

Elizabeth O'Donnell Executive Director Kentucky Public Service Commission 211 Sower Boulevard Frankfort, Kentucky 40602-0615

RECEIVED

JUN 29 2007

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

June 29, 2007

E.ON U.S. LLC State Regulation and Rates 220 West Main Street PO Box 32010 Louisville, Kentucky 40232 www.eon-us.com

Rick E. Lovekamp Manager – Regulatory Affairs T 502-627-3780 F 502-627-3213 rick.lovekamp@eon-us.com

RE: <u>AN INVESTIGATION OF THE RELIABILITY MEASURES OF KENTUCKY'S JURISDICTIONAL ELECTRIC DISTRIBUTION UTILITIES AND CERTAIN RELIABILITY MAINTENANCE PRACTICES</u> - Adm Case 2006-00494

Dear Ms. O'Donnell:

Enclosed please find an original and ten (10) copies of Kentucky Utilities Company ("KU") and Louisville Gas and Electric Company ("LG&E") Joint Post-Hearing Brief in compliance with the procedural schedule in Appendix B of the Commissions order dated December 12, 2006, in the above-referenced docket.

Should you have any questions concerning the enclosed, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Sincerely,

Rick E. Lovekamp

cc: Parties of Record

#### COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

#### BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

In the Matter of:

AN INVESTIGATION OF THE RELIABILITY	)	
MEASURES OF KENTUCKY'S JURISDICTIONAL	)	
ELECTRIC DISTRIBUTION UTILITIES AND	)	CASE NO. 2006-00494
CERTAIN RELIABILITY MAINTENANCE	)	
PRACTICES	)	

# JOINT POST-HEARING BRIEF OF KENTUCKY UTILITIES COMPANY AND LOUISVILLE GAS AND ELECTRIC COMPANY

\* \* \* \* \*

### INTRODUCTION

This investigation was initiated by the Commission on December 12, 2006. Following two rounds of discovery and an informal conference, the Commission held an evidentiary hearing on May 23, 2007. In compliance with the procedural schedule in Appendix B of the Commissions order dated December 12, 2006, Kentucky Utilities Company ("KU") and Louisville Gas and Electric Company ("LG&E") (collectively the "Companies") submit their joint brief to address the primary issues raised in this proceeding.

#### **ARGUMENT**

#### I. A Regular System Level Reliability Reporting Requirement is appropriate.

The first issue to be addressed is whether this Commission should require regular reporting of reliability information from all distribution utilities. It is the Companies' position that requiring such reporting is appropriate and would provide the Commission with useful data on utility reliability across the Commonwealth. However, the Companies believe that the Commission should establish standardized criteria, so that reporting by all utilities is done similarly.

Specifically, it is the Companies' position that reporting of SAIDI and SAIFI to the Commission would be appropriate. In addition, reporting should be required only on the system level. Reporting at the system level is the most appropriate given the diverse geographical characteristics and population density differences associated with individual circuits across Kentucky. Finally, KU and LG&E believe that major events – those such as tornados, major storm events, and extreme ice loading – should be excluded from any reporting requirement, because doing so would provide a more accurate assessment of system performance that is under the utilities' control. To the extent that the Commission decides to include major events within reliability reporting, however, the Companies recommend that the Commission provide a standardized definition of major events and that it allow utilities to report such events as a separate category of the indices.

# II. The Commission Should Not Establish Reliability Performance Standards.

While KU and LG&E believe that reliability reporting is appropriate, it is their position that the Commission should not adopt a reliability performance standard at this time, for two reasons. First, in order to be fair and meaningful, any standard of performance should be applied consistently to all customers and utilities.<sup>3</sup> However, creation of a consistent standard would be difficult due to the unique operational circumstances – such as a diversity of geography and variety of population density – faced by Kentucky's distribution utilities. Second, the Commission already has plenary authority to ensure the provision of adequate, efficient and reasonable service by all distribution utilities, and the exercise of that authority over the years

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Transcript of Evidence ("TE"), p. 35, line 21 to p. Pre-Filed Testimony of Paul Gregory (Greg) Thomas ("Thomas Testimony"), p. 5, lines 3-6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Thomas Testimony, p. 5, lines 11-21. <sup>3</sup> *Id.*, p. 6, lines 2-9; TE, p. 39, lines 2-9.

appears to the Companies to have worked well.<sup>4</sup> Accordingly, it seems unnecessary to create an additional level of authority, through establishment of a uniform performance standard, to ensure the continuing provision of adequate, efficient and reasonable service to Kentucky's utility ratepayers. In lieu of the development of a consistent performance standard, the Companies would support the use of Reliability Reporting by the Commission to monitor performance trends on a utility-by-utility basis to insure adequate and reasonable performance.

The Companies' position on creation of a standard notwithstanding, to the extent the Commission is inclined to pursue a performance standard, it is the view of KU and LG&E that the Commission should follow a measured approach to develop that standard. That approach should begin with the collection of standardized reliability data from each distribution utility. After sufficient information has been obtained, the Commission could then use that information, which would be common to all utilities, to draw conclusions about reliability performance and the need for performance standards.

