraisers, professional designations, reference to any professional appraisal organization or the firm with which the appraisers are connected), shall be disseminated to the public through advertising, public relations, news, sales, or other media without prior written consent and approval.
- 13. No claim is intended to be expressed for matters of expertise that would require specialized investigation or knowledge beyond that ordinarily employed by real estate appraisers. We claim no expertise in areas such as, but not limited to, legal, survey, structural, environmental, pest control, mechanical, etc.
- 14. This appraisal was prepared for the sole and exclusive use of the client for the function outlined herein. Any party who is not the client or intended user identified in the appraisal or engagement letter is not entitled to rely upon the contents of the appraisal without express written consent of Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans and Client. The Client shall not include partners, affiliates, or relatives of the party addressed herein. The appraiser assumes no obligation, liability or accountability to any third party.
- 15. Distribution of this report is at the sole discretion of the client, but third-parties not listed as an intended user on the face of the appraisal or the engagement letter may not rely upon the contents of the appraisal. In no event shall client give a third-party a partial copy of the appraisal report. We will make no distribution of the report without the specific direction of the client.
- 16. This appraisal shall be used only for the function outlined herein, unless expressly authorized by Valbridge Property Advisors |New Orleans.
- 17. This appraisal shall be considered in its entirety. No part thereof shall be used separately or out of context.
- 18. Unless otherwise noted in the body of this report, this appraisal assumes that the subject property does not fall within the areas where mandatory flood insurance is effective. Unless otherwise noted, we have not completed nor have we contracted to have completed an investigation to identify and/or quantify the presence of non-tidal wetland conditions on the subject property. Because the appraiser is not a surveyor, he or she makes no guarantees, express or implied, regarding this determination.
- 19. The flood maps are not site specific. We are not qualified to confirm the location of the subject property in relation to flood hazard areas based on the FEMA Flood Insurance Rate Maps or other surveying techniques. It is recommended that the client obtain a confirmation of the subject property's flood zone classification from a licensed surveyor.
- 20. If the appraisal is for mortgage loan purposes 1) we assume satisfactory completion of improvements if construction is not complete, 2) no consideration has been given for rent loss during rent-up unless noted in the body of this report, and 3) occupancy at levels consistent with our "Income and Expense Projection" are anticipated.
- 21. It is assumed that there are no hidden or unapparent conditions of the property, subsoil, or structures which would render it more or less valuable. No responsibility is assumed for such conditions or for engineering which may be required to discover them.



- 22. Our inspection included an observation of the land and improvements thereon only. It was not possible to observe conditions beneath the soil or hidden structural components within the improvements. We inspected the buildings involved, and reported damage (if any) by termites, dry rot, wet rot, or other infestations as a matter of information, and no guarantee of the amount or degree of damage (if any) is implied. Condition of heating, cooling, ventilation, electrical and plumbing equipment is considered to be commensurate with the condition of the balance of the improvements unless otherwise stated. Should the client have concerns in these areas, it is the client's responsibility to order the appropriate inspections. The appraiser does not have the skill or expertise to make such inspections and assumes no responsibility for these items.
- 23. This appraisal does not guarantee compliance with building code and life safety code requirements of the local jurisdiction. It is assumed that all required licenses, consents, certificates of occupancy or other legislative or administrative authority from any local, state or national governmental or private entity or organization have been or can be obtained or renewed for any use on which the value conclusion contained in this report is based unless specifically stated to the contrary.
- 24. When possible, we have relied upon building measurements provided by the client, owner, or associated agents of these parties. In the absence of a detailed rent roll, reliable public records, or "as-built" plans provided to us, we have relied upon our own measurements of the subject improvements. We follow typical appraisal industry methods; however, we recognize that some factors may limit our ability to obtain accurate measurements including, but not limited to, property access on the day of inspection, basements, fenced/gated areas, grade elevations, greenery/shrubbery, uneven surfaces, multiple story structures, obtuse or acute wall angles, immobile obstructions, etc. Professional building area measurements of the quality, level of detail, or accuracy of professional measurement services are beyond the scope of this appraisal assignment.
- 25. We have attempted to reconcile sources of data discovered or provided during the appraisal process, including assessment department data. Ultimately, the measurements that are deemed by us to be the most accurate and/or reliable are used within this report. While the measurements and any accompanying sketches are considered to be reasonably accurate and reliable, we cannot guarantee their accuracy. Should the client desire more precise measurement, they are urged to retain the measurement services of a qualified professional (space planner, architect or building engineer) as an alternative source. If this alternative measurement source reflects or reveals substantial differences with the measurements used within the report, upon request of the client, the appraiser will submit a revised report for an additional fee.
- 26. In the absence of being provided with a detailed land survey, we have used assessment department data to ascertain the physical dimensions and acreage of the property. Should a survey prove this information to be inaccurate, upon request of the client, the appraiser will submit a revised report for an additional fee.
- 27. If only preliminary plans and specifications were available for use in the preparation of this appraisal, and a review of the final plans and specifications reveals substantial differences upon request of the client the appraiser will submit a revised report for an additional fee.



- 28. Unless otherwise stated in this report, the value conclusion is predicated on the assumption that the property is free of contamination, environmental impairment or hazardous materials. Unless otherwise stated, the existence of hazardous material was not observed by the appraiser and the appraiser has no knowledge of the existence of such materials on or in the property. The appraiser, however, is not qualified to detect such substances. The presence of substances such as asbestos, urea-formaldehyde foam insulation or other potentially hazardous materials may affect the value of the property. No responsibility is assumed for any such conditions, or for any expertise or engineering knowledge required for discovery. The client is urged to retain an expert in this field, if desired.
- 29. The Americans with Disabilities Act ("ADA") became effective January 26, 1992. We have not made a specific compliance survey of the property to determine if it is in conformity with the various requirements of the ADA. It is possible that a compliance survey of the property, together with an analysis of the requirements of the ADA, could reveal that the property is not in compliance with one or more of the requirements of the Act. If so, this could have a negative effect on the value of the property. Since we have no direct evidence relating to this issue, we did not consider possible noncompliance with the requirements of ADA in developing an opinion of value.
- 30. This appraisal applies to the land and building improvements only. The value of trade fixtures, furnishings, and other equipment, or subsurface rights (minerals, gas, and oil) were not considered in this appraisal unless specifically stated to the contrary.
- 31. No changes in any federal, state or local laws, regulations or codes (including, without limitation, the Internal Revenue Code) are anticipated, unless specifically stated to the contrary.
- 32. Any income and expense estimates contained in the appraisal report are used only for the purpose of estimating value and do not constitute prediction of future operating results. Furthermore, it is inevitable that some assumptions will not materialize and that unanticipated events may occur that will likely affect actual performance.
- 33. Any estimate of insurable value, if included within the scope of work and presented herein, is based upon figures developed consistent with industry practices. However, actual local and regional construction costs may vary significantly from our estimate and individual insurance policies and underwriters have varied specifications, exclusions, and non-insurable items. As such, we strongly recommend that the Client obtain estimates from professionals experienced in establishing insurance coverage. This analysis should not be relied upon to determine insurance coverage and we make no warranties regarding the accuracy of this estimate.
- 34. The data gathered in the course of this assignment (except data furnished by the Client) shall remain the property of the Appraiser. The appraiser will not violate the confidential nature of the appraiser-client relationship by improperly disclosing any confidential information furnished to the appraiser. Notwithstanding the foregoing, the Appraiser is authorized by the client to disclose all or any portion of the appraisal and related appraisal data to appropriate representatives of the Appraisal Institute if such disclosure is required to enable the appraiser to comply with the Bylaws and Regulations of such Institute now or hereafter in effect.


- 35. You and Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans both agree that any dispute over matters in excess of \$5,000 will be submitted for resolution by arbitration. This includes fee disputes and any claim of malpractice. The arbitrator shall be mutually selected. If Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans and the client cannot agree on the arbitrator, the presiding head of the Local County Mediation & Arbitration panel shall select the arbitrator. Such arbitration shall be binding and final. In agreeing to arbitration, we both acknowledge that, by agreeing to binding arbitration, each of us is giving up the right to have the dispute decided in a court of law before a judge or jury. In the event that the client, or any other party, makes a claim against Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans or any of its employees in connections with or in any way relating to this assignment, the maximum damages recoverable by such claimant shall be the amount actually received by Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans for this assignment, and under no circumstances shall any claim for consequential damages be made.
- 36. Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans shall have no obligation, liability, or accountability to any third party. Any party who is not the "client" or intended user identified on the face of the appraisal or in the engagement letter is not entitled to rely upon the contents of the appraisal without the express written consent of Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans. "Client" shall not include partners, affiliates, or relatives of the party named in the engagement letter. Client shall hold Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans and its employees harmless in the event of any lawsuit brought by any third party, lender, partner, or part-owner in any form of ownership or any other party as a result of this assignment. The client also agrees that in case of lawsuit arising from or in any way involving these appraisal services, client will hold Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans harmless from and against any liability, loss, cost, or expense incurred or suffered by Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans in such action, regardless of its outcome.
- 37. The Valbridge Property Advisors office responsible for the preparation of this report is independently owned and operated by VPA of South Louisiana, Inc.. Neither Valbridge Property Advisors, Inc., nor any of its affiliates has been engaged to provide this report. Valbridge Property Advisors, Inc. does not provide valuation services, and has taken no part in the preparation of this report.
- 38. If any claim is filed against any of Valbridge Property Advisors, Inc., a Florida Corporation, its affiliates, officers or employees, or the firm providing this report, in connection with, or in any way arising out of, or relating to, this report, or the engagement of the firm providing this report, then (1) under no circumstances shall such claimant be entitled to consequential, special or other damages, except only for direct compensatory damages, and (2) the maximum amount of such compensatory damages recoverable by such claimant shall be the amount actually received by the firm engaged to provide this report.
- 39. This report and any associated work files may be subject to evaluation by Valbridge Property Advisors, Inc., or its affiliates, for quality control purposes.
- 40. Acceptance and/or use of this appraisal report constitutes acceptance of the foregoing general assumptions and limiting conditions.



# **Certification – Arthur L. Schwertz**

I certify that, to the best of my knowledge and belief:

- 1. The statements of fact contained in this report are true and correct.
- 2. The reported analyses, opinions, and conclusions are limited only by the reported assumptions and limiting conditions and are my personal, impartial, and unbiased professional analyses, opinions, and conclusions.
- 3. I have no present or prospective interest in the property that is the subject of this report and no personal interest with respect to the parties involved.
- 4. The undersigned has not performed services regarding the property that is the subject of this report within the three-year period immediately preceding acceptance of this assignment.
- 5. I have no bias with respect to the property that is the subject of this report or to the parties involved with this assignment.
- 6. My engagement in this assignment was not contingent upon developing or reporting predetermined results.
- 7. My compensation for completing this assignment is not contingent upon the development or reporting of a predetermined value or direction in value that favors the cause of the client, the amount of value opinion, the attainment of a stipulated result, or the occurrence of a subsequent event directly related to the intended use of this appraisal.
- 8. My analyses, opinions and conclusions were developed, and this report has been prepared, in conformity with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice.
- 9. Arthur L. Schwertz has personally inspected the subject property.
- 10. No one provided significant real property appraisal assistance to the person signing this certification, unless otherwise noted.
- 11. The reported analyses, opinions and conclusions were developed, and this report has been prepared, in conformity with the requirements of the Code of Professional Ethics and Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice of the Appraisal Institute.
- 12. The use of this report is subject to the requirements of the Appraisal Institute relating to review by its duly authorized representatives.
- 13. As of the date of this report, the undersigned has completed the continuing education program for Designated Members of the Appraisal Institute.

Arthur L. Schwertz, MAI Senior Managing Director Kentucky Certified General Real Property Appraiser #5470





# Addenda

Glossary

Qualifications

• Arthur L. Schwertz, MAI - Senior Managing Director

Information on Valbridge Property Advisors

Office Locations



# Glossary

Definitions are taken from The Dictionary of Real Estate Appraisal, 6<sup>th</sup> Edition (Dictionary), the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP), and Building Owners and Managers Association International (BOMA).

# Absolute Net Lease

A lease in which the tenant pays all expenses including structural maintenance, building reserves, and management; often a long-term lease to a credit tenant. (Dictionary)

# Amortization

The process of retiring a debt or recovering a capital investment, typically through scheduled, systematic repayment of the principal; a program of periodic contributions to a sinking fund or debt retirement fund. (Dictionary)

# As Is Market Value

The estimate of the market value of real property in its current physical condition, use, and zoning as of the appraisal date. (Dictionary)

# Base Rent

The minimum rent stipulated in a lease. (Dictionary)

# Base Year

The year on which escalation clauses in a lease are based. (Dictionary)

# Building Common Area

In office buildings, the areas of the building that provide services to building tenants but which are not included in the office area or store area of any specific tenant. These areas may include, but shall not be limited to, main and auxiliary lobbies, atrium spaces at the level of the finished floor, concierge areas or security desks, conference rooms, lounges or vending areas, food service facilities, health or fitness centers, daycare facilities, locker or shower facilities, mail rooms, fire control rooms, fully enclosed courtyards outside the exterior walls, and building core and service areas such as fully enclosed mechanical or equipment rooms. Specifically excluded from building common area are floor common areas, parking space, portions of loading docks outside the building line, and major vertical penetrations. (BOMA)

# **Building Rentable Area**

The sum of all floor rentable areas. Floor rentable area is the result of subtracting from the gross measured area of a floor the major vertical penetrations on that same floor. It is generally fixed for the life of the building and is rarely affected by changes in corridor size or configuration. (BOMA)

# Certificate of Occupancy (COO)

A formal written acknowledgment by an appropriate unit of local government that a new construction or renovation project is at the stage where it meets applicable health and safety codes and is ready for commercial or residential occupancy. (Dictionary)

# Common Area Maintenance (CAM)

The expense of operating and maintaining common areas; may or may not include management charges and usually does not include capital expenditures on tenant improvements or other improvements to the property. (Dictionary)

The amount of money charged to tenants for their shares of maintaining a [shopping] center's common area. The charge that a tenant pays for shared services and facilities such as electricity, security, and maintenance of parking lots. Items charged to common area maintenance may include cleaning services, parking lot sweeping and maintenance, snow removal, security and upkeep. (ICSC – International Council of Shopping Centers, 4<sup>th</sup> Ed.)

# Condominium

A multiunit structure, or a unit within such a structure, with a condominium form of ownership. (Dictionary)

# **Conservation Easement**

An interest in real estate restricting future land use to preservation, conservation, wildlife habitat, or some combination of those uses. A





conservation easement may permit farming, timber harvesting, or other uses of a rural nature as well as some types of conservation-oriented development to continue, subject to the easement. (Dictionary)

# **Contributory Value**

A type of value that reflects the amount a property or component of a property contributes to the value of another asset or to the property as a whole.

The change in the value of a property as a whole, whether positive or negative, resulting from the addition or deletion of a property component. Also called deprival value in some countries. (Dictionary)

# Debt Coverage Ratio (DCR)

The ratio of net operating income to annual debt service (DCR = NOI/Im), which measures the relative ability of a property to meet its debt service out of net operating income; also called *debt service coverage ratio (DSCR)*. A larger *DCR* typically indicates a greater ability for a property to withstand a reduction of income, providing an improved safety margin for a lender. (Dictionary)

# **Deed Restriction**

A provision written into a deed that limits the use of land. Deed restrictions usually remain in effect when title passes to subsequent owners. (Dictionary)

# Depreciation

In appraisal, a loss in property value from any cause; the difference between the cost of an improvement on the effective date of the appraisal and the market value of the improvement on the same date.

In accounting, an allocation of the original cost of an asset, amortizing the cost over the asset's life; calculated using a variety of standard techniques. (Dictionary)

# **Disposition Value**

The most probable price that a specified interest in property should bring under the following conditions:

- Consummation of a sale within a specified time, which is shorter than the typical exposure time for such a property in that market.
- The property is subjected to market conditions prevailing as of the date of valuation;
- Both the buyer and seller are acting prudently and knowledgeably;
- The seller is under compulsion to sell;
- The buyer is typically motivated;
- Both parties are acting in what they consider to be their best interests;
- An adequate marketing effort will be made during the exposure time;
- Payment will be made in cash in U.S. dollars (or the local currency) or in terms of financial arrangements comparable thereto; and

The price represents the normal consideration for the property sold, unaffected by special or creative financing or sales concessions granted by anyone associated with the sale. (Dictionary)

# Easement

The right to use another's land for a stated purpose. (Dictionary)

# EIFS

Exterior Insulation Finishing System. This is a type of exterior wall cladding system. Sometimes referred to as dry-vit.

# Effective Date

The date on which the appraisal or review opinion applies. (SVP)

In a lease document, the date upon which the lease goes into effect. (Dictionary)

# Effective Gross Income (EGI)

The anticipated income from all operations of the real estate after an allowance is made for vacancy and collection losses and an addition is made for any other income. (Dictionary)



# Effective Rent

Total base rent, or minimum rent stipulated in a lease, over the specified lease term minus rent concessions; the rent that is effectively paid by a tenant net of financial concessions provided by a landlord. (TIs). (Dictionary)

# EPDM

Ethylene Propylene Diene Monomer Rubber. A type of synthetic rubber typically used for roof coverings. (Dictionary)

# **Escalation Clause**

A clause in an agreement that provides for the adjustment of a price or rent based on some event or index. e.g., a provision to increase rent if operating expenses increase; also called *escalator clause, expense recovery clause or stop clause.* (Dictionary)

# **Estoppel Certificate**

A signed statement by a party (such as a tenant or a mortgagee) certifying, for another's benefit, that certain facts are correct, such as that a lease exists, that there are no defaults, and that rent is paid to a certain date. (Black's) In real estate, a buyer of rental property typically requests estoppel certificates from existing tenants. Sometimes referred to as an *estoppel letter*. (Dictionary)

# **Excess Land**

Land that is not needed to serve or support the existing use. The highest and best use of the excess land may or may not be the same as the highest and best use of the improved parcel. Excess land has the potential to be sold separately and is valued separately. (Dictionary)

# **Excess Rent**

The amount by which contract rent exceeds market rent at the time of the appraisal; created by a lease favorable to the landlord (lessor) and may reflect unusual management, unknowledgeable or unusually motivated parties, a lease execution in an earlier, stronger rental market, or an agreement of the parties. (Dictionary)

# **Expense Stop**

A clause in a lease that limits the landlord's expense obligation, which results in the lessee paying operating expenses above a stated level or amount. (Dictionary)

# **Exposure Time**

The time a property remains on the market.

The estimated length of time that the property interest being appraised would have been offered on the market prior to the hypothetical consummation of a sale at market value on the effective date of the appraisal;

<u>Comment:</u> Exposure time is a retrospective opinion based on an analysis of past events assuming a competitive and open market. (Dictionary)

# **Extraordinary Assumption**

An assignment-specific assumption as of the effective date regarding uncertain information used in an analysis which, if found to be false, could alter the appraiser's opinions or conclusions.

<u>Comment:</u> Uncertain information might include physical, legal, or economic characteristics of the subject property; or conditions external to the property, such as market conditions or trends; or the integrity of data used in an analysis. (USPAP)

# Fee Simple Estate

Absolute ownership unencumbered by any other interest or estate, subject only to the limitations imposed by the governmental powers of taxation, eminent domain, police power, and escheat. (Dictionary)

# Floor Common Area

In an office building, the areas on a floor such as washrooms, janitorial closets, electrical rooms, telephone rooms, mechanical rooms, elevator lobbies, and public corridors which are available primarily for the use of tenants on that floor. (BOMA)

# Full Service (Gross) Lease

A lease in which the landlord receives stipulated rent and is obligated to pay all of the property's



operating and fixed expenses; also called a *full service lease*. (Dictionary)

# Furniture, Fixtures, and Equipment (FF&E)

Business trade fixtures and personal property, exclusive of inventory. (Dictionary)

Going-Concern Value

An outdated label for the market value of all the tangible and intangible assets of an established and operating business with an indefinite life, as if sold in aggregate; more accurately termed the market value of the going concern or market value of the total assets of the business. (Dictionary)

# Gross Building Area (GBA)

Total floor area of a building, excluding unenclosed areas, measured from the exterior of the walls of the above-grade area. This includes mezzanines and basements if and when typically included in the market area of the type of property involved.

# Gross leasable area plus all common areas.

For residential space, the total area of all floor levels measured from the exterior of the walls and including the superstructure and substructure basement; typically does not include garage space. (Dictionary)

# Gross Measured Area

The total area of a building enclosed by the dominant portion (the portion of the inside finished surface of the permanent outer building wall which is 50 percent or more of the vertical floor-to-ceiling dimension, at the given point being measured as one moves horizontally along the wall), excluding parking areas and loading docks (or portions of same) outside the building line. It is generally not used for leasing purposes and is calculated on a floor by floor basis. (BOMA)

# Gross Up Method

A method of calculating variable operating expenses in income-producing properties when less than 100% occupancy is assumed. Expenses reimbursed based on the amount of occupied space, rather than on the total building area, are described as "grossed up." (Dictionary)

### **Gross Retail Sellout**

The sum of the separate and distinct market value opinions for each of the units in a condominium, subdivision development, or portfolio of properties, as of the date of valuation. The aggregate of retail values does not represent the value of all the units as though sold together in a single transaction; it is simply the total of the individual market value conclusions. Also called the *aggregate of the retail values, aggregate retail selling price or sum of the retail values.* (Dictionary)

# Ground Lease

A lease that grants the right to use and occupy land. Improvements made by the ground lessee typically revert to the ground lessor at the end of the lease term. (Dictionary)

# Ground Rent

The rent paid for the right to use and occupy land according to the terms of a ground lease; the portion of the total rent allocated to the underlying land. (Dictionary)

# HVAC

Heating, ventilation, air conditioning (HVAC) system. A unit that regulates the temperature and distribution of heat and fresh air throughout a building. (Dictionary)

# Highest and Best Use

The reasonably probable use of property that results in the highest value. The four criteria that the highest and best use must meet are legal permissibility, physical possibility, financial feasibility, and maximum productivity.

The use of an asset that maximizes its potential and that is possible, legally permissible, and financially feasible. The highest and best use may be for continuation of an asset's existing use of for some alternative use. This is determined by the use that a market participant would have in mind for the asset when formulating the price that it would be willing to bid. (IVS)

[The] highest and most profitable use for which the property is adaptable and needed or likely



to be needed in the reasonably near future. (Uniform Appraisal Standards for Federal Land Acquisitions) (Dictionary)

# Hypothetical Condition

A condition, directly related to a specific assignment, which is contrary to what is known by the appraiser to exist on the effective date of the assignment results, but is used for the purpose of analysis.

<u>Comment</u>: Hypothetical conditions are contrary to known facts about physical, legal, or economic characteristics of the subject property; or about conditions external to the property, such as market conditions or trends; or about the integrity of data used in an analysis. (USPAP)

# Industrial Gross Lease

A type of modified gross lease of an industrial property in which the landlord and tenant share expenses. The landlord receives stipulated rent and is obligated to pay certain operating expenses, often structural maintenance, insurance and real property taxes, as specified in the lease. There are significant regional and local differences in the use of this term. (Dictionary)

# Insurable Value

A type of value for insurance purposes. (Typically this includes replacement cost less basement excavation, foundation, underground piping and architect's fees). (Dictionary)

# Investment Value

The value of a property to a particular investor or class of investors based on the investor's specific requirements. Investment value may be different from market value because it depends on a set of investment criteria that are not necessarily typical of the market. (Dictionary)

# Just Compensation

In condemnation, the amount of loss for which a property owner is compensated when his or her property is taken. Just compensation should put the owner in as good a position pecuniarily as he or she would have been if the property had not been taken. (Dictionary)

### Leased Fee Interest

The ownership interest held by the lessor, which includes the right to receive the contract rent specified in the lease plus the reversionary right when the lease expires. (Dictionary)

# Leasehold Interest

The right held by the lessee to use and occupy real estate for a stated term and under the conditions specified in the lease. (Dictionary)

# Lessee (Tenant)

One who has the right to occupancy and use of the property of another for a period of time according to a lease agreement. (Dictionary)

# Lessor (Landlord)

One who conveys the rights of occupancy and use to others under a lease agreement. (Dictionary)

# Liquidation Value

The most probable price that a specified interest in property should bring under the following conditions:

- Consummation of a sale within a short time period.
- The property is subjected to market conditions prevailing as of the date of valuation.
- Both the buyer and seller are acting prudently and knowledgeably.
- The seller is under extreme compulsion to sell.
- The buyer is typically motivated.
- Both parties are acting in what they consider to be their best interests.
- A normal marketing effort is not possible due to the brief exposure time.
- Payment will be made in cash in U.S. dollars (or the local currency) or in terms of financial arrangements comparable thereto.

The price represents the normal consideration for the property sold, unaffected by special or



creative financing or sales concessions granted by anyone associated with the sale. (Dictionary)

# Loan to Value Ratio (LTV)

The ratio between a mortgage loan and the value of the property pledged as security, usually expressed as a percentage. (Dictionary)

# **Major Vertical Penetrations**

Stairs, elevator shafts, flues, pipe shafts, vertical ducts, and the like, and their enclosing walls. Atria, lightwells and similar penetrations above the finished floor are included in this definition. Not included, however, are vertical penetrations built for the private use of a tenant occupying office areas on more than one floor. Structural columns, openings for vertical electric cable or telephone distribution, and openings for plumbing lines are not considered to be major vertical penetrations. (BOMA)

# Market Rent

The most probable rent that a property should bring in a competitive and open market reflecting the conditions and restrictions of a specified lease agreement, including the rental adjustment and revaluation, permitted uses, use restrictions, expense obligations; term, concessions, renewal and purchase options and tenant improvements (TIs). (Dictionary)

# Market Value

The most probable price that a property should bring in a competitive and open market under all conditions requisite to a fair sale, the buyer and seller each acting prudently and knowledgeably, and assuming the price is not affected by undue stimulus. Implicit in this definition is the consummation of a sale as of a specified date and the passing of title from seller to buyer under conditions whereby:

- Buyer and seller are typically motivated;
- Both parties are well informed or well advised, and acting in what they consider their own best interests;
- A reasonable time is allowed for exposure in the open market;

• Payment is made in terms of cash in United States dollars or in terms of financial arrangements comparable thereto; and

The price represents the normal consideration for the property sold unaffected by special or creative financing or sales concessions granted by anyone associated with the sale. (Dictionary)

# Marketing Time

An opinion of the amount of time it might take to sell a real or personal property interest at the concluded market value level during the period immediately after the effective date of an appraisal. Marketing time differs from exposure time, which is always presumed to precede the effective date of an appraisal. (Advisory Opinion 7 of the Appraisal Standards Board of the Appraisal Foundation)

# Master Lease

A lease in which the fee owner leases a part or the entire property to a single entity (the master lease) in return for a stipulated rent. The master lessee then leases the property to multiple tenants. (Dictionary)

# Modified Gross Lease

A lease in which the landlord receives stipulated rent and is obligated to pay some, but not all, of the property's operating and fixed expenses. Since assignment of expenses varies among modified gross leases, expense responsibility must always be specified. In some markets, a modified gross lease may be called a *double net lease, net net lease, partial net lease, or semigross lease*. (Dictionary)

# Operating Expense Ratio

The ratio of total operating expenses to effective gross income (TOE/EGI); the complement of the net income ratio, i.e., OER = 1 - NIR (Dictionary)

# Option

A legal contract, typically purchased for a stated consideration, that permits but does not require the holder of the option (known as the *optionee*) to buy, sell, or lease real estate for a stipulated period of time in accordance with specified terms; a unilateral right to exercise a privilege. (Dictionary)



### Partial Interest

Divided or undivided rights in real estate that represent less than the whole, i.e., a fractional interest such as a tenancy in common, easement, or life interest. (Dictionary)

# Pass Through

A tenant's portion of operating expenses that may be composed of common area maintenance (CAM), real property taxes, property insurance, and any other expenses determined in the lease agreement to be paid by the tenant. (Dictionary)

# Potential Gross Income (PGI)

The total income attributable to property at full occupancy before vacancy and operating expenses are deducted. (Dictionary)

# Prospective Future Value Upon Completion

A prospective market value may be appropriate for the valuation of a property interest related to a credit decision for a proposed development or renovation project. According to USPAP, an appraisal with a prospective market value reflects an effective date that is subsequent to the date of the appraisal report. ... The prospective market value –as completedreflects the property's market value as of the time that development is expected to be complete. (Dictionary)

# Prospective Future Value Upon Stabilization

A prospective market value may be appropriate for the valuation of a property interest related to a credit decision for a proposed development or renovation project. According to USPAP, an appraisal with a prospective market value reflects an effective date that is subsequent to the date of the appraisal report ... The prospective market value - as stabilized reflects the property's market value as of the time the property is projected to achieve stabilized occupancy. For an income-producing property, stabilized occupancy is the occupancy level that a property is expected to achieve after the property is exposed to the market for lease over a reasonable period of time and at comparable terms and conditions to other similar properties. (Dictionary)

# **Replacement Cost**

The estimated cost to construct, at current prices as of a specific date, a substitute for a building or other improvements, using modern materials and current standards, design, and layout. (Dictionary)

# **Reproduction Cost**

The estimated cost to construct, at current prices as of the effective date of the appraisal, an exact duplicate or replica of the building being appraised, using the same materials, construction standards, design, layout, and quality of workmanship and embodying all of superadequacies, the deficiencies, and subject obsolescence of the building. (Dictionary)

# **Retrospective Value Opinion**

A value opinion effective as of a specified historical date. The term retrospective does not define a type of value. Instead, it identifies a value opinion as being effective at some specific prior date. Value as of a historical date is frequently sought in connection with property appeals, damage models, lease tax renegotiation, deficiency judgments, estate tax, and condemnation. Inclusion of the type of value with this term is appropriate, e.g., "retrospective market value opinion." (Dictionary)

# Sandwich Leasehold Estate

The interest held by the sandwich leaseholder when the property is subleased to another party; a type of leasehold estate. (Dictionary)

# Sublease

An agreement in which the lessee in a prior lease conveys the right of use and occupancy of a property to another, the sublessee, for a specific period of time, which may or may not be coterminous with the underlying lease term. (Dictionary)

# Subordination

A contractual arrangement in which a party with a claim to certain assets agrees to make his or her claim junior, or subordinate, to the claims of another party. (Dictionary)

© 2019 VALBRIDGE PROPERTY ADVISORS





# Surplus Land

Land that is not currently needed to support the existing use but cannot be separated from the property and sold off for another use. Surplus land does not have an independent highest and best use and may or may not contribute value to the improved parcel. (Dictionary)

# TPO

Thermoplastic polyolefin, a resilient synthetic roof covering.

# Triple Net (Net Net Net) Lease

An alternative term for a type of net lease. In some markets, a net net net lease is defined as a lease in which the tenant assumes all expenses (fixed and variable) of operating a property except that the landlord is responsible for structural maintenance, building reserves, and management; also called *NNN lease, net net net lease, or fully net lease.* (Dictionary)

(The market definition of a triple net lease varies; in some cases tenants pay for items such as roof repairs, parking lot repairs, and other similar items.)

# Usable Area

The measured area of an office area, store area, or building common area on a floor. The total of all the usable areas for a floor shall equal floor usable area of that same floor. (BOMA)

# Value-in-Use

The value of a property assuming a specific use, which may or may not be the property's highest and best use on the effective date of the appraisal. Value in use may or may not be equal to market value but is different conceptually. (Dictionary)

# VTAB

Value of the Total Assets of a Business. The value of a going concern (i.e. the business enterprise). (Dictionary)



DELAPLAIN DISPOSAL COMPANY ADDENDA

Qualifications of Arthur L. Schwertz, MAI Senior Managing Director Valbridge Property Advisors | South Louisiana



Independent Valuations for a Variable World

State Certifications
Certified General in:
Louisiana
Mississippi
Alabama
Texas
Virginia
California

# Education

Bachelor of Arts History Louisiana State University

### **Contact Details**

504-541-5101 (p) 504-541-5107 (f) <u>aschwertz@valbridge.com</u> (e)

Valbridge Property Advisors 2030 Dickory Avenue Suite 200 New Orleans, LA 70123

www.valbridge.com/south-louisiana

# Appraisal Institute & Related Courses

Appraisal Institute – MAI Designation

Louisiana Chapter President, 2017

Membership/Affiliations

Member:

Member:

Continuing education courses taken through the Appraisal Institute and other real estate organizations.

Celebration Church Administrative Team (Corporate Secretary)

### Publications, Seminars Presented, etc.

"Contract or Effective Rent: Finding the Real Rent", Appraisal Institute, Baton Rouge, Louisiana, 2016.

"Appraising Commercial and Complex Properties in an Historic Area", Webinar for the Appraisal Institute, 2015.

"The Unique Appraisal: Case Studies in Appraising Special Purpose Properties", Al Connect 2014 (Appraisal Institute's National Meeting), Austin, Texas, 2014.

Schwertz, Arthur L. 2014. "History Lesson", Valuation Magazine 2<sup>nd</sup> Quarter, 2014, 12 – 13.

Huso, Deborah R. 2013. "On the Waterfront", *Valuation Magazine 2<sup>nd</sup> Quarter*, 2013, 22 – 27. (Contributor)

### Experience

Senior Managing Director Valbridge Property Advisors | South Louisiana (2013-Present)

Vice-President Argote, Derbes, Graham, Shuffield & Tatje, Inc. (1992-2013)

Appraisal/valuation and consulting assignments include (but not limited to): Single-family, condominium, apartments, vacant land, funeral homes, amphitheaters, live performance theaters, office buildings, hospitals, nursing homes, specialized healthcare, hotels/motels, service stations, retail, industrial plants, warehouses, fractional interest valuations, contaminated properties, special purpose properties (port facilities, nuclear reactor simulator facility, shipyards, etc.), senior residential and healthcare facilities, feasibility studies, market studies, condemnation, construction defects, litigation support, mediations, and review appraisals.

Mr. Schwertz has provided valuation services in a wide variety of complex civil litigation including real estate, land use cases, condemnation, estate matters, property taxation, construction defect, and bankruptcy/creditors matters.

Qualified as an expert witness in Jefferson, Orleans, and St. Tammany Parishes, Dallas County, Texas, United States Court of Federal Claims and the Bankruptcy Court for the Middle District of Louisiana.



# FAST FACTS

- Valbridge is the largest independent national real estate valuation and advisory services firm in North America.
  - o Total number of MAI-designated appraisers (200+ on staff)
  - o Total number of office locations (70+ across U.S.)
  - o Total number of staff (675+ strong)
- Valbridge covers the entire U.S. from coast to coast.
- Valbridge services all property types, including special-purpose properties and residential.
- Valbridge provides independent valuation services. We are not owned by a brokerage firm or investment company.
- Every Valbridge office is led by a senior managing director who holds the MAI designation of the Appraisal Institute.
- Valbridge is owned by our local office leaders.
- Valbridge welcomes single-property assignments as well as portfolio, multi-market and other bulk-property engagements.

Valbridge Property Advisors, Inc. 2240 Venetian Court • Naples, FL 34109 • Phone: (888) 981-2029 www.valbridge.com





#### ALABAMA

4732 Woodmere Boulevard Montgomery, AL 36106 334.277.5077

200 Cahaba Park Circle Suite 213 Birmingham, AL 35242 205.440.2998

#### ARIZONA

6061 E. Grant Road Suite 121 Tucson, AZ 85712 520.321.0000

#### CALIFORNIA

4915 Calloway Drive Suite 101 Bakersfield, CA 93312 661.587.1010

1370 N. Brea Boulevard Suite 255 Fullerton, CA 92835 714.449.0852

2813 Coffee Road Suite E-2 Modesto, CA 95355 209.569.0450

99 S. Lake Avenue Suite 21 Pasadena, CA 91101 626,744,0428

3090 Fite Circle Suite 202 Sacramento, CA 95827 916.361.2509

55 South Market Street Suite 1210 San Jose, CA 95113 408.279.1520

3160 Crow Canyon Place Suite 245 San Ramon, CA 94583 925.327.1660

#### COLORADO

7445 E. Peakview Avenue Centennial, CO 80111 303.443.9600

5345 Arapahoe Avenue Suite 7 Boulder, CO 80303 303.443.9600

23272 Two Rivers Road Unit 101 Basalt, CO 81621 970.340.1016

1099 Main Avenue Suite 311 Durango, CO 81301 970.340.1016

#### CONNECTICUT

15 Concord Street Glastonbury, CT 06033 860.246.4606

17 Covewood Drive Norwalk, CT 06853 203.286.6520

CORPORATE OFFICE

Spring 2019

#### FLORIDA

2240 Venetian Court Naples, FL 34109 239.514.4646

> 301 Almeria Avenue, Suite 350 Coral Gables, FL 33134 305.639.8029

603 Hillcrest Street Orlando, FL 32803 407,839.3626

2711 Poinsettia Avenue West Palm Beach, FL 33407 561.833.5331

#### GEORGIA

2675 Paces Ferry Road Suite 145 Atlanta, GA 30339 678.644.4853

#### **IDAHO**

1459 Tyrell Lane Suite B Boise, ID 83706 208.336.1097 1875 N. Lakewood Drive Suite 100

Suite 100 Coeur d'Alene, ID 83814 208.292.2965

#### ILLINOIS

566 W. Lake Street Suite 240 Chicago, IL 60661 312.288.8687

#### INDIANA

KANSAS

820 Fort Wayne Avenue Indianapolis, IN 46204 317.687.2747

10990 Quivira Road Suite 100 Overland Park, KS 66210 913.451.1451

#### KENTUCKY

9000 Wessex Place Suite 306 Louisville, KY 40222 502.585.3651

#### LOUISIANA

2030 Dickory Avenue Suite 200 New Orleans, LA 70123 504.541.5100

#### MARYLAND 11100 Dovedale Court Marriottsville, MD 21104 443.333.5522

MASSACHUSETTS

260 Bear Hill Road Suite 106 Waltham MA 02451 781.790.5645

2240 Venetian Court Naples, FL 34109

#### MICHIGAN

1420 Washington Blvd. Suite 301 Detroit, MI 48226 313.986.3313.

2127 University Park Drive Suite 390 Okemos, MI 48864 517,336,0001

#### MINNESOTA 222 South 9th Street

Suite 825 Minneapolis, MN 55402 612.253.0650

275 East 4th Street, Suite 325 St. Paul, MN 55101 651.983.2408

#### MISSISSIPPI

1010 Ford Street Gulfport, MS 39507 228,604,1900

737 Highway 51 Suite 1C Madison, MS 39110 601.853.0736

MISSOURI

10990 Quivira Road Suite 100 Overland Park, KS 66210 913.451,1451

#### NEVADA

3034 S. Durango Drive Suite 100 Las Vegas, NV 89117 702,242,9369

6490 S McCarran Blvd #51 Reno, NV 89509 775.204.4100

#### NEW JERSEY

2740 Route 10 West, Suite 204 Morris Plains, NJ 07950 973.970.9333

3500 Route 9 South, Suite 202 Howell, NJ 07731 732.807.3113

#### **NEW YORK**

424 West 33rd Street Suite 630 New York, NY 10001 212.268.1113

# NORTH CAROLINA

412 E. Chatham Street Cary, NC 27511 919.859.2666

239-325-8234 phone 239-325-8356 fax

5950 Fairview Road, Suite 405 Charlotte, NC 28210 704.376.5400

#### OHIO

1655 W. Market Street Suite 130 Akron, OH 44313 330,899,9900

8291 Beechmont Ave., Suite B Cincinnati, OH 45255 513.785.0820

1422 Euclid Avenue Suite 616 Cleveland, OH 44115 216.367.9690

#### OKLAHOMA

5909 NW Expressway Suite 104 Oklahoma City, OK 73132 405.603.1553

6666 South Sheridan Road Suite 104 Tulsa, OK 74133 918.712.9992

#### PENNSYLVANIA

150 S. Warner Road Suite 440 King of Prussia, PA 19406 215.545.1900

215.545.1900 4701 Baptist Road Suite 304

# SOUTH CAROLINA

Pittsburgh, PA 15227 412.881.6080

11 Cleveland Court Greenville, SC 29607 864,233.6277

920 Bay Street Suite 26 Beaufort, SC 29902 843.342.2302

1250 Fairmont Avenue Mt. Pleasant, SC 29464 843.881.1266

#### TENNESSEE

5205 Maryland Way Suite 300 Brentwood, TN 37027 615.369.0670

701 Broad Street Suite 209 Chattanooga, TN 37402 423.285.8435

213 Fox Road Knoxville, TN 37922 865.522.2424

756 Ridge Lake Blvd Suite 225 Memphis, TN 38120 901,753,6977

#### TEXAS

High Point Center 12225 Greenville Avenue Suite 490 Dallas, TX 75243 214.446.1611

#### TEXAS (cont'd)

974 Campbell Road Suite 204 Houston, TX 77024 713.467.5858 2731 81st Street Lubbock, TX 79423 806.744.1188

9901 IH-10 West Suite 1035 San Antonio, TX 78230 210 227 6229

#### UTAH

260 South 2500 West Suite 301 Pleasant Grove, UT 84062 801,492,9328

1100 East 6600 South Suite 201 Salt Lake City, UT 84121 801.262.3388

20 North Main Suite 304 St. George, UT 84770 435.773.6300

#### VIRGINIA

656 Independence Parkway Suite 220 Chesapeake, VA 23320 757.410.1222

4914 Fitzhugh Avenue Suite 102 Richmond, VA 23230 757-345-0010

5107 Center Street Unit 2B Williamsburg, VA 23188 757.345.0010

#### WASHINGTON 18728 Bothell Way, NE

Suite B Bothell, WA 98011 425,450.0040

2927 Colby Avenue

Suite 100 Everett, WA 98201 425.258.2611

419 Berkeley Avenue

8378 W. Grandridge Boulevard Suite 110-D Kennewick, WA 99336 509.221.1540

Suite A Fircrest, WA 98466

506 Second Avenue

Suite 1001 Seattle, WA 98104

324 N. Mullan Road Spokane Valley, WA 99206 509.747.0999

12660 W. North Avenue

Brookfield, WI 53005

Each Valbridge office is independently owned and operated.

Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8

Case No. 2022-00432

Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 158 of 327

206,209,3016

WISCONSIN

262.782.7990

253.274.0099



# **Concise Appraisal Report**

River Bluffs Sewer Easements River Bluff, Oldham County, Kentucky 40059 Report Date: 05-24-2019



# FOR:

Central States Water Resource Ms. Sandy Neal Regional Director of Utility Acquisitions 500 Northwest Plaza Drive, Suite 500 St. Ann, Missouri 63074

> Valbridge File Number: LA01-19-0133.001

# Valbridge Property Advisors

2030 Dickory Avenue, Suite 200 New Orleans, LA 70123 504.541.5100 phone 504.541.5107 fax *valbridge.com* 

> Case No. 2022-00432 Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8 Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 159 of 327



2030 Dickory Avenue, Suite 200 New Orleans, LA 70123 504.541.5100 phone 504.541.5107 fax valbridge.com

05-24-2019

Arthur L. Schwertz MAI 504.541.5101 aschwertz@valbridge.com

Ms. Sandy Neal Regional Director of Utility Acquisitions Central States Water Resource 500 Northwest Plaza Drive, Suite 500 St. Ann, Missouri 63074

RE: Appraisal Report River Bluffs Sewer Easements River Bluff, Oldham County, Kentucky 40059

Dear Ms. Neal:

In accordance with your request, we have performed an appraisal of the above referenced property. This appraisal report sets forth the pertinent data gathered, the techniques employed, and the reasoning leading to our value opinions. This letter of transmittal is not valid if separated from the appraisal report.

The subject for this site consists of the utility easements for sewer within River Bluff, Kentucky. Said easements measure approximately 11,982.61 Linear Feet and contain an average width of 10 feet.

We developed our analyses, opinions, and conclusions and prepared this report in conformity with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP) of the Appraisal Foundation; the Code of Professional Ethics and Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice of the Appraisal Institute; and the requirements of our client as we understand them.

The client in this assignment is Central States Water Resource and the intended user of this report is Central States Water Resources and no others. The intended use is for regulatory filings and no other use. The value opinions reported herein are subject to the definitions, assumptions and limiting conditions, and certification contained in this report.



The acceptance of this appraisal assignment and the completion of the appraisal report submitted herewith are subject to the General Assumptions and Limiting Conditions contained in the report. The findings and conclusions are further contingent upon the following extraordinary assumptions and/or hypothetical conditions which might have affected the assignment results:

# **Extraordinary Assumptions:**

• The easements included in this analysis are for the apparent easements for which the appraiser could find evidence as we were not able to locate a recordation of these easements. There could exist the potential for additional easements. If such easements are located, the appraiser reserves the right to revise his estimate of value.

# Hypothetical Conditions:

• This report is predicated upon the hypothetical condition that the property is vacant land unencumbered by the existing improvements. In other words, this appraisal is of the underlying land as if vacant and ready for development.

Based on the analysis contained in the following report, our value conclusions are summarized as follows:

# **Value Conclusions**

Component	As Is
Value Type	Market Value
Property Rights Appraised	Fee Simple in the Easements
Effective Date of Value	May 15, 2019
Value Conclusion	\$103,000
	\$0.86 psf

Respectfully submitted, Valbridge Property Advisors

1/1 2/A

Arthur L. Schwertz, MAI Senior Managing Director Kentucky Certified General Real Property Appraiser #5470



# **Table of Contents**

Cover Page	
Letter of Transmittal	
Table of Contents	i
Summary of Salient Facts	ii
Aerial and Front Views	iv
Location Map	v
Introduction	1
Scope of Work	3
Regional and Market Area Analysis	5
Site Description	8
Subject Photos	
Highest and Best Use	13
Land Valuation	14
General Assumptions and Limiting Conditions	
Certification – Arthur L. Schwertz	
Addenda	
Glossary	
Qualifications of Arthur L. Schwertz, MAI	
Valbridge Property Advisors Information / Office Locations	



# **Summary of Salient Facts**

Property Identification		
Property Name	River Bluffs Sewer Easements	
Property Address	Varioius Streets	
	River Bluff, Oldham County, Kentucky 4005	59
Latitude & Longitude	38.376456, -85.604602	
Tax Parcel Number		
Property Owner	River Bluff Kentucky Farm Inc.	
Site		
Zoning	Conservation/Residential District (CO-1)	
FEMA Flood Map No.	21185C0090C	
Flood Zone	Х	
Primary Land Area	2.751 acres	
Valuation Opinions		
Highest & Best Use - As Vacant	Single-Family Residential	
Reasonable Exposure Time	Less than 12 months	
Reasonable Marketing Time	Less than 12 months	
	Value Indications	
Approach to Value		As Is
Sales Comparison		\$103.000

Sales Comparison	\$103,000
Cost	Not Developed
Income Capitalization	Not Developed
Value Conclusions	
Component	As Is
Value Type	Market Value
Property Rights Appraised	Fee Simple in the Easements
Effective Date of Value	May 15, 2019
Value Conclusion	\$103,000

Our findings and conclusions are further contingent upon the following extraordinary assumptions and/or hypothetical conditions which might have affected the assignment results:

# **Extraordinary Assumptions:**

• The easements included in this analysis are for the apparent easements for which the appraiser could find evidence as we were not able to locate a recordation of these easements. There could exist the potential for additional easements. If such easements are located, the appraiser reserves the right to revise his estimate of value.

#### Case No. 2022-00432 Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8 Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 163 of 327

\$0.86 psf



# Hypothetical Conditions:

• This report is predicated upon the hypothetical condition that the property is vacant land unencumbered by the existing improvements. In other words, this appraisal is of the underlying land as if vacant and ready for development.



RIVER BLUFFS SEWER EASEMENTS AERIAL AND FRONT VIEWS

# **Aerial and Front Views**

# **AERIAL VIEW**



**FRONT VIEW** 





RIVER BLUFFS SEWER EASEMENTS LOCATION MAP

# **Location Map**





# Introduction

# Client and Intended Users of the Appraisal

The client in this assignment is Central States Water Resource and the intended user of this report is Central States Water Resources and no others.

# Intended Use of the Appraisal

The intended use of this report is regulatory filings and no other use.

# Real Estate Identification

The subject for this site consists of the utility easements for sewer within River Bluff, Kentucky. Said easements measure approximately 11,982.61 Linear Feet and contain an average width of 10 feet.

Legal Description Lot 106, Section 3, Oldham County, City of River Bluff, Kentucky

Use of Real Estate as of the Effective Date of Value

As of the effective date of value, the subject was a property.

# Use of Real Estate as Reflected in this Appraisal

The subject is a subdivision-residential land property.

# Ownership of the Property

According to Public Records, title to the subject property is vested in River Bluff Kentucky Farm Inc..

# History of the Property

Ownership of the subject property has not changed within the past three years.

# Listings/Offers/Contracts

The subject is not currently listed for sale or under contract for sale.

# Type and Definition of Value

The appraisal problem (the term "Purpose of Appraisal" has been retired from appraisal terminology) is to develop an opinion of the market value of the subject property. "Market Value," as used in this appraisal, is defined as "the most probable price that a property should bring in a competitive and open market under all conditions requisite to a fair sale, the buyer and seller each acting prudently and knowledgeably, and assuming the price is not affected by undue stimulus." Implicit in this definition is the consummation of a sale as of a specified date and the passing of title from seller to buyer under conditions whereby:

- Buyer and seller are typically motivated.
- Both parties are well informed or well advised, each acting in what they consider their own best interests;
- A reasonable time is allowed for exposure in the open market;



- Payment is made in terms of cash in U.S. dollars or in terms of financial arrangements comparable thereto; and
- The price represents the normal consideration for the property sold unaffected by special or creative financing or sale concessions granted by anyone associated with the sale."1

The value conclusions apply to the value of the subject property under the market conditions presumed on the effective date(s) of value.

Please refer to the Glossary in the Addenda section for additional definitions of terms used in this report.

# Valuation Scenarios, Property Rights Appraised, and Effective Dates of Value

Per the scope of our assignment we developed opinions of value for the subject property under the following scenarios of value:

Valuation Scenario	Effective Date of Value
As Is Market Value of the Fee Simple in the Easements Interest	May 15, 2019

We completed an appraisal inspection of the subject property on 05-15-2019.

# Date of Report

The date of this report is 05-24-2019, which is the same as the date of the letter of transmittal.

# List of Items Requested but Not Provided

None

# Assumptions and Conditions of the Appraisal

The acceptance of this appraisal assignment and the completion of the appraisal report submitted herewith are subject to the General Assumptions and Limiting Conditions contained in the report. The findings and conclusions are further contingent upon the following extraordinary assumptions and/or hypothetical conditions which might have affected the assignment results:

Extraordinary Assumptions

• The easements included in this analysis are for the apparent easements for which the appraiser could find evidence as we were not able to locate a recordation of these easements. There could exist the potential for additional easements. If such easements are located, the appraiser reserves the right to revise his estimate of value.

Hypothetical Conditions

• This report is predicated upon the hypothetical condition that the property is vacant land unencumbered by the existing improvements. In other words, this appraisal is of the underlying land as if vacant and ready for development.

Page 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Source: Code of Federal Regulations, Title 12, Banks and Banking, Part 722.2-Definitions

<sup>© 2018</sup> VALBRIDGE PROPERTY ADVISORS | VPA of South Louisiana, Inc.



# Scope of Work

The elements addressed in the Scope of Work are (1) the extent to which the subject property is identified, (2) the extent to which the subject property is inspected, (3) the type and extent of data researched, (4) the type and extent of analysis applied, (5) the type of appraisal report prepared, and (6) the inclusion or exclusion of items of non-realty in the development of the value opinion. These items are discussed as below.

# Extent to Which the Property Was Identified

The three components of the property identification are summarized as follows:

- Legal Characteristics The subject was legally identified via public Records.
- <u>Economic Characteristics</u> Economic characteristics of the subject property were identified via information provided by the client, market surveys, discussions with market participants, and our database, as well as a comparison to properties with similar locational and physical characteristics.
- <u>Physical Characteristics</u> The subject was physically identified via an appraisal inspection consisted of exterior observations only as the appraisal is to assume the site is vacant and ready for development.

# Extent to Which the Property Was Inspected

We inspected the subject on 05-15-2019.

# Type and Extent of Data Researched

We researched and analyzed: (1) market area data, (2) property-specific market data, (3) zoning and land-use data, and (4) current data on comparable listings and transactions. We also interviewed people familiar with the subject market/property type.

# Type and Extent of Analysis Applied (Valuation Methodology)

We observed surrounding land use trends, the condition of any improvements, demand for the subject property, and relevant legal limitations in concluding a highest and best use. We then valued the subject based on that highest and best use conclusion.

There are four primary methodologies available for the estimation of land value: (1) Sales Comparison, (2) Land Residual Method, (3) Ground Rent Capitalization, and (4) Subdivision Development Method (Discounted Cash Flow). While other methods, such as Extraction and Allocation, are applicable under limited conditions, one or more of these approaches are used in most circumstances to derive an indication of land value.

- <u>Sales Comparison Approach</u> In the sales comparison approach, value is indicated by recent sales and/or listings of comparable properties in the market, with the appraiser analyzing the impact of material differences in both economic and physical elements between the subject and the comparables.
- <u>Direct Capitalization: Land Residual Method</u> The land residual methodology involves estimating the residual net income to the land by deducting from total potential income the



portion attributable to the improvements, assuming development of the site at its highest and best use. The residual income is capitalized at an appropriate rate, resulting in an indication of land value.

- <u>Direct Capitalization: Ground Rent Capitalization</u> A market derived capitalization rate is applied to the net income resulting from a ground lease. This can represent the leased fee or fee simple interest, depending on whether the income potential is reflective of a lease in place or market rental rates.
- <u>Yield Capitalization: Subdivision Development Method</u> Also known as Discounted Cash Flow Analysis (DCF), the methodology is most appropriate for land having multiple lot development in the near term as the highest and best use. The current site value is represented by discounting the anticipated cash flow to a present value, taking into consideration all necessary costs of development, maintenance, administration, and sales throughout the absorption period.

All of these approaches to value were considered. We assessed the availability of data and applicability of each approach to value within the context of the characteristics of the subject property and the needs and requirements of the client. Based on this assessment, we relied upon the sales comparison approach. Further discussion of the extent of our analysis and the methodology of each approach is provided later in the respective valuation sections.

# Appraisal Conformity and Report Type

We developed our analyses, opinions, and conclusions and prepared this report in conformity with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP) of the Appraisal Foundation; the Code of Professional Ethics and Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice of the Appraisal Institute; and the requirements of our client as we understand them.

This is an Appraisal Report as defined by the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice under Standards Rule 2-2a. USPAP gives appraisers flexibility to vary the level of information presented in the report dependent on the intended use and intended users of the appraisal. The appraisal is presented in a Concise format which briefly summarizes the data, reasoning, and analyses used in the appraisal assignment.

# Personal Property/FF&E

All items of non-realty are excluded from this analysis. The opinion of market value developed herein is reflective of real estate only.



# **Regional and Market Area Analysis**

# **REGIONAL MAP**



# Overview

The subject is located in River Bluff, in Oldham County. It is part of the Louisville, KY-IN MSA. The Greater Louisville region is made up of 15 counties surrounding the Greater Louisville and Southern Indiana areas, home to more than 1.4 million people and over 58,000 businesses.

# Population

Population characteristics relative to the subject property are presented in the following table.

			Annual %			Annual %
			Change	Estimated	Projected	Change
Area	2000	2010	2000 - 10	2018	2023	2018 - 23
United States	281,421,906	308,745,538	1.0%	330,088,686	343,954,683	0.8%
Kentucky	4,041,769	4,339,367	0.7%	4,548,018	4,665,793	0.5%
Louisville/Jefferson County	1,121,112	1,235,708	1.0%	1,304,874	1,351,952	0.7%
Oldham County, KY	46,178	60,316	3.1%	67,309	72,082	1.4%
River Bluff City, KY	152	403	16.5%	439	464	1.1%

© 2018 VALBRIDGE PROPERTY ADVISORS | VPA of South Louisiana, Inc.

Case No. 2022-00432 Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8 Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 171 of 327



# Transportation

Greater Louisville is within a day's drive of two-thirds of the U.S. population and, as the home of UPS WorldPort, within a day's flight for packages to almost any global destination.

The highway system in Greater Louisville provides one-day access to well over 66 percent of the major domestic markets via Interstates I-65, I-64, and I-71. In addition, a secondary road network provides convenient ingress and egress to the major interstate highways.

Louisville Muhammad Ali International Airport (SDF) provides dependable service to numerous international and domestic gateways; and for FY 2016 through FY 2020, more than \$127 million in capital and major maintenance projects are programmed. Non-stop service is offered to 31 domestic destinations.

The region has 48 private terminals and 3 public inland ports on the Ohio River: Jefferson Riverport International (Kentucky), Meade County Riverport (Kentucky) and Port of Indiana-Jeffersonville (Indiana).

Greater Louisville is served by three Class I railroads – Canadian Pacific (CP), CSX, and Norfolk Southern (NS) – and multiple regional and shortline railroads. Both CSX and NS railroads provide Louisville with direct rail service to all markets east of the Mississippi River, as well as connecting service to the West Coast. The city is also one of four regional hubs for CSX.

# Employment

The Greater Louisville area has a diverse economy due to its location as a hub for UPS as well as being located in the center of Bourbon country. A breakdown by employment sector is as follows:

Employment	by Ind	dustry - 🛛	Louisville/	Jefferson	County

	2018	Percent of
Industry	Estimate	Employment
Agriculture/Mining	4,637	0.70%
Construction	35,773	5.40%
Manufacturing	92,084	13.90%
Wholesale trade	18,549	2.80%
Retail trade	70,222	10.60%
Transportation/Utilities	50,348	7.60%
Information	11,262	1.70%
Finance/Insurance/Real Estate Services	51,010	7.70%
Services	308,049	46.50%
Public Administration	20,537	3.10%
Total	662,472	100.0%
Source: Site-to-Do-Business (STDB Online)		

# Unemployment

The following table exhibits current and past unemployment rates as obtained from the Bureau of Labor Statistics. Overall, the Region boasts one of the lowest unemployment rates for metropolitan statistical areas in the country at 4.0 percent.



Area	YE 2011	YE 2012	YE 2013	YE 2014	YE 2015	YE 2016	YE 2017	2018 YTD
United States	8.5%	7.9%	6.7%	5.6%	5.0%	4.7%	4.1%	3.7%
Kentucky	8.1%	7.7%	5.5%	5.3%	5.2%	4.4%	4.3%	4.0%
Louisville/Jefferson County	7.3%	6.3%	4.6%	4.3%	4.0%	3.4%	3.5%	4.0%
Oldham County, KY	5.4%	5.1%	3.5%	3.4%	3.1%	2.9%	2.9%	3.5%

# Median Household Income

Total median household income for the region is presented in the following table. Overall, the subject's MSA and county compare favorably to the state and the country.

#### Estimated Projected Annual % Change 2018 2023 2018 - 23 Area United States \$58,100 \$65,727 2.6% Kentucky \$47,571 \$53,381 2.4% Louisville/Jefferson County \$55,080 \$62,484 2.7% Oldham County, KY \$90,544 \$97,846 1.6% River Bluff City, KY \$175,542 \$167,538 -0.9% Source: Site-to-Do-Business (STDB Online)

# **Median Household Income**



# **Site Description**

The subject site is located on the west side of Creekview Road via an access road. The characteristics of the site are summarized as follows:

# Site Characteristics

/ Road via an access road
near, the site

# Street Frontage / Access

Street Hontage / Access	
Frontage Road	Primary
	Creekview Road, Cherry Tree Lane, River Bluff Road, Raintree
Street Name:	Court, Dog Tree Court, Apple Tree Lane, River Bluff Court, Elm
	Lane and Peach Tree Lane
Street Type:	Residential
Frontage (Linear Ft.):	11,982.61
Additional Access	
Water or Port Access:	No
Rail Access:	No
Flood Zone Data	
Flood Map Panel/Number:	21185C0090C
Flood Map Date:	09-20-2006
Flood Zone:	Х
	Flood hazard areas identified on the Flood Insurance Rate Map are identified as a Special Flood Hazard Area (SFHA). SFHA are defined as the area that will be inundated by the flood event



Site Area in Flood:	having a 1-percent chance of being equaled or exceeded in any given year. The 1-percent annual chance flood is also referred to as the base flood or 100-year flood. SFHAs are labeled as Zone A, Zone AO, Zone AH, Zones A1-A30, Zone AE, Zone A99, Zone AR, Zone AR/AE, Zone AR/AO, Zone AR/A1-A30, Zone AR/A, Zone V, Zone VE, and Zones V1-V30. Moderate flood hazard areas, labeled Zone B or Zone X (shaded) are also shown on the FIRM, and are the areas between the limits of the base flood and the 0.2-percent-annual-chance (or 500-year) flood. The areas of minimal flood hazard, which are the areas outside the SFHA and higher than the elevation of the 0.2-percent-annual-chance flood, are labeled Zone C or Zone X (unshaded). 100.00%
Other Site Conditions	
Soil Type:	Typical
Environmental Issues:	No environmental issues were noted at the time of inspection or disclosed by involved parties that would impact value.
Adjacent Land Uses	
North:	Residential
South:	Residential
East:	Land/ Residential
West:	Land
Site Ratings	
Access:	Average
Visibility:	Average
Zoning Designation	
Zoning Jurisdiction:	Oldham County
Zoning Classification:	CO-1, Conservation/Residential District
General Plan Designation:	Conservation and residential
Permitted Uses:	Agriculture, community facilities, public parks and recreational, religious institutions, residential, special. utilties
Zoning Comments:	The Conservation/Residential District is intended to promote and protect significant natural features, wooded areas, water courses, existing and potential lake sites, other recreational and conservation resources, wildlife habitat, present and future water

pollution of streams and lakes.

supplies, and to minimize erosion of soil and the siltation and



RIVER BLUFFS SEWER EASEMENTS SITE DESCRIPTION

# **FLOOD MAP**





RIVER BLUFFS SEWER EASEMENTS SITE DESCRIPTION







RIVER BLUFFS SEWER EASEMENTS SUBJECT PHOTOS

# **Subject Photos**



Typical Easement along Street Centerline



Another view along the easements



# **Highest and Best Use**

The Highest and Best Use of a property is the use that is legally permissible, physically possible, and financially feasible which results in the highest value. An opinion of the highest and best use results from consideration of the criteria noted above under the market conditions or likely conditions as of the effective date of value. Determination of highest and best use results from the judgment and analytical skills of the appraiser. It represents an opinion, not a fact. In appraisal practice, the concept of highest and best use represents the premise upon which value is based.

# Analysis of Highest and Best Use As If Vacant

The primary determinants of the highest and best use of the property as if vacant are the issues of (1) Legal permissibility, (2) Physical possibility, (3) Financial feasibility, and (4) Maximum productivity.

# Legally Permissible

The subject site is zoned CO-1, Conservation/Residential District which controls the general nature of permissible uses but is appropriate for the location and physical elements of the subject property, providing for a consistency of use with the general neighborhood. The location of the subject property is appropriate for the uses allowed, as noted previously, and a change in zoning is unlikely. There are no known easements, encroachments, covenants or other use restrictions that would unduly limit or impede development.

# Physically Possible

The physical attributes allow for a number of potential uses. Elements such as size, shape, availability of utilities, known hazards (flood, environmental, etc.), and other potential influences are described in the Site Description and have been considered. There are no items of a physical nature that would materially limit appropriate and likely development.

# **Financially Feasible**

The probable use of the site for residential subdivision development conforms to the pattern of land use in the market area. A review of published yield, rental and occupancy rates suggest that there is a balanced supply and demand is sufficient to support construction costs and ensure timely absorption of additional inventory in this market. Therefore, near-term speculative development of the subject site is financially feasible.

# Maximally Productive

Among the financially feasible uses, the use that results in the highest value (the maximally productive use) is the highest and best use. Considering these factors, the maximally productive use as though vacant is for single-family residential use.

# Conclusion of Highest and Best Use As If Vacant

The conclusion of the highest and best use as if vacant is for single-family residential use.



# Land Valuation

The subject servitudes will be valued herein utilizing only the Sales Comparison Approach to Value. They will be valued based upon a comparison with sales of comparably located sites in the immediate area of the subject sites which are more functionally useable in size and shape. This will give an Across the Fence or ATF value from which the market value of the corridor interest can be determined. This report contains a more specific description of each subject site, the immediate neighborhood of the subject and a description of adjoining land uses and types. It also contains a summary and analysis of the pertinent comparable land sale and listing data used in valuing each site.

# Methodology

Site Value is most often estimated using the sales comparison approach. This approach develops an indication of market value by analyzing closed sales, listings, or pending sales of properties similar to the subject, focusing on the difference between the subject and the comparables using all appropriate elements of comparison. This approach is based on the principles of supply and demand, balance, externalities, and substitution, or the premise that a buyer would pay no more for a specific property than the cost of obtaining a property with the same quality, utility, and perceived benefits of ownership.

# Unit of Comparison

The unit of comparison depends on land use economics and how buyers and sellers use the property. The unit of comparison in this analysis is per usable square foot.

# Elements of Comparison

Elements of comparison are the characteristics or attributes of properties and transactions that cause the prices of real estate to vary. The primary elements of comparison considered in sales comparison analysis are as follows: (1) property rights conveyed, (2) financing terms, (3) conditions of sale, (4) expenditures made immediately after purchase, (5) market conditions, (6) location, and (7) physical characteristics.

# Comparable Sales Data

To obtain and verify comparable sales of vacant land properties, we conducted a search of public records, field surveys, interviews with knowledgeable real estate professionals in the area, and a review of our internal database.

We included five sales in our analysis, as these sales were judged to be the most comparable to develop an indication of market value for the subject property. It should be noted that since the subject neighborhood is completely built-out, the appraiser has utilized sales of single-family residences. According to interviews with numerous builders, typically 25% of a home's sale price can be allocated to the underlying lot. Based upon this information, the sale prices shown are the amount allocated to the lots based upon comments of local builders.

The following is a table summarizing each sale comparable and a map illustrating the location of each in relation to the subject.


### Land Sales Summary

	Subject	Sale # 1	Sale # 2	Sale # 3	Sale # 4	Sale # 5
Sale ID		1405236	1405240	1405243	1405244	1405250
Sale Status		Closed	Closed	Closed	Closed	Closed
Location	Various Streets	13300 Creekview	13308 Creekview	13318 Creekview	3506 River Bluff	13406 Apple Tree
		Road	Road	Road	Road	Lane
	River Bluff, Kentucky	River Bluff, Kentucky				
Tax ID		02-02A-03-66	02-02A-03-68	02-02A-03-73	02-02A-02-42	02-02A-01-4
Sales Data						
Date of Sale	May-19	2/19/2019	1/2/2019	9/21/2018	12/14/2018	11/2/2018
Sales Price		\$335,000	\$326,000	\$278,000	\$315,100	\$260,000
Contributory Value of the	Site	\$83,750	\$81,500	\$69,500	\$78,775	\$65,000
Price/Usable Square Foot		\$2.67	\$2.79	\$1.72	\$3.12	\$1.76
Grantor		Daniel W. and Mary	John and Catherine	William J. and	Linda S. Heustis	irvin N. Besser
		Kathleen Dugan	Hughes Oliphant	Debra R. Carroll		
Grantee		Eric John and Emily	Michael H. and	Matthew and	Hewett Brown	Bobby J. Roberts
		Susanne Isbell	Sarah E. Friend	Angela Renderman		
				Patrick		
Recording Number		Book 1211/Page	Book1209/Page 038	Book 1202/Page	Book 1207/Page	Book 1204/Page
		465		183	556	431
Property Rights Conveyed	Fee Simple in the Easements	Fee Simple				
Financing		Cash to Seller				
Conditions of Sale		Typical	Typical	Typical	Typical	Typical
Physical Characteristics						
Usable Land Area (Sq. Ft.)	1	31,363	29,185	40,511	25,265	37,026
Gross Land Area (Sq. Ft.)		31,363	29,185	40,511	25,265	37,026
Zoning		Residential	Residential	Residential	Residential	Residential
Flood Zone		100% in X				
Corner Exposure		Interior	Interior	Interior	Interior	Interior
Access/Visibility		Average/Average	Average/Average	Average/Average	Average/Average	Average/Average

Case No. 2022-00432



RIVER BLUFFS SEWER EASEMENTS LAND VALUATION



#### **COMPARABLE SALES MAP**



# Land Sales Comparison Analysis

When necessary, adjustments were made for differences in various elements of comparison, including property rights conveyed, financing terms, conditions of sale, expenditures made immediately after purchase, market conditions, location, and other physical characteristics. If the element in comparison is considered superior to that of the subject, we applied a negative adjustment. Conversely, a positive adjustment was applied if inferior. A summary of the elements of comparison follows.

	Elements of Comparison		
Real Property Rights Conveyed	Adjustments for differences in property rights appraised.		
Financing Terms	Comparable properties are adjusted for differences between a transaction's financing terms and those assumed in the valuation of the subject property - e.g. seller financing, loan assumption, non-market terms.		
Conditions of Sale	Comparable properties are adjusted for differences in the motivations of either the buyer or a seller in the transaction.		
Expenditures After Purchase	Comparable properties can be adjusted for any additional investment required to make the property salable – e. g. costs to cure deferred maintenance, costs to demolish and remove any portion of the improvements, costs to remediate environmental contamination and/or costs to occupy or stabilize the property.		
Market Conditions	Comparable properties can be adjusted for changes in market conditions because of inflation, deflation, fluctuations in supply and demand, or other factors.		
Location	Location adjustments may be required when the locational characteristics of a comparable are different from those of the subject.		
Access/Exposure	Adjustments for differences in ease of access, visibility, etc.		
Size	The size adjustment addresses variance in the physical size of the comparables and that of the subject, as a larger parcel typically commands a lower price per unit than a smaller parcel.		
Shape /Depth	This element address variance in utility due to shape and/or depth.		
Corner Exposure	Tracts featuring corner influence typically command higher prices in the market place, as opposed to interior locations.		



# Summary of Adjustments

Presented on the following page is a summary of the adjustments made to the sale comparables. As noted earlier, these quantitative adjustments were based on our market research, best judgment, and experience in the appraisal of similar properties.



#### LAND SALES ADJUSTMENT GRID

	Subject	Sale # 1	Sale # 2	Sale # 3	Sale # 4	Sale # 5
Sale ID		1405236	1405240	1405243	1405244	1405250
Date of Value & Sale	May-19	February-19	January-19	September-18	December-18	November-18
Unadjusted Sales Price		\$335,000	\$326,000	\$278,000	\$315,100	\$260,000
Unadjusted Contributory Sales Pri	ice for Land	\$83,750	\$81,500	\$69,500	\$78,775	\$65,000
Usable Square Feet	119,826	31,363	29,185	40,511	25,265	37,026
Unadjusted Sales Price per Usab	le Sq. Ft.	\$2.67	\$2.79	\$1.72	\$3.12	\$1.76
Transactional Adjustments						
Property Rights Conveyed	Simple in the Easeme	Fee Simple	Fee Simple	Fee Simple	Fee Simple	Fee Simple
Adjusted Sales Price		\$2.67	\$2.79	\$1.72	\$3.12	\$1.76
Financing Terms	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller
Adjusted Sales Price	_	\$2.67	\$2.79	\$1.72	\$3.12	\$1.76
Conditions of Sale	Typical	Typical	Typical	Typical	Typical	Typical
Adjusted Sales Price	_	\$2.67	\$2.79	\$1.72	\$3.12	\$1.76
Expenditures after Sale	_					
Adjusted Sales Price		\$2.67	\$2.79	\$1.72	\$3.12	\$1.76
Market Conditions Adjustments						
Elapsed Time from Date of	Value	0.23 years	0.36 years	0.65 years	0.42 years	0.53 years
Market Trend Through	May-19	-	-	-	-	-
Analyzed Sales Price		\$2.67	\$2.79	\$1.72	\$3.12	\$1.76
Physical Adjustments						
Location	Varioius Streets	13300 Creekview	13308 Creekview	13318 Creekview	3506 River Bluff	13406 Apple Tree
		Road	Road	Road	Road	Lane
	River Bluff, Kentucky	River Bluff,	River Bluff,	River Bluff,	River Bluff,	River Bluff,
		Kentucky	Kentucky	Kentucky	Kentucky	Kentucky
Adjustment		-	-	-	-	-
Size	119,826 sf	31,363 sf	29,185 sf	40,511 sf	25,265 sf	37,026 sf
Adjustment		-20.0%	-21.0%	-16.0%	-23.0%	-18.0%
Shape/Depth	Irregular					
Adjustment	-91-1	-	-	-	-	-
Corner Exposure	Interior	Interior	Interior	Interior	Interior	Interior
Adjustment	_		-	-	-	-
Net Physical Adjustment		-20.0%	-21.0%	-16.0%	-23.0%	-18.0%
Adjusted Sales Price per Usable Square Foot		\$2.14	\$2.21	\$1.44	\$2.40	\$1.44

# Conclusion

From the market data available, we used five land sales in competitive market areas which were adjusted based on pertinent elements of comparison. The following table summarizes the unadjusted and adjusted unit prices:

Land Sale Statistics			
Metric	Unadjusted	Analyzed	Adjusted
Minimum Sales Price per Usable Square Foot	\$1.72	\$1.72	\$1.44
Maximum Sales Price per Usable Square Foot	\$3.12	\$3.12	\$2.40
Median Sales Price per Usable Square Foot	\$2.67	\$2.67	\$2.14
Mean Sales Price per Usable Square Foot	\$2.41	\$2.41	\$1.92

Based on the adjusted prices and the most comparable sale, a unit value for the subject property is near the middle of the adjusted range, or \$2.15 per usable square foot. Thus, the estimated "Across the Fence Value" of the Fee Simple Interest in the subject servitudes is calculated to be \$258,000.

© 2018 VALBRIDGE PROPERTY ADVISORS | VPA of South Louisiana, Inc.



# Valuation of the Servitude

The use to which the subject servitudes will be put to is for underground water and sewer pipes. As such, little or no surface improvements will be possible, but access across the surface will be allowed. It is my opinion, therefore, that such a servitude will encumber approximately 40% of the ownership rights in the subject properties.

Thus, based upon the assumptions, reasoning and comparable data discussed herein, the estimated "Market Value" of the subject servitudes is calculated as follows:

#### **Calculation of Easement Value**

Site Area	Unit Value	Market Value of the Fee		Easement Use		Indicated Value of the Easement
119,826 square feet X	\$2.15 psf =	= \$258,000	Х	40%	=	\$103,000



# **Valuation Summary**

The indicated value and our concluded market value for the subject property are summarized in the following table:

### **Value Conclusions**

Component	As Is
Value Type	Market Value
Property Rights Appraised	Fee Simple in the Easements
Effective Date of Value	May 15, 2019
Value Conclusion	\$103,000
	\$0.86 psf

Land properties such as the subject are typically purchased by Owner/Users.

Our findings and conclusions are further contingent upon the following extraordinary assumptions and/or hypothetical conditions which might have affected the assignment results:

# Extraordinary Assumptions:

• The easements included in this analysis are for the apparent easements for which the appraiser could find evidence as we were not able to locate a recordation of these easements. There could exist the potential for additional easements. If such easements are located, the appraiser reserves the right to revise his estimate of value.

# Hypothetical Conditions:

• This report is predicated upon the hypothetical condition that the property is vacant land unencumbered by the existing improvements. In other words, this appraisal is of the underlying land as if vacant and ready for development.

# Exposure Time and Marketing Periods

Based on statistical information about days on market, escrow length, and marketing times gathered through national investor surveys, sales verification, and interviews of market participants, marketing and exposure time estimates of less than 12 months and less than 12 months, respectively, are considered reasonable and appropriate for the subject property.



# **General Assumptions and Limiting Conditions**

This appraisal is subject to the following limiting conditions:

- 1. The legal description if furnished to us is assumed to be correct.
- 2. No responsibility is assumed for legal matters, questions of survey or title, soil or subsoil conditions, engineering, availability or capacity of utilities, or other similar technical matters. The appraisal does not constitute a survey of the property appraised. All existing liens and encumbrances have been disregarded and the property is appraised as though free and clear, under responsible ownership and competent management unless otherwise noted.
- 3. Unless otherwise noted, the appraisal will value the property as though free of contamination. Valbridge Property Advisors | VPA of South Louisiana, Inc. will conduct no hazardous materials or contamination inspection of any kind. It is recommended that the client hire an expert if the presence of hazardous materials or contamination poses any concern.
- 4. The stamps and/or consideration placed on deeds used to indicate sales are in correct relationship to the actual dollar amount of the transaction.
- 5. Unless otherwise noted, it is assumed there are no encroachments, zoning violations or restrictions existing in the subject property.
- 6. The appraiser is not required to give testimony or attendance in court by reason of this appraisal, unless previous arrangements have been made.
- 7. Unless expressly specified in the engagement letter, the fee for this appraisal does not include the attendance or giving of testimony by Appraiser at any court, regulatory, or other proceedings, or any conferences or other work in preparation for such proceeding. If any partner or employee of Valbridge Property Advisors | VPA of South Louisiana, Inc. is asked or required to appear and/or testify at any deposition, trial, or other proceeding about the preparation, conclusions or any other aspect of this assignment, client shall compensate Appraiser for the time spent by the partner or employee in appearing and/or testifying and in preparing to testify according to the Appraiser's then current hourly rate plus reimbursement of expenses.
- 8. The values for land and/or improvements, as contained in this report, are constituent parts of the total value reported and neither is (or are) to be used in making a summation appraisal of a combination of values created by another appraiser. Either is invalidated if so used.



- 9. The dates of value to which the opinions expressed in this report apply are set forth in this report. We assume no responsibility for economic or physical factors occurring at some point at a later date, which may affect the opinions stated herein. The forecasts, projections, or operating estimates contained herein are based on current market conditions and anticipated short-term supply and demand factors and are subject to change with future conditions.
- 10. The sketches, maps, plats and exhibits in this report are included to assist the reader in visualizing the property. The appraiser has made no survey of the property and assumed no responsibility in connection with such matters.
- 11. The information, estimates and opinions, which were obtained from sources outside of this office, are considered reliable. However, no liability for them can be assumed by the appraiser.
- 12. Possession of this report, or a copy thereof, does not carry with it the right of publication. Neither all, nor any part of the content of the report, or copy thereof (including conclusions as to property value, the identity of the appraisers, professional designations, reference to any professional appraisal organization or the firm with which the appraisers are connected), shall be disseminated to the public through advertising, public relations, news, sales, or other media without prior written consent and approval.
- 13. No claim is intended to be expressed for matters of expertise that would require specialized investigation or knowledge beyond that ordinarily employed by real estate appraisers. We claim no expertise in areas such as, but not limited to, legal, survey, structural, environmental, pest control, mechanical, etc.
- 14. This appraisal was prepared for the sole and exclusive use of the client for the function outlined herein. Any party who is not the client or intended user identified in the appraisal or engagement letter is not entitled to rely upon the contents of the appraisal without express written consent of Valbridge Property Advisors | VPA of South Louisiana, Inc. and Client. The Client shall not include partners, affiliates, or relatives of the party addressed herein. The appraiser assumes no obligation, liability or accountability to any third party.
- 15. Distribution of this report is at the sole discretion of the client, but third-parties not listed as an intended user on the face of the appraisal or the engagement letter may not rely upon the contents of the appraisal. In no event shall client give a third-party a partial copy of the appraisal report. We will make no distribution of the report without the specific direction of the client.
- 16. This appraisal shall be used only for the function outlined herein, unless expressly authorized by Valbridge Property Advisors | VPA of South Louisiana, Inc..



- 17. This appraisal shall be considered in its entirety. No part thereof shall be used separately or out of context.
- 18. Unless otherwise noted in the body of this report, this appraisal assumes that the subject property does not fall within the areas where mandatory flood insurance is effective. Unless otherwise noted, we have not completed nor have we contracted to have completed an investigation to identify and/or quantify the presence of non-tidal wetland conditions on the subject property. Because the appraiser is not a surveyor, he or she makes no guarantees, express or implied, regarding this determination.
- 19. The flood maps are not site specific. We are not qualified to confirm the location of the subject property in relation to flood hazard areas based on the FEMA Flood Insurance Rate Maps or other surveying techniques. It is recommended that the client obtain a confirmation of the subject property's flood zone classification from a licensed surveyor.
- 20. If the appraisal is for mortgage loan purposes 1) we assume satisfactory completion of improvements if construction is not complete, 2) no consideration has been given for rent loss during rent-up unless noted in the body of this report, and 3) occupancy at levels consistent with our "Income and Expense Projection" are anticipated.
- 21. It is assumed that there are no hidden or unapparent conditions of the property, subsoil, or structures which would render it more or less valuable. No responsibility is assumed for such conditions or for engineering which may be required to discover them.
- 22. Our inspection included an observation of the land and improvements thereon only. It was not possible to observe conditions beneath the soil or hidden structural components within the improvements. We inspected the buildings involved, and reported damage (if any) by termites, dry rot, wet rot, or other infestations as a matter of information, and no guarantee of the amount or degree of damage (if any) is implied. Condition of heating, cooling, ventilation, electrical and plumbing equipment is considered to be commensurate with the condition of the balance of the improvements unless otherwise stated. Should the client have concerns in these areas, it is the client's responsibility to order the appropriate inspections. The appraiser does not have the skill or expertise to make such inspections and assumes no responsibility for these items.
- 23. This appraisal does not guarantee compliance with building code and life safety code requirements of the local jurisdiction. It is assumed that all required licenses, consents, certificates of occupancy or other legislative or administrative authority from any local, state or national governmental or private entity or organization have been or can be obtained or renewed for any use on which the value conclusion contained in this report is based unless specifically stated to the contrary.



- 24. When possible, we have relied upon building measurements provided by the client, owner, or associated agents of these parties. In the absence of a detailed rent roll, reliable public records, or "as-built" plans provided to us, we have relied upon our own measurements of the subject improvements. We follow typical appraisal industry methods; however, we recognize that some factors may limit our ability to obtain accurate measurements including, but not limited to, property access on the day of inspection, basements, fenced/gated areas, grade elevations, greenery/shrubbery, uneven surfaces, multiple story structures, obtuse or acute wall angles, immobile obstructions, etc. Professional building area measurements of the quality, level of detail, or accuracy of professional measurement services are beyond the scope of this appraisal assignment.
- 25. We have attempted to reconcile sources of data discovered or provided during the appraisal process, including assessment department data. Ultimately, the measurements that are deemed by us to be the most accurate and/or reliable are used within this report. While the measurements and any accompanying sketches are considered to be reasonably accurate and reliable, we cannot guarantee their accuracy. Should the client desire a greater level of measuring detail, they are urged to retain the measurement services of a qualified professional (space planner, architect or building engineer). We reserve the right to use an alternative source of building size and amend the analysis, narrative and concluded values (at additional cost) should this alternative measurement source reflect or reveal substantial differences with the measurements used within the report.
- 26. In the absence of being provided with a detailed land survey, we have used assessment department data to ascertain the physical dimensions and acreage of the property. Should a survey prove this information to be inaccurate, we reserve the right to amend this appraisal (at additional cost) if substantial differences are discovered.
- 27. If only preliminary plans and specifications were available for use in the preparation of this appraisal, then this appraisal is subject to a review of the final plans and specifications when available (at additional cost) and we reserve the right to amend this appraisal if substantial differences are discovered.
- 28. Unless otherwise stated in this report, the value conclusion is predicated on the assumption that the property is free of contamination, environmental impairment or hazardous materials. Unless otherwise stated, the existence of hazardous material was not observed by the appraiser and the appraiser has no knowledge of the existence of such materials on or in the property. The appraiser, however, is not qualified to detect such substances. The presence of substances such as asbestos, urea-formaldehyde foam insulation, or other potentially hazardous materials may affect the value of the property. No responsibility is assumed for any such conditions, or for any expertise or engineering knowledge required for discovery. The client is urged to retain an expert in this field, if desired.



