

Henry Walker (615) 252-2363 Fax: (615) 252-6363 Email: hwalker@boultcummings.com

October 16, 2003

Kentucky Public Service Commission Mr. Thomas M. Dorman Executive Director P.O. Box 615 211 Sower Boulevard Frankfort, Kentucky 40602-0615 RECEIVED

OCT 1 7 2003

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

Re: Inquiry into the Use of Contract Service Arrangements by

Telecommunications Carriers in Kentucky

Case No. 2002-00456

Dear Mr. Dorman:

Enclosed for filing is the Response of AT&T to the Joint Proposal of BellSouth, Kentucky Alltel and Cincinnati Bell.

I have also enclosed a copy to be stamped "filed" and returned in the enclosed, self-addressed, postage prepaid envelope.

Very truly yours,

BOULT, CUMMINGS, CONNERS & BERRY, PLC

Bv:

Henry Walker

HW/bb Encl.

## COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

## **RECEIVED**

October 16, 2003

OCT 1 7 2003

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

IN RE:	)		
	)	CASE NO:	2002-00456
INQUIRY INTO THE USE OF CONTRACT	)		
SERVICE ARRANGEMENTS BY	)		
TELECOMMUNICATIONS CARRIERS IN			
KENTUCKY			

RESPONSE OF AT&T COMMUNICATIONS OF THE SOUTH CENTRAL STATES, LLC TO THE JOINT PROPOSAL OF BELLSOUTH TELECOMMUNICATIONS, INC., KENTUCKY ALLTEL, INC., AND CINCINNATI BELL TELEPHONE COMPANY

AT&T Communications of the South Central States, LLC ("AT&T") submits the following reply to the "Joint Proposal" presented by BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc. ("BellSouth"), Kentucky Alltel, Inc., and Cincinnati Bell Telephone Company. This response is intended to be only a summary of AT&T's position on the issue of contract service arrangements offered by incumbent local exchange carriers. These issues will be further discussed at the pending hearing in this matter on October 23, 2003.

The "Joint Proposal" filed last week is nearly identical to the proposal presented earlier by BellSouth and the other incumbents and discussed during an industry workshop on October 1, 2003. At that time AT&T expressed its strong opposition to the proposal which would, in effect, make the incumbents' filed tariffs obsolete and make it possible for the incumbents to engage in widespread discrimination, predatory pricing, and other anti-competitive practices with little regulatory oversight.

Under the Commission's current procedures, AT&T files all of its contract service arrangements ("CSAs") with the Commission. The CSAs filed by AT&T are complete and unredacted. Any Kentucky customer or competing carrier can readily determine all the terms

and conditions of each CSA as well as the name of the customer executing the CSA. Such transparency, AT&T submits, is the best way to protect the public from discriminatory pricing and anti-competitive practices.

If competitive local exchange carriers, such as AT&T, can comply with these filing requirements, it is even more important that incumbent carriers do so. That should be the goal of this proceeding.

Rather than promoting transparency, the Joint Proposal moves radically in the opposite direction. First, it allows the incumbents to enter into CSAs without any meaningful restrictions. The Joint Proposal would allow all carriers to offer CSAs "to meet competition or in other unique circumstances." It lists, as examples, five situations where CSAs may be offered. Those situations are so broad as to be meaningless. They would allow an incumbent carrier to offer a CSA at any time and under any circumstances simply because the incumbent carrier has determined that it would be good a business deal. Under this proposal, a carrier's published tariffs would be rendered meaningless and the door opened to wholesale price discrimination.

Second, the Joint Proposal does not require that any CSAs be filed with the Commission, except "upon request from the KPSC or staff." In other words, other carriers or customers would never be able to request a copy of a CSA and the Commission could do so only if the agency asked for a specific contract. Without knowing of the existence of specific contracts, however, the agency would presumably only act upon receiving a complaint from a customer or a competing carrier. But, of course, a customer or competitor could rarely complain about an incumbent's CSA if the incumbent keeps the contract itself a secret.

This proceeding was opened by the Commission more than a year ago primarily in response to problems created by the lack of scrutiny over BellSouth's CSAs. Instead of shedding more light on BellSouth's CSA practices, the Joint Proposal suggests more secrecy and less

903946 v1 100071-000 10/16/2003 review. That is the wrong direction for Kentucky ratepayers and for the regulation and promotion of a competitive, local exchange market.

For these reasons and others which will be discussed further at the hearing on this matter, AT&T opposes the Joint Proposal and suggests that the incumbent carriers should, just as AT&T does, file all their CSAs, unredacted, with the Commission.

Respectfully submitted,

BOULT, CUMMINGS, CONNERS & BERRY, PLC

Rv

Henry Walker

414 Union Street, Suite 1600

P.O. Box 198062

Nashville, Tennessee 37219

(615) 252-2363

Martha M. Ross-Bain

AT&T Communications of the South Central States, LLC

1200 Peachtree St., NE, Suite 8062

Atlanta, Georgia 30309

(404) 810-6713

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true and correct copy of the foregoing has been forwarded via fax or hand delivery and U.S. mail to the following on this the 16th day of October, 2003.

Martha Ross-Bain AT&T Communications of the South Central States 1200 Peachtree St., NE Suite 8100 Atlanta, GA 30309

Murray Barr ICG Telecom Group, Inc. 180 Grand Avenue, Suite 450 Oakland, CA 94612

Melissa Burris
Staff Specialist
MCIMetro Access Transmission Services,
Inc.
6 Concourse Parkway
Suite 3200
Alpharetta, GA 30328

Robert A. Bye Corporate Counsel Cinergy Communications Company 8829 Bond Street Overland Park, KS 66214

Honorable Ann Louise Cheveront Office of the Attorney General Utility & Rate Intervention Division 1024 Capital Center Drive Suite 200 Frankfort, KY 40601

Ms. Joan A. Coleman
Director - Regulatory
BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc.
601 West Chestnut Street, 4NE
P.O. Box 32410
Louisville, KY 40232

W. A. Gillum General Manager Mountain Telephone Cooperative, Inc. 405 Main Street P.O. Box 399 West Liberty, KY 41472-0399

Stephen R. Byars Vice President-External Affairs ALLTEL Kentucky, Inc. P.O. Box 1650 Lexington, KY 40588-1650

Brimm Sulmoneti, Esquire Intermedia Communications, Inc. c/o MCI Telecommunications Corp. Concourse Corporate Center Six 6 Concourse Parkway, Suite 3200 Atlanta, GA 30328

James Campbell
Director of Operations
Gearheart Communications Co., Inc.
dba Coalfields Telephone Co.
5 Laynesville Road
Harold, KY 41635

Honorable David A. Cohen Attorney at Law Yunker & Associates P.O. Box 21784 Lexington, KY 40522-1784

Dr. Bob Davis 113 Pebble Beach Georgetown, KY 40324 William K. Grigsby
Assistant Manager
Thacker-Grigsby Telephone Company, Inc.
9500 Communications Lane
P.O. Box 789
Hindman, KY 41822

Honorable William R. Atkinson Sprint Communications Company L.P. Southeast Division 3065 Cumberland Blvd. Mailstop GAATLD0602 Atlanta, GA 30339

Trevor R. Bonnstetter General Manager West Kentucky Rural Telephone Cooperative Corporation, Inc. 237 North Eighth Street P.O. Box 649 Mayfield, KY 42066-0649

Stephen R. Byars Vice President-External Affairs Kentucky ALLTEL, Inc. P.O. Box 1650 Lexington, KY 40588-1650

Honorable Dorothy J. Chambers Senior State Operations Counsel BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc. 601 West Chestnut Street, 4NE P.O. Box 32410 Louisville, KY 40232

Joan Coleman
Director-Regulatory & External Affairs
BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc.
601 West Chestnut Street, 4NE
P.O. Box 32410
Louisville, KY 40232

Keith Gabbard Manager Peoples Rural Telephone Cooperative Corporation, Inc. P. O. Box 159 McKee, KY 40447 James Hamby
Office Manager
Highland Telephone Cooperative, Inc.
P.O. Box 119
7840 Morgan County Highway
Sunbright, TN 37872

Jeff Handley
Manager-Revenue & Earnings
Leslie County Telephone Company, Inc. c/o TDS-Telecom Southeast Division
9737 Cogdill Road, Suite 230
Knoxville, TN 37932-3374

Honorable C. Kent Hatfield Attorney at Law Middleton & Reutlinger 2500 Brown & Williamson Tower Louisville, KY 40202

William W. Magruder
Duo County Telephone Cooperative
Corporation, Inc.
1021 West Cumberland Avenue
P.O. Box 80
Jamestown, KY 42629

