Teresa J. Hill, Secretary Environmental and Public Protection Cabinet

Christopher L. Lilly Commissioner Department of Public Protection

CT Corp System KY Home Life Building Louisville, KY 40202



Commonwealth of Kentucky Public Service Commission

211 Sower Blvd. P.O. Box 615 Frankfort, Kentucky 40602-0615 Telephone: (502) 564-3940 Fax: (502) 564-3460 psc.ky.gov

October 20, 2006

Mark David Goss Chairman

> John W. Clay Commissioner

RE: Case No. 2006-00401

We enclose one attested copy of the Commission's Order in the above case.

Sincerely,

Beth O'Donnell

Teresa J. Hill, Secretary **Environmental and Public Protection Cabinet** 

Christopher L. Lilly Commissioner Department of Public Protection

Insight Phone 810 Seventh Avenue New York, NY 10019



Commonwealth of Kentucky **Public Service Commission** 

211 Sower Blvd. P.O. Box 615 Frankfort, Kentucky 40602-0615 Telephone: (502) 564-3940 Fax: (502) 564-3460 psc.ky.gov

October 20, 2006

Mark David Goss Chairman

> John W. Clay Commissioner

RE: Case No. 2006-00401

We enclose one attested copy of the Commission's Order in the above case.

Sincerely,

Beth O'Donnell





Teresa J. Hill, Secretary Environmental and Public Protection Cabinet

Christopher L. Lilly Commissioner Department of Public Protection

Gregory Cameron Director, Telecom. Legal Affairs Insight Phone of Kentucky, LLC 810 7th. Avenue New York, NY 10019



Commonwealth of Kentucky

Public Service Commission
211 Sower Blvd.
P.O. Box 615

Frankfort, Kentucky 40602-0615
Telephone: (502) 564-3940

lephone: (502) 564-394 Fax: (502) 564-3460 psc.ky.gov

October 20, 2006

Mark David Goss Chairman

> John W. Clay Commissioner

RE: Case No. 2006-00401

We enclose one attested copy of the Commission's Order in the above case.

Sincerely,

Beth O'Donnell





Teresa J. Hill, Secretary Environmental and Public Protection Cabinet

Christopher L. Lilly Commissioner Department of Public Protection

Kenneth and LouAnn Schiess 1812 Millgate Road Louisville, KY 40223-1097



Commonwealth of Kentucky Public Service Commission

211 Sower Blvd. P.O. Box 615 Frankfort, Kentucky 40602-0615 Telephone: (502) 564-3940 Fax: (502) 564-3460 psc.ky.gov

October 20, 2006

Mark David Goss Chairman

> John W. Clay Commissioner

RE: Case No. 2006-00401

We enclose one attested copy of the Commission's Order in the above case.

Sincerely,

Beth O'Donnell Executive Director





Teresa J. Hill, Secretary Environmental and Public Protection Cabinet

Christopher L. Lilly Commissioner Department of Public Protection

Honorable Theodore Walton Attorney at Law UAW Legal Services Plans 1939 Goldsmith Lane Suite 117 Louisville, KY 40218



Commonwealth of Kentucky
Public Service Commission

211 Sower Blvd. P.O. Box 615 Frankfort, Kentucky 40602-0615 Telephone: (502) 564-3940 Fax: (502) 564-3460 psc.ky.gov

October 20, 2006

Mark David Goss Chairman

> John W. Clay Commissioner

RE: Case No. 2006-00401

We enclose one attested copy of the Commission's Order in the above case.

Sincerely,

Beth O'Donnell Executive Director

BOD/jc Enclosure



Teresa J. Hill, Secretary Environmental and Public Protection Cabinet

Christopher L. Lilly Commissioner Department of Public Protection

Marian Wright Billing Operations Manager Insight Phone of Kentucky, LLC 810 7th. Avenue New York, NY 10019



Commonwealth of Kentucky

Public Service Commission
211 Sower Blvd.

P.O. Box 615
Frankfort, Kentucky 40602-0615
Telephone: (502) 564-3940
Fax: (502) 564-3460
psc.ky.gov

October 20, 2006

Mark David Goss Chairman

> John W. Clay Commissioner

RE: Case No. 2006-00401

We enclose one attested copy of the Commission's Order in the above case.