- 29. The Americans with Disabilities Act ("ADA") became effective January 26, 1992. We have not made a specific compliance survey of the property to determine if it is in conformity with the various requirements of the ADA. It is possible that a compliance survey of the property, together with an analysis of the requirements of the ADA, could reveal that the property is not in compliance with one or more of the requirements of the Act. If so, this could have a negative effect on the value of the property. Since we have no direct evidence relating to this issue, we did not consider possible noncompliance with the requirements of ADA in developing an opinion of value.
- 30. This appraisal applies to the land and building improvements only. The value of trade fixtures, furnishings, and other equipment, or subsurface rights (minerals, gas, and oil) were not considered in this appraisal unless specifically stated to the contrary.
- 31. No changes in any federal, state or local laws, regulations or codes (including, without limitation, the Internal Revenue Code) are anticipated, unless specifically stated to the contrary.
- 32. Any income and expense estimates contained in the appraisal report are used only for the purpose of estimating value and do not constitute prediction of future operating results. Furthermore, it is inevitable that some assumptions will not materialize and that unanticipated events may occur that will likely affect actual performance.
- 33. Any estimate of insurable value, if included within the scope of work and presented herein, is based upon figures developed consistent with industry practices. However, actual local and regional construction costs may vary significantly from our estimate and individual insurance policies and underwriters have varied specifications, exclusions, and non-insurable items. As such, we strongly recommend that the Client obtain estimates from professionals experienced in establishing insurance coverage. This analysis should not be relied upon to determine insurance coverage and we make no warranties regarding the accuracy of this estimate.
- 34. The data gathered in the course of this assignment (except data furnished by the Client) shall remain the property of the Appraiser. The appraiser will not violate the confidential nature of the appraiser-client relationship by improperly disclosing any confidential information furnished to the appraiser. Notwithstanding the foregoing, the Appraiser is authorized by the client to disclose all or any portion of the appraisal and related appraisal data to appropriate representatives of the Appraisal Institute if such disclosure is required to enable the appraiser to comply with the Bylaws and Regulations of such Institute now or hereafter in effect.



- 35. You and Valbridge Property Advisors | VPA of South Louisiana, Inc. both agree that any dispute over matters in excess of \$5,000 will be submitted for resolution by arbitration. This includes fee disputes and any claim of malpractice. The arbitrator shall be mutually selected. If Valbridge Property Advisors | VPA of South Louisiana, Inc. and the client cannot agree on the arbitrator, the presiding head of the Local County Mediation & Arbitration panel shall select the arbitrator. Such arbitration shall be binding and final. In agreeing to arbitration, we both acknowledge that, by agreeing to binding arbitration, each of us is giving up the right to have the dispute decided in a court of law before a judge or jury. In the event that the client, or any other party, makes a claim against VPA of South Louisiana, Inc. or any of its employees in connections with or in any way relating to this assignment, the maximum damages recoverable by such claimant shall be the amount actually received by Valbridge Property Advisors | VPA of South Louisiana, Inc. for this assignment, and under no circumstances shall any claim for consequential damages be made.
- 36. Valbridge Property Advisors | VPA of South Louisiana, Inc. shall have no obligation, liability, or accountability to any third party. Any party who is not the "client" or intended user identified on the face of the appraisal or in the engagement letter is not entitled to rely upon the contents of the appraisal without the express written consent of Valbridge Property Advisors | VPA of South Louisiana, Inc.. "Client" shall not include partners, affiliates, or relatives of the party named in the engagement letter. Client shall hold Valbridge Property Advisors | VPA of South Louisiana, Inc. and its employees harmless in the event of any lawsuit brought by any third party, lender, partner, or part-owner in any form of ownership or any other party as a result of this assignment. The client also agrees that in case of lawsuit arising from or in any way involving these appraisal services, client will hold Valbridge Property Advisors | VPA of South Louisiana, Inc. harmless from and against any liability, loss, cost, or expense incurred or suffered by Valbridge Property Advisors | VPA of South Louisiana, Inc. in such action, regardless of its outcome.
- 37. The Valbridge Property Advisors office responsible for the preparation of this report is independently owned and operated by VPA of South Louisiana, Inc.. Neither Valbridge Property Advisors, Inc., nor any of its affiliates has been engaged to provide this report. Valbridge Property Advisors, Inc. does not provide valuation services, and has taken no part in the preparation of this report.
- 38. If any claim is filed against any of Valbridge Property Advisors, Inc., a Florida Corporation, its affiliates, officers or employees, or the firm providing this report, in connection with, or in any way arising out of, or relating to, this report, or the engagement of the firm providing this report, then (1) under no circumstances shall such claimant be entitled to consequential, special or other damages, except only for direct compensatory damages, and (2) the maximum amount of such compensatory damages recoverable by such claimant shall be the amount actually received by the firm engaged to provide this report.



- 39. This report and any associated work files may be subject to evaluation by Valbridge Property Advisors, Inc., or its affiliates, for quality control purposes.
- 40. Acceptance and/or use of this appraisal report constitutes acceptance of the foregoing general assumptions and limiting conditions.



# **Certification – Arthur L. Schwertz**

I certify that, to the best of my knowledge and belief:

- 1. The statements of fact contained in this report are true and correct.
- 2. The reported analyses, opinions, and conclusions are limited only by the reported assumptions and limiting conditions and are my personal, impartial, and unbiased professional analyses, opinions, and conclusions.
- 3. I have no present or prospective interest in the property that is the subject of this report and no personal interest with respect to the parties involved.
- 4. The undersigned has not performed services regarding the property that is the subject of this report within the three-year period immediately preceding acceptance of this assignment.
- 5. I have no bias with respect to the property that is the subject of this report or to the parties involved with this assignment.
- 6. My engagement in this assignment was not contingent upon developing or reporting predetermined results.
- 7. My compensation for completing this assignment is not contingent upon the development or reporting of a predetermined value or direction in value that favors the cause of the client, the amount of value opinion, the attainment of a stipulated result, or the occurrence of a subsequent event directly related to the intended use of this appraisal.
- 8. My analyses, opinions and conclusions were developed, and this report has been prepared, in conformity with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice.
- 9. Arthur L. Schwertz has personally inspected the subject property.
- 10. No one provided significant real property appraisal assistance to the person signing this certification, unless otherwise noted.
- 11. The reported analyses, opinions and conclusions were developed, and this report has been prepared, in conformity with the requirements of the Code of Professional Ethics and Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice of the Appraisal Institute.
- 12. The use of this report is subject to the requirements of the Appraisal Institute relating to review by its duly authorized representatives.
- 13. As of the date of this report, the undersigned has completed the continuing education program for Designated Members of the Appraisal Institute.

2

Arthur L. Schwertz, MAI Senior Managing Director Kentucky Certified General Real Property Appraiser #5470

RIVER BLUFFS SEWER EASEMENTS ADDENDA



# Addenda

Glossary Qualifications

• Arthur L. Schwertz, MAI - Senior Managing Director Information on Valbridge Property Advisors Office Locations



### Glossary

Definitions are taken from The Dictionary of Real Estate Appraisal, 6<sup>th</sup> Edition (Dictionary), the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP), and Building Owners and Managers Association International (BOMA).

#### Absolute Net Lease

A lease in which the tenant pays all expenses including structural maintenance, building reserves, and management; often a long-term lease to a credit tenant. (Dictionary)

#### Amortization

The process of retiring a debt or recovering a capital investment, typically through scheduled, systematic repayment of the principal; a program of periodic contributions to a sinking fund or debt retirement fund. (Dictionary)

#### As Is Market Value

The estimate of the market value of real property in its current physical condition, use, and zoning as of the appraisal date. (Dictionary)

#### Base Rent

The minimum rent stipulated in a lease. (Dictionary)

#### Base Year

The year on which escalation clauses in a lease are based. (Dictionary)

#### **Building Common Area**

In office buildings, the areas of the building that provide services to building tenants but which are not included in the office area or store area of any specific tenant. These areas may include, but shall not be limited to, main and auxiliary lobbies, atrium spaces at the level of the finished floor, concierge areas or security desks, conference rooms, lounges or vending areas, food service facilities, health or fitness centers, daycare facilities, locker or shower facilities, mail rooms, fire control rooms, fully enclosed courtyards outside the exterior walls, and building core and service areas such as fully enclosed mechanical or equipment rooms. Specifically excluded from building common area are floor common areas, parking space, portions of loading docks outside the building line, and major vertical penetrations. (BOMA)

#### **Building Rentable Area**

The sum of all floor rentable areas. Floor rentable area is the result of subtracting from the gross measured area of a floor the major vertical penetrations on that same floor. It is generally fixed for the life of the building and is rarely affected by changes in corridor size or configuration. (BOMA)

#### Certificate of Occupancy (COO)

A formal written acknowledgment by an appropriate unit of local government that a new construction or renovation project is at the stage where it meets applicable health and safety codes and is ready for commercial or residential occupancy. (Dictionary)

#### Common Area Maintenance (CAM)

The expense of operating and maintaining common areas; may or may not include management charges and usually does not include capital expenditures on tenant improvements or other improvements to the property. (Dictionary)

The amount of money charged to tenants for their shares of maintaining a [shopping] center's common area. The charge that a tenant pays for shared services and facilities such as electricity, security, and maintenance of parking lots. Items charged to common area maintenance may include cleaning services, parking lot sweeping and maintenance, snow removal, security and upkeep. (ICSC – International Council of Shopping Centers, 4<sup>th</sup> Ed.)

#### Condominium

A multiunit structure, or a unit within such a structure, with a condominium form of ownership. (Dictionary)

#### **Conservation Easement**

An interest in real estate restricting future land use to preservation, conservation, wildlife habitat, or some combination of those uses. A conservation easement may permit farming, timber harvesting, or other uses of a rural nature as well as some types of conservationoriented development to continue, subject to the easement. (Dictionary)

#### **Contributory Value**

A type of value that reflects the amount a property or component of a property contributes to the value of another asset or to the property as a whole.

The change in the value of a property as a whole, whether positive or negative, resulting from the addition or deletion of a property component. Also called deprival value in some countries. (Dictionary)



#### Debt Coverage Ratio (DCR)

The ratio of net operating income to annual debt service (DCR = NOI/Im), which measures the relative ability of a property to meet its debt service out of net operating income; also called *debt service coverage ratio (DSCR)*. A larger *DCR* typically indicates a greater ability for a property to withstand a reduction of income, providing an improved safety margin for a lender. (Dictionary)

#### **Deed Restriction**

A provision written into a deed that limits the use of land. Deed restrictions usually remain in effect when title passes to subsequent owners. (Dictionary)

#### Depreciation

- In appraisal, a loss in property value from any cause; the difference between the cost of an improvement on the effective date of the appraisal and the market value of the improvement on the same date.
- In accounting, an allocation of the original cost of an asset, amortizing the cost over the asset's life; calculated using a variety of standard techniques. (Dictionary)

#### **Disposition Value**

The most probable price that a specified interest in property should bring under the following conditions:

- Consummation of a sale within a specified time, which is shorter than the typical exposure time for such a property in that market.
- The property is subjected to market conditions prevailing as of the date of valuation;
- Both the buyer and seller are acting prudently and knowledgeably;
- The seller is under compulsion to sell;
- The buyer is typically motivated;
- Both parties are acting in what they consider to be their best interests;
- An adequate marketing effort will be made during the exposure time;
- Payment will be made in cash in U.S. dollars (or the local currency) or in terms of financial arrangements comparable thereto; and
- The price represents the normal consideration for the property sold, unaffected by special or creative financing or sales concessions granted by anyone associated with the sale. (Dictionary)

#### Easement

The right to use another's land for a stated purpose. (Dictionary)

#### EIFS

Exterior Insulation Finishing System. This is a type of exterior wall cladding system. Sometimes referred to as dry-vit.

#### Effective Date

- 1) The date on which the appraisal or review opinion applies. (SVP)
- 2) In a lease document, the date upon which the lease goes into effect. (Dictionary)

#### Effective Gross Income (EGI)

The anticipated income from all operations of the real estate after an allowance is made for vacancy and collection losses and an addition is made for any other income. (Dictionary)

#### Effective Rent

Total base rent, or minimum rent stipulated in a lease, over the specified lease term minus rent concessions; the rent that is effectively paid by a tenant net of financial concessions provided by a landlord. (TIs). (Dictionary)

#### EPDM

Ethylene Propylene Diene Monomer Rubber. A type of synthetic rubber typically used for roof coverings. (Dictionary)

#### **Escalation Clause**

A clause in an agreement that provides for the adjustment of a price or rent based on some event or index. e.g., a provision to increase rent if operating expenses increase; also called *escalator clause, expense recovery clause or stop clause*. (Dictionary)

#### **Estoppel Certificate**

A signed statement by a party (such as a tenant or a mortgagee) certifying, for another's benefit, that certain facts are correct, such as that a lease exists, that there are no defaults, and that rent is paid to a certain date. (Black's) In real estate, a buyer of rental property typically requests estoppel certificates from existing tenants. Sometimes referred to as an *estoppel letter*. (Dictionary)

#### **Excess Land**

Land that is not needed to serve or support the existing use. The highest and best use of the excess land may or may not be the same as the highest and best use of the improved parcel. Excess land has the potential to be sold separately and is valued separately. (Dictionary)

#### **Excess Rent**

The amount by which contract rent exceeds market rent at the time of the appraisal; created by a lease favorable to the landlord (lessor) and may reflect unusual management, unknowledgeable or unusually motivated parties, a lease execution in an earlier, stronger rental market, or an agreement of the parties. (Dictionary)



#### Expense Stop

A clause in a lease that limits the landlord's expense obligation, which results in the lessee paying operating expenses above a stated level or amount. (Dictionary)

#### **Exposure Time**

- 1) The time a property remains on the market.
- 2) The estimated length of time that the property interest being appraised would have been offered on the market prior to the hypothetical consummation of a sale at market value on the effective date of the appraisal; <u>Comment</u>: Exposure time is a retrospective opinion based on an analysis of past events assuming a competitive and open market. (Dictionary)

#### **Extraordinary Assumption**

An assumption, directly related to a specific assignment, as of the effective date of the assignment results, which, if found to be false, could alter the appraiser's opinions or conclusions. <u>Comment:</u> Extraordinary assumptions presume as fact otherwise uncertain information about physical, legal, or economic characteristics of the subject property; or about conditions external to the property such as market conditions or trends; or about the integrity of data used in an analysis. (USPAP, 2016-2017 ed.)

#### Fee Simple Estate

Absolute ownership unencumbered by any other interest or estate, subject only to the limitations imposed by the governmental powers of taxation, eminent domain, police power, and escheat. (Dictionary)

#### Floor Common Area

In an office building, the areas on a floor such as washrooms, janitorial closets, electrical rooms, telephone rooms, mechanical rooms, elevator lobbies, and public corridors which are available primarily for the use of tenants on that floor. (BOMA)

#### Full Service (Gross) Lease

A lease in which the landlord receives stipulated rent and is obligated to pay all of the property's operating and fixed expenses; also called a *full service lease*. (Dictionary)

#### Furniture, Fixtures, and Equipment (FF&E)

Business trade fixtures and personal property, exclusive of inventory. (Dictionary)

#### Going-Concern Value

An outdated label for the market value of all the tangible and intangible assets of an established and operating business with an indefinite life, as if sold in aggregate; more accurately termed the *market value of* 

the going concern or market value of the total assets of the business. (Dictionary)

#### Gross Building Area (GBA)

- Total floor area of a building, excluding unenclosed areas, measured from the exterior of the walls of the above-grade area. This includes mezzanines and basements if and when typically included in the market area of the type of property involved.
- 2) Gross leasable area plus all common areas.
- For residential space, the total area of all floor levels measured from the exterior of the walls and including the superstructure and substructure basement; typically does not include garage space. (Dictionary)

#### Gross Measured Area

The total area of a building enclosed by the dominant portion (the portion of the inside finished surface of the permanent outer building wall which is 50 percent or more of the vertical floor-to-ceiling dimension, at the given point being measured as one moves horizontally along the wall), excluding parking areas and loading docks (or portions of same) outside the building line. It is generally not used for leasing purposes and is calculated on a floor by floor basis. (BOMA)

#### Gross Up Method

A method of calculating variable operating expenses in income-producing properties when less than 100% occupancy is assumed. Expenses reimbursed based on the amount of occupied space, rather than on the total building area, are described as "grossed up." (Dictionary)

#### Gross Retail Sellout

The sum of the separate and distinct market value opinions for each of the units in a condominium, subdivision development, or portfolio of properties, as of the date of valuation. The aggregate of retail values does not represent the value of all the units as though sold together in a single transaction; it is simply the total of the individual market value conclusions. Also called the aggregate of the retail values, aggregate retail selling price or sum of the retail values. (Dictionary)

#### Ground Lease

A lease that grants the right to use and occupy land. Improvements made by the ground lessee typically revert to the ground lessor at the end of the lease term. (Dictionary)

#### Ground Rent

The rent paid for the right to use and occupy land according to the terms of a ground lease; the portion of the total rent allocated to the underlying land. (Dictionary)

#### Case No. 2022-00432 Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8 Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 199 of 327



#### HVAC

Heating, ventilation, air conditioning (HVAC) system. A unit that regulates the temperature and distribution of heat and fresh air throughout a building. (Dictionary)

#### Highest and Best Use

- The reasonably probable use of property that results in the highest value. The four criteria that the highest and best use must meet are legal permissibility, physical possibility, financial feasibility, and maximum productivity.
- 2) The use of an asset that maximizes its potential and that is possible, legally permissible, and financially feasible. The highest and best use may be for continuation of an asset's existing use of for some alternative use. This is determined by the use that a market participant would have in mind for the asset when formulating the price that it would be willing to bid. (IVS)
- [The] highest and most profitable use for which the property is adaptable and needed or likely to be needed in the reasonably near future. (Uniform Appraisal Standards for Federal Land Acquisitions) (Dictionary)

#### Hypothetical Condition

- A condition that is presumed to be true when it is known to be false. (SVP – Standards of Valuation Practice, effective January 1, 2015)
- 2) A condition, directly related to a specific assignment, which is contrary to what is known by the appraiser to exist on the effective date of the assignment results, but is used for the purpose of analysis. <u>Comment</u>: Hypothetical conditions are contrary to known facts about physical, legal, or economic characteristics of the subject property; or about conditions external to the property, such as market conditions or trends; or about the integrity of data used in an analysis. (USPAP, 2016-2017 ed.) (Dictionary)

#### Industrial Gross Lease

A type of modified gross lease of an industrial property in which the landlord and tenant share expenses. The landlord receives stipulated rent and is obligated to pay certain operating expenses, often structural maintenance, insurance and real property taxes, as specified in the lease. There are significant regional and local differences in the use of this term. (Dictionary)

#### Insurable Value

A type of value for insurance purposes. (Typically this includes replacement cost less basement excavation, foundation, underground piping and architect's fees). (Dictionary)

#### Investment Value

The value of a property to a particular investor or class of investors based on the investor's specific requirements. Investment value may be different from market value because it depends on a set of investment criteria that are not necessarily typical of the market. (Dictionary)

#### Just Compensation

In condemnation, the amount of loss for which a property owner is compensated when his or her property is taken. Just compensation should put the owner in as good a position pecuniarily as he or she would have been if the property had not been taken. (Dictionary)

#### Leased Fee Interest

The ownership interest held by the lessor, which includes the right to receive the contract rent specified in the lease plus the reversionary right when the lease expires. (Dictionary)

#### Leasehold Interest

The right held by the lessee to use and occupy real estate for a stated term and under the conditions specified in the lease. (Dictionary)

#### Lessee (Tenant)

One who has the right to occupancy and use of the property of another for a period of time according to a lease agreement. (Dictionary)

#### Lessor (Landlord)

One who conveys the rights of occupancy and use to others under a lease agreement. (Dictionary)

#### Liquidation Value

The most probable price that a specified interest in property should bring under the following conditions:

- Consummation of a sale within a short time period.
- The property is subjected to market conditions prevailing as of the date of valuation.
- Both the buyer and seller are acting prudently and knowledgeably.
- The seller is under extreme compulsion to sell.
- The buyer is typically motivated.
- Both parties are acting in what they consider to be their best interests.
- A normal marketing effort is not possible due to the brief exposure time.
- Payment will be made in cash in U.S. dollars (or the local currency) or in terms of financial arrangements comparable thereto.
  - The price represents the normal consideration for the property sold, unaffected by special or creative



financing or sales concessions granted by anyone associated with the sale. (Dictionary)

#### Loan to Value Ratio (LTV)

The ratio between a mortgage loan and the value of the property pledged as security, usually expressed as a percentage. (Dictionary)

#### **Major Vertical Penetrations**

Stairs, elevator shafts, flues, pipe shafts, vertical ducts, and the like, and their enclosing walls. Atria, lightwells and similar penetrations above the finished floor are included in this definition. Not included, however, are vertical penetrations built for the private use of a tenant occupying office areas on more than one floor. Structural columns, openings for vertical electric cable or telephone distribution, and openings for plumbing lines are not considered to be major vertical penetrations. (BOMA)

#### Market Rent

The most probable rent that a property should bring in a competitive and open market reflecting the conditions and restrictions of a specified lease agreement, including the rental adjustment and revaluation, permitted uses, use restrictions, expense obligations; term, concessions, renewal and purchase options and tenant improvements (TIs). (Dictionary)

#### Market Value

The most probable price that a property should bring in a competitive and open market under all conditions requisite to a fair sale, the buyer and seller each acting prudently and knowledgeably, and assuming the price is not affected by undue stimulus. Implicit in this definition is the consummation of a sale as of a specified date and the passing of title from seller to buyer under conditions whereby:

- Buyer and seller are typically motivated;
- Both parties are well informed or well advised, and acting in what they consider their own best interests;
- A reasonable time is allowed for exposure in the open market;
- Payment is made in terms of cash in United States dollars or in terms of financial arrangements comparable thereto; and
- The price represents the normal consideration for the property sold unaffected by special or creative financing or sales concessions granted by anyone associated with the sale.

(Dictionary)

#### Marketing Time

An opinion of the amount of time it might take to sell a real or personal property interest at the concluded market value level during the period immediately after the effective date of an appraisal. Marketing time differs from exposure time, which is always presumed to precede the effective date of an appraisal. (Advisory Opinion 7 of the Appraisal Standards Board of the Appraisal Foundation and Statement on Appraisal Standards No. 6, "Reasonable Exposure Time in Real Property and Personal Property Market Value Opinions" address the determination of reasonable exposure and marketing time.) (Dictionary)

#### Master Lease

A lease in which the fee owner leases a part or the entire property to a single entity (the master lease) in return for a stipulated rent. The master lessee then leases the property to multiple tenants. (Dictionary)

#### **Modified Gross Lease**

A lease in which the landlord receives stipulated rent and is obligated to pay some, but not all, of the property's operating and fixed expenses. Since assignment of expenses varies among modified gross leases, expense responsibility must always be specified. In some markets, a modified gross lease may be called a *double net lease, net net lease, partial net lease, or semigross lease*. (Dictionary)

#### **Operating Expense Ratio**

The ratio of total operating expenses to effective gross income (TOE/EGI); the complement of the net income ratio, i.e., OER = 1 - NIR (Dictionary)

#### Option

A legal contract, typically purchased for a stated consideration, that permits but does not require the holder of the option (known as the *optionee*) to buy, sell, or lease real estate for a stipulated period of time in accordance with specified terms; a unilateral right to exercise a privilege. (Dictionary)

#### Partial Interest

Divided or undivided rights in real estate that represent less than the whole, i.e., a fractional interest such as a tenancy in common, easement, or life interest. (Dictionary)

#### Pass Through

A tenant's portion of operating expenses that may be composed of common area maintenance (CAM), real property taxes, property insurance, and any other expenses determined in the lease agreement to be paid by the tenant. (Dictionary)

#### Potential Gross Income (PGI)

The total income attributable to property at full occupancy before vacancy and operating expenses are deducted. (Dictionary)



#### Prospective Future Value Upon Completion

A prospective market value may be appropriate for the valuation of a property interest related to a credit decision for a proposed development or renovation project. According to USPAP, an appraisal with a prospective market value reflects an effective date that is subsequent to the date of the appraisal report. ... The prospective market value –as completed- reflects the property's market value as of the time that development is expected to be complete. (Dictionary)

#### Prospective Future Value Upon Stabilization

A prospective market value may be appropriate for the valuation of a property interest related to a credit decision for a proposed development or renovation project. According to USPAP, an appraisal with a prospective market value reflects an effective date that is subsequent to the date of the appraisal report ...The prospective market value – as stabilized – reflects the property's market value as of the time the property is projected to achieve stabilized occupancy. For an income-producing property, stabilized occupancy is the occupancy level that a property is expected to achieve after the property is exposed to the market for lease over a reasonable period of time and at comparable terms and conditions to other similar properties. (Dictionary)

#### **Replacement Cost**

The estimated cost to construct, at current prices as of a specific date, a substitute for a building or other improvements, using modern materials and current standards, design, and layout. (Dictionary)

#### **Reproduction Cost**

The estimated cost to construct, at current prices as of the effective date of the appraisal, an exact duplicate or replica of the building being appraised, using the same materials, construction standards, design, layout, and quality of workmanship and embodying all of the deficiencies, superadequacies, and obsolescence of the subject building. (Dictionary)

#### **Retrospective Value Opinion**

A value opinion effective as of a specified historical date. The term *retrospective* does not define a type of value. Instead, it identifies a value opinion as being effective at some specific prior date. Value as of a historical date is frequently sought in connection with property tax appeals, damage models, lease renegotiation, deficiency judgments, estate tax, and condemnation. Inclusion of the type of value with this term is appropriate, e.g., "retrospective market value opinion." (Dictionary)

#### Sandwich Leasehold Estate

The interest held by the sandwich leaseholder when the property is subleased to another party; a type of leasehold estate. (Dictionary)

#### Sublease

An agreement in which the lessee in a prior lease conveys the right of use and occupancy of a property to another, the sublessee, for a specific period of time, which may or may not be coterminous with the underlying lease term. (Dictionary)

#### Subordination

A contractual arrangement in which a party with a claim to certain assets agrees to make his or her claim junior, or subordinate, to the claims of another party. (Dictionary)

#### Surplus Land

Land that is not currently needed to support the existing use but cannot be separated from the property and sold off for another use. Surplus land does not have an independent highest and best use and may or may not contribute value to the improved parcel. (Dictionary)

#### Triple Net (Net Net Net) Lease

An alternative term for a type of net lease. In some markets, a net net net lease is defined as a lease in which the tenant assumes all expenses (fixed and variable) of operating a property except that the landlord is responsible for structural maintenance, building reserves, and management; also called *NNN lease, net net net lease, or fully net lease*. (Dictionary)

(The market definition of a triple net lease varies; in some cases tenants pay for items such as roof repairs, parking lot repairs, and other similar items.)

#### Usable Area

The measured area of an office area, store area, or building common area on a floor. The total of all the usable areas for a floor shall equal floor usable area of that same floor. (BOMA)

#### Value-in-Use

The value of a property assuming a specific use, which may or may not be the property's highest and best use on the effective date of the appraisal. Value in use may or may not be equal to market value but is different conceptually. (Dictionary)



# RIVER BLUFFS SEWER EASEMENTS ADDENDA

# Qualifications of Arthur L. Schwertz, MAI Senior Managing Director Valbridge Property Advisors | South Louisiana

# Independent Valuations for a Variable World

### Education

Bachelor of Arts History Louisiana State University

Contact Details

504-541-5101 (p) 504-541-5107 (f) <u>aschwertz@valbridge.com</u> (e)

Valbridge Property Advisors 2030 Dickory Avenue Suite 200 New Orleans, LA 70123

www.valbridge.com/south-louisiana



ations for a	Variable World
	Membership/Affiliations
	Member: Appraisal Institute – MAI Designation
	Louisiana Chapter President, 2017
	Member: Celebration Church Administrative Team (Corporate Secretary)
	Appraisal Institute & Related Courses
	Continuing education courses taken through the Appraisal Institute and other real estate organizations.
	Publications, Seminars Presented, etc.
	"Contract or Effective Rent: Finding the Real Rent", Appraisal Institute, Baton
	Rouge, Louisiana, 2016.
	"Appraising Commercial and Complex Properties in an Historic Area", Webinar for the Appraisal Institute, 2015.
ity	"The Unique Appraisal: Case Studies in Appraising Special Purpose Properties", Al Connect 2014 (Appraisal Institute's National Meeting), Austin, Texas, 2014.
	Schwertz, Arthur L. 2014. "History Lesson", <i>Valuation Magazine 2<sup>nd</sup> Quarter, 2014,</i> 12 – 13.
<u>om</u> (e)	Huso, Deborah R. 2013. "On the Waterfront", <i>Valuation Magazine 2<sup>nd</sup> Quarter, 2013</i> , 22 – 27. (Contributor)
visors	<u>Experience</u> Senior Managing Director Valbridge Property Advisors   South Louisiana (2013-Present)
isiana	Vice-President Argote, Derbes, Graham, Shuffield & Tatje, Inc. (1992-2013)
	Appraisal/valuation and consulting assignments include (but not limited to): Single-family, condominium, apartments, vacant land, funeral homes, amphitheaters, live performance theaters, office buildings, hospitals, nursing homes, specialized healthcare, hotels/motels, service stations, retail, industrial plants warehouses fractional interest valuations contaminated properties special

plants, warehouses, fractional interest valuations, contaminated properties, special purpose properties (port facilities, nuclear reactor simulator facility, shipyards, etc.), senior residential and healthcare facilities, feasibility studies, market studies, condemnation, construction defects, litigation support, mediations, and review appraisals.

Mr. Schwertz has provided valuation services in a wide variety of complex civil litigation including real estate, land use cases, condemnation, estate matters, property taxation, construction defect, and bankruptcy/creditors matters.

Qualified as an expert witness in Jefferson, Orleans, and St. Tammany Parishes, Dallas County, Texas, United States Court of Federal Claims and the Bankruptcy Court for the Middle District of Louisiana.



# FAST FACTS

- Valbridge is the largest independent national real estate valuation and advisory services firm in North America.
  - o Total number of MAI-designated appraisers (200+ on staff)
  - Total number of office locations (70+ across U.S.)
  - Total number of staff (675+ strong)
- Valbridge covers the entire U.S. from coast to coast.
- Valbridge services all property types, including special-purpose properties and residential.
- Valbridge provides independent valuation services. We are not owned by a brokerage firm or investment company.
- Every Valbridge office is led by a senior managing director who holds the MAI designation of the Appraisal Institute.
- Valbridge is owned by our local office leaders.
- Valbridge welcomes single-property assignments as well as portfolio, multi-market and other bulk-property engagements.

Valbridge Property Advisors, Inc. 2240 Venetian Court • Naples, FL 34109 • Phone: (888) 981-2029 www.valbridge.com





#### ALABAMA

4732 Woodmere Boulevard Montgomery, AL 36106 334.277.5077

200 Cahaba Park Circle Suite 213 Birmingham, AL 35242 205.440.2998

#### ARIZONA

6061 E. Grant Road Suite 121 Tucson, AZ 85712 520.321.0000

#### CALIFORNIA

4915 Calloway Drive Suite 101 Bakersfield, CA 93312 661.587,1010

1370 N. Brea Boulevard Suite 255 Fullerton, CA 92835 714.449.0852

2813 Coffee Road Suite E-2 Modesto, CA 95355 209.569.0450

99 S. Lake Avenue Suite 21 Pasadena, CA 91101 626.744.0428

3090 Fite Circle Suite 202 Sacramento, CA 95827 916.361.2509

55 South Market Street Suite 1210 San Jose, CA 95113 408.279.1520

3160 Crow Canyon Place Suite 245 San Ramon, CA 94583 925.327.1660

#### COLORADO

7445 F Peakview Avenue Centennial, CO 80111 303.443.9600

5345 Arapahoe Avenue Suite 7 Boulder, CO 80303 303.443.9600

23272 Two Rivers Road Unit 101 Basalt, CO 81621 970.340.1016

1099 Main Avenue Suite 311 Durango, CO 81301 970.340.1016

#### CONNECTICUT

15 Concord Street Glastonbury, CT 06033 860.246.4606

17 Covewood Drive Norwalk, CT 06853 203.286.6520

CORPORATE OFFICE

Spring 2019

#### FLORIDA

2240 Venetian Court Naples, FL 34109 239.514.4646

301 Almeria Avenue, Suite 350 Coral Gables, FL 33134 305.639.8029

603 Hillcrest Street Orlando, FL 32803 407.839.3626

2711 Poinsettia Avenue West Palm Beach, FL 33407 561.833.5331

#### GEORGIA

2675 Paces Ferry Road Suite 145 Atlanta, GA 30339 678 644.4853

#### IDAHO

1459 Tyrell Lane Suite B Suite B Boise, ID 83706 208.336.1097 1875 N. Lakewood Drive

Suite 100 Coeur d'Alene, ID 83814 208.292.2965

#### ILLINOIS

566 W. Lake Street Suite 240 Chicago, IL 60661 312.288.8687

#### INDIANA

KANSAS

820 Fort Wayne Avenue Indianapolis, IN 46204 317.687.2747

10990 Quivira Road Suite 100 Overland Park, KS 66210 913.451.1451

#### KENTUCKY

9000 Wessex Place Suite 306 Louisville, KY 40222 502.585.3651

#### LOUISIANA

2030 Dickory Avenue Suite 200 New Orleans, LA 70123 504 541 5100

#### MARYLAND 11100 Dovedale Court Marriottsville, MD 21104 443.333.5522

MASSACHUSETTS

260 Bear Hill Road Suite 106 Waltham MA 02451 781.790.5645

2240 Venetian Court Naples, FL 34109

#### MICHIGAN

1420 Washington Blvd. Suite 301 Detroit, MI 48226 313.986.3313.

2127 University Park Drive Suite 390 Okemos, MI 48864 517.336.0001

#### MINNESOTA 222 South 9th Street

Suite 825 Minneapolis, MN 55402 612.253.0650

275 East 4th Street, Suite 325 St. Paul, MN 55101 651.983.2408

#### MISSISSIPPI

1010 Ford Street Gulfport, MS 39507 228.604.1900

737 Highway 51 Suite 1C Madison, MS 39110 601.853.0736

MISSOURI

10990 Quivira Road Suite 100 Overland Park, KS 66210 913.451.1451

#### NEVADA

3034 S. Durango Drive Suite 100 Las Vegas, NV 89117 702.242.9369

6490 S McCarran Blvd #51 Reno, NV 89509 775.204.4100

#### NEW JERSEY

2740 Route 10 West, Suite 204 Morris Plains, NJ 07950 973.970.9333

3500 Route 9 South, Suite 202 Howell, NJ 07731 732.807.3113

#### **NEW YORK**

424 West 33rd Street Suite 630 New York, NY 10001 212.268.1113

#### NORTH CAROLINA

412 E. Chatham Street Cary, NC 27511 919.859.2666

239-325-8234 phone 239-325-8356 fax

5950 Fairview Road, Suite 405 Charlotte, NC 28210 704.376.5400

#### OHIO

1655 W. Market Street Suite 130 Akron, OH 44313 330,899,9900

8291 Beechmont Ave. Suite B Cincinnati, OH 45255 513,785,0820

1422 Euclid Avenue Suite 616 Cleveland, OH 44115 216.367.9690

#### OKLAHOMA

5909 NW Expressway Suite 104 Oklahoma City, OK 73132 405.603.1553

6666 South Sheridan Road Suite 104 Tulsa, OK 74133 918.712.9992

#### PENNSYLVANIA

Suite 304

150 S. Warner Road Suite 440 King of Prussia, PA 19406 215.545.1900

4701 Baptist Road

# Pittsburgh, PA 15227 412.881.6080 SOUTH CAROLINA

11 Cleveland Court Greenville, SC 29607 864,233.6277

920 Bay Street Suite 26 Beaufort, SC 29902 843.342.2302

1250 Fairmont Avenue Mt. Pleasant, SC 29464 843.881.1266

#### TENNESSEE

5205 Maryland Way Suite 300 Brentwood, TN 37027 615.369.0670

701 Broad Street Suite 209 Chattanooga, TN 37402 423.285.8435

213 Fox Road Knoxville, TN 37922 865.522.2424

756 Ridge Lake Blvd Suite 225 Memphis, TN 38120 901.753.6977

#### TEXAS

High Point Center 12225 Greenville Avenue Suite 490 Dallas, TX 75243 214.446.1611

#### TEXAS (cont'd)

974 Campbell Road Suite 204 Houston, TX 77024 713.467.5858 2731 81st Street Lubbock, TX 79423 806.744.1188

9901 IH-10 West Suite 1035 San Antonio, TX 78230 210 227 6229

#### UTAH

260 South 2500 West Suite 301 Pleasant Grove, UT 84062 801.492.9328

1100 East 6600 South Suite 201 Salt Lake City, UT 84121 801.262.3388

20 North Main Suite 304 St. George, UT 84770 435.773.6300

#### VIRGINIA

656 Independence Parkway Suite 220 Chesapeake, VA 23320 757.410.1222

4914 Fitzhugh Avenue Suite 102 Richmond, VA 23230 757-345-0010

5107 Center Street Unit 2B Williamsburg, VA 23188 757.345.0010

#### WASHINGTON 18728 Bothell Way, NE

Suite B Bothell, WA 98011 425,450.0040

2927 Colby Avenue

Suite 100 Everett, WA 98201 425.258.2611

419 Berkeley Avenue

8378 W. Grandridge Boulevard Suite 110-D Kennewick, WA 99336 509.221.1540

Suite A Fircrest, WA 98466

506 Second Avenue

Suite 1001 Seattle, WA 98104

324 N. Mullan Road Spokane Valley, WA 99206 509.747.0999

12660 W. North Avenue

Brookfield, WI 53005

Each Valbridge office is independently owned and operated.

Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8

Case No. 2022-00432

Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 205 of 327

206.209.3016

WISCONSIN

262.782.7990

253.274.0099



# **Concise Appraisal Report**

River Bluffs Sewer Utility 13121 Creekview Road River Bluff, Oldham County, Kentucky 40059

Report Date: 05-24-2019



#### FOR:

Central States Water Resource Ms. Sandy Neal Regional Director of Utility Acquisitions 500 Northwest Plaza Drive, Suite 500 St. Ann, Missouri 63074

> Valbridge File Number: LA01-19-0133.000

#### Valbridge Property Advisors

2030 Dickory Avenue, Suite 200 New Orleans, LA 70123 504.541.5100 phone 504.541.5107 fax *valbridge.com* 

> Case No. 2022-00432 Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8 Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 206 of 327



2030 Dickory Avenue, Suite 200 New Orleans, LA 70123 504.541.5100 phone 504.541.5107 fax valbridge.com

05-24-2019

Arthur L. Schwertz MAI 504.541.5101 aschwertz@valbridge.com

Ms. Sandy Neal Regional Director of Utility Acquisitions Central States Water Resource 500 Northwest Plaza Drive, Suite 500 St. Ann, Missouri 63074

RE: Appraisal Report River Bluffs Sewer Utility 13121 Creekview Road River Bluff, Oldham County, Kentucky 40059

Dear Ms. Neal:

In accordance with your request, we have performed an appraisal of the above referenced property. This appraisal report sets forth the pertinent data gathered, the techniques employed, and the reasoning leading to our value opinions. This letter of transmittal is not valid if separated from the appraisal report.

The subject property, as referenced above, is located on the west side of Creekview Road via an access road and is further identified as Assessor's Parcel Number (APN) 02-02A-03-106. The subject is a 0.83-acre or 36,155-square-foot site. The subject for this site is a 36,155 square foot site which is currently the location of the sewer treatment plant for the community of River Bluff, Kentucky.

We developed our analyses, opinions, and conclusions and prepared this report in conformity with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP) of the Appraisal Foundation; the Code of Professional Ethics and Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice of the Appraisal Institute; and the requirements of our client as we understand them.



The client in this assignment is Central States Water Resource and the intended user of this report is Central States Water Resources and no others. The intended use is for regulatory filings and no other use. The value opinions reported herein are subject to the definitions, assumptions and limiting conditions, and certification contained in this report.

The acceptance of this appraisal assignment and the completion of the appraisal report submitted herewith are subject to the General Assumptions and Limiting Conditions contained in the report. The findings and conclusions are further contingent upon the following extraordinary assumptions and/or hypothetical conditions which might have affected the assignment results:

### Extraordinary Assumptions:

• None

# Hypothetical Conditions:

• This report is predicated upon the hypothetical condition that the property is vacant land unencumbered by the existing improvements. In other words, this appraisal is of the underlying land as if vacant and ready for development.

