

1578 Highway 44 East, Suite 6 P.O. Box 369 Shepherdsville, KY 40165-0369 Phone (502) 955-4400 or (800) 516-4293 Fax (502) 543-4410 or (800) 541-4410

RECEIVED

NOV 09 2017

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

VIA FEDEX

November 8, 2017

Gwen R. Pinson, Executive Director Kentucky Public Service Commission P.O. Box 615 Frankfort, KY 40602-0615

Re:

Response to Request for Intervention

PSC Case No.: 2017-00368

Site Name: Symsonia

Dear Ms. Pinson:

We have received and responded to a Request To Intervene from Jose M. Flores concerning this tower site. Please find enclosed our response to their concerns and make this letter and its enclosures a part of the administrative record. Do not hesitate to contact us with any concerns regarding this matter

Sincerely,

David A. Pike

Attorney for New Cingular Wireless PCS, LLC

d/b/a AT&T Mobility

Enclosure

cc: Brittany Hayes Koenig, Div. of General Counsel

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

RECEIVED

NOV 0 9 2017
PUBLIC SERVICE
COMMISSION
CASE NO.: 2017-00368

SITE NAME: SYMSONIA

RESPONSE TO REQUEST TO INTERVENE

Applicant New Cingular Wireless PCS, LLC, d/b/a AT&T Mobility ("AT&T Mobility"), by counsel, make this Response to Request to Intervene. Applicant respectfully states, as follows:

- 1. A Request to Intervene made by Jose M. Flores offers no new evidence in support of intervention and largely duplicates the claims of his initial filing without directly countering that there are no grounds for denial of the subject application and substantial evidence of record exists in support of the requested CPCN, as set forth in Applicant's Response filed September 29, 2017.
- 2. Mr. Flores repeats his generalized concerns about "property values and aesthetics," but otherwise attaches no expert testimony in support of his concerns to the motion. A denial of the Application could not be supported by Mr. Flores' assertions. Moreover, Mr. Flores does not detail why the proposed tower site should be rejected under statute or regulation even if his concerns as to property values and aesthetics were

true.

زني

- 3. Mr. Flores acknowledges that that there is a problem with cell phone coverage in the area, but expresses the unsupported lay opinion that there are more appropriate locations for a new tower without offering any specific alternatives and without demonstrating that another location is available for leasing, would meet the radio frequency needs of the project, and would not result in opposition from other property owners in the area.
- 4. The Public Service Commission should not become a facilitator to Mr. Flores' efforts to circumvent clear and controlling legal precedent. 807 K.A.R. 5:001 Section 4 (11)(b) provides:
 - "(b) The commission shall grant a person leave to intervene if the commission finds that he or she had made a timely motion for intervention and that he or she has a special interest in the case that is not otherwise adequately represented or that his or her <u>intervention</u> is likely to present issues or to develop facts that assist the commission in fully considering the matter without unduly complicating or disrupting the proceedings." (Emphasis added). Id at 807 K.A.R. 5:001 Section 4 -1 (11)(b).

Federal Courts recognize that lay opinion or generalized aesthetic concerns are not substantial evidence justifying a rejection of this application. <u>Cellco Partnership v. Franklin Co.</u>, KY, 553 F. Supp. 2d 838, 845-846 (E.D. Ky. 2008). Unsupported opinion is not substantial evidence. <u>Cellco Partnership</u> at 849. Generalized expressions of concerns with "aesthetics" are not substantial evidence. <u>Cellco Partnership</u> at 851.

It is clear the Request to Intervene adds nothing to Mr. Flores' initial filing and provides no credible response to the issues raised by Applicant's Response filed September 29, 2017.

WHEREFORE, Applicant respectfully requests the Kentucky Public Service

Commission:

- (a) Accept this Response to Request to Intervene for filing:
- (b) Deny the Request to Intervene; and
- (c) Grant Applicant any other relief to which it is entitled.

Respectfully submitted,

David A. Pike

Attorney for Applicant

Pike Legal Group, PLLC

1578 Highway 44 East, Suite 6

P. O. Box 369

Shepherdsville, KY 40165-0369

Telephone: (502) 955-4400

Telefax:

(502) 543-4410

Email: dpike@pikelegal.com

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that on this $\frac{1}{2}$ day of November 2017, a true and accurate copy of the foregoing was sent by U.S. Postal Service first class mail. postage prepaid, to Jose M. Flores, 181 Symsonia Rd, Symsonia, KY 42082.

David A. Pike

Attorney for Applicant