# III. The Commission Should Not Adopt A Right-of-Way (ROW) Management Standard.

The final issue to be addressed is whether the Commission should adopt a standard for ROW maintenance. It is the Companies' position that a standard should not be adopted. A rigid standard, prescribing the width of the ROW to be cleared, is impractical due to the wide range of easement widths, differences between rural and urban service territories, applicability of local codes or ordinances, and the need to maintain some level of flexibility in addressing landowner

.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> KRS 278.030.

requests or concerns.<sup>5</sup> Moreover, such a standard is likely to increase the cost of, and the level of landowner discontent with, utility ROW clearing activities.<sup>6</sup>

Nonetheless, should the Commission determine to create some standard for vegetation management, the Companies would again urge a measured approach. The Commission should consider creation of a stakeholder process involving all electric utilities, representatives of the state Fish and Wildlife department, and perhaps other interested persons or groups, for the purpose of providing input into the creation of such standard.<sup>7</sup>

# **CONCLUSION**

For all of the foregoing reasons, Kentucky Utilities Company and Louisville Gas and Electric Company respectfully request that the Commission enter an order concluding the investigation in a manner consistent with the positions set forth above.

Respectfully submitted,

Allyson K. Sturgeon
Corporate Attorney

Louisville Gas and Electric Company

Kentucky Utilities Company

220 West Main Street

Post Office Box 32010

Louisville, Kentucky 40232

Telephone: (502) 627-2088

Counsel for Kentucky Utilities Company and Louisville Gas and Electric Company

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Thomas Testimony, p. 7, lines 4-7, 15-23.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> *Id*, p. 8, lines 5-8. <sup>7</sup> TE., p. 128, lines 3-23.

# **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned hereby certifies that a true and correct copy of the foregoing Application was served on the following persons on the 29<sup>th</sup> day of June, 2007, U.S. mail, postage prepaid:

Allen Anderson, President/CEO South Kentucky R.E.C.C. P.O. Box 910 925-929 N. Main Street Somerset, KY 42502

Mark A. Bailey, President/CEO Kenergy Corp. P.O. Box 18 6402 Old Corydon Road Henderson, KY 42419

Jackie B. Browning, President/CEO Farmers R.E.C.C. 504 South Broadway P.O. Box 1298 Glasgow, KY 42141

John J. Finnigan Associate General Counsel Duke Energy Kentucky, Inc. 139 East Fourth Street Cincinnati, OH 45202

Carol H. Fraley President and CEO Grayson R.E.C.C. 109 Bagby Park Grayson, KY 41143

Larry Hicks, President/CEO Salt River Electric Cooperative Corp. 111 West Brashear Avenue P.O. Box 609 Bardstown, KY 40004

James L. Jacobus, President/CEO Inter-County Energy Cooperative Corporation 1009 Hustonville Road P.O. Box 87 Danville, KY 40423

Vince Heuser Nolin R.E.C.C. 411 Ring Road Elizabethtown, KY 42701-8701

Bobby D. Sexton President/General Manager Big Sandy R.E.C.C. 504 11<sup>th</sup> Street Paintsville, KY 41240 Michael I. Williams Senior Vice President Blue Grass Energy Cooperative Corp. P.O. Box 990 1201 Lexington Road Nicholasville, KY 40340

Sharon K. Carson Executive Vice President & CFO Jackson Energy Cooperative 115 Jackson Energy Lane McKee, KY 40447

Paul G. Embs, President & CEO Clark Energy Cooperative, Inc. P.O. Box 748 2640 Ironworks Road Winchester, KY 40392

Ted Hampton, President & CEO Cumberland Valley Electric, Inc. Highway 25E, P.O. Box 440 Gray, KY 40734

Kerry K. Howard, President & CEO Licking Valley R.E.C.C. P.O. Box 605 271 Main Street West Liberty, KY 41472

Daniel W. Brewer, President & CEO Blue Grass Energy Cooperative Corp. P. O. Box 990 1201 Lexington Road Nicholasville, KY 40340-0990

Burns E. Mercer, President/CEO Meade County R.E.C.C. P.O. Box 489 Brandenburg, KY 40108

G. Kelly Nuckols, President/CEO Jackson Purchase Energy Corporation 2900 Irvin Cobb Drive P.O. Box 4030 Paducah, KY 42002

Chris Perry, President/CEO Fleming-Mason Energy Cooperative P.O. Box 328 Flemingsburg, KY 41041 Debbie Martin, President & CEO Shelby Energy Cooperative, Inc. 620 Old Finchville Road Shelbyville, KY 40065

Barry L. Myers, Manager Taylor County R.E.C.C. 100 West Main Street P. O. Box 100 Campbellsville, KY 42719

Hon. Frank N. King, Jr. Attorney at Law Dorsey, King, Gray, Norment & Hopgood 318 Second Street Henderson, KY 42420

Robert Hood, President & CEO Owen Electric Cooperative, Inc. 8205 Highway 127 North P. O. Box 400 Owenton, KY 40359

Hon. Mark R. Overstreet Attorney at Law Stites & Harbison 421 West Main Street P. O. Box 634 Frankfort, KY 40602 Rick E. Lovekamp Kentucky Utilities Company Louisville Gas and Electric Company P. O. Box 32010 Louisville, KY 40232-2010

Clayton O. Oswald Taylor, Keller & Dunaway & Tooms Attorneys at Law 1306 West Fifth Street P. O. Box 905 London, KY 40743-0905

Lawrence W. Cook Assistant Attorney General Office of the Attorney General Utility & Rate 1024 Capital Center Drive, Suite 200 Frankfort, KY 40601-8204

Melissa D. Yates Attorney Denton & Keuler, LLP 555 Jefferson Street P. O. Box 929 Paducah, KY 42002-0929

Counsel for Louisville Gas and

Electric Company and Kentucky Utilities

Company