Based on the analysis contained in the following report, our value conclusions are summarized as follows:

### Value Conclusions

Component	As Is
Value Type	Market Value
Property Rights Appraised	Fee Simple
Effective Date of Value	May 15, 2019
Value Conclusion	\$61,000
	\$1.69 psf

Respectfully submitted, Valbridge Property Advisors

Arthur L. Schwertz, MAI Senior Managing Director Kentucky Certified General Real Property Appraiser #5470



# **Table of Contents**

Cover Page	
Letter of Transmittal	
Table of Contents	i
Summary of Salient Facts	ii
Aerial and Front Views	iv
Location Map	V
Introduction	1
Scope of Work	3
Regional and Market Area Analysis	Error! Bookmark not defined.
City and Neighborhood Analysis	8
Site Description	
Subject Photos	
Highest and Best Use	
Land Valuation	
General Assumptions and Limiting Conditions	
Certification – Arthur L. Schwertz	
Addenda	
Glossary	
Qualifications of Arthur L. Schwertz, MAI	41
Valbridge Property Advisors Information / Office Locations	



# **Summary of Salient Facts**

### **Property Identification**

Sales Comparison		\$61,000	
Approach to Value		As Is	
	Value Indications		
Reasonable Marketing Time Less than 12 months			
Reasonable Exposure Time	Less than 12 months		
Highest & Best Use - As Vacant	Single-Family Residential		
Valuation Opinions			
Primary Land Area	0.830 acres		
Flood Zone	Х		
FEMA Flood Map No.	21185C0090C		
Zoning	Conservation/Residential District (CO-1)		
Site			
Property Owner	River Bluff Kentucky Farm Inc.		
Tax Parcel Number	02-02A-03-106		
Latitude & Longitude	38.376456, -85.604602		
	River Bluff, Oldham County, Kentucky 4005	9	
Property Address	13121 Creekview Road		
Property Name	River Bluffs Sewer Utility		

### **Value Conclusions**

Component	As Is
Value Type	Market Value
Property Rights Appraised	Fee Simple
Effective Date of Value	May 15, 2019
Value Conclusion	\$61,000
	\$1.69 psf

Our findings and conclusions are further contingent upon the following extraordinary assumptions and/or hypothetical conditions which might have affected the assignment results:

# **Extraordinary Assumptions:**

• None

Cost

Income Capitalization

Not Developed

Not Developed



# Hypothetical Conditions:

• This report is predicated upon the hypothetical condition that the property is vacant land unencumbered by the existing improvements. In other words, this appraisal is of the underlying land as if vacant and ready for development.



RIVER BLUFFS SEWER UTILITY AERIAL AND FRONT VIEWS

# **Aerial and Front Views**

#### **AERIAL VIEW**



**FRONT VIEW** 



Page iv Case No. 2022-00432 Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8 Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 212 of 327



RIVER BLUFFS SEWER UTILITY LOCATION MAP

# **Location Map**



Page v Case No. 2022-00432 Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8 Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 213 of 327



# Introduction

# Client and Intended Users of the Appraisal

The client in this assignment is Central States Water Resource and the intended user of this report is Central States Water Resources and no others.

# Intended Use of the Appraisal

The intended use of this report is regulatory filings and no other use.

# Real Estate Identification

The subject property is located at 13121 Creekview Road, River Bluff, Oldham County, Kentucky 40059. The subject property is further identified by Assessor Parcel Number 02-02A-03-106. The subject for this site is a 36,155 square foot site which is currently the location of the sewer treatment plant for the community of River Bluff, Kentucky.

# Legal Description

Lot 106, Section 3, Oldham County, City of River Bluff, Kentucky

# Use of Real Estate as of the Effective Date of Value

As of the effective date of value, the subject was a residential property.

# Use of Real Estate as Reflected in this Appraisal

The subject is a subdivision-residential land property.

# Ownership of the Property

According to Public Records, title to the subject property is vested in River Bluff Kentucky Farm Inc..

# History of the Property

Ownership of the subject property has not changed within the past three years. When appropriate, we have considered and analyzed the known history of the subject in the development of our opinions and conclusions.

# Listings/Offers/Contracts

The subject is not currently listed for sale or under contract for sale. However, the appraiser is aware that a purchase agreement is being contemplated but was not provided with any details.

# Type and Definition of Value

The appraisal problem (the term "Purpose of Appraisal" has been retired from appraisal terminology) is to develop an opinion of the market value of the subject property. "Market Value," as used in this appraisal, is defined as "the most probable price that a property should bring in a competitive and open market under all conditions requisite to a fair sale, the buyer and seller each acting prudently and knowledgeably, and assuming the price is not affected by undue stimulus." Implicit in this definition is the consummation of a sale as of a specified date and the passing of title from seller to buyer under conditions whereby:

Page 1



- Buyer and seller are typically motivated.
- Both parties are well informed or well advised, each acting in what they consider their own best interests;
- A reasonable time is allowed for exposure in the open market;
- Payment is made in terms of cash in U.S. dollars or in terms of financial arrangements comparable thereto; and
- The price represents the normal consideration for the property sold unaffected by special or creative financing or sale concessions granted by anyone associated with the sale."1

The value conclusions apply to the value of the subject property under the market conditions presumed on the effective date(s) of value.

Please refer to the Glossary in the Addenda section for additional definitions of terms used in this report.

# Valuation Scenarios, Property Rights Appraised, and Effective Dates of Value

Per the scope of our assignment we developed opinions of value for the subject property under the following scenarios of value:

Valuation Scenario	Effective Date of Value
As Is Market Value of the Fee Simple Interest	May 15, 2019

We completed an appraisal inspection of the subject property on 05-15-2019.

# Date of Report

The date of this report is 05-24-2019, which is the same as the date of the letter of transmittal.

# List of Items Requested but Not Provided

None

# Assumptions and Conditions of the Appraisal

The acceptance of this appraisal assignment and the completion of the appraisal report submitted herewith are subject to the General Assumptions and Limiting Conditions contained in the report. The findings and conclusions are further contingent upon the following extraordinary assumptions and/or hypothetical conditions which might have affected the assignment results:

### Extraordinary Assumptions

None

# Hypothetical Conditions

• This report is predicated upon the hypothetical condition that the property is vacant land unencumbered by the existing improvements. In other words, this appraisal is of the underlying land as if vacant and ready for development.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Source: Code of Federal Regulations, Title 12, Banks and Banking, Part 722.2-Definitions



# Scope of Work

The elements addressed in the Scope of Work are (1) the extent to which the subject property is identified, (2) the extent to which the subject property is inspected, (3) the type and extent of data researched, (4) the type and extent of analysis applied, (5) the type of appraisal report prepared, and (6) the inclusion or exclusion of items of non-realty in the development of the value opinion. These items are discussed as below.

# Extent to Which the Property Was Identified

The three components of the property identification are summarized as follows:

- Legal Characteristics The subject was legally identified via public Records.
- <u>Economic Characteristics</u> Economic characteristics of the subject property were identified via information provided by the client, market surveys, discussions with market participants, and our database, as well as a comparison to properties with similar locational and physical characteristics.
- <u>Physical Characteristics</u> The subject was physically identified via an appraisal inspection consisted of exterior observations only as the appraisal is to assume the site is vacant and ready for development.

# Extent to Which the Property Was Inspected

We inspected the subject on 05-15-2019.

# Type and Extent of Data Researched

We researched and analyzed: (1) market area data, (2) property-specific market data, (3) zoning and land-use data, and (4) current data on comparable listings and transactions. We also interviewed people familiar with the subject market/property type.

# Type and Extent of Analysis Applied (Valuation Methodology)

We observed surrounding land use trends, the condition of any improvements, demand for the subject property, and relevant legal limitations in concluding a highest and best use. We then valued the subject based on that highest and best use conclusion.

There are four primary methodologies available for the estimation of land value: (1) Sales Comparison, (2) Land Residual Method, (3) Ground Rent Capitalization, and (4) Subdivision Development Method (Discounted Cash Flow). While other methods, such as Extraction and Allocation, are applicable under limited conditions, one or more of these approaches are used in most circumstances to derive an indication of land value.

- <u>Sales Comparison Approach</u> In the sales comparison approach, value is indicated by recent sales and/or listings of comparable properties in the market, with the appraiser analyzing the impact of material differences in both economic and physical elements between the subject and the comparables.
- <u>Direct Capitalization: Land Residual Method</u> The land residual methodology involves estimating the residual net income to the land by deducting from total potential income the


portion attributable to the improvements, assuming development of the site at its highest and best use. The residual income is capitalized at an appropriate rate, resulting in an indication of land value.

- <u>Direct Capitalization: Ground Rent Capitalization</u> A market derived capitalization rate is applied to the net income resulting from a ground lease. This can represent the leased fee or fee simple interest, depending on whether the income potential is reflective of a lease in place or market rental rates.
- <u>Yield Capitalization: Subdivision Development Method</u> Also known as Discounted Cash Flow Analysis (DCF), the methodology is most appropriate for land having multiple lot development in the near term as the highest and best use. The current site value is represented by discounting the anticipated cash flow to a present value, taking into consideration all necessary costs of development, maintenance, administration, and sales throughout the absorption period.

All of these approaches to value were considered. We assessed the availability of data and applicability of each approach to value within the context of the characteristics of the subject property and the needs and requirements of the client. Based on this assessment, we relied upon the sales comparison approach. Further discussion of the extent of our analysis and the methodology of each approach is provided later in the respective valuation sections.

## Appraisal Conformity and Report Type

We developed our analyses, opinions, and conclusions and prepared this report in conformity with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP) of the Appraisal Foundation; the Code of Professional Ethics and Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice of the Appraisal Institute; and the requirements of our client as we understand them.

This is an Appraisal Report as defined by the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice under Standards Rule 2-2a. USPAP gives appraisers flexibility to vary the level of information presented in the report dependent on the intended use and intended users of the appraisal. The appraisal is presented in a Concise format which briefly summarizes the data, reasoning, and analyses used in the appraisal assignment.

## Personal Property/FF&E

All items of non-realty are excluded from this analysis. The opinion of market value developed herein is reflective of real estate only.



## **Regional and Market Area Analysis**

## **REGIONAL MAP**



## Overview

The subject is located in River Bluff, in Oldham County. It is part of the Louisville, KY-IN MSA. The Greater Louisville region is made up of 15 counties surrounding the Greater Louisville and Southern Indiana areas, home to more than 1.4 million people and over 58,000 businesses.

## Population

Population characteristics relative to the subject property are presented in the following table.

			Annual %			Annual %
			Change	Estimated	Projected	Change
Area	2000	2010	2000 - 10	2018	2023	2018 - 23
United States	281,421,906	308,745,538	1.0%	330,088,686	343,954,683	0.8%
Kentucky	4,041,769	4,339,367	0.7%	4,548,018	4,665,793	0.5%
Louisville/Jefferson County	1,121,112	1,235,708	1.0%	1,304,874	1,351,952	0.7%
Oldham County, KY	46,178	60,316	3.1%	67,309	72,082	1.4%
River Bluff City, KY	152	403	16.5%	439	464	1.1%

© 2019 VALBRIDGE PROPERTY ADVISORS

Page 5 Case No. 2022-00432 Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8 Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 218 of 327



## Transportation

Greater Louisville is within a day's drive of two-thirds of the U.S. population and, as the home of UPS WorldPort, within a day's flight for packages to almost any global destination.

The highway system in Greater Louisville provides one-day access to well over 66 percent of the major domestic markets via Interstates I-65, I-64, and I-71. In addition, a secondary road network provides convenient ingress and egress to the major interstate highways.

Louisville Muhammad Ali International Airport (SDF) provides dependable service to numerous international and domestic gateways; and for FY 2016 through FY 2020, more than \$127 million in capital and major maintenance projects are programmed. Non-stop service is offered to 31 domestic destinations.

The region has 48 private terminals and 3 public inland ports on the Ohio River: Jefferson Riverport International (Kentucky), Meade County Riverport (Kentucky) and Port of Indiana-Jeffersonville (Indiana).

Greater Louisville is served by three Class I railroads – Canadian Pacific (CP), CSX, and Norfolk Southern (NS) – and multiple regional and shortline railroads. Both CSX and NS railroads provide Louisville with direct rail service to all markets east of the Mississippi River, as well as connecting service to the West Coast. The city is also one of four regional hubs for CSX.

## Employment

The Greater Louisville area has a diverse economy due to its location as a hub for UPS as well as being located in the center of Bourbon country. A breakdown by employment sector is as follows:

Employment by Industry - Louisville/Jefferson County	
	20 <sup>-</sup>

nlaumant hu Inductmu I auiouilla / laffarran Countu

	2018	Percent of
Industry	Estimate	Employment
Agriculture/Mining	4,637	0.70%
Construction	35,773	5.40%
Manufacturing	92,084	13.90%
Wholesale trade	18,549	2.80%
Retail trade	70,222	10.60%
Transportation/Utilities	50,348	7.60%
Information	11,262	1.70%
Finance/Insurance/Real Estate Services	51,010	7.70%
Services	308,049	46.50%
Public Administration	20,537	3.10%
Total	662,472	100.0%
Source: Site-to-Do-Business (STDB Online)		

## Unemployment

The following table exhibits current and past unemployment rates as obtained from the Bureau of Labor Statistics. Overall, the Region boasts one of the lowest unemployment rates for metropolitan statistical areas in the country at 4.0 percent.



Area	YE 2011	YE 2012	YE 2013	YE 2014	YE 2015	YE 2016	YE 2017	2018 YTD
United States	8.5%	7.9%	6.7%	5.6%	5.0%	4.7%	4.1%	3.7%
Kentucky	8.1%	7.7%	5.5%	5.3%	5.2%	4.4%	4.3%	4.0%
Louisville/Jefferson County	7.3%	6.3%	4.6%	4.3%	4.0%	3.4%	3.5%	4.0%
Oldham County, KY	5.4%	5.1%	3.5%	3.4%	3.1%	2.9%	2.9%	3.5%

## Median Household Income

Total median household income for the region is presented in the following table. Overall, the subject's MSA and county compare favorably to the state and the country.

#### Estimated Projected Annual % Change 2018 2023 2018 - 23 Area United States \$58,100 \$65,727 2.6% Kentucky \$47,571 \$53,381 2.4% Louisville/Jefferson County 2.7% \$55,080 \$62,484 Oldham County, KY \$90,544 \$97,846 1.6% River Bluff City, KY \$175,542 \$167,538 -0.9% Source: Site-to-Do-Business (STDB Online)

### **Median Household Income**



## **City and Neighborhood Analysis**

## **NEIGHBORHOOD MAP**



## Overview

The subject is located in the City of River Bluff in Oldham County. As presented in the table in the previous section, the city's population as of was . ?? City Discussion

The Louisville area of River Bluff is characterized by ?? add commentary here as necessary

## Neighborhood Location and Boundaries

The subject neighborhood is located in the section of River Bluff. The area is <mark>?? Location Setting</mark> in nature. The neighborhood is bounded by to the north, to the east, to the south, and to the west.



## Demographics

The following table depicts the area demographics in River Bluff within a one-, three-, and five-mile radius from the subject.

Neighborhood Demographics			
Radius	1 mile	3 miles	5 miles
Population Summary			
2000 Population	1,914	10,997	23,519
2010 Population	3,698	14,058	32,405
2018 Population	4,058	15,007	36,337
2023 Population Estimate	4,325	15,750	38,752
Annual % Change (2018 - 2023)	1.3%	1.0%	1.3%
Housing Unit Summary			
2000 Housing Units	662	4,075	8,994
% Owner Occupied	90.0%	86.8%	85.2%
% Renter Occupied	5.6%	6.1%	8.7%
2010 Housing Units	1,199	5,250	13,024
% Owner Occupied	92.3%	87.0%	81.9%
% Renter Occupied	3.6%	6.0%	10.8%
2018 Housing Units	1,299	5,584	14,342
% Owner Occupied	92.1%	86.0%	81.2%
% Renter Occupied	3.7%	6.5%	12.6%
2023 Housing Units	1,381	5,853	15,218
% Owner Occupied	92.4%	86.3%	81.9%
% Renter Occupied	3.4%	6.1%	12.1%
Annual % Change (2018 - 2023)	1.2%	0.9%	1.2%
Income Summary			
2018 Median Household Income	\$160,775	\$127,276	\$112,408
2023 Median Household Income Estimate	\$155,760	\$129,329	\$116,157
Annual % Change	-0.6%	0.3%	0.7%
2018 Per Capita Income	\$59,585	\$62,090	\$57,617
2023 Per Capita Income Estimate	\$60,193	\$63,767	\$60,065
Annual % Change	0.2%	0.5%	0.8%

Source: Site-to-Do-Business (STDB Online)

## Transportation Access

Within the immediate area of the subject property, transportation access helps define the character of its development. Major travel and commuter routes within the area of the subject property include and . **??** Additional city transportation discussion if needed . Access to the area is considered **??** Rating.



## Neighborhood Land Use

The subject neighborhood is located in an area with primarily **?? type** land uses. An approximate breakdown of the development in the area is as follows:

### LAND USES

Developed	?? Enter data%
Built up:	?? Enter data%
Residential:	?? Enter data%
Retail:	?? Enter data%
Office:	?? Enter data%
Industrial:	?? Enter data%
Vacant:	?? Enter data%

## Conclusions

**?? Subject Neighborhood Conclusion**. Overall, the subject neighborhood is in the stage of its life cycle.



## **Site Description**

The subject site is located on the west side of Creekview Road via an access road. The characteristics of the site are summarized as follows:

## Site Characteristics

Gross Land Area: 0.83 Acres or 36,155 SF
Useble Land Area: 0.92 Acres or 26 155 SE
Usable Land Area: 0.83 Acres or 36,155 SF
Usable Land %: 100.0%
Shape: Irregular
Average Depth: 180.00 feet
Topography: Varies
Drainage: Adequate
Grade: Below street grade
Utilities: All are available
Off-Site Improvements: None
Interior or Corner: Interior
Signalized Intersection: No: No traffic signal at, or near, the site
Excess Land: None
Surplus Land: None

## Street Frontage / Access

Street Hontage / Access	
Frontage Road	Primary
Street Name:	Creekview Road
Street Type:	Residential
Frontage (Linear Ft.):	40.00
Additional Access	
Water or Port Access:	No
Rail Access:	No
Flood Zone Data	
Flood Map Panel/Number:	21185C0090C
Flood Map Date:	09-20-2006
Flood Zone:	Х
	Flood hazard areas identified on the Flood Insurance Rate Map are identified as a Special Flood Hazard Area (SFHA). SFHA are defined as the area that will be inundated by the flood event having a 1-percent chance of being equaled or exceeded in any given year. The 1-percent annual chance flood is also referred to



as the base flood or 100-year flood. SFHAs are labeled as Zone A, Zone AO, Zone AH, Zones A1-A30, Zone AE, Zone A99, Zone AR, Zone AR/AE, Zone AR/AO, Zone AR/A1-A30, Zone AR/A, Zone V, Zone VE, and Zones V1-V30. Moderate flood hazard areas, labeled Zone B or Zone X (shaded) are also shown on the FIRM, and are the areas between the limits of the base flood and the 0.2-percent-annual-chance (or 500-year) flood. The areas of minimal flood hazard, which are the areas outside the SFHA and higher than the elevation of the 0.2-percent-annual-chance flood, are labeled Zone C or Zone X (unshaded). 100.00%

Site Area in Flood:

## Other Site Conditions

Soil Type: Environmental Issues:

#### Typical

No environmental issues were noted at the time of inspection or disclosed by involved parties that would impact value.

## Adjacent Land Uses

North:	Residential
South:	Residential
East:	Land/ Residential
West:	Land

## Site Ratings

Access:	Average
Visibility:	Average

## **Zoning Designation**

Zoning Jurisdiction:	Oldham County				
Zoning Classification:	CO-1, Conservation/Residential District				
General Plan Designation:	Conservation and residential				
Permitted Uses:	Agriculture, community facilities, public parks and recreational, religious institutions,residential, special. utilties				
Zoning Comments:	The Conservation/Residential District is intended to promote and protect significant natural features, wooded areas, water courses, existing and potential lake sites, other recreational and conservation resources, wildlife habitat, present and future water supplies, and to minimize erosion of soil and the siltation and pollution of streams and lakes.				

## Analysis/Comments on Site

The site is significantly below grade of Creekview Road.



### **TAX/PLAT MAP**



Page 13 Case No. 2022-00432 Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8 Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 226 of 327



RIVER BLUFFS SEWER UTILITY SITE DESCRIPTION

### **FLOOD MAP**



Page 14 Case No. 2022-00432 Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8 Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 227 of 327



### **ZONING MAP**





RIVER BLUFFS SEWER UTILITY SUBJECT PHOTOS

# **Subject Photos**



View looking along access drive toward Creekview Road



View facing northwest across subject





View facing southwest across subject



View from Creekview Road along access drive



## **Highest and Best Use**

The Highest and Best Use of a property is the use that is legally permissible, physically possible, and financially feasible which results in the highest value. An opinion of the highest and best use results from consideration of the criteria noted above under the market conditions or likely conditions as of the effective date of value. Determination of highest and best use results from the judgment and analytical skills of the appraiser. It represents an opinion, not a fact. In appraisal practice, the concept of highest and best use represents the premise upon which value is based.

## Analysis of Highest and Best Use As If Vacant

The primary determinants of the highest and best use of the property as if vacant are the issues of (1) Legal permissibility, (2) Physical possibility, (3) Financial feasibility, and (4) Maximum productivity.

### Legally Permissible

The subject site is zoned CO-1, Conservation/Residential District which controls the general nature of permissible uses but is appropriate for the location and physical elements of the subject property, providing for a consistency of use with the general neighborhood. The location of the subject property is appropriate for the uses allowed, as noted previously, and a change in zoning is unlikely. There are no known easements, encroachments, covenants or other use restrictions that would unduly limit or impede development.

### Physically Possible

The physical attributes allow for a number of potential uses. Elements such as size, shape, availability of utilities, known hazards (flood, environmental, etc.), and other potential influences are described in the Site Description and have been considered. There are no items of a physical nature that would materially limit appropriate and likely development.

### **Financially Feasible**

The probable use of the site for residential subdivision development conforms to the pattern of land use in the market area. A review of published yield, rental and occupancy rates suggest that there is a balanced supply and demand is sufficient to support construction costs and ensure timely absorption of additional inventory in this market. Therefore, near-term speculative development of the subject site is financially feasible.

### Maximally Productive

Among the financially feasible uses, the use that results in the highest value (the maximally productive use) is the highest and best use. Considering these factors, the maximally productive use as though vacant is for single-family residential use.

### Conclusion of Highest and Best Use As If Vacant

The conclusion of the highest and best use as if vacant is for single-family residential use.

## Most Probable Buyer

As of the date of value, the most probable buyer of the subject property is owner/user.



## Land Valuation

## Methodology

Site Value is most often estimated using the sales comparison approach. This approach develops an indication of market value by analyzing closed sales, listings, or pending sales of properties similar to the subject, focusing on the difference between the subject and the comparables using all appropriate elements of comparison. This approach is based on the principles of supply and demand, balance, externalities, and substitution, or the premise that a buyer would pay no more for a specific property than the cost of obtaining a property with the same quality, utility, and perceived benefits of ownership.

### Unit of Comparison

The unit of comparison depends on land use economics and how buyers and sellers use the property. The unit of comparison in this analysis is per usable square foot.

#### **Elements of Comparison**

Elements of comparison are the characteristics or attributes of properties and transactions that cause the prices of real estate to vary. The primary elements of comparison considered in sales comparison analysis are as follows: (1) property rights conveyed, (2) financing terms, (3) conditions of sale, (4) expenditures made immediately after purchase, (5) market conditions, (6) location, and (7) physical characteristics.

#### Comparable Sales Data

To obtain and verify comparable sales of vacant land properties, we conducted a search of public records, field surveys, interviews with knowledgeable real estate professionals in the area, and a review of our internal database.

We included four sales in our analysis, as these sales were judged to be the most comparable to develop an indication of market value for the subject property. It should be noted that since the subject neighborhood is completely built-out, the appraiser has utilized sales of single-family residences. According to interviews with numerous builders, typically 25% of a home's sale price can be allocated to the underlying lot. Based upon this information, the sale prices shown are the amount allocated to the lots based upon comments of local builders.

The following is a table summarizing each sale comparable and a map illustrating the location of each in relation to the subject.



#### Land Sales Summary

	Subject	Sale # 1	Sale # 2	Sale # 3	Sale # 4	Sale # 5
Sale ID		1405236	1405240	1405243	1405244	1405250
Sale Status		Closed	Closed	Closed	Closed	Closed
Location	13121	13300 Creekview	13308 Creekview	13318 Creekview	3506 River Bluff Road	13406 Apple Tree Lane
	Creekview	Road	Road	Road		
	Road					
	River Bluff,	River Bluff, Kentucky				
	Kentucky					
Tax ID	02-02A-03-106	02-02A-03-66	02-02A-03-68	02-02A-03-73	02-02A-02-42	02-02A-01-4
Sales Data						
Date of Sale	May-19	2/19/2019	1/2/2019	9/21/2018	12/14/2018	11/2/2018
Sales Price		\$335,000	\$326,000	\$278,000	\$315,100	\$260,000
Contributory Sale Price of	Lot	\$83,750	\$81,500	\$69,500	\$78,775	\$65,000
Price/Usable Square Foot		\$2.67	\$2.79	\$1.72	\$3.12	\$1.76
Grantor		Daniel W. and Mary	John and Catherine	William J. and Debra	Linda S. Heustis	irvin N. Besser
		Kathleen Dugan	Hughes Oliphant	R. Carroll		
Grantee		Eric John and Emily	Michael H. and Sarah	Matthew and Angela	Hewett Brown	Bobby J. Roberts
		Susanne Isbell	E. Friend	Renderman Patrick		
Recording Number		Book 1211/Page 465	Book1209/Page 038	Book 1202/Page 183	Book 1207/Page 556	Book 1204/Page 431
Property Rights Conveyed	Fee Simple	Fee Simple	Fee Simple	Fee Simple	Fee Simple	Fee Simple
Financing		Cash to Seller				
Conditions of Sale		Typical	Typical	Typical	Typical	Typical
Physical Characteristics						
Usable Land Area (Sq. Ft.)		31,363	29,185	40,511	25,265	37,026
Gross Land Area (Sq. Ft.)		31,363	29,185	40,511	25,265	37,026
Zoning		Residential	Residential	Residential	Residential	Residential
Flood Zone		100% in X				
Corner Exposure		Interior	Interior	Interior	Interior	Interior
Access/Visibility		Average/Average	Average/Average	Average/Average	Average/Average	Average/Average



RIVER BLUFFS SEWER UTILITY LAND VALUATION



#### COMPARABLE SALES MAP



## Land Sales Comparison Analysis

When necessary, adjustments were made for differences in various elements of comparison, including property rights conveyed, financing terms, conditions of sale, expenditures made immediately after purchase, market conditions, location, and other physical characteristics. If the element in comparison is considered superior to that of the subject, we applied a negative adjustment. Conversely, a positive adjustment was applied if inferior. A summary of the elements of comparison follows.

	Elements of Comparison	
Real Property Rights Conveyed	Adjustments for differences in property rights appraised.	
Financing Terms	Comparable properties are adjusted for differences between a transaction's financing terms and those assumed in the valuation of the subject property - e.g. seller financing, loan assumption, non-market terms.	
Conditions of Sale	Comparable properties are adjusted for differences in the motivations of either the buyer or a seller in the transaction.	
Expenditures After Purchase	Comparable properties can be adjusted for any additional investment required to make the property salable – e. g. costs to cure deferred maintenance, costs to demolish and remove any portion of the improvements, costs to remediate environmental contamination and/or costs to occupy or stabilize the property.	
Market Conditions	Comparable properties can be adjusted for changes in market conditions because of inflation, deflation, fluctuations in supply and demand, or other factors.	
Location	Location adjustments may be required when the locational characteristics of a comparable are different from those of the subject. The subject is located in a ravine behind another residence that fronts Creekview Road, therefore, each of the comparables have been adjusted downward for their superior location.	
Size	The size adjustment addresses variance in the physical size of the comparables and that of the subject, as a larger parcel typically commands a lower price per unit than a smaller parcel. Thus, each comparable has been adjusted for its size relative to the size of the subject.	
Shape /Depth	This element address variance in utility due to shape and/or depth.	
Corner Exposure	Tracts featuring corner influence typically command higher prices in the market place, as opposed to interior locations.	



## Summary of Adjustments

Presented on the following page is a summary of the adjustments made to the sale comparables. As noted earlier, these quantitative adjustments were based on our market research, best judgment, and experience in the appraisal of similar properties.

	Subject	Sale # 1	Sale # 2	Sale # 3	Sale # 4	Sale # 5
Sale ID		1405236	1405240	1405243	1405244	1405250
Date of Value & Sale	May-19	February-19	January-19	September-18	December-18	November-18
Jnadjusted Sales Price		\$83,750	\$81,500	\$69,500	\$78,775	\$65,000
Jsable Square Feet	36,155	31,363	29,185	40,511	25,265	37,026
Jnadjusted Sales Price per Usab	le Sq. Ft.	\$2.67	\$2.79	\$1.72	\$3.12	\$1.76
Transactional Adjustments						
Property Rights Conveyed	Fee Simple	Fee Simple	Fee Simple	Fee Simple	Fee Simple	Fee Simple
Adjusted Sales Price		\$2.67	\$2.79	\$1.72	\$3.12	\$1.76
Financing Terms	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller
Adjusted Sales Price		\$2.67	\$2.79	\$1.72	\$3.12	\$1.76
Conditions of Sale	Typical	Typical	Typical	Typical	Typical	Typical
Adjusted Sales Price		\$2.67	\$2.79	\$1.72	\$3.12	\$1.76
Expenditures after Sale						
Adjusted Sales Price	_	\$2.67	\$2.79	\$1.72	\$3.12	\$1.70
Arket Conditions Adjustments						
Elapsed Time from Date of V	Value	0.23 years	0.36 years	0.65 years	0.42 years	0.53 years
Market Trend Through	May-19	-	-	-	-	
Analyzed Sales Price	_	\$2.67	\$2.79	\$1.72	\$3.12	\$1.76
hysical Adjustments						
Location	13121 Creekview	13300 Creekview	13308 Creekview	13318 Creekview	3506 River Bluff	13406 Apple Tree
	Road	Road	Road	Road	Road	Lane
	River Bluff, Kentucky	River Bluff,	River Bluff,	River Bluff,	River Bluff,	River Bluff,
		Kentucky	Kentucky	Kentucky	Kentucky	Kentucky
Adjustment		-30.0%	-30.0%	-30.0%	-30.0%	-30.0%
Size	36,155 sf	31,363 sf	29,185 sf	40,511 sf	25,265 sf	37,026 sf
Adjustment		-3.0%	-4.0%	1.0%	-6.0%	-
Shape/Depth	Irregular					
Adjustment	5	-	-	-	-	-
Corner Exposure	Interior	Interior	Interior	Interior	Interior	Interior
Adjustment	_					
Net Physical Adjustment	_	-33.0%	-34.0%	-29.0%	-36.0%	-30.0%
Adjusted Sales Price per Usable	Square Foot	\$1.79	\$1.84	\$1.22	\$2.00	\$1.23

### LAND SALES ADJUSTMENT GRID

## Conclusion

From the market data available, we used land sales in competitive market areas which were adjusted based on pertinent elements of comparison. The following table summarizes the unadjusted and adjusted unit prices:

## Land Sale Statistics

Metric	Unadjusted	Analyzed	Adjusted
Minimum Sales Price per Usable Square Foot	\$1.72	\$1.72	\$1.22
Maximum Sales Price per Usable Square Foot	\$3.12	\$3.12	\$2.00
Median Sales Price per Usable Square Foot	\$2.67	\$2.67	\$1.79
Mean Sales Price per Usable Square Foot	\$2.41	\$2.41	\$1.61

Based on the adjusted prices and the comparable sales, a unit value for the subject property is near the middle of the adjusted range, or \$1.70 per usable square foot. This indicates a market value of \$61,000.



Based on this analysis, the land value indication is summarized as follows:

Land Value Indication				
Reasonable Adjusted Comparable Ra	ange			
36,155 square feet	Х	\$1.20 psf	=	\$43,386
36,155 square feet	х	\$2.00 psf	=	\$72,310
Market Value Opinion				(Rounded)
36,155 square feet	Х	\$1.70 psf	=	\$61,000



## **Valuation Summary**

The indicated value and our concluded market value for the subject property are summarized in the following table:

### **Value Conclusions**

Component	As Is
Value Type	Market Value
Property Rights Appraised	Fee Simple
Effective Date of Value	May 15, 2019
Value Conclusion	\$61,000
	\$1.69 psf

Land properties such as the subject are typically purchased by Owner/Users.

Our findings and conclusions are further contingent upon the following extraordinary assumptions and/or hypothetical conditions which might have affected the assignment results:

## Extraordinary Assumptions:

• None

## Hypothetical Conditions:

• This report is predicated upon the hypothetical condition that the property is vacant land unencumbered by the existing improvements. In other words, this appraisal is of the underlying land as if vacant and ready for development.

## Exposure Time and Marketing Periods

Based on statistical information about days on market, escrow length, and marketing times gathered through national investor surveys, sales verification, and interviews of market participants, marketing and exposure time estimates of less than 12 months and less than 12 months, respectively, are considered reasonable and appropriate for the subject property.



## **General Assumptions and Limiting Conditions**

This appraisal is subject to the following limiting conditions:

- 1. The legal description if furnished to us is assumed to be correct.
- 2. No responsibility is assumed for legal matters, questions of survey or title, soil or subsoil conditions, engineering, availability or capacity of utilities, or other similar technical matters. The appraisal does not constitute a survey of the property appraised. All existing liens and encumbrances have been disregarded and the property is appraised as though free and clear, under responsible ownership and competent management unless otherwise noted.
- 3. Unless otherwise noted, the appraisal will value the property as though free of contamination. Valbridge Property Advisors | VPA of South Louisiana, Inc. will conduct no hazardous materials or contamination inspection of any kind. It is recommended that the client hire an expert if the presence of hazardous materials or contamination poses any concern.
- 4. The stamps and/or consideration placed on deeds used to indicate sales are in correct relationship to the actual dollar amount of the transaction.
- 5. Unless otherwise noted, it is assumed there are no encroachments, zoning violations or restrictions existing in the subject property.
- 6. The appraiser is not required to give testimony or attendance in court by reason of this appraisal, unless previous arrangements have been made.
- 7. Unless expressly specified in the engagement letter, the fee for this appraisal does not include the attendance or giving of testimony by Appraiser at any court, regulatory, or other proceedings, or any conferences or other work in preparation for such proceeding. If any partner or employee of Valbridge Property Advisors | VPA of South Louisiana, Inc. is asked or required to appear and/or testify at any deposition, trial, or other proceeding about the preparation, conclusions or any other aspect of this assignment, client shall compensate Appraiser for the time spent by the partner or employee in appearing and/or testifying and in preparing to testify according to the Appraiser's then current hourly rate plus reimbursement of expenses.
- 8. The values for land and/or improvements, as contained in this report, are constituent parts of the total value reported and neither is (or are) to be used in making a summation appraisal of a combination of values created by another appraiser. Either is invalidated if so used.



- 9. The dates of value to which the opinions expressed in this report apply are set forth in this report. We assume no responsibility for economic or physical factors occurring at some point at a later date, which may affect the opinions stated herein. The forecasts, projections, or operating estimates contained herein are based on current market conditions and anticipated short-term supply and demand factors and are subject to change with future conditions.
- 10. The sketches, maps, plats and exhibits in this report are included to assist the reader in visualizing the property. The appraiser has made no survey of the property and assumed no responsibility in connection with such matters.
- 11. The information, estimates and opinions, which were obtained from sources outside of this office, are considered reliable. However, no liability for them can be assumed by the appraiser.
- 12. Possession of this report, or a copy thereof, does not carry with it the right of publication. Neither all, nor any part of the content of the report, or copy thereof (including conclusions as to property value, the identity of the appraisers, professional designations, reference to any professional appraisal organization or the firm with which the appraisers are connected), shall be disseminated to the public through advertising, public relations, news, sales, or other media without prior written consent and approval.
- 13. No claim is intended to be expressed for matters of expertise that would require specialized investigation or knowledge beyond that ordinarily employed by real estate appraisers. We claim no expertise in areas such as, but not limited to, legal, survey, structural, environmental, pest control, mechanical, etc.
- 14. This appraisal was prepared for the sole and exclusive use of the client for the function outlined herein. Any party who is not the client or intended user identified in the appraisal or engagement letter is not entitled to rely upon the contents of the appraisal without express written consent of Valbridge Property Advisors | VPA of South Louisiana, Inc. and Client. The Client shall not include partners, affiliates, or relatives of the party addressed herein. The appraiser assumes no obligation, liability or accountability to any third party.
- 15. Distribution of this report is at the sole discretion of the client, but third-parties not listed as an intended user on the face of the appraisal or the engagement letter may not rely upon the contents of the appraisal. In no event shall client give a third-party a partial copy of the appraisal report. We will make no distribution of the report without the specific direction of the client.
- 16. This appraisal shall be used only for the function outlined herein, unless expressly authorized by Valbridge Property Advisors | VPA of South Louisiana, Inc..



- 17. This appraisal shall be considered in its entirety. No part thereof shall be used separately or out of context.
- 18. Unless otherwise noted in the body of this report, this appraisal assumes that the subject property does not fall within the areas where mandatory flood insurance is effective. Unless otherwise noted, we have not completed nor have we contracted to have completed an investigation to identify and/or quantify the presence of non-tidal wetland conditions on the subject property. Because the appraiser is not a surveyor, he or she makes no guarantees, express or implied, regarding this determination.
- 19. The flood maps are not site specific. We are not qualified to confirm the location of the subject property in relation to flood hazard areas based on the FEMA Flood Insurance Rate Maps or other surveying techniques. It is recommended that the client obtain a confirmation of the subject property's flood zone classification from a licensed surveyor.
- 20. If the appraisal is for mortgage loan purposes 1) we assume satisfactory completion of improvements if construction is not complete, 2) no consideration has been given for rent loss during rent-up unless noted in the body of this report, and 3) occupancy at levels consistent with our "Income and Expense Projection" are anticipated.
- 21. It is assumed that there are no hidden or unapparent conditions of the property, subsoil, or structures which would render it more or less valuable. No responsibility is assumed for such conditions or for engineering which may be required to discover them.
- 22. Our inspection included an observation of the land and improvements thereon only. It was not possible to observe conditions beneath the soil or hidden structural components within the improvements. We inspected the buildings involved, and reported damage (if any) by termites, dry rot, wet rot, or other infestations as a matter of information, and no guarantee of the amount or degree of damage (if any) is implied. Condition of heating, cooling, ventilation, electrical and plumbing equipment is considered to be commensurate with the condition of the balance of the improvements unless otherwise stated. Should the client have concerns in these areas, it is the client's responsibility to order the appropriate inspections. The appraiser does not have the skill or expertise to make such inspections and assumes no responsibility for these items.
- 23. This appraisal does not guarantee compliance with building code and life safety code requirements of the local jurisdiction. It is assumed that all required licenses, consents, certificates of occupancy or other legislative or administrative authority from any local, state or national governmental or private entity or organization have been or can be obtained or renewed for any use on which the value conclusion contained in this report is based unless specifically stated to the contrary.



- 24. When possible, we have relied upon building measurements provided by the client, owner, or associated agents of these parties. In the absence of a detailed rent roll, reliable public records, or "as-built" plans provided to us, we have relied upon our own measurements of the subject improvements. We follow typical appraisal industry methods; however, we recognize that some factors may limit our ability to obtain accurate measurements including, but not limited to, property access on the day of inspection, basements, fenced/gated areas, grade elevations, greenery/shrubbery, uneven surfaces, multiple story structures, obtuse or acute wall angles, immobile obstructions, etc. Professional building area measurements of the quality, level of detail, or accuracy of professional measurement services are beyond the scope of this appraisal assignment.
- 25. We have attempted to reconcile sources of data discovered or provided during the appraisal process, including assessment department data. Ultimately, the measurements that are deemed by us to be the most accurate and/or reliable are used within this report. While the measurements and any accompanying sketches are considered to be reasonably accurate and reliable, we cannot guarantee their accuracy. Should the client desire a greater level of measuring detail, they are urged to retain the measurement services of a qualified professional (space planner, architect or building engineer). We reserve the right to use an alternative source of building size and amend the analysis, narrative and concluded values (at additional cost) should this alternative measurement source reflect or reveal substantial differences with the measurements used within the report.
- 26. In the absence of being provided with a detailed land survey, we have used assessment department data to ascertain the physical dimensions and acreage of the property. Should a survey prove this information to be inaccurate, we reserve the right to amend this appraisal (at additional cost) if substantial differences are discovered.
- 27. If only preliminary plans and specifications were available for use in the preparation of this appraisal, then this appraisal is subject to a review of the final plans and specifications when available (at additional cost) and we reserve the right to amend this appraisal if substantial differences are discovered.
- 28. Unless otherwise stated in this report, the value conclusion is predicated on the assumption that the property is free of contamination, environmental impairment or hazardous materials. Unless otherwise stated, the existence of hazardous material was not observed by the appraiser and the appraiser has no knowledge of the existence of such materials on or in the property. The appraiser, however, is not qualified to detect such substances. The presence of substances such as asbestos, urea-formaldehyde foam insulation, or other potentially hazardous materials may affect the value of the property. No responsibility is assumed for any such conditions, or for any expertise or engineering knowledge required for discovery. The client is urged to retain an expert in this field, if desired.



- 29. The Americans with Disabilities Act ("ADA") became effective January 26, 1992. We have not made a specific compliance survey of the property to determine if it is in conformity with the various requirements of the ADA. It is possible that a compliance survey of the property, together with an analysis of the requirements of the ADA, could reveal that the property is not in compliance with one or more of the requirements of the Act. If so, this could have a negative effect on the value of the property. Since we have no direct evidence relating to this issue, we did not consider possible noncompliance with the requirements of ADA in developing an opinion of value.
- 30. This appraisal applies to the land and building improvements only. The value of trade fixtures, furnishings, and other equipment, or subsurface rights (minerals, gas, and oil) were not considered in this appraisal unless specifically stated to the contrary.
- 31. No changes in any federal, state or local laws, regulations or codes (including, without limitation, the Internal Revenue Code) are anticipated, unless specifically stated to the contrary.
- 32. Any income and expense estimates contained in the appraisal report are used only for the purpose of estimating value and do not constitute prediction of future operating results. Furthermore, it is inevitable that some assumptions will not materialize and that unanticipated events may occur that will likely affect actual performance.
- 33. Any estimate of insurable value, if included within the scope of work and presented herein, is based upon figures developed consistent with industry practices. However, actual local and regional construction costs may vary significantly from our estimate and individual insurance policies and underwriters have varied specifications, exclusions, and non-insurable items. As such, we strongly recommend that the Client obtain estimates from professionals experienced in establishing insurance coverage. This analysis should not be relied upon to determine insurance coverage and we make no warranties regarding the accuracy of this estimate.
- 34. The data gathered in the course of this assignment (except data furnished by the Client) shall remain the property of the Appraiser. The appraiser will not violate the confidential nature of the appraiser-client relationship by improperly disclosing any confidential information furnished to the appraiser. Notwithstanding the foregoing, the Appraiser is authorized by the client to disclose all or any portion of the appraisal and related appraisal data to appropriate representatives of the Appraisal Institute if such disclosure is required to enable the appraiser to comply with the Bylaws and Regulations of such Institute now or hereafter in effect.



- 35. You and Valbridge Property Advisors | VPA of South Louisiana, Inc. both agree that any dispute over matters in excess of \$5,000 will be submitted for resolution by arbitration. This includes fee disputes and any claim of malpractice. The arbitrator shall be mutually selected. If Valbridge Property Advisors | VPA of South Louisiana, Inc. and the client cannot agree on the arbitrator, the presiding head of the Local County Mediation & Arbitration panel shall select the arbitrator. Such arbitration shall be binding and final. In agreeing to arbitration, we both acknowledge that, by agreeing to binding arbitration, each of us is giving up the right to have the dispute decided in a court of law before a judge or jury. In the event that the client, or any other party, makes a claim against VPA of South Louisiana, Inc. or any of its employees in connections with or in any way relating to this assignment, the maximum damages recoverable by such claimant shall be the amount actually received by Valbridge Property Advisors | VPA of South Louisiana, Inc. for this assignment, and under no circumstances shall any claim for consequential damages be made.
- 36. Valbridge Property Advisors | VPA of South Louisiana, Inc. shall have no obligation, liability, or accountability to any third party. Any party who is not the "client" or intended user identified on the face of the appraisal or in the engagement letter is not entitled to rely upon the contents of the appraisal without the express written consent of Valbridge Property Advisors | VPA of South Louisiana, Inc.. "Client" shall not include partners, affiliates, or relatives of the party named in the engagement letter. Client shall hold Valbridge Property Advisors | VPA of South Louisiana, Inc. and its employees harmless in the event of any lawsuit brought by any third party, lender, partner, or part-owner in any form of ownership or any other party as a result of this assignment. The client also agrees that in case of lawsuit arising from or in any way involving these appraisal services, client will hold Valbridge Property Advisors | VPA of South Louisiana, Inc. harmless from and against any liability, loss, cost, or expense incurred or suffered by Valbridge Property Advisors | VPA of South Louisiana, Inc. in such action, regardless of its outcome.
- 37. The Valbridge Property Advisors office responsible for the preparation of this report is independently owned and operated by VPA of South Louisiana, Inc.. Neither Valbridge Property Advisors, Inc., nor any of its affiliates has been engaged to provide this report. Valbridge Property Advisors, Inc. does not provide valuation services, and has taken no part in the preparation of this report.
- 38. If any claim is filed against any of Valbridge Property Advisors, Inc., a Florida Corporation, its affiliates, officers or employees, or the firm providing this report, in connection with, or in any way arising out of, or relating to, this report, or the engagement of the firm providing this report, then (1) under no circumstances shall such claimant be entitled to consequential, special or other damages, except only for direct compensatory damages, and (2) the maximum amount of such compensatory damages recoverable by such claimant shall be the amount actually received by the firm engaged to provide this report.



- 39. This report and any associated work files may be subject to evaluation by Valbridge Property Advisors, Inc., or its affiliates, for quality control purposes.
- 40. Acceptance and/or use of this appraisal report constitutes acceptance of the foregoing general assumptions and limiting conditions.



## **Certification – Arthur L. Schwertz**

I certify that, to the best of my knowledge and belief:

- 1. The statements of fact contained in this report are true and correct.
- 2. The reported analyses, opinions, and conclusions are limited only by the reported assumptions and limiting conditions and are my personal, impartial, and unbiased professional analyses, opinions, and conclusions.
- 3. I have no present or prospective interest in the property that is the subject of this report and no personal interest with respect to the parties involved.
- 4. The undersigned has not performed services regarding the property that is the subject of this report within the three-year period immediately preceding acceptance of this assignment.
- 5. I have no bias with respect to the property that is the subject of this report or to the parties involved with this assignment.
- 6. My engagement in this assignment was not contingent upon developing or reporting predetermined results.
- 7. My compensation for completing this assignment is not contingent upon the development or reporting of a predetermined value or direction in value that favors the cause of the client, the amount of value opinion, the attainment of a stipulated result, or the occurrence of a subsequent event directly related to the intended use of this appraisal.
- 8. My analyses, opinions and conclusions were developed, and this report has been prepared, in conformity with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice.
- 9. Arthur L. Schwertz has personally inspected the subject property.
- 10. No one provided significant real property appraisal assistance to the person signing this certification, unless otherwise noted.
- 11. The reported analyses, opinions and conclusions were developed, and this report has been prepared, in conformity with the requirements of the Code of Professional Ethics and Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice of the Appraisal Institute.
- 12. The use of this report is subject to the requirements of the Appraisal Institute relating to review by its duly authorized representatives.
- 13. As of the date of this report, the undersigned has completed the continuing education program for Designated Members of the Appraisal Institute.

2

Arthur L. Schwertz, MAI Senior Managing Director Kentucky Certified General Real Property Appraiser #5470

RIVER BLUFFS SEWER UTILITY ADDENDA



## Addenda

Glossary Qualifications

• Arthur L. Schwertz, MAI - Senior Managing Director Information on Valbridge Property Advisors Office Locations



### Glossary

Definitions are taken from The Dictionary of Real Estate Appraisal, 6<sup>th</sup> Edition (Dictionary), the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP), and Building Owners and Managers Association International (BOMA).

#### Absolute Net Lease

A lease in which the tenant pays all expenses including structural maintenance, building reserves, and management; often a long-term lease to a credit tenant. (Dictionary)

#### Amortization

The process of retiring a debt or recovering a capital investment, typically through scheduled, systematic repayment of the principal; a program of periodic contributions to a sinking fund or debt retirement fund. (Dictionary)

#### As Is Market Value

The estimate of the market value of real property in its current physical condition, use, and zoning as of the appraisal date. (Dictionary)

#### Base Rent

The minimum rent stipulated in a lease. (Dictionary)

#### **Base Year**

The year on which escalation clauses in a lease are based. (Dictionary)

#### **Building Common Area**

In office buildings, the areas of the building that provide services to building tenants but which are not included in the office area or store area of any specific tenant. These areas may include, but shall not be limited to, main and auxiliary lobbies, atrium spaces at the level of the finished floor, concierge areas or security desks, conference rooms, lounges or vending areas, food service facilities, health or fitness centers, daycare facilities, locker or shower facilities, mail rooms, fire control rooms, fully enclosed courtyards outside the exterior walls, and building core and service areas such as fully enclosed mechanical or equipment rooms. Specifically excluded from building common area are floor common areas, parking space, portions of loading docks outside the building line, and major vertical penetrations. (BOMA)

#### **Building Rentable Area**

The sum of all floor rentable areas. Floor rentable area is the result of subtracting from the gross measured area of a floor the major vertical penetrations on that same floor. It is generally fixed for the life of the building and is rarely affected by changes in corridor size or configuration. (BOMA)

#### Certificate of Occupancy (COO)

A formal written acknowledgment by an appropriate unit of local government that a new construction or renovation project is at the stage where it meets applicable health and safety codes and is ready for commercial or residential occupancy. (Dictionary)

#### Common Area Maintenance (CAM)

The expense of operating and maintaining common areas; may or may not include management charges and usually does not include capital expenditures on tenant improvements or other improvements to the property. (Dictionary)

The amount of money charged to tenants for their shares of maintaining a [shopping] center's common area. The charge that a tenant pays for shared services and facilities such as electricity, security, and maintenance of parking lots. Items charged to common area maintenance may include cleaning services, parking lot sweeping and maintenance, snow removal, security and upkeep. (ICSC – International Council of Shopping Centers, 4<sup>th</sup> Ed.)

#### Condominium

A multiunit structure, or a unit within such a structure, with a condominium form of ownership. (Dictionary)

#### **Conservation Easement**

An interest in real estate restricting future land use to preservation, conservation, wildlife habitat, or some combination of those uses. A conservation easement may permit farming, timber harvesting, or other uses of a rural nature as well as some types of conservationoriented development to continue, subject to the easement. (Dictionary)

#### **Contributory Value**

A type of value that reflects the amount a property or component of a property contributes to the value of another asset or to the property as a whole.

The change in the value of a property as a whole, whether positive or negative, resulting from the addition or deletion of a property component. Also called deprival value in some countries. (Dictionary)



#### Debt Coverage Ratio (DCR)

The ratio of net operating income to annual debt service (DCR = NOI/Im), which measures the relative ability of a property to meet its debt service out of net operating income; also called *debt service coverage ratio (DSCR)*. A larger *DCR* typically indicates a greater ability for a property to withstand a reduction of income, providing an improved safety margin for a lender. (Dictionary)

#### **Deed Restriction**

A provision written into a deed that limits the use of land. Deed restrictions usually remain in effect when title passes to subsequent owners. (Dictionary)

#### Depreciation

- In appraisal, a loss in property value from any cause; the difference between the cost of an improvement on the effective date of the appraisal and the market value of the improvement on the same date.
- In accounting, an allocation of the original cost of an asset, amortizing the cost over the asset's life; calculated using a variety of standard techniques. (Dictionary)

#### **Disposition Value**

The most probable price that a specified interest in property should bring under the following conditions:

- Consummation of a sale within a specified time, which is shorter than the typical exposure time for such a property in that market.
- The property is subjected to market conditions prevailing as of the date of valuation;
- Both the buyer and seller are acting prudently and knowledgeably;
- The seller is under compulsion to sell;
- The buyer is typically motivated;
- Both parties are acting in what they consider to be their best interests;
- An adequate marketing effort will be made during the exposure time;
- Payment will be made in cash in U.S. dollars (or the local currency) or in terms of financial arrangements comparable thereto; and
- The price represents the normal consideration for the property sold, unaffected by special or creative financing or sales concessions granted by anyone associated with the sale. (Dictionary)

#### Easement

The right to use another's land for a stated purpose. (Dictionary)

#### EIFS

Exterior Insulation Finishing System. This is a type of exterior wall cladding system. Sometimes referred to as dry-vit.

RIVER BLUFFS SEWER UTILITY ADDENDA

#### Effective Date

- 1) The date on which the appraisal or review opinion applies. (SVP)
- 2) In a lease document, the date upon which the lease goes into effect. (Dictionary)

#### Effective Gross Income (EGI)

The anticipated income from all operations of the real estate after an allowance is made for vacancy and collection losses and an addition is made for any other income. (Dictionary)

#### **Effective Rent**

Total base rent, or minimum rent stipulated in a lease, over the specified lease term minus rent concessions; the rent that is effectively paid by a tenant net of financial concessions provided by a landlord. (TIs). (Dictionary)

#### EPDM

Ethylene Propylene Diene Monomer Rubber. A type of synthetic rubber typically used for roof coverings. (Dictionary)

#### **Escalation Clause**

A clause in an agreement that provides for the adjustment of a price or rent based on some event or index. e.g., a provision to increase rent if operating expenses increase; also called *escalator clause, expense recovery clause or stop clause*. (Dictionary)

#### **Estoppel Certificate**

A signed statement by a party (such as a tenant or a mortgagee) certifying, for another's benefit, that certain facts are correct, such as that a lease exists, that there are no defaults, and that rent is paid to a certain date. (Black's) In real estate, a buyer of rental property typically requests estoppel certificates from existing tenants. Sometimes referred to as an *estoppel letter*. (Dictionary)

#### **Excess Land**

Land that is not needed to serve or support the existing use. The highest and best use of the excess land may or may not be the same as the highest and best use of the improved parcel. Excess land has the potential to be sold separately and is valued separately. (Dictionary)

#### **Excess Rent**

The amount by which contract rent exceeds market rent at the time of the appraisal; created by a lease favorable to the landlord (lessor) and may reflect unusual management, unknowledgeable or unusually motivated parties, a lease execution in an earlier, stronger rental market, or an agreement of the parties. (Dictionary)



#### Expense Stop

A clause in a lease that limits the landlord's expense obligation, which results in the lessee paying operating expenses above a stated level or amount. (Dictionary)

#### **Exposure Time**

- 1) The time a property remains on the market.
- 2) The estimated length of time that the property interest being appraised would have been offered on the market prior to the hypothetical consummation of a sale at market value on the effective date of the appraisal; <u>Comment:</u> Exposure time is a retrospective opinion based on an analysis of past events assuming a competitive and open market. (Dictionary)

#### **Extraordinary Assumption**

An assumption, directly related to a specific assignment, as of the effective date of the assignment results, which, if found to be false, could alter the appraiser's opinions or conclusions. <u>Comment:</u> Extraordinary assumptions presume as fact otherwise uncertain information about physical, legal, or economic characteristics of the subject property; or about conditions external to the property such as market conditions or trends; or about the integrity of data used in an analysis. (USPAP, 2016-2017 ed.)

#### Fee Simple Estate

Absolute ownership unencumbered by any other interest or estate, subject only to the limitations imposed by the governmental powers of taxation, eminent domain, police power, and escheat. (Dictionary)

#### Floor Common Area

In an office building, the areas on a floor such as washrooms, janitorial closets, electrical rooms, telephone rooms, mechanical rooms, elevator lobbies, and public corridors which are available primarily for the use of tenants on that floor. (BOMA)

#### Full Service (Gross) Lease

A lease in which the landlord receives stipulated rent and is obligated to pay all of the property's operating and fixed expenses; also called a *full service lease*. (Dictionary)

#### Furniture, Fixtures, and Equipment (FF&E)

Business trade fixtures and personal property, exclusive of inventory. (Dictionary)

#### Going-Concern Value

An outdated label for the market value of all the tangible and intangible assets of an established and operating business with an indefinite life, as if sold in aggregate; more accurately termed the *market value of* 

the going concern or market value of the total assets of the business. (Dictionary)

#### Gross Building Area (GBA)

- Total floor area of a building, excluding unenclosed areas, measured from the exterior of the walls of the above-grade area. This includes mezzanines and basements if and when typically included in the market area of the type of property involved.
- 2) Gross leasable area plus all common areas.
- For residential space, the total area of all floor levels measured from the exterior of the walls and including the superstructure and substructure basement; typically does not include garage space. (Dictionary)

#### Gross Measured Area

The total area of a building enclosed by the dominant portion (the portion of the inside finished surface of the permanent outer building wall which is 50 percent or more of the vertical floor-to-ceiling dimension, at the given point being measured as one moves horizontally along the wall), excluding parking areas and loading docks (or portions of same) outside the building line. It is generally not used for leasing purposes and is calculated on a floor by floor basis. (BOMA)

#### Gross Up Method

A method of calculating variable operating expenses in income-producing properties when less than 100% occupancy is assumed. Expenses reimbursed based on the amount of occupied space, rather than on the total building area, are described as "grossed up." (Dictionary)

#### Gross Retail Sellout

The sum of the separate and distinct market value opinions for each of the units in a condominium, subdivision development, or portfolio of properties, as of the date of valuation. The aggregate of retail values does not represent the value of all the units as though sold together in a single transaction; it is simply the total of the individual market value conclusions. Also called the *aggregate of the retail values, aggregate retail selling price or sum of the retail values.* (Dictionary)

#### Ground Lease

A lease that grants the right to use and occupy land. Improvements made by the ground lessee typically revert to the ground lessor at the end of the lease term. (Dictionary)

#### Ground Rent

The rent paid for the right to use and occupy land according to the terms of a ground lease; the portion of the total rent allocated to the underlying land. (Dictionary)



#### HVAC

Heating, ventilation, air conditioning (HVAC) system. A unit that regulates the temperature and distribution of heat and fresh air throughout a building. (Dictionary)

#### Highest and Best Use

- The reasonably probable use of property that results in the highest value. The four criteria that the highest and best use must meet are legal permissibility, physical possibility, financial feasibility, and maximum productivity.
- 2) The use of an asset that maximizes its potential and that is possible, legally permissible, and financially feasible. The highest and best use may be for continuation of an asset's existing use of for some alternative use. This is determined by the use that a market participant would have in mind for the asset when formulating the price that it would be willing to bid. (IVS)
- [The] highest and most profitable use for which the property is adaptable and needed or likely to be needed in the reasonably near future. (Uniform Appraisal Standards for Federal Land Acquisitions) (Dictionary)

#### Hypothetical Condition

- A condition that is presumed to be true when it is known to be false. (SVP – Standards of Valuation Practice, effective January 1, 2015)
- 2) A condition, directly related to a specific assignment, which is contrary to what is known by the appraiser to exist on the effective date of the assignment results, but is used for the purpose of analysis. <u>Comment</u>: Hypothetical conditions are contrary to known facts about physical, legal, or economic characteristics of the subject property; or about conditions external to the property, such as market conditions or trends; or about the integrity of data used in an analysis. (USPAP, 2016-2017 ed.) (Dictionary)

#### Industrial Gross Lease

A type of modified gross lease of an industrial property in which the landlord and tenant share expenses. The landlord receives stipulated rent and is obligated to pay certain operating expenses, often structural maintenance, insurance and real property taxes, as specified in the lease. There are significant regional and local differences in the use of this term. (Dictionary)

#### Insurable Value

A type of value for insurance purposes. (Typically this includes replacement cost less basement excavation, foundation, underground piping and architect's fees). (Dictionary)

#### Investment Value

The value of a property to a particular investor or class of investors based on the investor's specific requirements. Investment value may be different from market value because it depends on a set of investment criteria that are not necessarily typical of the market. (Dictionary)

#### Just Compensation

In condemnation, the amount of loss for which a property owner is compensated when his or her property is taken. Just compensation should put the owner in as good a position pecuniarily as he or she would have been if the property had not been taken. (Dictionary)

#### Leased Fee Interest

The ownership interest held by the lessor, which includes the right to receive the contract rent specified in the lease plus the reversionary right when the lease expires. (Dictionary)

#### Leasehold Interest

The right held by the lessee to use and occupy real estate for a stated term and under the conditions specified in the lease. (Dictionary)

#### Lessee (Tenant)

One who has the right to occupancy and use of the property of another for a period of time according to a lease agreement. (Dictionary)

#### Lessor (Landlord)

One who conveys the rights of occupancy and use to others under a lease agreement. (Dictionary)

#### Liquidation Value

The most probable price that a specified interest in property should bring under the following conditions:

- Consummation of a sale within a short time period.
- The property is subjected to market conditions prevailing as of the date of valuation.
- Both the buyer and seller are acting prudently and knowledgeably.
- The seller is under extreme compulsion to sell.
- The buyer is typically motivated.
- Both parties are acting in what they consider to be their best interests.
- A normal marketing effort is not possible due to the brief exposure time.
- Payment will be made in cash in U.S. dollars (or the local currency) or in terms of financial arrangements comparable thereto.
- The price represents the normal consideration for the property sold, unaffected by special or creative



financing or sales concessions granted by anyone associated with the sale. (Dictionary)

#### Loan to Value Ratio (LTV)

The ratio between a mortgage loan and the value of the property pledged as security, usually expressed as a percentage. (Dictionary)

#### **Major Vertical Penetrations**

Stairs, elevator shafts, flues, pipe shafts, vertical ducts, and the like, and their enclosing walls. Atria, lightwells and similar penetrations above the finished floor are included in this definition. Not included, however, are vertical penetrations built for the private use of a tenant occupying office areas on more than one floor. Structural columns, openings for vertical electric cable or telephone distribution, and openings for plumbing lines are not considered to be major vertical penetrations. (BOMA)

#### Market Rent

The most probable rent that a property should bring in a competitive and open market reflecting the conditions and restrictions of a specified lease agreement, including the rental adjustment and revaluation, permitted uses, use restrictions, expense obligations; term, concessions, renewal and purchase options and tenant improvements (TIs). (Dictionary)

#### Market Value

The most probable price that a property should bring in a competitive and open market under all conditions requisite to a fair sale, the buyer and seller each acting prudently and knowledgeably, and assuming the price is not affected by undue stimulus. Implicit in this definition is the consummation of a sale as of a specified date and the passing of title from seller to buyer under conditions whereby:

- Buyer and seller are typically motivated;
- Both parties are well informed or well advised, and acting in what they consider their own best interests;
- A reasonable time is allowed for exposure in the open market;
- Payment is made in terms of cash in United States dollars or in terms of financial arrangements comparable thereto; and
- The price represents the normal consideration for the property sold unaffected by special or creative financing or sales concessions granted by anyone associated with the sale.

(Dictionary)

#### Marketing Time

An opinion of the amount of time it might take to sell a real or personal property interest at the concluded market value level during the period immediately after the effective date of an appraisal. Marketing time differs from exposure time, which is always presumed to precede the effective date of an appraisal. (Advisory Opinion 7 of the Appraisal Standards Board of the Appraisal Foundation and Statement on Appraisal Standards No. 6, "Reasonable Exposure Time in Real Property and Personal Property Market Value Opinions" address the determination of reasonable exposure and marketing time.) (Dictionary)

#### Master Lease

A lease in which the fee owner leases a part or the entire property to a single entity (the master lease) in return for a stipulated rent. The master lessee then leases the property to multiple tenants. (Dictionary)

#### **Modified Gross Lease**

A lease in which the landlord receives stipulated rent and is obligated to pay some, but not all, of the property's operating and fixed expenses. Since assignment of expenses varies among modified gross leases, expense responsibility must always be specified. In some markets, a modified gross lease may be called a *double net lease, net net lease, partial net lease, or semigross lease*. (Dictionary)

#### **Operating Expense Ratio**

The ratio of total operating expenses to effective gross income (TOE/EGI); the complement of the net income ratio, i.e., OER = 1 - NIR (Dictionary)

#### Option

A legal contract, typically purchased for a stated consideration, that permits but does not require the holder of the option (known as the *optionee*) to buy, sell, or lease real estate for a stipulated period of time in accordance with specified terms; a unilateral right to exercise a privilege. (Dictionary)

#### Partial Interest

Divided or undivided rights in real estate that represent less than the whole, i.e., a fractional interest such as a tenancy in common, easement, or life interest. (Dictionary)

#### Pass Through

A tenant's portion of operating expenses that may be composed of common area maintenance (CAM), real property taxes, property insurance, and any other expenses determined in the lease agreement to be paid by the tenant. (Dictionary)

#### Potential Gross Income (PGI)

The total income attributable to property at full occupancy before vacancy and operating expenses are deducted. (Dictionary)


#### Prospective Future Value Upon Completion

A prospective market value may be appropriate for the valuation of a property interest related to a credit decision for a proposed development or renovation project. According to USPAP, an appraisal with a prospective market value reflects an effective date that is subsequent to the date of the appraisal report. ... The prospective market value –as completed- reflects the property's market value as of the time that development is expected to be complete. (Dictionary)

#### Prospective Future Value Upon Stabilization

A prospective market value may be appropriate for the valuation of a property interest related to a credit decision for a proposed development or renovation project. According to USPAP, an appraisal with a prospective market value reflects an effective date that is subsequent to the date of the appraisal report ...The prospective market value – as stabilized – reflects the property's market value as of the time the property is projected to achieve stabilized occupancy. For an income-producing property, stabilized occupancy is the occupancy level that a property is expected to achieve after the property is exposed to the market for lease over a reasonable period of time and at comparable terms and conditions to other similar properties. (Dictionary)

#### **Replacement Cost**

The estimated cost to construct, at current prices as of a specific date, a substitute for a building or other improvements, using modern materials and current standards, design, and layout. (Dictionary)

#### **Reproduction Cost**

The estimated cost to construct, at current prices as of the effective date of the appraisal, an exact duplicate or replica of the building being appraised, using the same materials, construction standards, design, layout, and quality of workmanship and embodying all of the deficiencies, superadequacies, and obsolescence of the subject building. (Dictionary)

#### **Retrospective Value Opinion**

A value opinion effective as of a specified historical date. The term *retrospective* does not define a type of value. Instead, it identifies a value opinion as being effective at some specific prior date. Value as of a historical date is frequently sought in connection with property tax appeals, damage models, lease renegotiation, deficiency judgments, estate tax, and condemnation. Inclusion of the type of value with this term is appropriate, e.g., "retrospective market value opinion." (Dictionary)

#### Sandwich Leasehold Estate

The interest held by the sandwich leaseholder when the property is subleased to another party; a type of leasehold estate. (Dictionary)

#### Sublease

An agreement in which the lessee in a prior lease conveys the right of use and occupancy of a property to another, the sublessee, for a specific period of time, which may or may not be coterminous with the underlying lease term. (Dictionary)

#### Subordination

A contractual arrangement in which a party with a claim to certain assets agrees to make his or her claim junior, or subordinate, to the claims of another party. (Dictionary)

#### Surplus Land

Land that is not currently needed to support the existing use but cannot be separated from the property and sold off for another use. Surplus land does not have an independent highest and best use and may or may not contribute value to the improved parcel. (Dictionary)

#### Triple Net (Net Net Net) Lease

An alternative term for a type of net lease. In some markets, a net net net lease is defined as a lease in which the tenant assumes all expenses (fixed and variable) of operating a property except that the landlord is responsible for structural maintenance, building reserves, and management; also called *NNN lease, net net net lease, or fully net lease*. (Dictionary)

(The market definition of a triple net lease varies; in some cases tenants pay for items such as roof repairs, parking lot repairs, and other similar items.)

#### Usable Area

The measured area of an office area, store area, or building common area on a floor. The total of all the usable areas for a floor shall equal floor usable area of that same floor. (BOMA)

#### Value-in-Use

The value of a property assuming a specific use, which may or may not be the property's highest and best use on the effective date of the appraisal. Value in use may or may not be equal to market value but is different conceptually. (Dictionary)



#### RIVER BLUFFS SEWER UTILITY ADDENDA

#### Qualifications of Arthur L. Schwertz, MAI Senior Managing Director Valbridge Property Advisors | South Louisiana

#### Independent Valuations for a Variable World

State Certifications
Certified General in:
Louisiana
Mississippi
Alabama
Texas
Virginia
California
Kentucky

#### Education

Bachelor of Arts History Louisiana State University

Contact Details

504-541-5101 (p) 504-541-5107 (f) <u>aschwertz@valbridge.com</u> (e)

Valbridge Property Advisors 2030 Dickory Avenue Suite 200 New Orleans, LA 70123

www.valbridge.com/south-louisiana



tions for a	Variable World
	Membership/Affiliations
	Member: Appraisal Institute – MAI Designation
	Louisiana Chapter President, 2017
	Member: Celebration Church Administrative Team (Corporate Secretary)
	Appraisal Institute & Related Courses
	Continuing education courses taken through the Appraisal Institute and other real
	estate organizations.
	5
	Publications, Seminars Presented, etc.
	"Contract or Effective Rent: Finding the Real Rent", Appraisal Institute, Baton
	Rouge, Louisiana, 2016.
	"Appraising Commercial and Complex Properties in an Historic Area", Webinar for
	the Appraisal Institute, 2015.
у	"The Unique Appraisal: Case Studies in Appraising Special Purpose Properties", AI
,	Connect 2014 (Appraisal Institute's National Meeting), Austin, Texas, 2014.
	Schwertz, Arthur L. 2014. "History Lesson", Valuation Magazine 2 <sup>nd</sup> Quarter, 2014,
	12 – 13.
<u>m</u> (e)	Huso, Deborah R. 2013. "On the Waterfront", Valuation Magazine 2 <sup>nd</sup> Quarter,
	2013, 22 – 27. (Contributor)
sors	Experience
	Senior Managing Director
	Valbridge Property Advisors   South Louisiana (2013-Present)
	Vice-President
	Argote, Derbes, Graham, Shuffield & Tatje, Inc. (1992-2013)
<u>ana</u>	
	Appraisal/valuation and consulting assignments include (but not limited to):
	Single-family, condominium, apartments, vacant land, funeral homes,
	amphitheaters, live performance theaters, office buildings, hospitals, nursing homes, specialized healthcare, hotels/motels, service stations, retail, industrial
	nomes, specialized field interest valuations, service stations, retail, industrial

homes, specialized healthcare, hotels/motels, service stations, retail, industrial plants, warehouses, fractional interest valuations, contaminated properties, special purpose properties (port facilities, nuclear reactor simulator facility, shipyards, etc.), senior residential and healthcare facilities, feasibility studies, market studies, condemnation, construction defects, litigation support, mediations, and review appraisals.

Mr. Schwertz has provided valuation services in a wide variety of complex civil litigation including real estate, land use cases, condemnation, estate matters, property taxation, construction defect, and bankruptcy/creditors matters.

Qualified as an expert witness in Jefferson, Orleans, and St. Tammany Parishes, Dallas County, Texas, United States Court of Federal Claims and the Bankruptcy Court for the Middle District of Louisiana.



# FAST FACTS

- Valbridge is the largest independent national real estate valuation and advisory services firm in North America.
  - o Total number of MAI-designated appraisers (200+ on staff)
  - o Total number of office locations (70+ across U.S.)
  - o Total number of staff (675+ strong)
- Valbridge covers the entire U.S. from coast to coast.
- Valbridge services all property types, including special-purpose properties and residential.
- Valbridge provides independent valuation services. We are not owned by a brokerage firm or investment company.
- Every Valbridge office is led by a senior managing director who holds the MAI designation of the Appraisal Institute.
- Valbridge is owned by our local office leaders.
- Valbridge welcomes single-property assignments as well as portfolio, multi-market and other bulk-property engagements.

Valbridge Property Advisors, Inc. 2240 Venetian Court • Naples, FL 34109 • Phone: (888) 981-2029 www.valbridge.com





#### ALABAMA

4732 Woodmere Boulevard Montgomery, AL 36106 334.277.5077

200 Cahaba Park Circle Suite 213 Birmingham, AL 35242 205.440.2998

#### ARIZONA

6061 E. Grant Road Suite 121 Tucson, AZ 85712 520.321.0000

#### CALIFORNIA

4915 Calloway Drive Suite 101 Bakersfield, CA 93312 661.587,1010

1370 N. Brea Boulevard Suite 255 Fullerton, CA 92835 714.449.0852

2813 Coffee Road Suite E-2 Modesto, CA 95355 209.569.0450

99 S. Lake Avenue Suite 21 Pasadena, CA 91101 626.744.0428

3090 Fite Circle Suite 202 Sacramento, CA 95827 916.361.2509

55 South Market Street Suite 1210 San Jose, CA 95113 408.279.1520

3160 Crow Canyon Place Suite 245 San Ramon, CA 94583 925.327.1660

#### COLORADO

7445 F Peakview Avenue Centennial, CO 80111 303.443.9600

5345 Arapahoe Avenue Suite 7 Boulder, CO 80303 303.443.9600

23272 Two Rivers Road Unit 101 Basalt, CO 81621 970.340.1016

1099 Main Avenue Suite 311 Durango, CO 81301 970.340.1016

#### CONNECTICUT

15 Concord Street Glastonbury, CT 06033 860.246.4606

17 Covewood Drive Norwalk, CT 06853 203.286.6520

CORPORATE OFFICE

Spring 2019

#### FLORIDA

2240 Venetian Court Naples, FL 34109 239.514.4646

301 Almeria Avenue, Suite 350 Coral Gables, FL 33134 305.639.8029

603 Hillcrest Street Orlando, FL 32803 407.839.3626

2711 Poinsettia Avenue West Palm Beach, FL 33407 561.833.5331

#### GEORGIA

2675 Paces Ferry Road Suite 145 Atlanta, GA 30339 678 644.4853

#### IDAHO

1459 Tyrell Lane Suite B Suite B Boise, ID 83706 208.336.1097 1875 N. Lakewood Drive

Suite 100 Coeur d'Alene, ID 83814 208.292.2965

#### ILLINOIS

566 W. Lake Street Suite 240 Chicago, IL 60661 312.288.8687

#### INDIANA

820 Fort Wayne Avenue Indianapolis, IN 46204 317.687.2747

#### KANSAS

10990 Quivira Road Suite 100 Overland Park, KS 66210 913.451.1451

#### KENTUCKY

9000 Wessex Place Suite 306 Louisville, KY 40222 502.585.3651

#### LOUISIANA

2030 Dickory Avenue Suite 200 New Orleans, LA 70123 504 541 5100

#### MARYLAND

11100 Dovedale Court Marriottsville, MD 21104 443.333.5522

#### MASSACHUSETTS 260 Bear Hill Road

2240 Venetian Court Naples, FL 34109

Suite 106 Waltham MA 02451 781.790.5645

#### MICHIGAN

1420 Washington Blvd. Suite 301 Detroit, MI 48226 313.986.3313.

2127 University Park Drive Suite 390 Okemos, MI 48864 517.336.0001

#### MINNESOTA 222 South 9th Street

Suite 825 Minneapolis, MN 55402 612.253.0650

275 East 4th Street, Suite 325 St. Paul, MN 55101 651.983.2408

#### MISSISSIPPI

1010 Ford Street Gulfport, MS 39507 228.604.1900

737 Highway 51 Suite 1C Madison, MS 39110 601.853.0736

MISSOURI

10990 Quivira Road Suite 100 Overland Park, KS 66210 913.451.1451

#### NEVADA

3034 S. Durango Drive Suite 100 Las Vegas, NV 89117 702.242.9369

6490 S McCarran Blvd #51 Reno, NV 89509 775.204.4100

#### NEW JERSEY

2740 Route 10 West, Suite 204 Morris Plains, NJ 07950 973.970.9333

3500 Route 9 South, Suite 202 Howell, NJ 07731 732.807.3113

#### **NEW YORK**

424 West 33rd Street Suite 630 New York, NY 10001 212.268.1113

#### NORTH CAROLINA

412 E. Chatham Street Cary, NC 27511 919.859.2666

239-325-8234 phone 239-325-8356 fax

#### 5950 Fairview Road, Suite 405 Charlotte, NC 28210 704.376.5400

OHIO

1655 W. Market Street Suite 130 Akron, OH 44313 330,899,9900

8291 Beechmont Ave. Suite B Cincinnati, OH 45255 513,785,0820

1422 Euclid Avenue Suite 616 Cleveland, OH 44115 216.367.9690

#### OKLAHOMA

5909 NW Expressway Suite 104 Oklahoma City, OK 73132 405.603.1553

6666 South Sheridan Road Suite 104 Tulsa, OK 74133 918.712.9992

#### PENNSYLVANIA

150 S. Warner Road Suite 440 King of Prussia, PA 19406 215.545.1900

4701 Baptist Road

## Pittsburgh, PA 15227 412.881.6080 SOUTH CAROLINA

Suite 304

11 Cleveland Court Greenville, SC 29607 864,233.6277

920 Bay Street Suite 26 Beaufort, SC 29902 843.342.2302

1250 Fairmont Avenue Mt. Pleasant, SC 29464 843.881.1266

#### TENNESSEE

5205 Maryland Way Suite 300 Brentwood, TN 37027 615.369.0670

701 Broad Street Suite 209 Chattanooga, TN 37402 423.285.8435

213 Fox Road Knoxville, TN 37922 865.522.2424

756 Ridge Lake Blvd Suite 225 Memphis, TN 38120 901.753.6977

#### TEXAS

High Point Center 12225 Greenville Avenue Suite 490 Dallas, TX 75243 214.446.1611

#### TEXAS (cont'd)

974 Campbell Road Suite 204 Houston, TX 77024 713.467.5858 2731 81st Street Lubbock, TX 79423 806.744.1188

9901 IH-10 West Suite 1035 San Antonio, TX 78230 210 227 6229

#### UTAH

260 South 2500 West Suite 301 Pleasant Grove, UT 84062 801.492.9328

1100 East 6600 South Suite 201 Salt Lake City, UT 84121 801.262.3388

20 North Main Suite 304 St. George, UT 84770 435.773.6300

#### VIRGINIA

656 Independence Parkway Suite 220 Chesapeake, VA 23320 757.410.1222

4914 Fitzhugh Avenue Suite 102 Richmond, VA 23230 757-345-0010

5107 Center Street Unit 2B Williamsburg, VA 23188 757.345.0010

WASHINGTON

Suite B Bothell, WA 98011 425,450.0040

2927 Colby Avenue

Suite 100 Everett, WA 98201 425.258.2611

419 Berkeley Avenue

8378 W. Grandridge Boulevard Suite 110-D Kennewick, WA 99336 509.221.1540

Suite A Fircrest, WA 98466

506 Second Avenue

Suite 1001 Seattle, WA 98104

324 N. Mullan Road Spokane Valley, WA 99206 509.747.0999

12660 W. North Avenue

Brookfield, WI 53005

Each Valbridge office is independently owned and operated.

Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8

Case No. 2022-00432

Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 256 of 327

206.209.3016

WISCONSIN

262.782.7990

253.274.0099

18728 Bothell Way, NE



## **Appraisal Report**

Woodland Acres Utilities Hemlock Drive Shepherdsville, Bullitt County, Kentucky 40165

Report Date: 09-22-2022



#### FOR:

Central States Water Resources Mr. Todd Thomas Vice-President 1650 Des Peres Road, Suite 303 Des Peres, Missouri 63074

**Client Number:** 

#### Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans

2030 Dickory Avenue, Suite 200 New Orleans, LA 70123 504.541.5100 phone 504.541.5107 fax *valbridge.com* 

Valbridge File Number: LA01-20-0136.000

Case No. 2022-00432 Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8 Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 257 of 327



2030 Dickory Avenue, Suite 200 New Orleans, LA 70123 504.541.5100 phone 504.541.5107 fax valbridge.com

09-22-2022

Arthur L. Schwertz MAI 504.541.5101 aschwertz@valbridge.com

Mr. Todd Thomas Vice-President Central States Water Resources 1650 Des Peres Road, Suite 303 Des Peres, Missouri 63074

RE: Appraisal Report Woodland Acres Utilities Hemlock Drive Shepherdsville, Bullitt County, Kentucky 40165

Dear Mr. Thomas:

In accordance with your request, we have performed an appraisal of the above referenced property. This appraisal report sets forth the pertinent data gathered, the techniques employed, and the reasoning leading to our value opinions. This letter of transmittal does not constitute an appraisal report and the rationale behind the value opinion(s) reported cannot be adequately understood without the accompanying appraisal report.

The subject property, as referenced above, is located in Woodland Acres Subdivision and includes tax parcel numbers 036-500-15-005. The subject property consists of a total of 3.07-acres or 133,729-square-feet. Of the total, 2.19 acres are easements and 0.88 acres are fee simple area. The subject is the sewer system for Woodland Acres Subdivision.

We developed our analyses, opinions, and conclusions and prepared this report in conformity with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP) of the Appraisal Foundation; the Code of Professional Ethics and Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice of the Appraisal Institute; and the requirements of our client as we understand them.

The client in this assignment is Central States Water Resources and the intended user of this report is Central States Water Resources and no others. The sole intended use is for regulatory filings. The value opinions reported herein are subject to the definitions, assumptions, limiting conditions, and certifications contained in this report.



The findings and conclusions are further contingent upon the following extraordinary assumptions and/or hypothetical conditions, the use of which might have affected the assignment results:

#### **Extraordinary Assumptions:**

• The appraiser was unable to locate any documents definitively specifying the location or width of the utility easements. However, a visual inspection of the neighborhood indicates the presence of sewer lines near the street frontage and it has been assumed for purposes of this analysis that they lie within a 10' utility easement.

#### Hypothetical Conditions:

• This appraisal is predicated on the hypothetical condition that the property is unimproved and ready for development.

Based on the analysis contained in the following report, our value conclusions are summarized as follows:

Value Conclusions		
Component	Prospective	As Is
Value Type	Market Value	Market Value
Property Rights Appraised	Easement	Fee Simple
Effective Date of Value	September 22, 2022	September 22, 2022
Value Conclusion	\$38,000	\$38,000

Respectfully submitted, Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans

H 2 A.

Arthur L. Schwertz, MAI Senior Managing Director Kentucky Certified General Real Property Appraiser #5470



## **Table of Contents**

Cover Page	
Letter of Transmittal	
Table of Contents	i
Summary of Salient Facts	ii
Aerial and Front Views	iv
Location Map	V
Introduction	1
Scope of Work	4
City and Neighborhood Analysis	6
Site Description	10
Highest and Best Use	14
Land Valuation	15
Exposure Time and Marketing Period	21
General Assumptions and Limiting Conditions	
Certification – Arthur L. Schwertz	27
Addenda	29
Glossary	
Qualifications	
Qualifications of Arthur L. Schwertz, MAI	
Valbridge Property Advisors Information / Office Locations	46



## **Summary of Salient Facts**

## **Property Identification**

Property Name	Woodland Acres Utilities
Property Address	Hemlock Drive
	Shepherdsville, Bullitt County, Kentucky 40165
Latitude & Longitude	37.988399, -85.715792
Tax Parcel Number	036-500-15-005
Property Owner	Bluegrass Water Utility Operating Co LLC
Site	
Zoning	Not Zoned
FEMA Flood Map No.	21029C0063F
Flood Zone	AE, X
Easement Land Area	95,396 square feet
Fee Simple Land Area	38,333 square feet
Valuation Opinions	
Highest & Best Use - As Vacant	Residential
Reasonable Exposure Time	Six months or less
Reasonable Marketing Time	Six months or less



Value Conclusions		
Component	Prospective	As Is
Value Type	Market Value	Market Value
Property Rights Appraised	Easement	Fee Simple
Effective Date of Value	September 22, 2022	September 22, 2022
Value Conclusion	\$38,000	\$38,000



WOODLAND ACRES UTILITIES AERIAL AND FRONT VIEWS

## **Aerial and Front Views**

**AERIAL VIEW** 



#### FRONT VIEW FROM ASSESSOR





WOODLAND ACRES UTILITIES LOCATION MAP

## **Location Map**



Page v Case No. 2022-00432 Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8 Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 264 of 327



## Introduction

## Client and Intended Users of the Appraisal

The client in this assignment is Central States Water Resources and the sole intended user of this report is Central States Water Resources. Under no circumstances shall any of the following parties be entitled to use or rely on the appraisal or this appraisal report:

- i. The borrower(s) on any loans or financing relating to or secured by the subject property,
- ii. Any guarantor(s) of such loans or financing; or
- iii. Principals, shareholders, investors, members or partners in such borrower(s) or guarantors.

## Intended Use of the Appraisal

The sole intended use of this report is for regulatory filings.

## **Real Estate Identification**

The subject property is located at Hemlock Drive, Shepherdsville, Bullitt County, Kentucky 40165. The subject property is further identified by the tax parcel number 036-500-15-005.

## Legal Description

LT 57 WOODLAND ACS (SEWAGE TREATMENT PL) and the easements for the sewer lines for Woodland Acres Subdivision

## Use of Real Estate as of the Effective Date of Value

As of the effective date of value, the subject was a utility property.

## Use of Real Estate as Reflected in this Appraisal

The opinion of value for the subject as is reflects use as a utility property.

## Ownership of the Property

According to Public Records, title to the subject property is vested in Bluegrass Water Utility Operating Co LLC.

## History of the Property

Ownership of the subject property has not changed within the past three years.

## Analysis of Listings/Offers/Contracts

The subject is not currently listed for sale or under contract for sale..



## Type and Definition of Value

The appraisal problem is to develop an opinion of the market value of the subject property. "Market Value," as used in this appraisal, is defined as "the most probable price that a property should bring in a competitive and open market under all conditions requisite to a fair sale, the buyer and seller each acting prudently and knowledgeably, and assuming the price is not affected by undue stimulus." Implicit in this definition is the consummation of a sale as of a specified date and the passing of title from seller to buyer under conditions whereby:

- Buyer and seller are typically motivated.
- Both parties are well informed or well advised, each acting in what they consider their own best interests;
- A reasonable time is allowed for exposure in the open market;
- Payment is made in terms of cash in U.S. dollars or in terms of financial arrangements comparable thereto; and
- The price represents the normal consideration for the property sold unaffected by special or creative financing or sale concessions granted by anyone associated with the sale."1

The value conclusions apply to the value of the subject property under the market conditions presumed on the effective date of value. Please refer to the Glossary in the Addenda section for additional definitions of terms used in this report.

## Valuation Scenarios, Property Rights Appraised, and Effective Dates of Value

Per the scope of our assignment we developed opinions of value for the subject property under the following scenarios of value:

Valuation Scenario	Effective Date of Value
Prospective As Is Market Value of the Easement Interest	September 22, 2022
As Is Market Value of the Fee Simple Interest	September 22, 2022

## Date of Report

The date of this report is 09-22-2022.

#### List of Items Requested but Not Provided

• All information requested has been provided

## Assumptions and Conditions of the Appraisal

This appraisal assignment and the opinions reported herein are subject to the General Assumptions and Limiting Conditions contained in the report and the following extraordinary assumptions and/or hypothetical conditions, the use of which might have affected the assignment results.

Page 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Source: Code of Federal Regulations, Title 12, Banks and Banking, Part 722.2-Definitions

<sup>© 2022</sup> VALBRIDGE PROPERTY ADVISORS | New Orleans



#### **Extraordinary Assumptions**

• The appraiser was unable to locate any documents definitively specifying the location or width of the utility easements. However, a visual inspection of the neighborhood indicates the presence of sewer lines near the street frontage and it has been assumed for purposes of this analysis that they lie within a 10' utility easement.

#### Hypothetical Conditions

• This appraisal is predicated on the hypothetical condition that the property is unimproved and ready for development.



## Scope of Work

The elements addressed in the Scope of Work are (1) the extent to which the subject property is identified, (2) the extent to which the subject property is inspected, (3) the type and extent of data researched, (4) the type and extent of analysis applied, (5) the type of appraisal report prepared, and (6) the inclusion or exclusion of items of non-realty in the development of the value opinion. These items are discussed as below.

## Extent to Which the Property Was Identified

The three components of the property identification are summarized as follows:

- <u>Legal Characteristics</u> The subject was legally identified via a general inspection of the property by the appraiser, a visual review of aerial maps, a legal description, and tax assessment maps.
- <u>Economic Characteristics</u> Economic characteristics of the subject property were identified via information provided by the client, market surveys, discussions with market participants, and our database, as well as a comparison to properties with similar locational and physical characteristics.
- <u>Physical Characteristics</u> The subject was physically identified via a general inspection of the property by the appraiser.

## Extent to Which the Property Was Inspected

We did not perform an appraisal inspection of the property.

## Type and Extent of Data Researched

We researched and analyzed: (1) market area data, (2) property-specific market data, (3) zoning and land-use data, and (4) current data on comparable listings and transactions. We also interviewed people familiar with the subject market/property type.

## Type and Extent of Analysis Applied (Valuation Methodology)

We observed surrounding land use trends, the condition of any improvements, demand for the subject property, and relevant legal limitations in concluding a highest and best use. We then valued the subject based on that highest and best use conclusion.

Appraisers develop an opinion of property value with specific appraisal procedures that reflect three distinct methods of data analysis: the Cost Approach, Sales Comparison Approach, and Income Capitalization Approach. One or more of these approaches are used in all estimations of value.

- <u>Sales Comparison Approach</u> In the Sales Comparison Approach, value is indicated by recent sales and/or listings of comparable properties in the market, with the appraiser analyzing the impact of material differences in both economic and physical elements between the subject and the comparables.
- <u>Direct Capitalization: Land Residual Method</u> The Land Residual Methodology involves estimating the residual net income to the land by deducting from total potential income the portion attributable to the improvements, assuming development of the site at its highest and



best use. The residual income is capitalized at an appropriate rate, resulting in an indication of land value.

- <u>Direct Capitalization: Ground Rent Capitalization</u> A market derived capitalization rate is applied to the net income resulting from a ground lease. This can represent the leased fee or fee simple interest, depending on whether the income potential is reflective of a lease in place or market rental rates.
- <u>Yield Capitalization: Subdivision Development Method</u> Also known as Discounted Cash Flow Analysis (DCF), the methodology is most appropriate for land having multiple lot development in the near term as the highest and best use. The current site value is represented by discounting the anticipated cash flow to a present value, taking into consideration all necessary costs of development, maintenance, administration, and sales throughout the absorption period.

All of these approaches to value were considered. We assessed the availability of data and applicability of each approach to value within the context of the characteristics of the subject property and the needs and requirements of the client. Based on this assessment, we relied upon the Sales Comparison Approach. Further discussion of the extent of our analysis and the methodology of each approach is provided later in the respective valuation sections.

## Appraisal Conformity and Report Type

We developed our analyses, opinions, and conclusions and prepared this report in conformity with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP) of the Appraisal Foundation; the Code of Professional Ethics and Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice of the Appraisal Institute; and the requirements of our client as we understand them. This is an Appraisal Report as defined by the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice under Standards Rule 2-2a.

## Personal Property/FF&E

All items of non-realty are excluded from this analysis. The opinion of market value developed herein is reflective of real estate only.



## **City and Neighborhood Analysis**

## **NEIGHBORHOOD MAP**



## Overview

The subject is located in Shepherdsville in Bullitt County, Kentucky.

The area of Shepherdsville is characterized by being an outer suburb of Louisville.



#### Neighborhood Location and Boundaries

The subject neighborhood is located in the section of Shepherdsville. The area is semi-rural in nature.

The neighborhood is bounded by KY-1526 to the north, US-150 to the east, Lebanon Junction to the south, and Ohio River to the west.

#### **Transportation Access**

Within the immediate area of the subject property, transportation access helps define the character of its development. Major travel and commuter routes within the area of the subject property include Hwy 44 and I-65. Access to the area is considered average.

## Neighborhood Land Use

The subject neighborhood is located in an area with primarily residential land uses. An approximate breakdown of the development in the area is as follows:

LAND USES		
Developed	60%	
Residential	70%	
Retail	10%	
Office	5%	
Industrial	15%	
Vacant	40%	
Total	100%	

#### Land Use Trends

The neighborhood is not experiencing a change in land use.



## Demographics

The following table depicts the area demographics in Shepherdsville within a one-, three-, and five-mile radius from the subject.

Neighborhood Demographics			
Radius (Miles)	1 Mile	3 Mile	5 Mile
Population Summary			
2010 Population	2,349	15,283	24,171
2020 Population Estimate	3,183	17,919	27,364
2025 Population Projection	3,382	18,568	28,134
Annual % Change (2020 - 2025)	1.2%	0.7%	0.6%
Housing Unit Summary			
2010 Housing Units	974	6,012	9,603
% Owner Occupied	49.7%	63.5%	70.7%
% Renter Occupied	38.7%	29.9%	23.4%
2020 Housing Units	1,342	7,205	11,053
% Owner Occupied	49.0%	59.0%	66.6%
% Renter Occupied	42.4%	36.8%	29.5%
2025 Housing Units	1,433	7,500	11,408
% Owner Occupied	48.6%	58.9%	66.7%
% Renter Occupied	42.9%	36.8%	29.3%
Annual % Change (2020 - 2025)	1.4%	0.8%	0.6%
Income Summary			
2020 Median Household Income Estimate	\$55,204	\$58,911	\$64,906
2025 Median Household Income Projection	\$60,714	\$64,630	\$72,741
Annual % Change	1.9%	1.9%	2.3%
2020 Per Capita Income Estimate	\$26,933	\$28,007	\$32,334
2025 Per Capita Income Projection	\$29,743	\$31,179	\$36,318
Annual % Change	2.0%	2.2%	2.4%
Source: ESRI (ArcGIS)		(Lat: 37.988399, L	on: -85.715792)

Within a three-mile radius, the reported population is 17,919 with a projected growth rate of approximately 0.7% annually. There are 7,205 housing units within that three-mile radius. The growth rate is expected to be 0.8% annually. Most of the housing is owner-occupied. Our research indicates that property values in the area are increasing.

Within a three-mile radius, the median household income is \$58,911. Looking ahead, annual household income growth is projected at **1.9**% per year. The average income figures suggest that the inhabitants are within the middle income brackets.

## Nuisances & External Obsolescence

Neighborhood properties have adequate levels of maintenance. No adverse or unfavorable factors were observed.



## Neighborhood Life Cycle

Most neighborhoods are classified as being in four stages: **growth**, **stability**, **decline**, and **renewal**. Overall, the subject neighborhood is in the stable stage of its life cycle.

## Immediate Area Uses

The below aerial photo exhibits the uses located in the subject's immediate vicinity.



#### **IMMEDIATE AREA USES**

Source: Google Maps

Uses in the vicinity of the subject are primarily residential in nature. Recognized uses in the immediate area of the subject include mobile home parks, single family subdivisions, auto related retail, and special use properties. As shown above, the density of uses in the area is sporadic with some vacant land remaining available in the area.

## Analysis and Conclusions

The neighborhood is characterized by being an outer suburban area of the Louisville MSA.



## **Site Description**

The subject site is located in Woodland Acres Subdivision. The characteristics of the site are summarized as follows:

#### Site Characteristics

3.07 Acres or 133,729 SF
0.88 Acres or 38,333 SF
2.19 Acres or 95,396
Irregular
Level
Adequate
All are available

## Flood Zone Data

Flood Map Panel/Number:	21029C0063F
Flood Map Date:	04-05-2016
Flood Zone:	AE, X
	Flood Zone AE is an area of special flood hazards. Properties in this classification generally require flood insurance for mortgage lending and is generally recommended.

Flood Zone X

## Adjacent Land Uses

North:	Residential
South:	Residential
East:	Residential
West:	Residential

## Analysis/Comments on Site

The subject is the sewer system for Woodland Acres Subdivision. It consist of 2.19 acres of easements and 0.88 acres of fee simple area.



#### TAX/PLAT MAP





#### **SERVICE AREA MAP**





#### **FLOOD MAP**





## Highest and Best Use

The Highest and Best Use of a property is the use that is legally permissible, physically possible, and financially feasible which results in the highest value. An opinion of the highest and best use results from consideration of the criteria noted above under the market conditions or likely conditions as of the effective date of value. Determination of highest and best use results from the judgment and analytical skills of the appraiser. It represents an opinion, not a fact. In appraisal practice, the concept of highest and best use represents the premise upon which value is based.

## Analysis of Highest and Best Use As Though Vacant

The primary determinants of the highest and best use of the property As Though Vacant are the issues of (1) Legal permissibility, (2) Physical possibility, (3) Financial feasibility, and (4) Maximum productivity.

#### Legally Permissible

The subject site is zoned residential, which controls the general nature of permissible uses but is appropriate for the location and physical elements of the subject property, providing for a consistency of use with the general neighborhood. The location of the subject property is appropriate for the uses allowed, as noted previously, and a change in zoning is unlikely. There are no known easements, encroachments, covenants or other use restrictions that would unduly limit or impede development.

#### **Physically Possible**

The physical attributes allow for a number of potential uses. Elements such as size, shape, availability of utilities, known hazards (flood, environmental, etc.), and other potential influences are described in the Site Description and have been considered. There are no items of a physical nature which would adversely impact development with the legal permitted uses.

#### **Financially Feasible**

The probable use of the site for residential development conforms to the pattern of land use in the market area. A review of published yield, rental and occupancy rates suggest that there is an undersupply and demand is sufficient to support construction costs and ensure timely absorption of additional inventory in this market. Therefore, near-term speculative development of the subject site is financially feasible.

#### Maximally Productive

Among the financially feasible uses, the use that results in the highest value (the maximally productive use) is the highest and best use. Considering these factors, the maximally productive use as though vacant is for residential use.

## Conclusion of Highest and Best Use As Though Vacant

The conclusion of the highest and best use As Though Vacant is for residential use.

#### Most Probable Buyer

As of the date of value, the most probable buyer of the subject property is an owner user.



## **Land Valuation**

#### Methodology

Site Value is most often estimated using the sales comparison approach. This approach develops an indication of market value by analyzing closed sales, listings, or pending sales of properties similar to the subject, focusing on the difference between the subject and the comparables using all appropriate elements of comparison. This approach is based on the principles of supply and demand, balance, externalities, and substitution, or the premise that a buyer would pay no more for a specific property than the cost of obtaining a property with the same quality, utility, and perceived benefits of ownership.

The process of developing the sales comparison approach consists of the following analyses: (1) researching and verifying transactional data, (2) selecting relevant units of comparison, (3) analyzing and adjusting the comparable sales for differences in various elements of comparison, and (4) reconciling the adjusted sales into a value indication for the subject site.

#### Unit of Comparison

The unit of comparison depends on land use economics and how buyers and sellers use the property. The unit of comparison in this analysis is per usable square foot.

#### Elements of Comparison

Elements of comparison are the characteristics or attributes of properties and transactions that cause the prices of real estate to vary. The primary elements of comparison considered in sales comparison analysis are as follows: (1) property rights conveyed, (2) financing terms, (3) conditions of sale, (4) expenditures made immediately after purchase, (5) market conditions, (6) location and (7) physical characteristics.

#### Comparable Sales Data

To obtain and verify comparable sales of vacant land properties, we conducted a search of public records, field surveys, interviews with knowledgeable real estate professionals in the area, and a review of our internal database.

We included four sales in our analysis, as these sales were judged to be the most comparable to develop an indication of market value for the subject property.

The following is a table summarizing each sale comparable and a map illustrating the location of each in relation to the subject.



#### Land Sales Summary

	Sale # 1	Sale # 2	Sale # 3	Sale # 4
Sale ID	1613204	1613211	1613215	1613208
Property Name	Residential Lot	Residential Lot	Residential Lot	Residential Lot
Sale Status	Closed	Closed	Closed	Closed
Location	Highway 44	190 Old Preston	Devin Road	141 Spruce Street
		Highway S		
	Sheperdsville,	Shepherdsville,	Brooks, Kentucky	Shepherdsville,
	Kentucky	Kentucky		Kentucky
Tax ID	045-000-00-026H	037-E00-15-003	035-NE0-02-015C	036-S00-13-024
Sales Data				
Date of Sale	3/29/2022	12/15/2021	1/31/2021	1/6/2021
Sales Price	\$85,000	\$47,000	\$23,000	\$20,000
Price/Usable Square Foot	\$1.07	\$1.08	\$0.67	\$0.90
Grantor	John J and Dilley	Charles Roution	Stephen A and Jane	Ben and Tana
	George Miller		C Thomas	Hammons
Grantee	Vincent F Heuser JR	Rodney Hadley	Mondragon FGF &	Billy Clark
			Garcia VG	
Recording Number				
Book/Page Number	1057-418	1048-797	1052-850	1017-367
Document Number				
Property Rights Conveyed	Fee Simple	Fee Simple	Fee Simple	Fee Simple
Financing	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller
Conditions of Sale	Arm's Length	Arm's Length	Arm's Length	Arm's Length
Physical Characteristics				
Usable Land Area (Sq. Ft.)	79,279	43,560	34,412	22,216
Gross Land Area (Sq. Ft.)	79,279	43,560	34,412	22,216
Zoning		Residential	Residential	
Flood Zone	X Shaded	AE	Х	AE
Topography	Gently sloping	Rolling	Gently sloping	Level
Shape	Slightly Irregular	Irregular	Rectangular	Rectangular
Access/Visibility	Good/Average	Average/Average	Poor/Average	Average/Average



WOODLAND ACRES UTILITIES LAND VALUATION



**COMPARABLE SALES MAP** 



## Land Sales Comparison Analysis

When necessary, adjustments were made for differences in various elements of comparison, including property rights conveyed, financing terms, conditions of sale, expenditures made immediately after purchase, market conditions, location, and other physical characteristics. If the element in comparison is considered superior to that of the subject, we applied a negative adjustment. Conversely, a positive adjustment was applied if inferior. A summary of the elements of comparison follows.

	Elements of Comparison
Real Property Rights Conveyed	Adjustments for differences in property rights appraised.
Financing Terms	Comparable properties are adjusted for differences between a transaction's financing terms and those assumed in the valuation of the subject property - e.g. seller financing, loan assumption, non-market terms.
Conditions of Sale	Comparable properties are adjusted for differences in the motivations of either the buyer or a seller in the transaction. In the instant case, no adjustments are required.
Expenditures After Purchase	Comparable properties can be adjusted for any additional investment required to make the property salable – e. g. costs to cure deferred maintenance, costs to demolish and remove any portion of the improvements, costs to remediate environmental contamination and/or costs to occupy or stabilize the property.
Market Conditions	Comparable properties can be adjusted for changes in market conditions because of inflation, deflation, fluctuations in supply and demand, or other factors.
Location	Location adjustments may be required when the locational characteristics of a comparable are different from those of the subject.
Size	The size adjustment addresses variance in the physical size of the comparables and that of the subject, as a larger parcel typically commands a lower price per unit than a smaller parcel. As this is an estimate of the Across the Fence Value, it is assumed that the subject would be part of a lot similar in size to the comparables. As such, no positive adjustments for size are warranted.
Shape /Depth	This element address variance in utility due to shape and/or depth. No adjustments are warranted.
Corner Exposure	Tracts featuring corner influence typically command higher prices in the market place, as opposed to interior locations. As the subject includes both corner and interior lots, no adjustments are warranted.



## Summary of Adjustments

Presented on the following page is a summary of the adjustments made to the sale comparables. As noted earlier, these quantitative adjustments were based on our market research, best judgment, and experience in the appraisal of similar properties.



#### LAND SALES ADJUSTMENT GRID

	Subject	Sale # 1	Sale # 2	Sale # 3	Sale # 4
Sale ID		1613204	1613211	1613215	1613208
Date of Value & Sale	September-22	March-22	December-21	January-21	January-21
Unadjusted Sales Price		\$85,000	\$47,000	\$23,000	\$20,000
Usable Square Feet	38,333	79,279	43,560	34,412	22,216
Unadjusted Sales Price per Us	sable Sq. Ft.	\$1.07	\$1.08	\$0.67	\$0.90
Transactional Adjustments					
Property Rights Conveyed	Easement	Fee Simple	Fee Simple	Fee Simple	Fee Simple
Adjusted Sales Price		\$1.07	\$1.08	\$0.67	\$0.90
Financing Terms	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller	Cash to Seller
Adjusted Sales Price		\$1.07	\$1.08	\$0.67	\$0.90
Conditions of Sale	Typical	Arm's Length	Arm's Length	Arm's Length	Arm's Length
Adjusted Sales Price		\$1.07	\$1.08	\$0.67	\$0.90
Expenditures after Sale					
Adjusted Sales Price		\$1.07	\$1.08	\$0.67	\$0.90
Market Conditions Adjustme	nts				
Elapsed Time from Date of	Value	0.48 years	0.77 years	1.64 years	1.71 years
Market Trend Through	September-22	1.9%	3.1%	6.6%	6.8%
Analyzed Sales Price		\$1.09	\$1.11	\$0.71	\$0.96
Physical Adjustments					
Location	Hemlock Drive	Highway 44	190 Old Preston Highway S	Devin Road	141 Spruce Street
	Shepherdsville,	Sheperdsville,	Shepherdsville,	Brooks, Kentucky	Shepherdsville,
	Kentucky	Kentucky	Kentucky		Kentucky
Adjustment		-	-	25.0%	10.0%
Size	38,333 sf	79,279 sf	43,560 sf	34,412 sf	22,216 sf
Adjustment		5.0%	1.0%	-1.0%	-4.0%
Floodplain	AE, X	X Shaded	AE	X	AE
Adjustment		-5.0%	-	-10.0%	-
Net Physical Adjustment		-	1.0%	14.0%	6.0%
Adjusted Sales Price per Usable Square Foot		\$1.09	\$1.12	\$0.81	\$1.02



#### Conclusion

From the market data available, we used four land sales in competitive market areas which were adjusted based on pertinent elements of comparison. The following table summarizes the unadjusted and adjusted unit prices:

#### Land Sale Statistics

Metric	Unadjusted	Analyzed	Adjusted
Min. Sales Price per Usable Square Foot	\$0.67	\$0.71	\$0.81
Max. Sales Price per Usable Square Foot	\$1.08	\$1.11	\$1.12
Median Sales Price per Usable Square Foot	\$0.99	\$1.03	\$1.06
Mean Sales Price per Usable Square Foot	\$0.93	\$0.97	\$1.01

Based on the adjusted prices and the most comparable sale, a unit value for the subject property is near the middle of the adjusted range, or \$1.00 per usable square foot. Thus, the estimated "Across the Fence Value" of the Fee Simple Interest in the subject easements is calculated to be \$95,000.

## Valuation of the Fee Simple Area

Based on the adjusted prices and the most comparable sale, a unit value for the subject property is near the middle of the adjusted range, or \$1.00 per usable square foot. Thus, based upon the assumptions, reasoning and comparable data discussed herein, the estimated "Market Value" of the subject Fee Simple area is calculated as follows:

## **Calculation of Fee Simple Value**

Site Area		Unit Value	Unit Value	
38,333 Square Feet	Х	\$1.00	=	\$38,000

## Valuation of the Easement

The use to which the subject easements will be put to is for underground water and sewer pipes. As such, little or no surface improvements will be possible, but access across the surface will be allowed. It is my opinion, therefore, that such an easement will encumber approximately 40% of the ownership rights in the subject.

Thus, based upon the assumptions, reasoning and comparable data discussed herein, the estimated "Market Value" of the subject easements is calculated as follows:

#### **Calculation of Easement Value**

							Indicated Value of
Site Area		Unit Value		Market Value of Fee		Easement Use	Easement
95,396 square feet	Х	\$1.00 PSF	=	\$95,000	Х	40%	\$38,000

## Exposure Time and Marketing Period

Based on statistical information about days on market, escrow length, and marketing times gathered through national investor surveys, sales verification, and interviews of market participants, marketing and exposure time estimates of six months or less and six months or less, respectively, are considered reasonable and appropriate for the subject property.

© 2022 VALBRIDGE PROPERTY ADVISORS | New Orleans



## **General Assumptions and Limiting Conditions**

This appraisal is subject to the following general assumptions and limiting conditions:

- 1. The legal description if furnished to us is assumed to be correct.
- 2. No responsibility is assumed for legal matters, questions of survey or title, soil or subsoil conditions, engineering, availability or capacity of utilities, or other similar technical matters. The appraisal does not constitute a survey of the property appraised. All existing liens and encumbrances have been disregarded and the property is appraised as though free and clear, under responsible ownership and competent management unless otherwise noted.
- 3. Unless otherwise noted, the appraisal will value the property as though free of contamination. Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans will conduct no hazardous materials or contamination inspection of any kind. It is recommended that the client hire an expert if the presence of hazardous materials or contamination poses any concern.
- 4. The stamps and/or consideration placed on deeds used to indicate sales are in correct relationship to the actual dollar amount of the transaction.
- 5. Unless otherwise noted, it is assumed there are no encroachments, zoning violations or restrictions existing in the subject property.
- 6. The appraiser is not required to give testimony or attendance in court by reason of this appraisal, unless previous arrangements have been made.
- 7. Unless expressly specified in the engagement letter, the fee for this appraisal does not include the attendance or giving of testimony by Appraiser at any court, regulatory or other proceedings, or any conferences or other work in preparation for such proceeding. If any partner or employee of Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans is asked or required to appear and/or testify at any deposition, trial, or other proceeding about the preparation, conclusions or any other aspect of this assignment, client shall compensate Appraiser for the time spent by the partner or employee in appearing and/or testifying and in preparing to testify according to the Appraiser's then current hourly rate plus reimbursement of expenses.
- 8. The values for land and/or improvements, as contained in this report, are constituent parts of the total value reported and neither is (or are) to be used in making a summation appraisal of a combination of values created by another appraiser. Either is invalidated if so used.
- 9. The dates of value to which the opinions expressed in this report apply are set forth in this report. We assume no responsibility for economic or physical factors occurring at some point at a later date, which may affect the opinions stated herein. The forecasts, projections, or operating estimates contained herein are based on current market conditions and anticipated short-term supply and demand factors and are subject to change with future conditions. Appraiser is not responsible for determining whether the date of value requested by Client is appropriate for Client's intended use.
- 10. The sketches, maps, plats and exhibits in this report are included to assist the reader in visualizing the property. The appraiser has made no survey of the property and assumed no responsibility in connection with such matters.
- 11. The information, estimates and opinions, which were obtained from sources outside of this office, are considered reliable. However, no liability for them can be assumed by the appraiser.



- 12. Possession of this report, or a copy thereof, does not carry with it the right of publication. Neither all, nor any part of the content of the report, or copy thereof (including conclusions as to property value, the identity of the appraisers, professional designations, reference to any professional appraisal organization or the firm with which the appraisers are connected), shall be disseminated to the public through advertising, public relations, news, sales, or other media without prior written consent and approval.
- 13. No claim is intended to be expressed for matters of expertise that would require specialized investigation or knowledge beyond that ordinarily employed by real estate appraisers. We claim no expertise in areas such as, but not limited to, legal, survey, structural, environmental, pest control, mechanical, etc.
- 14. This appraisal was prepared for the sole and exclusive use of the client for the function outlined herein. Any party who is not the client or intended user identified in the appraisal or engagement letter is not entitled to rely upon the contents of the appraisal without express written consent of Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans and Client. The Client shall not include partners, affiliates, or relatives of the party addressed herein. The appraiser assumes no obligation, liability or accountability to any third party.
- 15. Distribution of this report is at the sole discretion of the client, but third-parties not listed as an intended user on the face of the appraisal or the engagement letter may not rely upon the contents of the appraisal. In no event shall client give a third-party a partial copy of the appraisal report. We will make no distribution of the report without the specific direction of the client.
- 16. This appraisal shall be used only for the function outlined herein, unless expressly authorized by Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans.
- 17. This appraisal shall be considered in its entirety. No part thereof shall be used separately or out of context.
- 18. Unless otherwise noted in the body of this report, this appraisal assumes that the subject property does not fall within the areas where mandatory flood insurance is effective. Unless otherwise noted, we have not completed nor have we contracted to have completed an investigation to identify and/or quantify the presence of non-tidal wetland conditions on the subject property. Because the appraiser is not a surveyor, he or she makes no guarantees, express or implied, regarding this determination.
- 19. The flood maps are not site specific. We are not qualified to confirm the location of the subject property in relation to flood hazard areas based on the FEMA Flood Insurance Rate Maps or other surveying techniques. It is recommended that the client obtain a confirmation of the subject property's flood zone classification from a licensed surveyor.
- 20. If the appraisal is for mortgage loan purposes 1) we assume satisfactory completion of improvements if construction is not complete, 2) no consideration has been given for rent loss during rent-up unless noted in the body of this report, and 3) occupancy at levels consistent with our "Income and Expense Projection" are anticipated.
- 21. It is assumed that there are no hidden or unapparent conditions of the property, subsoil, or structures which would render it more or less valuable. No responsibility is assumed for such conditions or for engineering which may be required to discover them.



- 22. Our inspection included an observation of the land and improvements thereon only. It was not possible to observe conditions beneath the soil or hidden structural components within the improvements. We inspected the buildings involved, and reported damage (if any) by termites, dry rot, wet rot, or other infestations as a matter of information, and no guarantee of the amount or degree of damage (if any) is implied. Condition of heating, cooling, ventilation, electrical and plumbing equipment is considered to be commensurate with the condition of the balance of the improvements unless otherwise stated. Should the client have concerns in these areas, it is the client's responsibility to order the appropriate inspections. The appraiser does not have the skill or expertise to make such inspections and assumes no responsibility for these items.
- 23. This appraisal does not guarantee compliance with building code and life safety code requirements of the local jurisdiction. It is assumed that all required licenses, consents, certificates of occupancy or other legislative or administrative authority from any local, state or national governmental or private entity or organization have been or can be obtained or renewed for any use on which the value conclusion contained in this report is based unless specifically stated to the contrary.
- 24. When possible, we have relied upon building measurements provided by the client, owner, or associated agents of these parties. In the absence of a detailed rent roll, reliable public records, or "as-built" plans provided to us, we have relied upon our own measurements of the subject improvements. We follow typical appraisal industry methods; however, we recognize that some factors may limit our ability to obtain accurate measurements including, but not limited to, property access on the day of inspection, basements, fenced/gated areas, grade elevations, greenery/shrubbery, uneven surfaces, multiple story structures, obtuse or acute wall angles, immobile obstructions, etc. Professional building area measurements of the quality, level of detail, or accuracy of professional measurement services are beyond the scope of this appraisal assignment.
- 25. We have attempted to reconcile sources of data discovered or provided during the appraisal process, including assessment department data. Ultimately, the measurements that are deemed by us to be the most accurate and/or reliable are used within this report. While the measurements and any accompanying sketches are considered to be reasonably accurate and reliable, we cannot guarantee their accuracy. Should the client desire more precise measurement, they are urged to retain the measurement services of a qualified professional (space planner, architect or building engineer) as an alternative source. If this alternative measurement source reflects or reveals substantial differences with the measurements used within the report, upon request of the client, the appraiser will submit a revised report for an additional fee.
- 26. In the absence of being provided with a detailed land survey, we have used assessment department data to ascertain the physical dimensions and acreage of the property. Should a survey prove this information to be inaccurate, upon request of the client, the appraiser will submit a revised report for an additional fee.
- 27. If only preliminary plans and specifications were available for use in the preparation of this appraisal, and a review of the final plans and specifications reveals substantial differences upon request of the client the appraiser will submit a revised report for an additional fee.


- 28. Unless otherwise stated in this report, the value conclusion is predicated on the assumption that the property is free of contamination, environmental impairment or hazardous materials. Unless otherwise stated, the existence of hazardous material was not observed by the appraiser and the appraiser has no knowledge of the existence of such materials on or in the property. The appraiser, however, is not qualified to detect such substances. The presence of substances such as asbestos, urea-formaldehyde foam insulation or other potentially hazardous materials may affect the value of the property. No responsibility is assumed for any such conditions, or for any expertise or engineering knowledge required for discovery. The client is urged to retain an expert in this field, if desired.
- 29. The Americans with Disabilities Act ("ADA") became effective January 26, 1992. We have not made a specific compliance survey of the property to determine if it is in conformity with the various requirements of the ADA. It is possible that a compliance survey of the property, together with an analysis of the requirements of the ADA, could reveal that the property is not in compliance with one or more of the requirements of the Act. If so, this could have a negative effect on the value of the property. Since we have no direct evidence relating to this issue, we did not consider possible noncompliance with the requirements of ADA in developing an opinion of value.
- 30. This appraisal applies to the land and building improvements only. The value of trade fixtures, furnishings, and other equipment, or subsurface rights (minerals, gas, and oil) were not considered in this appraisal unless specifically stated to the contrary.
- 31. No changes in any federal, state or local laws, regulations or codes (including, without limitation, the Internal Revenue Code) are anticipated, unless specifically stated to the contrary.
- 32. Any income and expense estimates contained in the appraisal report are used only for the purpose of estimating value and do not constitute prediction of future operating results. Furthermore, it is inevitable that some assumptions will not materialize and that unanticipated events may occur that will likely affect actual performance.
- 33. Any estimate of insurable value, if included within the scope of work and presented herein, is based upon figures developed consistent with industry practices. However, actual local and regional construction costs may vary significantly from our estimate and individual insurance policies and underwriters have varied specifications, exclusions, and non-insurable items. As such, we strongly recommend that the Client obtain estimates from professionals experienced in establishing insurance coverage. This analysis should not be relied upon to determine insurance coverage and we make no warranties regarding the accuracy of this estimate.
- 34. The data gathered in the course of this assignment (except data furnished by the Client) shall remain the property of the Appraiser. The appraiser will not violate the confidential nature of the appraiserclient relationship by improperly disclosing any confidential information furnished to the appraiser. Notwithstanding the foregoing, the Appraiser is authorized by the client to disclose all or any portion of the appraisal and related appraisal data to appropriate representatives of the Appraisal Institute if such disclosure is required to enable the appraiser to comply with the Bylaws and Regulations of such Institute now or hereafter in effect.



- 35. You and Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans both agree that any dispute over matters in excess of \$5,000 will be submitted for resolution by arbitration. This includes fee disputes and any claim of malpractice. The arbitrator shall be mutually selected. If Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans and the client cannot agree on the arbitrator, the presiding head of the Local County Mediation & Arbitration panel shall select the arbitrator. Such arbitration shall be binding and final. In agreeing to arbitration, we both acknowledge that, by agreeing to binding arbitration, each of us is giving up the right to have the dispute decided in a court of law before a judge or jury. In the event that the client, or any other party, makes a claim against Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans or any of its employees in connections with or in any way relating to this assignment, the maximum damages recoverable by such claimant shall be the amount actually received by Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans for this assignment, and under no circumstances shall any claim for consequential damages be made.
- 36. Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans shall have no obligation, liability, or accountability to any third party. Any party who is not the "client" or intended user identified on the face of the appraisal or in the engagement letter is not entitled to rely upon the contents of the appraisal without the express written consent of Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans. "Client" shall not include partners, affiliates, or relatives of the party named in the engagement letter. Client shall hold Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans and its employees harmless in the event of any lawsuit brought by any third party, lender, partner, or part-owner in any form of ownership or any other party as a result of this assignment. The client also agrees that in case of lawsuit arising from or in any way involving these appraisal services, client will hold Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans harmless from and against any liability, loss, cost, or expense incurred or suffered by Valbridge Property Advisors | New Orleans in such action, regardless of its outcome.
- 37. The Valbridge Property Advisors office responsible for the preparation of this report is independently owned and operated by VPA of South Louisiana, Inc.. Neither Valbridge Property Advisors, Inc., nor any of its affiliates has been engaged to provide this report. Valbridge Property Advisors, Inc. does not provide valuation services, and has taken no part in the preparation of this report.
- 38. If any claim is filed against any of Valbridge Property Advisors, Inc., a Florida Corporation, its affiliates, officers or employees, or the firm providing this report, in connection with, or in any way arising out of, or relating to, this report, or the engagement of the firm providing this report, then (1) under no circumstances shall such claimant be entitled to consequential, special or other damages, except only for direct compensatory damages, and (2) the maximum amount of such compensatory damages recoverable by such claimant shall be the amount actually received by the firm engaged to provide this report.
- 39. This report and any associated work files may be subject to evaluation by Valbridge Property Advisors, Inc., or its affiliates, for quality control purposes.
- 40. Acceptance and/or use of this appraisal report constitutes acceptance of the foregoing general assumptions and limiting conditions.
- 41. The global outbreak of a "novel coronavirus" (known as COVID-19) was officially declared a pandemic by the World Health Organization (WHO). It is currently unknown what direct, or indirect, effect, if any, this event may have on the national economy, the local economy or the market in which the subject property is located. The reader is cautioned, and reminded that the conclusions presented in this appraisal report apply only as of the effective date(s) indicated. The appraiser makes no representation as to the effect on the subject property of this event, or any event, subsequent to the effective date of the appraisal.



# **Certification – Arthur L. Schwertz**

I certify that, to the best of my knowledge and belief:

- 1. The statements of fact contained in this report are true and correct.
- 2. The reported analyses, opinions, and conclusions are limited only by the reported assumptions and limiting conditions and are my personal, impartial, and unbiased professional analyses, opinions, and conclusions.
- 3. I have no present or prospective interest in the property that is the subject of this report and no personal interest with respect to the parties involved.
- 4. The undersigned has not performed services regarding the property that is the subject of this report within the three-year period immediately preceding acceptance of this assignment.
- 5. I have no bias with respect to the property that is the subject of this report or to the parties involved with this assignment.
- 6. My engagement in this assignment was not contingent upon developing or reporting predetermined results.
- 7. My compensation for completing this assignment is not contingent upon the development or reporting of a predetermined value or direction in value that favors the cause of the client, the amount of value opinion, the attainment of a stipulated result, or the occurrence of a subsequent event directly related to the intended use of this appraisal.
- 8. My analyses, opinions and conclusions were developed, and this report has been prepared, in conformity with the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice.
- 9. Arthur L. Schwertz did not personally inspected the subject property.
- 10. R. Carter Higdon provided significant real property appraisal assistance to the person signing this certification.
- 11. The reported analyses, opinions and conclusions were developed, and this report has been prepared, in conformity with the requirements of the Code of Professional Ethics and Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice of the Appraisal Institute.
- 12. The use of this report is subject to the requirements of the Appraisal Institute relating to review by its duly authorized representatives.
- 13. As of the date of this report, the undersigned has completed the continuing education program for Designated Members of the Appraisal Institute.

2

Arthur L. Schwertz, MAI Senior Managing Director Kentucky Certified General Real Property Appraiser #5470



WOODLAND ACRES UTILITIES CERTIFICATION

WOODLAND ACRES UTILITIES ADDENDA



# Addenda

Glossary

Qualifications

Arthur L. Schwertz, MAI - Senior Managing Director

Information on Valbridge Property Advisors

Office Locations



## Glossary

Definitions are taken from The Dictionary of Real Estate Appraisal, 6<sup>th</sup> Edition (Dictionary), the Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP), and Building Owners and Managers Association International (BOMA).

## Absolute Net Lease

A lease in which the tenant pays all expenses including structural maintenance, building reserves, and management; often a long-term lease to a credit tenant. (Dictionary)

#### Amortization

The process of retiring a debt or recovering a capital investment, typically through scheduled, systematic repayment of the principal; a program of periodic contributions to a sinking fund or debt retirement fund. (Dictionary)

#### As Is Market Value

The estimate of the market value of real property in its current physical condition, use, and zoning as of the appraisal date. (Dictionary)

#### Base Rent

The minimum rent stipulated in a lease. (Dictionary)

#### Base Year

The year on which escalation clauses in a lease are based. (Dictionary)

#### **Building Common Area**

In office buildings, the areas of the building that provide services to building tenants but which are not included in the office area or store area of any specific tenant. These areas may include, but shall not be limited to, main and auxiliary lobbies, atrium spaces at the level of the finished floor, concierge areas or security desks, conference rooms, lounges or vending areas, food service facilities, health or fitness centers, daycare facilities, locker or shower facilities, mail rooms, fire control rooms, fully enclosed courtyards outside the exterior walls, and building core and service areas such as fully enclosed mechanical or equipment rooms. Specifically excluded from building common area are floor common areas, parking space, portions of loading docks outside the building line, and major vertical penetrations. (BOMA)

#### **Building Rentable Area**

The sum of all floor rentable areas. Floor rentable area is the result of subtracting from the gross measured area of a floor the major vertical penetrations on that same floor. It is generally fixed for the life of the building and is rarely affected by changes in corridor size or configuration. (BOMA)

#### **Bulk Value**

The value of multiple units, subdivided plots, or properties in a portfolio as though sold together in a single transaction.

#### Certificate of Occupancy (COO)

A formal written acknowledgment by an appropriate unit of local government that a new construction or renovation project is at the stage where it meets applicable health and safety codes and is ready for commercial or residential occupancy. (Dictionary)

#### Common Area Maintenance (CAM)

The expense of operating and maintaining common areas; may or may not include management charges and usually does not include capital expenditures on tenant improvements or other improvements to the property. (Dictionary)

The amount of money charged to tenants for their shares of maintaining a [shopping] center's common area. The charge that a tenant pays for shared services and facilities such as electricity, security, and maintenance of parking lots. Items charged to common area maintenance may include cleaning services, parking lot sweeping and maintenance, snow removal, security and upkeep. (ICSC – International Council of Shopping Centers, 4<sup>th</sup> Ed.)

#### Condominium

A multiunit structure, or a unit within such a structure, with a condominium form of ownership. (Dictionary)

#### **Conservation Easement**

An interest in real estate restricting future land use to preservation, conservation, wildlife habitat, or some combination of those uses. A conservation easement may permit farming, timber harvesting, or other uses of a rural nature as well as some types of conservation-oriented development to continue, subject to the easement. (Dictionary)

## Contributory Value

A type of value that reflects the amount a property or component of a property contributes to the value of another asset or to the property as a whole.

The change in the value of a property as a whole, whether positive or negative, resulting from the addition or deletion of a property component. Also called deprival value in some countries. (Dictionary)



## Debt Coverage Ratio (DCR)

The ratio of net operating income to annual debt service (DCR = NOI/Im), which measures the relative ability of a property to meet its debt service out of net operating income; also called *debt service coverage ratio (DSCR)*. A larger *DCR* typically indicates a greater ability for a property to withstand a reduction of income, providing an improved safety margin for a lender. (Dictionary)

#### **Deed Restriction**

A provision written into a deed that limits the use of land. Deed restrictions usually remain in effect when title passes to subsequent owners. (Dictionary)

#### Depreciation

In appraisal, a loss in property value from any cause; the difference between the cost of an improvement on the effective date of the appraisal and the market value of the improvement on the same date.

In accounting, an allocation of the original cost of an asset, amortizing the cost over the asset's life; calculated using a variety of standard techniques. (Dictionary)

#### **Disposition Value**

The most probable price that a specified interest in property should bring under the following conditions:

- Consummation of a sale within a specified time, which is shorter than the typical exposure time for such a property in that market.
- The property is subjected to market conditions prevailing as of the date of valuation;
- Both the buyer and seller are acting prudently and knowledgeably;
- The seller is under compulsion to sell;
- The buyer is typically motivated;
- Both parties are acting in what they consider to be their best interests;
- An adequate marketing effort will be made during the exposure time;
- Payment will be made in cash in U.S. dollars (or the local currency) or in terms of financial arrangements comparable thereto; and
- The price represents the normal consideration for the property sold, unaffected by special or creative financing or sales concessions granted by anyone associated with the sale. (Dictionary)

#### Double Net (Net Net) Lease

An alternative term for a type of net lease. In some markets, a net net lease is defined as a lease in which the tenant is responsible to pay both property taxes and premiums for insuring the building(s). (Valbridge) (The market definition of a double net lease varies depending on the market)

#### Easement

The right to use another's land for a stated purpose. (Dictionary)

#### EIFS

Exterior Insulation Finishing System. This is a type of exterior wall cladding system. Sometimes referred to as dry-vit.

#### Effective Date

The date on which the appraisal or review opinion applies. (SVP)

In a lease document, the date upon which the lease goes into effect. (Dictionary)

## Effective Gross Income (EGI)

The anticipated income from all operations of the real estate after an allowance is made for vacancy and collection losses and an addition is made for any other income. (Dictionary)

#### **Effective Rent**

Total base rent, or minimum rent stipulated in a lease, over the specified lease term minus rent concessions; the rent that is effectively paid by a tenant net of financial concessions provided by a landlord. (TIs). (Dictionary)

#### EPDM

Ethylene Propylene Diene Monomer Rubber. A type of synthetic rubber typically used for roof coverings. (Dictionary)

## **Escalation Clause**

A clause in an agreement that provides for the adjustment of a price or rent based on some event or index. e.g., a provision to increase rent if operating expenses increase; also called *escalator clause, expense recovery clause or stop clause*. (Dictionary)

## **Estoppel Certificate**

A signed statement by a party (such as a tenant or a mortgagee) certifying, for another's benefit, that certain facts are correct, such as that a lease exists, that there are no defaults, and that rent is paid to a certain date. (Black's) In real estate, a buyer of rental property typically requests estoppel certificates from existing tenants. Sometimes referred to as an *estoppel letter*. (Dictionary)

#### **Excess Land**

Land that is not needed to serve or support the existing use. The highest and best use of the excess land may or may not be the same as the highest and best use of the improved parcel. Excess land has the potential to be sold separately and is valued separately. (Dictionary)



#### **Excess Rent**

The amount by which contract rent exceeds market rent at the time of the appraisal; created by a lease favorable to the landlord (lessor) and may reflect unusual management, unknowledgeable or unusually motivated parties, a lease execution in an earlier, stronger rental market, or an agreement of the parties. (Dictionary)

#### **Expense Stop**

A clause in a lease that limits the landlord's expense obligation, which results in the lessee paying operating expenses above a stated level or amount. (Dictionary)

#### **Exposure Time**

The time a property remains on the market. The estimated length of time that the property interest being appraised would have been offered on the market prior to the hypothetical consummation of a sale at market value on the effective date of the appraisal;

**<u>Comment</u>:** Exposure time is a retrospective opinion based on an analysis of past events assuming a competitive and open market. (Dictionary)

#### **Extraordinary Assumption**

An assignment-specific assumption as of the effective date regarding uncertain information used in an analysis which, if found to be false, could alter the appraiser's opinions or conclusions.

**Comment:** Uncertain information might include physical, legal, or economic characteristics of the subject property; or conditions external to the property, such as market conditions or trends; or the integrity of data used in an analysis. (USPAP)

#### Fee Simple Estate

Absolute ownership unencumbered by any other interest or estate, subject only to the limitations imposed by the governmental powers of taxation, eminent domain, police power, and escheat. (Dictionary)

#### Floor Common Area

In an office building, the areas on a floor such as washrooms, janitorial closets, electrical rooms, telephone rooms, mechanical rooms, elevator lobbies, and public corridors which are available primarily for the use of tenants on that floor. (BOMA)

#### Full Service (Gross) Lease

A lease in which the landlord receives stipulated rent and is obligated to pay all of the property's operating and fixed expenses; also called a *full service lease*. (Dictionary)

#### Furniture, Fixtures, and Equipment (FF&E)

Business trade fixtures and personal property, exclusive of inventory. (Dictionary)

#### Going-Concern Value

An outdated label for the market value of all the tangible and intangible assets of an established and operating business with an indefinite life, as if sold in aggregate; more accurately termed the *market value of the going concern* or *market value of the total assets of the business*. (Dictionary)

#### Gross Building Area (GBA)

Total floor area of a building, excluding unenclosed areas, measured from the exterior of the walls of the abovegrade area. This includes mezzanines and basements if and when typically included in the market area of the type of property involved.

#### Gross leasable area plus all common areas.

For residential space, the total area of all floor levels measured from the exterior of the walls and including the superstructure and substructure basement; typically does not include garage space. (Dictionary)

#### Gross Measured Area

The total area of a building enclosed by the dominant portion (the portion of the inside finished surface of the permanent outer building wall which is 50 percent or more of the vertical floor-to-ceiling dimension, at the given point being measured as one moves horizontally along the wall), excluding parking areas and loading docks (or portions of same) outside the building line. It is generally not used for leasing purposes and is calculated on a floor by floor basis. (BOMA)

#### Gross Up Method

A method of calculating variable operating expenses in income-producing properties when less than 100% occupancy is assumed. Expenses reimbursed based on the amount of occupied space, rather than on the total building area, are described as "grossed up." (Dictionary)

#### **Gross Retail Sellout**

The sum of the separate and distinct market value opinions for each of the units in a condominium, subdivision development, or portfolio of properties, as of the date of valuation. The aggregate of retail values does not represent the value of all the units as though sold together in a single transaction; it is simply the total of the individual market value conclusions. Also called the aggregate of the retail values, aggregate retail selling price or sum of the retail values. (Dictionary)

#### Ground Lease

A lease that grants the right to use and occupy land. Improvements made by the ground lessee typically revert to the ground lessor at the end of the lease term. (Dictionary)



#### Ground Rent

The rent paid for the right to use and occupy land according to the terms of a ground lease; the portion of the total rent allocated to the underlying land. (Dictionary)

## HVAC

Heating, ventilation, air conditioning (HVAC) system. A unit that regulates the temperature and distribution of heat and fresh air throughout a building. (Dictionary)

#### Highest and Best Use

The reasonably probable use of property that results in the highest value. The four criteria that the highest and best use must meet are legal permissibility, physical possibility, financial feasibility, and maximum productivity.

The use of an asset that maximizes its potential and that is possible, legally permissible, and financially feasible. The highest and best use may be for continuation of an asset's existing use of for some alternative use. This is determined by the use that a market participant would have in mind for the asset when formulating the price that it would be willing to bid. (IVS)

[The] highest and most profitable use for which the property is adaptable and needed or likely to be needed in the reasonably near future. (Uniform Appraisal Standards for Federal Land Acquisitions) (Dictionary)

#### Hypothetical Condition

A condition, directly related to a specific assignment, which is contrary to what is known by the appraiser to exist on the effective date of the assignment results, but is used for the purpose of analysis.

**Comment:** Hypothetical conditions are contrary to known facts about physical, legal, or economic characteristics of the subject property; or about conditions external to the property, such as market conditions or trends; or about the integrity of data used in an analysis. (USPAP)

#### Insurable Value

A type of value for insurance purposes. (Typically this includes replacement cost less basement excavation, foundation, underground piping and architect's fees). (Dictionary)

#### Investment Value

The value of a property to a particular investor or class of investors based on the investor's specific requirements. Investment value may be different from market value because it depends on a set of investment criteria that are not necessarily typical of the market. (Dictionary)

#### Just Compensation

In condemnation, the amount of loss for which a property owner is compensated when his or her property is taken. Just compensation should put the owner in as good a position pecuniarily as he or she would have been if the property had not been taken. (Dictionary)

#### Leased Fee Interest

The ownership interest held by the lessor, which includes the right to receive the contract rent specified in the lease plus the reversionary right when the lease expires. (Dictionary)

#### Leasehold Interest

The right held by the lessee to use and occupy real estate for a stated term and under the conditions specified in the lease. (Dictionary)

See also Positive Leasehold and Negative Leasehold.

#### Lessee (Tenant)

One who has the right to occupancy and use of the property of another for a period of time according to a lease agreement. (Dictionary)

#### Lessor (Landlord)

One who conveys the rights of occupancy and use to others under a lease agreement. (Dictionary)

#### Liquidation Value

The most probable price that a specified interest in property should bring under the following conditions:

- Consummation of a sale within a short time period.
- The property is subjected to market conditions prevailing as of the date of valuation.
- Both the buyer and seller are acting prudently and knowledgeably.
- The seller is under extreme compulsion to sell.
- The buyer is typically motivated.
- Both parties are acting in what they consider to be their best interests.
- A normal marketing effort is not possible due to the brief exposure time.
- Payment will be made in cash in U.S. dollars (or the local currency) or in terms of financial arrangements comparable thereto.

The price represents the normal consideration for the property sold, unaffected by special or creative financing or sales concessions granted by anyone associated with the sale. (Dictionary)



#### Loan to Value Ratio (LTV)

The ratio between a mortgage loan and the value of the property pledged as security, usually expressed as a percentage. (Dictionary)

#### **Major Vertical Penetrations**

Stairs, elevator shafts, flues, pipe shafts, vertical ducts, and the like, and their enclosing walls. Atria, lightwells and similar penetrations above the finished floor are included in this definition. Not included, however, are vertical penetrations built for the private use of a tenant occupying office areas on more than one floor. Structural columns, openings for vertical electric cable or telephone distribution, and openings for plumbing lines are not considered to be major vertical penetrations. (BOMA)

#### Market Rent

The most probable rent that a property should bring in a competitive and open market under all the conditions requisite to a fair lease transaction, the lessee and the lessor each acting prudently and knowledgeably, and assuming the rent is not affected by undue stimulus. Implicit in this definition is the execution of a lease as of a specified date under conditions whereby:

Lessee and lessor are typically motivated;

Both parties are well informed or well advised, and acting in what they consider their best interests;

Payment is made in terms of cash or in terms of financial arrangements comparable thereto; and

The rent reflects specified terms and conditions, such as permitted uses, use restrictions, expense obligations, duration, concessions, rental adjustments and revaluations, renewal and purchase options, and tenant improvements (TIs). (Appraisal Institute)

#### Market Value

The most probable price that a property should bring in a competitive and open market under all conditions requisite to a fair sale, the buyer and seller each acting prudently and knowledgeably, and assuming the price is not affected by undue stimulus. Implicit in this definition is the consummation of a sale as of a specified date and the passing of title from seller to buyer under conditions whereby:

- Buyer and seller are typically motivated;
- Both parties are well informed or well advised, and acting in what they consider their own best interests;
- A reasonable time is allowed for exposure in the open market;
- Payment is made in terms of cash in United States dollars or in terms of financial arrangements comparable thereto; and
- The price represents the normal consideration for the property sold unaffected by special or creative

financing or sales concessions granted by anyone associated with the sale. (Dictionary)

## Marketing Time

An opinion of the amount of time it might take to sell a real or personal property interest at the concluded market value level during the period immediately after the effective date of an appraisal. Marketing time differs from exposure time, which is always presumed to precede the effective date of an appraisal. (Advisory Opinion 7 of the Appraisal Standards Board of the Appraisal Foundation)

#### Master Lease

A lease in which the fee owner leases a part or the entire property to a single entity (the master lease) in return for a stipulated rent. The master lessee then leases the property to multiple tenants. (Dictionary)

#### **Modified Gross Lease**

A lease in which the landlord receives stipulated rent and is obligated to pay some, but not all, of the property's operating and fixed expenses. Since assignment of expenses varies among modified gross leases, expense responsibility must always be specified. In some markets, a modified gross lease may be called a *double net lease*, *net net lease*, *partial net lease*, *or semi-gross lease*. (Dictionary)

#### Negative Leasehold

A lease situation in which the market rent is less than the contract rent. (Dictionary)

## **Operating Expense Ratio**

The ratio of total operating expenses to effective gross income (TOE/EGI); the complement of the net income ratio, i.e., OER = 1 - NIR (Dictionary)

## Option

A legal contract, typically purchased for a stated consideration, that permits but does not require the holder of the option (known as the *optionee*) to buy, sell, or lease real estate for a stipulated period of time in accordance with specified terms; a unilateral right to exercise a privilege. (Dictionary)

#### **Partial Interest**

Divided or undivided rights in real estate that represent less than the whole, i.e., a fractional interest such as a tenancy in common, easement, or life interest. (Dictionary)

#### Pass Through

A tenant's portion of operating expenses that may be composed of common area maintenance (CAM), real property taxes, property insurance, and any other expenses determined in the lease agreement to be paid by the tenant. (Dictionary)



#### Percentage Lease

A lease in which the rent or some portion of the rent represents a specified percentage of the volume of business, productivity, or use achieved by the tenant. (Dictionary)

#### **Positive Leasehold**

A lease situation in which the market rent is greater than the contract rent. (Dictionary)

#### Potential Gross Income (PGI)

The total income attributable to property at full occupancy before vacancy and operating expenses are deducted. (Dictionary)

#### Prospective Future Value Upon Completion

A prospective market value may be appropriate for the valuation of a property interest related to a credit decision for a proposed development or renovation project. According to USPAP, an appraisal with a prospective market value reflects an effective date that is subsequent to the date of the appraisal report. ... The prospective market value –as completed- reflects the property's market value as of the time that development is expected to be complete. (Dictionary)

#### Prospective Future Value Upon Stabilization

A prospective market value may be appropriate for the valuation of a property interest related to a credit decision for a proposed development or renovation project. According to USPAP, an appraisal with a prospective market value reflects an effective date that is subsequent to the date of the appraisal report ...The prospective market value – as stabilized – reflects the property's market value as of the time the property is projected to achieve stabilized occupancy. For an income-producing property, stabilized occupancy is the occupancy level that a property is expected to achieve after the property is exposed to the market for lease over a reasonable period of time and at comparable terms and conditions to other similar properties. (Dictionary)

#### Replacement Cost

The estimated cost to construct, at current prices as of a specific date, a substitute for a building or other improvements, using modern materials and current standards, design, and layout. (Dictionary)

#### **Reproduction Cost**

The estimated cost to construct, at current prices as of the effective date of the appraisal, an exact duplicate or replica of the building being appraised, using the same materials, construction standards, design, layout, and quality of workmanship and embodying all of the deficiencies, superadequacies, and obsolescence of the subject building. (Dictionary)

#### **Retrospective Value Opinion**

A value opinion effective as of a specified historical date. The term *retrospective* does not define a type of value. Instead, it identifies a value opinion as being effective at some specific prior date. Value as of a historical date is frequently sought in connection with property tax appeals, damage models, lease renegotiation, deficiency judgments, estate tax, and condemnation. Inclusion of the type of value with this term is appropriate, e.g., "retrospective market value opinion." (Dictionary)

#### Sandwich Leasehold Estate

The interest held by the sandwich leaseholder when the property is subleased to another party; a type of leasehold estate. (Dictionary)

#### Sublease

An agreement in which the lessee in a prior lease conveys the right of use and occupancy of a property to another, the sublessee, for a specific period of time, which may or may not be coterminous with the underlying lease term. (Dictionary)

#### Subordination

A contractual arrangement in which a party with a claim to certain assets agrees to make his or her claim junior, or subordinate, to the claims of another party. (Dictionary)

#### Surplus Land

Land that is not currently needed to support the existing use but cannot be separated from the property and sold off for another use. Surplus land does not have an independent highest and best use and may or may not contribute value to the improved parcel. (Dictionary)

## TPO

Thermoplastic polyolefin, a resilient synthetic roof covering.

#### Triple Net (Net Net Net) Lease

An alternative term for a type of net lease. In some markets, a net net net lease is defined as a lease in which the tenant assumes all expenses (fixed and variable) of operating a property except that the landlord is responsible for structural maintenance, building reserves, and management; also called *NNN lease, net net net lease, or fully net lease.* (Dictionary)

(The market definition of a triple net lease varies; in some cases tenants pay for items such as roof repairs, parking lot repairs, and other similar items.)

#### Usable Area

The measured area of an office area, store area, or building common area on a floor. The total of all the usable areas for a floor shall equal floor usable area of that same floor. (BOMA)



## Value-in-Use

The value of a property assuming a specific use, which may or may not be the property's highest and best use on the effective date of the appraisal. Value in use may or may not be equal to market value but is different conceptually. (Dictionary)

## VTAB

Value of the Total Assets of a Business. The value of a going concern (i.e. the business enterprise). (Dictionary)



WOODLAND ACRES UTILITIES ADDENDA



WOODLAND ACRES UTILITIES ADDENDA



Qualifications of Arthur L. Schwertz, MAI Senior Managing Director Valbridge Property Advisors | South Louisiana

## Independent Valuations for a Variable World

Certified General in: Louisiana Mississippi Alabama Texas Virginia California Arizona Kentucky Tennessee North Carolina Maryland	State Certifications
Mississippi Alabama Texas Virginia California Arizona Kentucky Tennessee North Carolina	Certified General in:
Alabama Texas Virginia California Arizona Kentucky Tennessee North Carolina	Louisiana
Texas Virginia California Arizona Kentucky Tennessee North Carolina	Mississippi
Virginia California Arizona Kentucky Tennessee North Carolina	Alabama
California Arizona Kentucky Tennessee North Carolina	Texas
Arizona Kentucky Tennessee North Carolina	Virginia
Kentucky Tennessee North Carolina	California
Tennessee North Carolina	Arizona
North Carolina	Kentucky
	Tennessee
Maryland	North Carolina
	Maryland

## Education

Bachelor of Arts History Louisiana State University

## **Contact Details**

504-541-5101 (p) 504-541-5107 (f) <u>aschwertz@valbridge.com</u> (e)

Valbridge Property Advisors | South Louisiana 2030 Dickory Avenue Suite 200 New Orleans, LA 70123

www.valbridge.com/south-louisiana



Membership/Affiliations   Member: Appraisal Institute – MAI Designation Louisiana Chapter President, 2017   Member: Celebration Church Administrative Team (Corporate Secretary Appraisal Institute & Related Courses   Continuing education courses taken through the Appraisal Institute and ot estate organizations.   Publications, Seminars Presented, etc.   "Contract or Effective Rent: Finding the Real Rent", Appraisal Institute, Texas, 2019.	ther real
Louisiana Chapter President, 2017   Member: Celebration Church Administrative Team (Corporate Secretary   Appraisal Institute & Related Courses   Continuing education courses taken through the Appraisal Institute and ot estate organizations.   Publications, Seminars Presented, etc.   "Contract or Effective Rent: Finding the Real Rent", Appraisal Institute,	ther real
Member: Celebration Church Administrative Team (Corporate Secretary   Appraisal Institute & Related Courses   Continuing education courses taken through the Appraisal Institute and ot estate organizations.   Publications, Seminars Presented, etc.   "Contract or Effective Rent: Finding the Real Rent", Appraisal Institute,	ther real
Appraisal Institute & Related Courses Continuing education courses taken through the Appraisal Institute and ot estate organizations. <u>Publications, Seminars Presented, etc.</u> "Contract or Effective Rent: Finding the Real Rent", Appraisal Institute,	ther real
Continuing education courses taken through the Appraisal Institute and ot estate organizations. <u>Publications, Seminars Presented, etc.</u> "Contract or Effective Rent: Finding the Real Rent", Appraisal Institute,	
estate organizations. <u>Publications, Seminars Presented, etc.</u> "Contract or Effective Rent: Finding the Real Rent", Appraisal Institute,	
"Contract or Effective Rent: Finding the Real Rent", Appraisal Institute,	Austin,
	, Austin,
"Contract or Effective Rent: Finding the Real Rent", Appraisal Institute Rouge, Louisiana, 2016.	e, Baton
"Appraising Commercial and Complex Properties in an Historic Area", Web the Appraisal Institute, 2015.	oinar for
"The Unique Appraisal: Case Studies in Appraising Special Purpose Prope Connect 2014 (Appraisal Institute's National Meeting), Austin, Texas, 2	
y Schwertz, Arthur L. 2014. "History Lesson", Valuation Magazine 2 <sup>nd</sup> Quarter 12 – 13.	er, 2014,
Huso, Deborah R. 2013. "On the Waterfront", <i>Valuation Magazine 2<sup>nd</sup> Quart</i> 22 – 27. (Contributor)	er, 2013,
<u>Experience</u> Senior Managing Director Valbridge Property Advisors   South Louisiana (2013-Present)	
Valbhuge Froperty Advisors   South Eduisiana (2013-Fresent)	
sors Vice-President Argote, Derbes, Graham, Shuffield & Tatje, Inc. (1992-2013)	
Appraisal/valuation and consulting assignments include (but not limi Single-family, condominium, apartments, vacant land, funeral amphitheaters, live performance theaters, office buildings, hospitals, homes, specialized healthcare, hotels/motels, service stations, retail, ir plants, warehouses, fractional interest valuations, contaminated properties	homes, nursing

plants, warehouses, fractional interest valuations, contaminated properties, special purpose properties (port facilities, nuclear reactor simulator facility, shipyards, etc.), senior residential and healthcare facilities, feasibility studies, market studies, condemnation, construction defects, litigation support, mediations, and review appraisals.

Mr. Schwertz has provided valuation services in a wide variety of complex civil litigation including real estate, land use cases, condemnation, estate matters, property taxation, construction defect, and bankruptcy/creditors matters.

Qualified as an expert witness in Terrebonne, Jefferson, Orleans, and St. Tammany Parishes, Dallas County, Texas, Indiana Board of Tax Review, United States Court of Federal Claims, United States Court for the Eastern District of Louisiana and the United States Bankruptcy Court for the Middle District of Louisiana.



#### ARTHUR L. SCHWERTZ, MAI

#### Designations, Associations and Professional Awards

- Louisiana Certified General Real Estate Appraiser; License No. G-0932
- Mississippi Certified General Real Estate Appraiser; License No. GA-633
- Alabama Certified General Real Estate Appraiser; License No. G00937
- Texas Certified General Real Estate Appraiser, License No. TX-1337393-G
- California Certified General Real Estate Appraiser, License No. 3005682
- Virginia Certified General Real Estate Appraiser, License No. 400101572
- Arizona Certified General Real Estate Appraiser, License No. 1003038
- North Carolina Certified General Real Estate Appraiser, License No. A8506
- Tennessee Certified General Real Estate Appraiser, License No. 5810
- Kentucky Certified General Real Estate Appraiser, License No. 5470
- Maryland Certified General Real Estate Appraiser, License No. 40034070
- Member of the Appraisal Institute, MAI Certificate No. 12678
- Instructor of the Appraisal Institute
- Secretary, Louisiana Chapter of the Appraisal Institute, 2014
- Treasurer, Louisiana Chapter of the Appraisal Institute, 2015
- Vice-President, Louisiana Chapter of the Appraisal Institute, 2016
- President, Louisiana Chapter of the Appraisal Institute, 2017

#### **Civic Organizations**

- 1982 Eagle Scout, Boy Scouts of America
- 1983 Vigil Honor Member, Order of the Arrow, Boy Scouts of America
- 1999 2001 Board of Directors, Berean Bible Church, New Orleans, Louisiana
- 2000 2001 Treasurer, Berean Bible Church, New Orleans, Louisiana
- 2008 2010 School Board Chairman, Crescent City Christian School, Metairie, Louisiana.
- 2008 Present Board of Directors, Celebration Church, Metairie, Louisiana
- 2010 Present Corporate Secretary, Celebration Church, Metairie, Louisiana



## ARTHUR L. SCHWERTZ, MAI

## Expert Witness Experience

- Expert Witness, United States Court of Federal Claims
- Expert Witness, United States Bankruptcy Court, Middle and Eastern Districts of Louisiana
- Expert Witness, United States Federal Court, Eastern District of Louisiana
- Expert Witness, Civil District Court for the Parish of Orleans, State of Louisiana.
- Expert Witness, State Civil District Court, Dallas County, State of Texas.
- Expert Witness, Louisiana Tax Commission
- Expert Witness, Circuit Court for the City of Norfolk, Virginia
- Expert Witness, 9<sup>th</sup> JDC, 23<sup>rd</sup> JDC and 32<sup>nd</sup> JDC, State of Louisiana
- Expert Witness, Indiana Board of Tax Review, State of Indiana

#### **Court Testimony**

2020	GIV Green Tree Mall Investor, LLC v. Clark County Assessor, Petition Nos. 10-011-17-1-4-02088-17, 10-011-18-1-4-00149-20 and 10-011-19-1-4-00150-20, Indiana Board of Tax Review, State of Indiana.
2020	Low Land Investors, LLC, Low Land Construction Co., Inc. v. New Generation Shipbuilding, LLC, Case No. 180743, 32 <sup>nd</sup> Judicial District for Terrebonne Parish, State of Louisiana (Deposition/Testimony)
2020	Cella III, LLC v. Jefferson Parish Hospital District No. 2, Civil Action No. EDLA 19-11528, Bankruptcy No. 19-01145, United States District Court for the Eastern District of Louisiana (Deposition/Testimony)
2020	Elizabeth Sewell, et al v. Sewerage & Water Board of New Orleans, Docket No. 15-4501, Division D- 12, Civil District Court, Parish of Orleans, State of Louisiana (Deposition)
2019	Virginia Natural Gas, Inc. v. Colonna's Ship Yard, Incorporated, Case No. CL18-2169, Circuit Court for the City of Norfolk, State of Virginia (Deposition)
2018	Jeannette C. Liebman, Wife of/and Paul E. Ramoni, Jr. v. The United States, Docket No. 14-1165, United States Court of Federal Claims (Testimony)
2016	Appeal of Filmore Parc Apartments v. Orleans Parish Board of Review, Docket Nos. 16-22173-001 and 16-22173-002, Louisiana Tax Commission, State of Louisiana. (Testimony)
2016	Appeal of Fulton Development (Harrah's Hotel) v. Orleans Parish Board of Review, Docket No. 16- 22171-002, Louisiana Tax Commission, State of Louisiana (Testimony)
2016	Jeannette C. Liebman and Paul E. Ramoni, Jr. v. United States of America, Case No. 14-1165 L, United States Court of Federal Claims (Deposition)
2016	State of Louisiana, Department of Transportation & Development v. Northport Properties Partnership, Et Al, Docket No. 233,894, 9 <sup>th</sup> Judicial District, Parish of Rapides, State of Louisiana (Deposition)
2015	Appeal of Filmore Parc Apartments v. Orleans Parish Board of Review, Docket Nos. 15-22173-018 and 15-22173-019, Louisiana Tax Commission, State of Louisiana. (Testimony)



## ARTHUR L. SCHWERTZ, MAI

#### Court Testimony (Continued)

2015	Doretha Z. Walker et al vs. AMID/Metro Partnership, LLC and City of New Orleans, Docket No. 07-14794, Division H-14, Civil District Court for the Parish of Orleans, State of Louisiana. (Testimony)
2015	Sandra Oubre Sotile, Et Al vs Dooley Oubre, Et Al, Docket No. 110,622, 23 <sup>rd</sup> Judicial District Court, Ascension Parish, Louisiana (Deposition)
2014	North Shore Lodging, LLC vs Commonwealth Land Title Insurance Company, Case No. 2:2013cv06070, United States Court for the Eastern District of Louisiana (Deposition)
2014	Appeal of Filmore Parc Apartments v. Orleans Parish Board of Review, Docket Nos. 14-22173-003 and 14-22173-004, Louisiana Tax Commission, State of Louisiana. (Testimony)
2014	State Bank of Texas vs. Granbury Hospitality Inc., et al, Cause No. DC-12-06398, 44 <sup>th</sup> State Civil District Court, Dallas County, State of Texas. (Testimony)
2013	Bruce L. Feingerts v Succession of Doris Feingerts, et al, Adversary Proceeding No. 2011-9918, Civil District Court for the Parish of Orleans, State of Louisiana. (Testimony)
2012	Consolidated Cases of Percy J. Marchand versus Entergy New Orleans, Inc., Docket No. 2009-12695 AND Omar Duncan, Et Al, vs. Entergy New Orleans, Inc., Docket No. 2010-0714 AND Leroy Anthony Vignaud versus Entergy New Orleans, Inc. Docket No. 2010-5566, Division "C" of the Civil District Court for the Parish of Orleans, State of Louisiana. (Deposition)
2011	Pleasant View Development, LLC v Charles Anthony Bonaventure, Gina Bonaventure Porciau, Charles R. St. Romain, and Patin Engineers and Surveyors, Inc., Adversary Proceeding No. 10-1024, United States Bankruptcy Court, Middle District of Louisiana (Testimony)
2011	1522 R.E. Lee Blvd., LLC v. Bank of New Orleans, Civil District Court for the Parish of Orleans, State of Louisiana (Deposition)

#### Partial List of Appraisal Assignments Completed

#### Water and Wastewater Systems

Resolve Water, Slidell, LA

Coast Water, Slidell, LA

H20 Water and Wastewater, St. Tammany Parish, LA

Mo-Dad Utilities, Tangipahoa, Livingston, West Baton Rouge, East Baton Rouge and West Feliciana Parishes, LA

Scientific System, Jacksonville, NC

Center Ridge System, Murray, KY

Blue Creek Utilities, Jacksonville, NC

Delaplain Utilities, Georgetown, KY

River Bluff Wastewater System, River Bluff, KY

#### <u>Major Retail</u>

Green Tree Mall (±443,933 square feet), Clarksville, IN Northshore Square Mall (±621,192 square feet), Slidell, LA The Shoppes at Fremaux (±600,000 square feet), Slidell, LA Slidell Factory Outlet Mall, Slidell, LA Southland Mall (±600,000 square feet), Houma, LA The Plaza (±1,200,000 square feet), New Orleans, LA Belle Promenade (±750,000 square feet), Marrero, LA Jax Brewery, New Orleans, LA River Marketplace Shopping Center, Lafayette, LA Natchez Mall (±268,857 square feet), Natchez, MS Bradley Square Mall (568,508 square feet), Cleveland, TN



#### ARTHUR L. SCHWERTZ, MAI

## Partial List of Appraisal Assignments Completed (Continued)

#### **Healthcare**

Gilchrist at Stadium Place, Baltimore, MD Savoy Medical Center, Mamou, LA Methodist Hospital, New Orleans, LA Lakeland Hospital, New Orleans, LA Shriner's Hospital, New Orleans, LA Fairway Surgical Hospital, Covington, LA Southpark Hospital, Lafayette, LA St. James Parish Hospital, St. James, LA Green Clinic and Surgery Center, Ruston, LA Numerous Nursing Homes throughout Louisiana Lambeth House Assisted Living, New Orleans, LA O'Connor Hospital, San Jose, CA St. Louise Regional Medical Center, Gilroy, CA St. Vincent Medical Center, Los Angeles, CA Rosewood Assisted Living Facility, Charlottesville, VA

#### Industrial

Colonna's Shipyard, Norfolk, VA Signal International Shipyard, Orange, TX Signal International Shipyard, Mobile, AL Signal International Shipyard, Port Arthur, TX Signal International Shipyard, Pascagoula, MS Bender Shipyard, Mobile, AL Plastic Infusion Plant, Hammond, LA UBT Coal Transfer Facility, Davant, LA Trinity Yachts, Gulfport, MS Trinity Yachts, New Orleans, LA Coca-Cola Facility, Thibodaux, LA LaShip Shipyard, Houma, LA Dow Chemical Plant, Norco, LA Port of St. Bernard, St. Bernard, LA Owensboro Riverport, Owensboro, KY Toulouse Street Wharf, Port of New Orleans, LA Mississippi River Dock, Venice, LA Port of Iberia, New Iberia, LA. Kaiser Site, Port of Greater Baton Rouge, LA

Proposed Port of Cameron, Cameron, LA Union Tank Car Plant, Alexandria, LA

#### Entertainment/Leisure

Dixie Landing Amusement Park, Baton Rouge, LA Blue Bayou Water Park, Baton Rouge, LA Proposed Aqualand Water Park, Dayton, TX Saenger Theatre, New Orleans, LA Orpheum Theatre, New Orleans, LA Vina Robles Amphitheatre, Paso Robles, CA House of Blues, New Orleans, LA The Oaks Golf Course, Pass Christian, MS Money Hill Golf Course, Abita Springs, LA Pelican Pointe Golf Course, Gonzales, LA Colonial Country Club, Harahan, LA O'Neal Theatres, Louisiana/Mississippi Antoine's Restaurant, New Orleans, LA AMC Theatres, Metairie/Hammond/Houma, LA Southern Belle Casino, St. Francisville, LA Bayou Marina, Casino and Hotel, Chalmette, LA Lucky Deuces Casino, Greensburg, LA Lafitte Harbor Marina, Lafitte, LA Vinot Marina, New Orleans, LA River Highlands Marina, Ascension Parish, LA Kemper Marina, Gulfport, MS C and M Marina, Lafitte, LA Cypress Cove Marina, Venice, LA Starlight Movie Studios, New Orleans, LA Schools Clifton L. Ganus Academy, New Orleans, LA Mt. Carmel Academy, New Orleans, LA Israel Augustine School, New Orleans, LA Millerville Academy, Baton Rouge, LA Louise S. McGhee School, New Orleans, LA Stuart Hall Academy, New Orleans, LA

Believer's Life Academy, Marrero, LA

© 2022 VALBRIDGE PROPERTY ADVISORS | New Orleans



#### ARTHUR L. SCHWERTZ, MAI

#### Partial List of Appraisal Assignments Completed (Continued)

#### Special Purpose Properties

Nuclear Reactor Simulator Facility, St. Francisville, LA Statewide Economic Obsolescence Study for Hibernia Bank, State of Louisiana Mitigation Bank, St. James Parish, LA Mitigation Bank, Livingston Parish, LA Mitigation Bank, East Baton Rouge Parish, LA Elmer's Island, Jefferson Parish, LA USPS Facilities throughout Louisiana and Mississippi Multi-Family Shadowlake Apartments, Harvey, LA Citrus Creek Apartments, Harahan, LA Palmetto Creek Apartments, Harahan, LA The Reserve at Acadiana, Lafayette, LA Gravier Place Apartments, New Orleans, LA The Saulet Apartments, New Orleans, LA Town Oaks Apartments, Shreveport, LA

University Edge Apartments, Hattiesburg, MS Legacy Condominiums Phase I, Gulfport, MS Legacy Condominiums Phase II, Gulfport, MS South Beach Condominiums, Biloxi, MS

#### <u>Hotels</u>

Super 7 Motel, Lafayette, LA Harrah's Hotel, New Orleans, LA Candlewoods Suites Hotel, Houma, LA Candlewoods Suites Hotel, Lafayette, LA Hyatt House Hotel, Columbus, MS Hampton Inn, Harahan, LA Hampton Inn, Metairie, LA Hampton Inn Convention Center, New Orleans, LA Hampton Inn Uptown, New Orleans, LA Hampton Inn, Mobile, AL Courtyard by Marriott, Metairie, LA, Baton Rouge, Residence Inn, Metairie, LA Quality Inn, Opelousas, LA LaQuinta, Slidell, LA Historic French Market Inn, New Orleans, LA Wyndham Hotel, Metairie, LA Holiday Inn Superdome, New Orleans, LA Hilton Garden Inn, Kenner, LA Hilton Garden Inn LA Office Buildings Xerox Centre, Kenner, LA Park Tower, Lafayette, LA Former Stewart Enterprises Building, Metairie, LA First NBC Building, New Orleans, LA Executive Plaza, New Orleans, LA Chase Tower, Houma, LA Maison Blanche Building, New Orleans, LA Yenni Office Building, Harahan, LA Dominion Tower, New Orleans, LA Elmwood Tower, Harahan, LA Freeport-McMoran Building, New Orleans, LA Entergy Building, New Orleans, LA 1250 Poydras Building, New Orleans, LA Subdivisions Ashton Plantation, Luling, LA Acadiana Subdivision, Marrero, LA Acadian Villas, Marrero, LA The Arbors at English Turn, New Orleans, LA Plantation Acres, Thibodaux, LA Woodstone Subdivision, Mandeville, LA Southlake Villages, Kenner, LA Village Green Subdivision, Harvey, LA Oak Island Subdivision, New Orleans, LA



WOODLAND ACRES UTILITIES ADDENDA



# FAST FACTS

## COMPANY INFORMATION

- Valbridge is the largest independent national commercial real estate valuation and advisory services firm in North America.
  - o Total number of MAI-designated appraisers: 200+ on staff
  - o Total number of office locations: 70+ across U.S.
  - Total number of staff: 675+ strong
- Valbridge covers the entire U.S. from coast to coast.
- Valbridge services all property types, including special-purpose properties.
- Valbridge provides independent valuation services. We are not owned by a brokerage firm or investment company.
- Every Valbridge office is led by a senior managing director who holds the MAI designation of the Appraisal Institute.
- Valbridge is owned by our local office leaders.
- Valbridge welcomes single-property assignments as well as portfolio, multi-market and other bulk-property engagements.

Valbridge Property Advisors, Inc. 2240 Venetian Court • Naples, FL 34109 • Phone: (888) 981-2029 www.valbridge.com





#### ALABAMA

4732 Woodmere Bou ulevard Montgomery, AL 36106 334.277.5077

200 Cahaba Park Circle Suite 213 Birmingham, AL 35242 205.440.2998

ARIZONA 6061 E. Grant Road Suite 121 Tucson, AZ 85712 520.321.0000

CALIFORNIA 4915 Calloway Drive Suite 101 Bakersfield CA 93312 661.587.1010

1370 N. Brea Boulevard Suite 255 Fullerton, CA 92835 714.449.0852

2813 Coffee Road Suite E-2 Modesto, CA 95355 209.569.0450

99 S. Lake Avenue Suite 21 Pasadena CA 91101 626.744.0428

3090 Fite Circle Suite 202 Sacramento, CA 95827 916.361.2509

55 South Market Street Suite 1210 San Jose, CA 95113 408.279.1520

1306 Higuera Street San Luis Obispo, CA 93401 805,544.2472

3160 Crow Canyon Place Suite 245 San Ramon, CA 94583 925.327.1660

COLORADO 7445 E. Peakview Av Centennial, CO 80111 303.443.9600

5345 Arapahoe Avenue Suite 7 Boulder, CO 80303 303 443 9600

23272 Two Rivers Road Unit 101 Basalt CO 81621 970.340,1016

1099 Main Avenue Suite 311 Durango, CO 81301 970.340.1016

CONNECTICUT 15 Concord Street Glastonbury, CT 06033 860,246,4606

17 Covewood Drive Norwalk, CT 06853 203.286.6520

FLORIDA 2240 Venetian Court Naples, FL 34109 239.514.4646

301 Almeria Avenue, Suite 350 Coral Gables, FL 33134 305,639,8029

10950 San Jose Boulevard

Jacksonville, FL 32223 844.822.7825 734 Rugby Street Orlando, FL 32804

2601 W Horatio Street Unit 6 Tampa, FL 33609

844.822.7825

844.822.7825

2711 Poinsettia Avenue West Palm Beach, FL 33407 561.833.5331

GEORGIA 2675 Paces Ferry Road Suite 145 Atlanta, GA 30339 678.644.4853

IDAHO 1459 Tyrell Lane Suite B Boise, ID 83706 208.336.1097

1875 N. Lakewood Drive Suite 100 Coeur d'Alene, ID 83814 208.292.2965

ILLINOIS 566 W. Lake Street Suite 240 Chicago, IL 60661 312.288.8687

INDIANA 820 Fort Wayne Avenue Indianapolis, IN 46204 317.687.2747

KANSAS 10990 Quivira Road Suite 100 Overland Park, KS 66210 913.451.1451

KENTUCKY 9000 Wessex Place Suite 306 Louisville, KY 40222 502.585.3651

LOUISIANA 2030 Dickory Avenue Suite 200 New Orleans, LA 70123 504 541 5100

MARYLAND 11100 Dovedale Court Marriottsville, MD 21104 443.333.5522

MASSACHUSETTS 260 Bear Hill Road Suite 106 Waltham MA 02451 781.790.5645

MICHIGAN 1420 Washington Blvd. Suite 301 Detroit, MI 48226 313.986.3313.

