Matthew G. Bevin Governor

Charles G. Snavely Secretary Energy and Environment Cabinet



Commonwealth of Kentucky

Public Service Commission
211 Sower Blvd.
P.O. Box 615

Frankfort, Kentucky 40602-0615

Telephone: (502) 564-3940

Telephone: (502) 564-3940 Fax: (502) 564-3460 psc.ky.gov James W. Gardner Chairman

Daniel E. Logsdon Jr. Vice Chairman

> J. Roger Thomas Commissioner

February 8, 2016

Parties of Record

Re: Atmos Energy Corporation, Case No. 2015-00343

On January 26, 2016, I filed in the record of Case No. 2015-00343 a letter asking parties in the case to comment on whether I should recuse myself because I am a member of the Public Interest Advisory Council ("PIAC") of the Gas Technology Institute ("GTI"). I attached a copy of my appointment letter outlining those advisory duties. On February 2, 2016, the Attorney General ("AG") filed his Response and requested that I recuse myself because it "will create the appearance of impropriety should he participate in any determination of the R&D Rider." (P. 2) In spite of my concern regarding the AG's position as described below, I will in fact recuse myself from participation on the R&D Rider matter.

The issue as to whether R&D program funding may be recoverable through utility rates is a legitimate issue. However, the means by which the AG has raised the issue is not appropriate. It is not legitimate to use a recusal motion as an overt litigation strategy to try to force Atmos to withdraw part of its application, nor is it appropriate to attempt to smear a 501(c)(3) R&D organization by insinuating it has inappropriate ties to Asian efforts to reduce reliance on coal.

The AG's arguments disparaging GTI reference the institute's 2014 Annual Report, which is not in the record and was apparently accessed through an Internet search, while Atmos has indicated in the record in Response to Item 53 of the Commission Staff's First Request for Information that its GTI contributions resulting from its longstanding R&D Rider are used for projects other than Chinese, South Korean, or anti-coal research efforts.

Further, the record shows that Atmos provided information concerning its funding of GTI's Operations Technology Development and Utilization Technology Development programs, and included attachments highlighting the results of those programs. The AG ignores this information in his response.



This Commission has a long history of approving as reasonable ratepayer funded research by jurisdictional utilities following a fully developed record and a finding of reasonableness regarding benefits to Kentucky ratepayers. Both before and during my tenure the Commission has approved requests by Kentucky jurisdictional utilities to participate in the research of the Electric Power Research Institute and the Center for Applied Energy Research, as well as GTI. It is apparent that the Attorney General is now asking the PSC to change its practice. In support of his position, he should expect to develop his recommendation as is his right through the process of discovery.

Even though the litigation tactics of the AG cannot be condoned, in order to avoid the appearance of impropriety I will recuse myself from participating with respect to the R&D Rider.

Sincerely, Gardi

James W. Gardner

Chairman

*Gregory T Dutton
Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General Utility & Rate
1024 Capital Center Drive
Suite 200
Frankfort, KENTUCKY 40601-8204

*Stefanie J Kingsley
Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General Utility & Rate
1024 Capital Center Drive
Suite 200
Frankfort, KENTUCKY 40601-8204

*Jennifer Black Hans Assistant Attorney General Office of the Attorney General Utility & Rate 1024 Capital Center Drive Suite 200 Frankfort, KENTUCKY 40601-8204

*Honorable John N Hughes Attorney at Law 124 West Todd Street Frankfort, KENTUCKY 40601

*Atmos Energy Corporation 3275 Highland Pointe Drive Owensboro, KY 42303

*Mark A Martin Atmos Energy Corporation 3275 Highland Pointe Drive Owensboro, KY 42303

*Mark R Hutchinson Wilson, Hutchinson & Littlepage 611 Frederica Street Owensboro, KENTUCKY 42301

*Eric Wilen Project Manager-Rates & Regulatory Affairs Atmos Energy Corporation 5420 LBJ Freeway, Suite 1629 Dallas, TEXAS 75420