Honorable James R Newberry, Jr. Wyatt, Tarrant & Combs, LLP Lexington Financial Center 250 West Main Street, Suite 1700 Lexington, KY 40507

John Powell President Computer Innovations P.O. Box 539 Richmond, KY 40476

Honorable W. Brent Rice Attorney At Law McBayer, McGinnis, Leslie and Kirkland, PLLC 201 East Main Street Suite 1000 Lexington, KY 40507 F. Thomas Rowland
Executive V.P./General Manager
North Central Telephone
Cooperative, Inc.
872 Highway 52 By-Pass
P.O. Box 70
Lafayette, TN 37083-0070

Jeff Handley
Manager-Revenue & Earnings
Lewisport Telephone Company, Inc.
c/o TDS-Telecom Southeast Division
9737 Cogdill Road
Suite 230
Knoxville, TN 37932-3374

Honorable John N. Hughes Attorney At Law 124 West Todd Street Frankfort, KY 40601

Honorable Thomas A. Marshall Attorney At Law 212 Washington Street P.O. Box 223 Frankfort, KY 40601

Harlon E. Parker
General Manager
Ballard Rural Telephone Cooperative
Corporation, Inc.
159W. 2nd Street
P.O. Box 209
La Center, KY 42056-0209

Thomas E. Preston Foothills Rural Telephone Cooperative Corporation, Inc. 1621 Kentucky Route 40 W P.O. Box 240 Staffordsville, KY 41256

Mark Romito
Director - Government Relations
Cincinnati Bell Telephone Company
201 East Fourth Street
P.O. Box 2301
Cincinnati, OH 45201-2301

David Sandidge Electric And Water Plant Board Of The City Of Frankfort 317 West Second Street Frankfort, KY 40601

Jeff Handley
Manager-Revenue & Earnings
Salem Telephone Company
c/o TDS-Telecom Southeast Division
9737 Cogdill Road
Suite 230
Knoxville, TN 37932-3374

Thomas Kramer
Sr. Vice President
Cincinnati Bell Long Distance Inc.
CBLD Center, Suite 2300
36 East Seventh Street
Cincinnati, OH 45202

Darrell Maynard
President
SouthEast Telephone, Inc.
106 Power Drive
P.O. Box 1001
Pikeville, KY 41502-1001

John A. Powell AEEP, Inc. 205 South Third Street Richmond, KY 40475

Clinton Quenzer Logan Telephone Cooperative, Inc. P.O. Box 97 10725 Bowling Green Road Auburn, KY 42206

F. Thomas Rowland
Executive V.P./General Manager
North Central Telephone
Cooperative, Inc.
872 Highway 52 By-Pass
P.O. Box 70
Lafayette, TN 37083-0070

Robin H. Taylor BellSouth BSE, Inc. 400 Perimeter Center Terrace North Terraces Bldg., Suite 220 Atlanta, GA 30346

Robin H. Taylor BellSouth Long Distance, Inc. 400 Perimeter Center Terrace North Terraces Bldg. - Suite 400 Atlanta, GA 30346

Craig Winstead
Owner
SPIS.net
P.O. Box 1250
Dulin Street
Madisonville, KY 42431

Daryl Wyatt General Manager South Central Telcom, LLC 1399 Happy Valley Road P.O. Drawer 159 Glasgow, KY 42141-0159

Hon. Robert A. Bowman Hobson & Bowman 222 W. Main Street Frankfort, KY 40601

Scott E. Beer ICG Telecom Group, Inc. 180 Grand Avenue, Suite 450 Oakland, CA 94612 J. D. Tobin, Jr.
Brandenburg Telephone Company, Inc.
200 Telco Road
P.O. Box 599
Brandenburg, KY 40108

A.D. Wright e-Tel, LLC 607 Broadway Paducah, KY 42001

Allison T. Willoughby Brandenburg Telecom, LLC 200 Telco Drive Brandenburg, KY 40108

Daryl Wyatt General Manager South Central Rural Telephone Cooperative Corporation, Inc. 1399 Happy Valley Road P. O. Box 159 Glasgow, KY 42141-0159

Hon. David C. Olson Frost, Brown Todd, LLC 2200 PNC Center 201 E. 5<sup>th</sup> Street Cincinnati, OH 45202-4182

Henry Walker