MICHIGAN (cont'd) 2127 University Park Drive Suite 390 Okemos, MI 48864 517.336.0001

MINNESOTA 255 East Kellogg Boule Suite 102A St. Paul, MN 55101 651.370.1475

MISSISSIPPI 1010 Ford Street Gulfport, MS 39507

228.604.1900 737 Highway 51

Suite 1C Madison, MS 39110 601.853.0736

501 Highway 12 West Suite 150-M Starkville, MS 39759 662.617.2350

MISSOURI

1118 Hampton Aven Suite 208 St Louis, MO 63139 314.255-1323

10990 Quivira Road Suite 100 Overland Park, KS 66210 913.451.1451

NEVADA 3034 S. Durango Drive Suite 100 Las Vegas, NV 89117 702 242 9369

6490 S McCarran Blvd #51 Reno, NV 89509 775.204.4100

NEW JERSEY 2740 Route 10 West, Suite 204 Morris Plains, NJ 07950 973.970.9333

3500 Route 9 South, Suite 202 Howell, NJ 07731 732.807.3113

NEW YORK 424 West 33rd Street Suite 630 New York, NY 10001 212.268.1113

NORTH CAROLINA 412 E. Chatham Street Cary, NC 27511 919.859.2666

5950 Fairview Road, Suite 405 Charlotte, NC 28210 704 376 5400

OHIO 1655 W, Market Street Suite 130 Akron, OH 44313 330,899,9900

239-325-8234 phone 239-325-8356 fax

OHIO (cont'd) 8291 Beechmont Ave. Suite B Cincinnati, OH 45255 513,785,0820

1422 Euclid Avenue Suite 616 Cleveland, OH 44115 216.367.9690

OKLAHOMA

5909 NW Expressway Suite 104 Oklahoma City, OK 73132 405.603.1553

6666 South Sheridan Road Suite 104 Tulsa, OK 74133 918.712.9992

PENNSYLVANIA 150 S. Warner Road Suite 440

King of Prussia, PA 19406 215.545.1900

4701 Baptist Road Suite 304 Pittsburgh, PA 15227 412.881.6080

SOUTH CAROLINA 11 Cleveland Court Greenville, SC 29607 864,233,6277

920 Bay Street Suite 26 Beaufort SC 29902 843.342.2302

1250 Fairmont Avenue ML Pleasant, SC 29464 843.881.1266

TENNESSEE 5205 Maryland Way Suite 300 Brentwood, TN 37027 615.369.0670

701 Broad Street Suite 209 Chattanooga, TN 37402

213 Fox Road Knoxville, TN 37922 865.522.2424

423.285.8435

756 Ridge Lake Blvd Suite 225

TEXAS

10210 North Central Expressway Suite 115 Dallas, TX 75231

974 Campbell Road Suite 204 Houston, TX 77024

2731 81st Street Lubbock, TX 79423 806.744.1188

TEXAS (cont'd) 9901 IH-10 West Suite 1035 San Antonio, TX 78230 210.227.6229

UTAH 321 North County Boulevard Unit D American Fork, UT 84003 801.492.9328

1100 East 6600 South Suite 201 Salt Lake City, UT 84121 801.262.3388

20 North Main Suite 304 St. George, UT 84770 435.773.6300

VIRGINIA Parkway 656 Indepe Suite 220 Chesapeake, VA 23320 757.410.1222

4914 Fitzhugh Avenue Suite 102 Richmond, VA 23230 757-345-0010

5107 Center Street Unit 2B Williamsburg, VA 23188 757.345.0010

#### WASHINGTON

8378 W. Grandridge Be Suite 110-D Kennewick, WA 99336 509.221.1540

25923 Washingon Blvd, NE Suite 300 Kingston, WA 98346 360.649.7300

324 N. Mullan Road Spokane Valley, WA 99206 509.747.0999

WISCONSIN 12660 W. North Avenue Brookfield, WI 53005

262.782.7990

Memphis, TN 38120 901.753.6977

901 Mopac Expressway South Building 1, Suite 300 Austin TX 78746 737.242.8585

214,446,1611

713.467.5858

## CORPORATE OFFICE

2240 Venetian Court Naples, FL 34109

Spring 2021

Each Valbridge office is independently owned and operated. Case No. 2022-00432 Bluegrass Water's Response to PSC 3-8 Exhibit PSC 3-8 Page 311 of 327



Flinn Engineering, LLC 11216 Neumann Lane Highland, Illinois 62249 618-550-8427 ksimpson@flinnengineering.com

April 1, 2020

Jacob Freeman, PE Director, Engineering Central States Water Resources 500 NW Plaza #500 St. Ann, MO 63074

Re: Asset Valuation Report Arcadia Pines Subdivision

Dear Mr. Freeman:

Flinn Engineering, LLC has completed the valuation of the wastewater assets for the Arcadia Pines Subdivision in Paducah, Kentucky. The purpose of this report is to estimate the value of the assets at the time the system was placed in service and estimate the depreciated book value of the assets.

The original installation date and costs were not recorded by the developer. The estimated cost of installation was calculated using a combination of an engineering opinion of cost to install the assets today based on knowledge of other systems of similar size, the Handy-Whitman Index, and correspondence from contractors. The Handy-Whitman Index was used to adjust the estimated installation cost to the date the assets were placed in service. The original installation date of 2009 is based on information about the Arcadia Pines Sewer Association on the Dunn and Bradstreet business directory. A screen capture is included in **Appendix A**.

A site visit was not conducted since this report is not evaluating the condition of the system. The following describes the information available, assumptions made, and methodology used to determine the installed value of the wastewater assets for the Arcadia Pines Subdivision.

## <u>Summary</u>

The Arcadia Pines Subdivision wastewater assets are assumed to date back to 2009. The wastewater system includes a wastewater treatment plant and sewer collection system. **Table 1** summarizes the estimated installation cost in 2019 dollars, the estimated original installation cost, and the estimated depreciated book value.

		Estimated		Original	l	Estimated	
Description		allation Cost		Installation	Depreciated		
		2019		Value 2009	Book Value		
Wastewater System	\$	241,400.00	\$	184,122.74	\$	147,725.22	
Total	\$	241,400.00	\$	184,122.74	\$	147,725.22	

Table 1 – Wastewater System Estimated Installation Cost and Estimated Value

Mr. Jake Freeman Page 2 | April 1, 2020

## Available Information

The following information was used and is attached as Appendix A.

- Map of approximate service area prepared by 21 Design Group, dated 11/14/19.
- Screen shot of Dunn and Bradstreet Business directory.
- Property records for Marshall Ridge lagoon from McCracken County web site.
- USEPA Fact Sheet on Lagoons.
- Engineering memo prepared by 21 Design dated October 5, 2019.
- Assumed sewer alignment on Google Earth.
- Carriage Park engineering memo prepared by 21 Design dated October 5, 2019.
- Rick Martin e-mail showing the acreage of the lagoon property.

## **Assumptions**

- All assets were installed in 2009.
- Based on the approximate service area map (**Appendix A**) and the engineering memo from 21 Design, we assumed 33 customers.
- We assumed the sewer material is 8-inch PVC and sewer depth is approximately six (6) to eight (8) feet deep. The per foot estimate for sewer installation includes design, excavation, material, installation, backfill, and restoration.
- We assumed the sewer alignment would include 8 manholes, assuming one at each deadend, one at each intersection, and every 500' along long straight stretches.
- We assume the capacity of the lagoon is the same as Carriage Park based on similar size, number of customers and date of installation.

## Wastewater System

The wastewater system includes a wastewater treatment plant; an estimated 2,630 feet of 8-inch gravity sewer; an estimated 8 manholes; and an estimated 33 service laterals. The quantities of gravity sewer, manholes, and service laterals were estimated based on the assumptions described above.

The wastewater treatment plant is assumed to be a 19,000 gallon per day (gpd) single cell lagoon plant based on the assumptions described above. Drawings were not available for the treatment plant. The original installation cost was not recorded by the developer. The lagoon does not include any chemical feed or mechanical equipment. The USEPA published a Technology Fact Sheet on lagoons (**Appendix A**). The Fact Sheet does not list typical installation costs because the costs vary significantly based on depth, soil type, inlet/outlet structures, mechanical equipment, and chemical equipment. The 2019 estimated unit cost for the lagoon is \$2.50 per gallon of treatment capacity based on discussions with contractors.

The McCracken County Assessor's office provides access to certain property records on their website. Information on this property was not available but we assume the price per acre to be comparable with the Marshall Ridge neighborhood lagoon property at approximately \$3,309 per acre. Based on 3.42 acres as referenced in an email from Rick Martin dated May 9, 2019 and on the Marshall Ridge property assessment, (**Appendix A**), we estimate the property value at \$11,350.

The collection system includes an estimated 2,630 feet of 8-inch gravity sewer; an estimated 8 manholes; and an estimated 33 service laterals. The estimated 2019 installation costs are based on our experience with recent construction bids of similar sized systems with similar materials and discussions with contractors. The quantities, estimated costs, and conversion to 2009 costs are summarized in **Table 2**.

Mr. Jake Freeman Page 3 | April 1, 2020

					20	18 Estimated	Handy-	Handy-	Estimated		Estimated
Description	Description Quantity Unit Estimated Unit		imated Unit		Installation Whitman		Whitman	Unit Cost	Installation		
			(	Cost 2019		Cost 2019	Index 2009	Index 2019	2009	Cost 2009	
Lagoon Property	1	each	\$	11,350.00	\$	11,350.00	n/a	n/a	\$ 11,350.00	\$	11,350.00
WWTP-Lagoons	19,000	gallons	\$	2.50	\$	47,500.00	530	683	\$ 1.94	\$	36,859.44
8" Sanitary Sewer-Gravity	2630	feet	\$	55.00	\$	144,650.00	581	783	\$ 40.81	\$	107,332.89
Manholes	8	each	\$	3,500.00	\$	28,000.00	581	783	\$ 2,597.06	\$	20,776.50
4" Lateral	33	each	\$	300.00	\$	9,900.00	484	614	\$ 236.48	\$	7,803.91
	Estima	Estimated Installation Cost 2019					Estimated Installation Cost \$ 184,1				184,122.74

## Table 2 – Wastewater Assets Estimated Installation Cost

## **Depreciated Value**

The estimated original cost was depreciated based on depreciation rates used by the Missouri Public Service Commission (PSC) during recent rate cases. We searched the Kentucky PSC docket library and could not find depreciation rates approved by the Kentucky PSC. It is reasonable to assume the depreciation rates approved by the Missouri PSC are typical of other states. The depreciation schedules from three (3) wastewater systems are included in **Appendix B**. The depreciation periods used are summarized in **Table 3**. The depreciation calculation is included in **Appendix C**.

Table 3 – Depreciation Periods								
Asset	Depreciation Period (years)							
Property	n/a							
WWTP (Lagoons)	40							
Sanitary Sewer	50							

We appreciate the opportunity to assist you on this project. If you have any questions, please let me know.

Sincerely,

Kelly A. Simpson

Kelly A. Simpson, PE, LEED® AP Owner

Enclosures: Appendix A – Available Information Appendix B – PSC Depreciation Rate Schedules Appendix C – Depreciation Calculation



Flinn Engineering, LLC 11216 Neumann Lane Highland, Illinois 62249 618-550-8427 ksimpson@flinnengineering.com

April 1, 2020

Jacob Freeman, PE Director, Engineering Central States Water Resources 1650 Des Peres Rd., Suite 303 St. Louis, MO 63131

Re: Asset Valuation Report Carriage Park Subdivision

Dear Mr. Freeman:

Flinn Engineering, LLC has completed the valuation of the wastewater assets for the Carriage Park Subdivision in Paducah, Kentucky. The purpose of this report is to estimate the value of the assets at the time the system was placed in service and estimate the depreciated book value of the assets.

The original installation date and costs were not recorded by the developer. The estimated cost of installation was calculated using a combination of an engineering opinion of cost to install the assets today based on knowledge of other systems of similar size, the Handy-Whitman Index, and correspondence from contractors. The Handy-Whitman Index was used to adjust the estimated installation cost to the date the assets were placed in service. The original installation date of 2008 is based on the lagoon certification paperwork included in **Appendix A**.

A site visit was not conducted since this report is not evaluating the condition of the system. The following describes the information available, assumptions made, and methodology used to determine the installed value of the wastewater assets for the Carriage Park Subdivision.

## Summary

The Carriage Park Subdivision wastewater assets are assumed to date back to 2008. The wastewater system includes a wastewater treatment plant and sewer collection system. **Table 1** summarizes the estimated installation cost in 2019 dollars, the estimated original installation cost, and the estimated depreciated book value.

Table 1 – Wastewater System Estimated installation cost and Estimated Value										
	Estimated Original					Estimated				
Description		allation Cost		Installation	Depreciated					
		2019		Value 2008	Book Value					
Wastewater System	\$	303,745.00	\$	206,906.33	\$	160,641.16				
Total	\$	303,745.00	\$	206,906.33	\$	160,641.16				

## Table 1 – Wastewater System Estimated Installation Cost and Estimated Value

Mr. Jake Freeman Page 2 | April 1, 2020

## Available Information

The following information was used and is attached as Appendix A.

- Plat map of the Carriage Park subdivision.
- Property records for Carriage Park lagoon from McCracken County web site.
- USEPA Fact Sheet on Lagoons.
- Engineering memo prepared by 21 Design dated October 5, 2019.
- Assumed service area map from Google Earth.
- Carriage Park lagoon design drawing.

## **Assumptions**

- All assets were installed in 2008.
- Based on the plat map (**Appendix A**) and the engineering memo from 21 Design, we assumed 36 customers.
- We assumed the sewer material is 8-inch PVC and sewer depth is approximately six (6) to eight (8) feet deep. The per foot estimate for sewer installation includes design, excavation, material, installation, backfill, and restoration.
- We assumed the sewer alignment would include 9 manholes, assuming one at each deadend, one at each intersection, and every 500' along long straight stretches.

## Wastewater System

The wastewater system includes a wastewater treatment plant; an estimated 3,784 feet of 8-inch gravity sewer; an estimated 9 manholes; and an estimated 36 service laterals. The quantities of gravity sewer, manholes, and service laterals were estimated based on the assumptions described above.

The wastewater treatment plant is assumed to be a 19,000 gallon per day (gpd) single cell lagoon plant based on drawings for the lagoon. The original installation cost was not recorded by the developer. The lagoon does not include any chemical feed or mechanical equipment. The USEPA published a Technology Fact Sheet on lagoons (**Appendix A**). The Fact Sheet does not list typical installation costs because the costs vary significantly based on depth, soil type, inlet/outlet structures, mechanical equipment, and chemical equipment. The 2019 estimated unit cost for the lagoon is \$2.50 per gallon of treatment capacity based on discussions with contractors.

The McCracken County Assessor's office provides access to certain property records on their website. Information on this property is included in **Appendix A** with a property value at \$5,825.

The collection system includes an estimated 3,784 feet of 8-inch gravity sewer; an estimated 9 manholes; and an estimated 36 service laterals. The estimated 2019 installation costs are based on our experience with recent construction bids of similar sized systems with similar materials and discussions with contractors. The quantities, estimated costs, and conversion to 2009 costs are summarized in **Table 2**.

Mr. Jake Freeman Page 3 | April 1, 2020

					20	18 Estimated	Handy-	Handy-	Estimated		Estimated										
Description	Quantity	Unit	Esti	Estimated Unit		Estimated Unit		Estimated Unit		Estimated Unit		Estimated Unit		Estimated Unit		Installation	Whitman	Whitman	Unit Cost		nstallation
			Cost 2019			Cost 2019	Index 2008	Index 2019	2008	Cost 2008											
Lagoon Property	1	each	\$	5,825.00	\$	5,825.00	n/a	n/a	\$ 5,825.00	\$	5,825.00										
WWTP-Lagoons	19,000	gallons	\$	2.50	\$	47,500.00	530	683	\$ 1.94	\$	36,859.44										
8" Sanitary Sewer-Gravity	3,784	feet	\$	55.00	\$	208,120.00	508	783	\$ 35.68	\$	135,025.49										
Manholes	9	each	\$	3,500.00	\$	31,500.00	508	783	\$ 2,270.75	\$	20,436.78										
4" Lateral	36	each	\$	300.00	\$	10,800.00	498	614	\$ 243.32	\$	8,759.61										
	Estima	Estimated Installation Cost 2019						Estimated Inst	tallation Cost	\$	206,906.33										

## Table 2 – Wastewater Assets Estimated Installation Cost

## **Depreciated Value**

The estimated original cost was depreciated based on depreciation rates used by the Missouri Public Service Commission (PSC) during recent rate cases. We searched the Kentucky PSC docket library and could not find depreciation rates approved by the Kentucky PSC. It is reasonable to assume the depreciation rates approved by the Missouri PSC are typical of other states. The depreciation schedules from three (3) wastewater systems are included in **Appendix B**. The depreciation periods used are summarized in **Table 3**. The depreciation calculation is included in **Appendix C**.

Table 3 – Depreciation Periods								
Asset	Depreciation							
10001	Period (years)							
Property	n/a							
WWTP (Lagoons)	40							
Sanitary Sewer	50							

We appreciate the opportunity to assist you on this project. If you have any questions, please let me know.

Sincerely,

Kelly A. Simpson

Kelly A. Simpson, PE, LEED® AP Owner

Enclosures: Appendix A – Available Information Appendix B – PSC Depreciation Rate Schedules Appendix C – Depreciation Calculation



Flinn Engineering, LLC 11216 Neumann Lane Highland, Illinois 62249 618-550-8427 ksimpson@flinnengineering.com

December 3, 2021

Jacob Freeman, PE Director, Engineering Central States Water Resources 1650 Des Peres Rd., Suite 303 St. Louis, MO 63131

## Re: Asset Valuation Report Darlington Creek Homeowners Association Wastewater System

Dear Mr. Freeman:

Flinn Engineering, LLC has completed the valuation of the assets owned by the Darlington Creek Homeowners Association for the Darlington Creek Subdivision in Alexandria, KY. The purpose of this report is to estimate the value of the assets at the time the system was placed in service and estimate the depreciated book value of the assets.

The original installation costs were not recorded by the developer. In order to establish the original cost, we estimated the cost to install the assets in 2021 dollars using a combination of an engineering opinion based on knowledge of other systems of similar size and correspondence from contractors and suppliers. The Handy-Whitman Index was used to adjust the estimated installation cost to the date the assets were placed in service. The original installation date is based on a variety of assumptions and available information that are described below.

A site visit was not conducted since this report is not evaluating the condition of the system. The following describes the information available, assumptions made, and methodology used to determine the installed value of the assets.

Property values are not included in this estimate of asset value. Property values could include the wastewater treatment plant site and easements for the collection system.

## Summary

The Darlington Creek Subdivision includes sewer customers only. The wastewater customers are served by an extended aeration package plant. **Table 1** summarizes the estimated installation cost in 2021 dollars, the estimated original installation cost, and the estimated depreciated book value.

	Estimated	Estimated	Estimated		
Description	Installation Cost	Original	Depreciated		
	2021	Installation Cost	Book Value		
Wastewater System	\$ 1,125,650.00	\$ 823,928.25	\$ 469,814.16		

## Table 1 – Wastewater Systems Estimated Installation Cost and Depreciated Book Value

Mr. Jacob Freeman Page 2 | December 3, 2021

## Available Information/Assumption

The following information/assumptions were used to determine the quantity, age, and estimated installation cost for the assets. The numbers are shown in **Table 2** for easy reference. The items listed under "Available Information" are included in **Appendix A**.

## Available Information

- 1. Engineering Report prepared by 21 Design dated September 15, 2021 (Engineering Report).
- 2. Google Earth image showing assumed locations of sewer collection system.
- 3. USEPA Fact Sheet-Package Plants dated September 2000

## **Assumptions**

- 4. The wastewater treatment plant was installed in 2007 with the original phase of construction. All sewer, manholes, and laterals were installed in phases in 2007, 2012, 2019, and 2021 based on the historic imagery available on Google Earth.
- 5. The Engineering Report indicates that sewer collection system is gravity with no lift stations. We assumed the gravity sewer is 8-inch PVC. We assumed the location/length of sewer based on the topography available on Google Earth.
- 6. The USEPA published a Technology Fact Sheet on Package Plants in September 2000 (Item 3 in Appendix A). The Fact Sheet estimates the capital costs for this type of WWTP including the entire package plant, as well as filtration to be \$7 per treated gallon. The 2000 (H-W 351) per gallon cost was converted to 2021 (H-W 694). The estimated 2021 cost for the installation of the extended aeration package plant with filtration is \$14 per gallon treated.
- 7. The sewer unit cost in 2021 is estimated to be \$55 per foot for 8-inch PVC. We assumed the gravity sewer is approximately six (6) to eight (8) feet deep. The per foot estimate for sewer installation includes design, excavation, material, installation, backfill, and restoration.
- 8. The manhole installation cost in 2021 is estimated to be \$4,000 based on recent conversations with contractors. This includes excavation, material, installation, backfill, and restoration.
- 9. The sewer lateral installation cost in 2021 is estimated to be \$400 based on 4-inch PVC and recent conversations with contractors. This estimate includes excavation, material, installation, backfill, and restoration.

## Wastewater System

Based on the information available and the assumptions listed above, the wastewater system for the Darlington Creek Subdivision includes the Extended Aeration Package Plant; 5,270 feet of 8-inch PVC gravity sewer; 24 manholes; and 117 service laterals.

**Table 2** includes the asset description, quantity, information/assumption to determine quantity, date of installation, information/assumption to determine date of installation, unit cost, and information/assumption used to determine unit cost. The cost in **Table 2** is the estimated cost to install the wastewater assets in 2021.

Description	Quantity	Unit	Quantity Info/ Assumption <sup>1</sup>	Date Installed	Date Info/ Assumption <sup>1</sup>	Lotiniatoa oriit		Cost Info/ Assumption <sup>1</sup>	I	Estimated nstallation Cost 2021
WWTP-Extended Aeration	49,500	gpd	1	2007	4	\$	14.00	6	\$	693,000.00
8" Gravity Sewer 2007	2,200	feet	2 and 5	2007	4	\$	55.00	7	\$	121,000.00
8" Gravity Sewer 2012	1,300	feet	2 and 5	2012	4	\$	55.00	7	\$	71,500.00
8" Gravity Sewer 2019	650	feet	2 and 5	2019	4	\$	55.00	7	\$	35,750.00
8" Gravity Sewer 2021	1,120	feet	2 and 5	2021	4	\$	55.00	7	\$	61,600.00
Manholes 2007	10	ea	2 and 5	2007	4	\$	4,000.00	8	\$	40,000.00
Manholes 2012	5	ea	2 and 5	2012	4	\$	4,000.00	8	\$	20,000.00
Manholes 2019	3	ea	2 and 5	2019	4	\$	4,000.00	8	\$	12,000.00
Manholes 2021	6	ea	2 and 5	2021	4	\$	4,000.00	8	\$	24,000.00
Service Laterals 2007	43	ea	2 and 5	2007	4	\$	400.00	9	\$	17,200.00
Service Laterals 2012	30	ea	2 and 5	2012	4	\$	400.00	9	\$	12,000.00
Service Laterals 2019	16	ea	2 and 5	2019	4	\$	400.00	9	\$	6,400.00
Service Laterals 2021	28	ea	2 and 5	2021	4	\$	400.00	9	\$	11,200.00
					E	stima	ited Installa	ition Cost 2021	\$	1,125,650.00

Table 2 – Estimated Installation Cost for Wastewater Assets in 2021

Notes:

1 – Info/Assumption number refers to list above.

**Table 3** shows the calculation using the Handy-Whitman indices to convert the estimated installation cost in 2021 to the estimated original installation cost.

Description	Estimated Installation Cost 2021		Handy- Whitman Index Original Install Date	Handy- Whitman Index 2021		stimated ginal Unit Cost	Estimated Original nstallation Cost
WWTP-Extended Aeration	\$	693,000.00	482	694	\$	9.72	\$ 481,305.48
8" Gravity Sewer 2007	\$	121,000.00	488	819	\$	32.77	\$ 72,097.68
8" Gravity Sewer 2012	\$	71,500.00	654	819	\$	43.92	\$ 57,095.24
8" Gravity Sewer 2019	\$	35,750.00	793	819	\$	53.25	\$ 34,615.08
8" Gravity Sewer 2021	\$	61,600.00	819	819	\$	55.00	\$ 61,600.00
Manholes 2007	\$	40,000.00	488	819	\$	2,383.39	\$ 23,833.94
Manholes 2012	\$	20,000.00	654	819	\$	3,194.14	\$ 15,970.70
Manholes 2019	\$	12,000.00	793	819	\$	3,873.02	\$ 11,619.05
Manholes 2021	\$	24,000.00	819	819	\$	4,000.00	\$ 24,000.00
Service Laterals 2007	\$	17,200.00	490	628	\$	312.10	\$ 13,420.38
Service Laterals 2012	\$	12,000.00	569	628	\$	362.42	\$ 10,872.61
Service Laterals 2019	\$	6,400.00	618	628	\$	393.63	\$ 6,298.09
Service Laterals 2021	\$	11,200.00	628	628	\$	400.00	\$ 11,200.00
			Estimate	ed Original Ins	stall	ation Cost	\$ 823,928.25

Table 3 - Wastewater Assets Estimated Original Installation Cost

## **Depreciated Value**

The estimated original cost was depreciated based on depreciation rates used by the Missouri Public Service Commission (PSC) during recent rate cases. It is reasonable to assume the depreciation rates approved by the Missouri PSC are typical of other states. The depreciation schedules from three (3) recent wastewater system rate cases are included in **Appendix B**. The depreciation periods used are summarized in **Table 4**. The depreciation calculation is included in **Appendix C**.

Mr. Jacob Freeman Page 4 | December 3, 2021

Asset	Depreciation
Asset	Period (years)
WWTP - Equipment	22
Sanitary Sewer, Manholes, Laterals	50

We appreciate the opportunity to assist you on this project. If you have any questions, please let me know.

Sincerely, Kelly A. Simpson

Kelly A. Simpson, PE, LEED® AP Owner

Enclosures: Appendix A – Available Information Appendix B – PSC Depreciation Rate Schedules Appendix C – Depreciation Calculation



Flinn Engineering, LLC 11216 Neumann Lane Highland, Illinois 62249 618-550-8427 ksimpson@flinnengineering.com

April 1, 2020

Jacob Freeman, PE Director, Engineering Central States Water Resources 1650 Des Peres Rd., Suite 303 St. Louis, MO 63131

Re: Asset Valuation Report Marshall Ridge Subdivision

Dear Mr. Freeman:

Flinn Engineering, LLC has completed the valuation of the wastewater assets for the Marshall Ridge Subdivision in Paducah, Kentucky. The purpose of this report is to estimate the value of the assets at the time the system was placed in service and estimate the depreciated book value of the assets.

The original installation date and costs were not recorded by the developer. The estimated cost of installation was calculated using a combination of an engineering opinion of cost to install the assets today based on knowledge of other systems of similar size, the Handy-Whitman Index, and correspondence from contractors. The Handy-Whitman Index was used to adjust the estimated installation cost to the date the assets were placed in service. The original installation date of 2001 is based on information about the Marshall Ridge Sewer Association on the Dunn and Bradstreet business directory. A screen capture is included in **Appendix A**.

A site visit was not conducted since this report is not evaluating the condition of the system. The following describes the information available, assumptions made, and methodology used to determine the installed value of the wastewater assets for the Marshall Ridge Subdivision.

## <u>Summary</u>

The Marshall Ridge Subdivision wastewater assets are assumed to date back to 2001. The wastewater system includes a wastewater treatment plant and sewer collection system. **Table 1** summarizes the estimated installation cost in 2019 dollars, the estimated original installation cost, and the estimated depreciated book value.

Description		Estimated	Original			Estimated	
		allation Cost	l	Installation	Depreciated		
		2019		Value 2001		Book Value	
Wastewater System	\$	325,605.00	\$	225,559.57	\$	147,520.78	
Total	\$	325,605.00	\$	225,559.57	\$	147,520.78	

Table 1 – Wastewater System Estimated Installation Cost and Estimated Value

Mr. Jake Freeman Page 2 | April 1, 2020

## Available Information

The following information was used and is attached as Appendix A.

- Map of approximate service area prepared by 21 Design Group, dated 5/8/2019.
- Screen shot of Dunn and Bradstreet Business directory.
- Property records for Marshall Ridge lagoon from McCracken County web site.
- USEPA Fact Sheet on Lagoons.
- Engineering memo prepared by 21 Design dated October 5, 2019.
- Assumed service area map from Google Earth
- Carriage Park engineering memo prepared by 21 Design dated October 5, 2019

## Assumptions

- All assets were installed in 2001.
- Based on the approximate service area map (**Appendix A**) and the engineering memo from 21 Design, we assumed 40 customers.
- We assumed the sewer material is 8-inch PVC and sewer depth is approximately six (6) to eight (8) feet deep. The per foot estimate for sewer installation includes design, excavation, material, installation, backfill, and restoration.
- We assumed the sewer alignment would include 11 manholes, assuming one at each dead-end, one at each intersection, and every 500' along long straight stretches.
- We assume the capacity of the lagoon is the same as Carriage Park based on similar size, number of customers and date of installation.

## Wastewater System

The wastewater system includes a wastewater treatment plant; an estimated 3,811 feet of 8-inch gravity sewer; an estimated 11 manholes; and an estimated 40 service laterals. The quantities of gravity sewer, manholes, and service laterals were estimated based on the assumptions described above and drawing the assumed sewer main route on Google Earth.

The wastewater treatment plant is assumed to be a 19,000 gallon per day (gpd) two cell lagoon. Drawings were not available for the treatment plant. The original installation cost was not recorded by the developer. The lagoon does not include any chemical feed or mechanical equipment. The USEPA published a Technology Fact Sheet on lagoons (**Appendix A**). The Fact Sheet does not list typical installation costs because the costs vary significantly based on depth, soil type, inlet/outlet structures, mechanical equipment, and chemical equipment. The 2019 estimated unit cost for the lagoon is \$2.50 per gallon of treatment capacity based on discussions with contractors.

The McCracken County Assessor's office provides access to certain property records on their website. Information on the property was printed and is included in **Appendix A**. The fair market value of the property is \$18,000.

The collection system includes an estimated 3,811 feet of 8-inch gravity sewer; an estimated 11 manholes; and an estimated 40 service laterals. The estimated 2019 installation costs are based on our experience with recent construction bids of similar sized systems with similar materials and discussions with contractors. The quantities, estimated costs, and conversion to 2001 costs are summarized in **Table 2**.

Mr. Jake Freeman Page 3 | April 1, 2020

									20	18 Estimated	Handy-	Handy-	Estimated		Estimated
Description	Quantity	Unit	Esti	mated Unit	1	nstallation	Whitman	Whitman	Unit Cost	- 1	nstallation				
			Cost 2019			Cost 2019	Index 2001	Index 2019	2001		Cost 2001				
Lagoon Property	1	each	\$	18,000.00	\$	18,000.00	n/a	n/a	\$ 18,000.00	\$	18,000.00				
WWTP-Lagoons	19,000	gallons	\$	2.50	\$	47,500.00	530	683	\$ 1.94	\$	36,859.44				
8" Sanitary Sewer-Gravity	3811	feet	\$	55.00	\$	209,605.00	508	783	\$ 35.68	\$	135,988.94				
Manholes	11	each	\$	3,500.00	\$	38,500.00	508	783	\$ 2,270.75	\$	24,978.29				
4" Lateral	40	each	\$	300.00	\$	12,000.00	498	614	\$ 243.32	\$	9,732.90				
	Estima	ated Instal	latic	on Cost 2019	\$	325,605.00		Estimated Ins <sup>-</sup>	tallation Cost	\$	225,559.57				

## Table 2 – Wastewater Assets Estimated Installation Cost

## **Depreciated Value**

The estimated original cost was depreciated based on depreciation rates used by the Missouri Public Service Commission (PSC) during recent rate cases. We searched the Kentucky PSC docket library and could not find depreciation rates approved by the Kentucky PSC. It is reasonable to assume the depreciation rates approved by the Missouri PSC are typical of other states. The depreciation schedules from three (3) wastewater systems are included in **Appendix B**. The depreciation periods used are summarized in **Table 3**. The depreciation calculation is included in **Appendix C**.

Table 3 – Depreciation Periods						
Asset	Depreciation Period (years)					
Property	n/a					
WWTP (Lagoons)	40					
Sanitary Sewer	50					

We appreciate the opportunity to assist you on this project. If you have any questions, please let me know.

Sincerely,

Kelly A. Simpson

Kelly A. Simpson, PE, LEED® AP Owner

Enclosures: Appendix A – Available Information Appendix B – PSC Depreciation Rate Schedules Appendix C – Depreciation Calculation



Flinn Engineering, LLC 11216 Neumann Lane Highland, Illinois 62249 618-550-8427 ksimpson@flinnengineering.com

April 1, 2020

Jacob Freeman, PE Director, Engineering Central States Water Resources 500 NW Plaza #500 St. Ann, MO 63074

Re: Asset Valuation Report Randview Wastewater System

Dear Mr. Freeman:

Flinn Engineering, LLC has completed the valuation of the wastewater assets for the Randview Subdivision wastewater system near Graves, Kentucky. The purpose of this report is to estimate the value of the assets at the time the system was placed in service and estimate the depreciated book value of the assets.

The original installation date and costs were not recorded by the developer. The estimated cost of installation was calculated using a combination of an engineering opinion of cost to install the assets today based on knowledge of other systems of similar size, the Handy-Whitman Index, and correspondence from contractors. The Handy-Whitman Index was used to adjust the estimated installation cost to the date the assets were placed in service. The original installation date of 1994 is based on information about the Randview Septic Corporation on the Bizapedia business directory website. A screen capture is included in **Appendix A**.

A site visit was not conducted since this report is not evaluating the condition of the system. The following describes the information available, assumptions made, and methodology used to determine the installed value of the wastewater assets for the Randview wastewater system.

## <u>Summary</u>

The Randview wastewater assets are assumed to date back to 1994. The wastewater system includes a wastewater treatment plant, three lift stations and sewer collection system. **Table 1** summarizes the estimated installation cost in 2019 dollars, the estimated original installation cost, and the estimated depreciated book value.

Table 1 – Wastewater System Estimated installation cost and Estimated value										
		Estimated		Original		Estimated				
Description	Ins	tallation Cost	I	nstallation	D	epreciated				
		2019		Value 1994		Book Value				
Wastewater System	\$	984,816.00	\$	380,226.61	\$	178,099.40				
Total	\$	984,816.00	\$	380,226.61	\$	178,099.40				

## Table 1 – Wastewater System Estimated Installation Cost and Estimated Value

Mr. Jake Freeman Page 2 | April 1, 2020

## Available Information

The following information was used and is attached as Appendix A.

- Map of approximate service area prepared by 21 Design Group, dated 10/15/2019.
- Screen shot of Bizapedia website business directory.
- Property records for the Randview lagoon #1 property
- USEPA Fact Sheet on Lagoons.
- Engineering memo prepared by 21 Design dated October 17, 2019.
- Assumed service area map from Google Earth
- Engineering Memo for Carriage Park Subdivision

## <u>Assumptions</u>

- All assets were installed in 1994.
- Based on similar size, we assumed the property value of lagoon #2 is the same as lagoon #1.
- Based on the approximate service area map (**Appendix A**) and the engineering memo from 21 Design, we assumed 54 customers.
- We assumed the sewer material is 8-inch PVC and sewer depth is approximately six (6) to eight (8) feet deep. The per foot estimate for sewer installation includes design, excavation, material, installation, backfill, and restoration.
- We assumed the forcemain material is 6-inch PVC and sewer depth is approximately three (3) to four (4) feet. The per foot estimate for sewer installation includes design, excavation, material, installation, backfill, and restoration.
- We assumed the sewer alignment would include 28 manholes, assuming one at each dead-end, one at each intersection, and every 500' along long straight stretches.
- We assume the capacity of the lagoon is the same as Carriage Park based on similar size and number of customers.

## Wastewater System

The wastewater system includes a wastewater treatment plant; three (3) lift stations, an estimated 11,140 feet of 8-inch gravity sewer; an estimated 3,310 feet of 6-inch forcemain; an estimated 28 manholes; and an estimated 54 service laterals. The quantities of gravity sewer, manholes, and service laterals were estimated based on the assumptions described above and drawing the assumed sewer main route on Google Earth.

The wastewater treatment plant is assumed to be a 19,000 gallon per day (gpd) two cell lagoon. There are two (2) lift stations near the first lagoon that pumps wastewater to the second lagoon that is approximately 2,000 feet away. Drawings were not available for the treatment plant. The original installation cost was not recorded by the developer. The lagoon does not include any chemical feed or mechanical equipment. The USEPA published a Technology Fact Sheet on lagoons (**Appendix A**). The Fact Sheet does not list typical installation costs because the costs vary significantly based on depth, soil type, inlet/outlet structures, mechanical equipment, and chemical equipment. The 2019 estimated unit cost for the lagoon is \$2.50 per gallon of treatment capacity based on discussions with contractors.

Information was not available on the lift stations. We made several assumptions based on similar systems with approximately 50 customers. We assumed the lift station includes two (2) submersible grinder pumps that are 10 horsepower. We assumed the lift station is fairly shallow based on ground elevations. Based on other systems of similar size, the lift station is estimated to cost \$20,000 in 2019.

The Graves County Assessor's office provides access to certain property records on their website. Information on the property was printed and is included in **Appendix A**. The fair market value of

the lagoon #1 property is \$733. Information was not available for lagoon #2 so we assumed the value of lagoon #2 is the same based on similar size.

The collection system includes an estimated 11,140 feet of 8-inch gravity sewer; an estimated 3,310 feet of 6-inch forcemain; an estimated 28 manholes; and an estimated 54 service laterals. The estimated 2019 installation costs are based on our experience with recent construction bids of similar sized systems with similar materials and discussions with contractors. The quantities, estimated costs, and conversion to 1994 costs are summarized in **Table 2**.

		20						2018 Estimated Handy-		Handy-	Estimated		Estimated					
Description	Quantity	Unit	Estimated Unit		Estimated Unit		Estimated Unit		Estimated Unit		Installation		Whitman	Whitman	Unit Cost		1	nstallation
			(	Cost 2019		Cost 2019		Cost 2019	Index 1994	Index 2019		1994		Cost 1994				
Lagoon #1 Property	1	each	\$	733.00	\$	733.00	n/a	n/a	\$	733.00	\$	733.00						
Lagoon #2 Property	1	each	\$	733.00	\$	733.00	n/a	n/a	\$	733.00	\$	733.00						
WWTP-Lagoons	19,000	gallons	\$	2.50	\$	47,500.00	295	683	\$	1.08	\$	20,516.11						
8" Sanitary Sewer-Gravity	11,140	feet	\$	55.00	\$	612,700.00	301	783	\$	21.14	\$	235,533.46						
6" Force Main	3,310	feet	\$	45.00	\$	148,950.00	301	783	\$	17.30	\$	57,259.20						
Lift Station	3	each	\$	20,000.00	\$	60,000.00	428	1261	\$	6,788.26	\$	20,364.79						
Manholes	28	each	\$	3,500.00	\$	98,000.00	301	783	\$	1,345.47	\$	37,673.05						
4" Lateral	54	each	\$	300.00	\$	16,200.00	281	614	\$	137.30	\$	7,414.01						
	Estima	ated Instal	stallation Cost 2019 \$			984,816.00	Estimated Installation Cost			\$	380,226.61							

Table 2 – Wastewater	Assets Estimated	Installation Cost
	ASSOLS ESTIMATOR	instantion 005t

## **Depreciated Value**

The estimated original cost was depreciated based on depreciation rates used by the Missouri Public Service Commission (PSC) during recent rate cases. We searched the Kentucky PSC docket library and could not find depreciation rates approved by the Kentucky PSC. It is reasonable to assume the depreciation rates approved by the Missouri PSC are typical of other states. The depreciation schedules from three (3) wastewater systems are included in **Appendix B**. The depreciation periods used are summarized in **Table 3**. The depreciation calculation is included in **Appendix C**.

Asset	Depreciation
73501	Period (years)
Property	n/a
WWTP - Lagoon	40
Sanitary Sewer, Manholes, Laterals	50
Lift Station	10

Table 3 – Depreciation Periods

We appreciate the opportunity to assist you on this project. If you have any questions, please let me know.

Sincerely, Kelly A. Simpson

Kelly A. Simpson, PE, LEED® AP Owner

Enclosures: Appendix A – Available Information Appendix B – PSC Depreciation Rate Schedules Appendix C – Depreciation Calculation