

Mary K. Keyer General Attorney Kentucky Legal Department AT&T Kentucky 601 W. Chestnut Street Room 407 Louisville, KY 40203 T 502-582-8219 F 502-582-1573 mary.keyer@att.com

April 26, 2010

## VIA OVERNIGHT MAIL

RECEIVED

APR 27 2010 PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

Mr. Jeff Derouen Executive Director Kentucky Public Service Commission 211 Sower Boulevard P.O. Box 615 Frankfort, KY 40602

> Re: MCI Communications, Services, Inc., Bell Atlantic Communications. Inc., NYNEX Long Distance Company, TTI National, Inc., Teleconnect Long Distance Services & Systems Company and Verizon Select Services, Inc., Complainants v. Windstream Kentucky West, Inc., Windstream Kentucky East, Inc.-Lexington, and Windstream Kentucky East, Inc.-London, Defendants PSC 2007-00503

Dear Mr. Derouen:

Enclosed for filing in the above-captioned case are Supplemental Responses of BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc., d/b/a AT&T Kentucky and AT&T Communications of the South Central States, LLC to Item Nos. 6 and 7 of the First Data Requests of Windstream Kentucky East, LLC and Windstream Kentucky, West, LLC dated February 12, 2010.

A portion of AT&T's responses contains confidential commercial information and AT&T files herewith its Motion for Confidentiality, pursuant to 807 KAR 5:001, Section 7, seeking protection of that material. Specifically, AT&T requests the Commission to grant confidentiality to the highlighted information in Supplemental Responses to Item Nos. 6 and 7. One proprietary copy and six edited copies are provided to the Commission. A proprietary copy is also provided to counsel to Windstream pursuant to a previously-signed Non-Disclosure Agreement. Edited copies of the filing are also provided to parties of record.

Should you have any questions, please let me know.



Enclosures

cc: Parties of Record 806493



### COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

#### BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

In the Matter of:

MCI COMMUNICATIONS SERVICES, INC., BELL ATLANTIC COMMUNICATIONS, INC., NYNEX LONG DISTANCE COMPANY, TTI NATIONAL, INC., TELECONNECT LONG DISTANCE SERVICES & SYSTEMS COMPANY AND VERIZON SELECT SERVICES, INC.	) ) ) )
Complainants	) CASE NO. ) 2007-00503
VS.	)
WINDSTREAM KENTUCKY WEST, INC., WINDSTREAM KENTUCKY EAST, INC. – LEXINGTON AND WINDSTREAM KENTUCKY EAST, INC. – LONDON	) ) )
Defendants	)

## MOTION FOR CONFIDENTIALITY OF BELLSOUTH TELECOMMUNICATIONS, INC. D/B/A AT&T KENTUCKY AND AT&T COMMUNICATIONS OF THE SOUTH CENTRAL STATES, LLC

Petitioner, BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc. d/b/a AT&T Kentucky and AT&T Communications of the South Central States, LLC ("AT&T"), by counsel, hereby moves the Public Service Commission of the Commonwealth of Kentucky (the "Commission"), pursuant to KRS 61.878 and 807 KAR 5:001, § 7, to classify as confidential the highlighted information in AT&T's Supplemental Responses to Windstream's First Set of Data Requests, Nos. 6 and 7, filed herewith. The material that is highlighted contains company information specific to market share of identified long distance providers in AT&T Kentucky's territory. The Kentucky Open Records Act exempts certain information from the public disclosure requirements of the Act, including confidential and/or proprietary information, the disclosure of which would permit an unfair commercial advantage to competitors. KRS 61.878(1)(c)1. To qualify for the commercial information exemption and, therefore, keep the information confidential, a party must establish that disclosure of the commercial information would permit an unfair advantage to competitors and the parties seeking confidentiality if openly discussed. KRS 61.878(1)(c)1; 807 KAR 5:001 § 7. The Commission has taken the position that the statute and rules require the party to demonstrate actual competition and the likelihood of competitive injury if the information is disclosed.

The information for which AT&T seeks confidentiality contains carrier-specific market share information. Specifically, the information that is highlighted in Supplemental Responses to Item Nos. 6 and 7 is company-specific data regarding the percentage of customers who have selected the identified carriers as their long distance providers. This data contains market sensitive information that could compromise AT&T's and the identified carriers' competitive positions in the long distance market.

Public disclosure of the identified information would provide competitors that provide services similar to AT&T and the identified carriers, namely CLECs, IXCs, and other competitors, with an unfair competitive advantage. The Commission should also grant confidential treatment to the information for the following reasons:

(1) The information for which AT&T is requesting confidential treatment is not known outside of AT&T;

2

(2) The information is not disseminated within AT&T and is known only by those of AT&T 's employees who have a legitimate business need to know and act upon the information;

(3) AT&T seeks to preserve the confidentiality of this information through

appropriate means, including the maintenance of appropriate security at its offices; and

(4) By granting AT&T's petition, there would be no damage to any public interest.

For the reasons stated herein, the Commission should grant AT&T's request for confidential treatment of the identified information.

Respectfully submitted,

Mary K. Keyer 601 W. Chestnut Street, Room 407 Louisville, KY 40203 (502) 582-8219 <u>mary.keyer@att.com</u>

COUNSEL FOR BELLSOUTH TELECOMMUNICATIONS, INC. D/B/A AT&T KENTUCKY AND AT&T COMMUNICATIONS OF THE SOUTH CENTRAL STATES, LLC

806494

AT&T Kentucky and AT&T Communications Supplemental Response KY PSC Case No. 2007-00503 Windstream's First Set of Data Requests February 12, 2010 Item No. 6 Page 1 of 1

- REQUEST: Provide all documents and information you maintain relating to the respective market share of Sprint long distance affiliates in your incumbent local exchange carrier's service territories.
- RESPONSE: AT&T objects to this request for the reasons set forth in its initial response to Windstream's First Data Request No. 6. Without waiving its objections, AT&T supplements its initial response and states that as of end of year 2009, **Second** of its business customers and **Second** of its residential customers had selected Sprint as their long distance provider.

# EDITED

AT&T Kentucky and AT&T Communications Supplemental Response KY PSC Case No. 2007-00503 Windstream's First Set of Data Requests February 12, 2010 Item No. 7 Page 1 of 1

- REQUEST: Provide all documents and information you maintain relating to the respective market share of Verizon long distance affiliates in your incumbent local exchange carrier's service territories.
- RESPONSE: AT&T objects to this request for the reasons set forth in its initial response to Windstream's First Data Request No. 7. Without waiving its objections, AT&T supplements its initial response and states that as of end of year 2009, for the business customers and for the residential customers had selected Verizon as their long distance provider.

806393

EDITED

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing was served on the following

individuals by mailing a copy thereof, this 26th day of April 2010.

Honorable Douglas F. Brent Stoll Keenon Ogden, PLLC 2000 PNC Plaza 500 W. Jefferson Street Louisville, KY 40202-2828

Kimberly Caswell Associate General Counsel Verizon P.O. Box 110, MC FLTC0007 Tampa, FL 33601-0110

Honorable John N. Hughes Attorney at Law 124 West Todd Street Frankfort, KY 40601

Honorable Robert C. Moore Hazelrigg & Cox, LLP 415 West Main Street P.O. Box 676 Frankfort, KY 40602

Dulaney L O'Roark III VP & General Counsel - SE Region Verizon 5055 North Point Parkway Alpharetta, GA 30022

Jeanne Shearer Windstream Kentucky East, LLC Windstream Kentucky West, LLC 124 E. Main Street P. O. Box 458 Ephrata, PA 17522-0458