Sincerely,

Beth O'Donnell



Gregory Cameron Director, Telecom. Legal Affairs Insight Phone of Kentucky, LLC 810 7th Avenue New York, NY 10019 CT Corp System KY Home Life Building Louisville, KY 40202 Insight Phone 810 Seventh Avenue New York, NY 10019

Kenneth and LouAnn Schiess 1812 Millgate Road Louisville, KY 40223-1097 Honorable Theodore Walton Attorney at Law UAW Legal Services Plans 1939 Goldsmith Lane Suite 117 Louisville, KY 40218 Marian Wright Billing Operations Manager Insight Phone of Kentucky, LLC 810 7th Avenue New York, NY 10019

## COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

## BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

In the Matter of:

KENNETH SCHIESS AND LOUANN SCHIESS	
COMPLAINANTS	)
V.	) CASE NO. 2006-0040
INSIGHT PHONE OF KENTUCKY, LLC	)
DEFENDANT	<i>)</i>

## ORDER

On September 21, 2006, Insight Phone of Kentucky, LLC ("Insight") filed its answer to this formal complaint with the Commission. The answer is signed by Marian Wright, Billing Operations Manager. On information and belief, Ms. Wright is not an attorney licensed to practice law in Kentucky.

No person may engage in the practice of law in Kentucky without first obtaining a license to practice.<sup>1</sup> The practice of law is:

[A]ny service rendered involving legal knowledge or legal advice, whether of representation, counsel or advocacy in or out of court, rendered in respect to the rights, duties, obligations, liabilities, or business relations of one requiring the services.<sup>2</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Kentucky Supreme Court Rule 2.100.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Kentucky Supreme Court Rule 3.020.

The practice of law includes, as Kentucky's highest court held in <u>Kentucky State Bar</u> <u>Association v. Henry Vogt Machine Co.</u>, 416 S.W.2d 727 (Ky. 1967), the representation of a corporation before a state administrative agency.

As to its own proceedings, this Commission has adopted a similar position and has required that those representing the interests of others before us be licensed attorneys. In a previous case, the Commission ordered that:

[A]ny attorney who is not licensed to practice in the State of Kentucky and who seeks to represent a client or employer before this Commission must engage a member of the Kentucky Bar Association. It logically follows that if an unlicensed attorney may not represent a client before this Commission, neither may a layman.<sup>3</sup>

The Commission therefore finds that Insight's answer fails to comply with Kentucky law and should not be accepted for filing. The Commission further finds that Insight should be afforded the opportunity to file an answer signed by an attorney licensed to practice law in Kentucky.

In addition, within the text of the answer filed and on the exhibit attached thereto it is indicated by Insight that it contains "confidential call detail records." The Commission is a public agency and the documents at issue are public records subject to the Open Records Act. "The basic policy of [the Open Records Act] is that free and open examination of public records is in the public interest and the exceptions provided for by KRS 61.878 or otherwise provided by law shall be strictly construed, even though such examination may cause inconvenience or embarrassment to public officials or others." The primary purpose

Administrative Case No. 249, Practice Before the Commission by Attorneys Non-Licensed in the Commonwealth of Kentucky (Ky. P.S.C. June 15, 1981) at 2.

of the Open Records Act is to inform the public as to whether governmental agencies are properly executing their statutory functions.

All material on file with the Commission is to be "open for inspection by any person, except as otherwise provided in KRS 61.870 to 61.884." A person requesting that the Commission grant confidential treatment has the burden to show that the material falls within an exclusion from disclosure requirements enumerated in the Open Records Act.

KRS 61.878(1)(c) of the Open Records Act provides an exemption for "records confidentially disclosed to an agency or required by an agency to be disclosed to it, generally recognized as confidential or proprietary, which if openly disclosed would permit an unfair commercial advantage to competitors of the entity that disclosed the records..."

To the extent that the parties rely on KRS 61.878(1)(c), they must show that the commercial documents are generally recognized as confidential or proprietary and that disclosure would permit an unfair commercial advantage to competitors. The court in <u>Southeastern United Medigroup, Inc. v. Hughes</u>, in considering KRS 61.878(1)(c), held that if it is established that a document sought to be withheld is confidential or proprietary, and if disclosure to competitors would provide substantially more than a trivial unfair advantage, the document should be protected from disclosure.

## IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that:

- 1. The answer is rejected for filing.
- Within 10 days of the date of this Order, an attorney licensed to practice in Kentucky shall be permitted to file an answer on behalf of Insight.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Southeastern United Medigroup, Inc. v. Hughes, 952 S.W.2d 195 (Ky.1997).

- 3. If Insight asserts that any part of its answer is confidential, then the answer must be accompanied by a petition for confidentiality pursuant to KRS 61.878.
- 4. The Commission will hold the information filed and marked confidential for 20 days, it will then be placed in the public record if no such petition as described herein is received.

Done at Frankfort, Kentucky, this 20th day of October, 2006.

By the Commission

ATTEST: