Matthew G. Bevin Governor

Charles G. Snavely Secretary Energy and Environment Cabinet



Commonwealth of Kentucky Public Service Commission 211 Sower Blvd. P.O. Box 615 Frankfort, Kentucky 40602-0615 Telephone: (502) 564-3940 Fax: (502) 564-3460 psc.ky.gov

January 20, 2016

James W. Gardner Chairman

Daniel E. Logsdon Jr. Vice Chairman

> J. Roger Thomas Commissioner

PARTIES OF RECORD

Re: Case No. 2015-00353

Attached is a copy of a letter with attachment dated January 19, 2016, from Mickey T. Webster to David Spenard, Staff Attorney, Public Service Commission. This document has been filed in the record of the above referenced case. Any comments regarding this correspondence should be submitted to the Commission within five days of receipt of this letter. Any questions regarding this letter should be directed to David Spenard, Staff Attorney, at (502) 782-2580

Sincerely Jeff Derouen **Executive Director**

DES/ph

Attachment

KentuckyUnbridledSpirit.com

Kentuc

An Equal Opportunity Employer M/F/D



Lexington Financial Center 250 West Main Street, Suite 1600 Lexington, Kentucky 40507-1746 859.233.2012 Fax: 859.259.0649

Mickey T. Webster 859.288.7622 mwebster@wyattfirm.com

January 19, 2016

VIA HAND DELIVERY ONLY

David Spenard Staff Attorney Kentucky Public Service Commission 211 Sower Boulevard Frankfort, KY 40602

RE: In the Matter of: Mountain Water District, Former Commissioners Rhonda James, Lester John Collins, Toni Akers and Mike Litafik Case No. 2015-00353

Dear Mr. Spenard:

Enclosed please find a copy of the Stipulation of Facts and Settlement Agreement in the above-referenced matter, with signature pages for my clients, the individual former commissioners of the Mountain Water District.

Please contact me if you have any questions.

Very truly yours,

WYATT, TARRANT & COMBS, LLP

Mickey T. Webster

MTW Enclosure 61448151.1

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

In the Matter of:

MOUNTAIN WATER DISTRICT; RHONDA JAMES, COMMISSIONER AND CHAIRPERSON; LESTER "JOHN" COLLINS, COMMISSIONER; TONI AKERS, FORMER COMMISSIONER; AND MIKE LITAFIK, FORMER COMMISSIONER

CASE NO. 2015-00353

ALLEGED FAILURE TO COMPLY WITH KRS 278.300(1)

STIPULATION OF FACTS AND SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

By Order entered November 2, 2015, the Commission initiated this proceeding to determine whether Mountain Water District ("MWD"); Rhonda James, Former Commissioner and Chairperson; Lester "John" Collins, Former Commissioner; Toni Akers, Former Commissioner; and Mike Litafik, Former Commissioner (collectively "Respondents") should be subject to the penalties prescribed in KRS 278.990 for aiding and abetting an alleged violation of KRS 278.300(1), which states that no utility shall issue any form of indebtedness until it has been authorized to do so by an order of the Commission.

The alleged violation giving rise to this case is MWD's execution of a \$500,000 "forgivable loan" payable to Utility Management Group, LLC ("UMG"), for which prior Commission approval was required under KRS 278.300, but was never sought or obtained. Commission Staff alleges that it discovered this "forgivable loan" during an examination of MWD's financial records in the course of reviewing MWD's application

-1-

for a rate adjustment pursuant to 807 KAR 5:076.¹ The "forgivable loan" was executed as part of the "Amendment to Agreement for Operations, Maintenance and Management Services" dated April 29, 2009, wherein UMG agreed to provide MWD a \$500,000 forgivable loan, to be amortized over a five-year period at a simple interest rate of five percent per annum.²

The minutes of the MWD Board Special Meeting held on April 3, 2009, reflect that UMG had proposed to provide MWD with a \$500,000 forgivable loan in exchange for MWD extending its contract with UMG.³ The minutes of the MWD Board Special Meeting held on April 6, 2009, reflect that all MWD Commissioners then serving, with the exception of Commissioner Earl Sullivan, voted in favor of approving a proposed amended contract with UMG containing the loan provision.⁴ The minutes of the MWD Board Regular Meeting held on April 29, 2009, reflect that then serving Commissioner and Chairperson Akers, Commissioner Litafik, and Commissioner Collins again voted to approve the amended contract containing the loan provision.⁵

On November 23, 2015, each of the Respondents filed responses to the Commission's Order. They each admitted that one of the provisions of the April 29, 2009 Operating Agreement with UMG was a "forgivable loan" in the amount of

¹ Case No. 2014-00342, Application of Mountain Water District for an Adjustment of Water and Sewer Rates (Ky. PSC Oct. 9, 2015).

² Case No. 2014-00342, MWD Response to PSC First Request for Information ("PSC First Request"), Vol. 1 of 7, Item 3(c) (attached hereto as Appendix A).

³ Case No. 2014-00342, MWD Response to PSC First Request, Vol. 1 of 7, Item 3(b). Minutes of MWD Board of Commissioners Special Meeting, April 3, 2009 (attached hereto as Appendix B).

⁴ Case No. 2014-00342, MWD Response to PSC First Request, Vol. 1 of 7, Item 3(b). Minutes of MWD Board of Commissioners Special Meeting, April 6, 2009 (attached hereto as Appendix C).

⁵ Case No. 2014-00342, MWD Response to PSC First Request, Vol. 1 of 7, Item 3(b). Minutes of MWD Board of Commissioners Regular Meeting, April 29, 2009 (attached hereto as Appendix D).

\$500,000, but disputed whether the "forgivable loan" was in fact an "evidence of indebtedness" or otherwise set to expire after two years so as to fall under KRS 278.300, and they argued that this action was barred by the statute of limitations. Each of the named former commissioners also disputed any "willful" action on their respective part in committing the alleged violation, emphasizing their reliance on MWD's legal counsel. Each former commissioner further maintained that the Commission received reasonable notice of the "forgivable loan" by way of MWD's financial disclosure statement in July 2010, as well as MWD's financial audit in September 2010. Additionally, each commissioner argued that this action was barred by statutory immunity and that the proceedings violate their respective due process rights. Respondent Rhonda James also stated that she is a former Commissioner and Chairperson of MWD's Board of Commissioners,⁶ while respondent Lester "John" Collins stated that he too is a former Commissioner of MWD's Board of Commissioners.⁷

At Respondents' request, Commission Staff conducted an informal conference on January 5, 2016. At that conference, Respondents' responses to the allegations were discussed, as well as possible terms of a stipulation agreement.

Respondents and Commission Staff submit the following Stipulation of Facts and Settlement Agreement ("Stipulation") for the Commission's consideration in rendering its decision in this proceeding:

1. MWD is a water district organized pursuant to KRS Chapter 74.

⁶ Respondent Rhonda James' Response to the Commission's Order of November 2, 2015 (filed Nov. 23, 2015) at 1.

⁷ Respondent Lester "John" Collins' Response to the Commission's Order of November 2, 2015 (filed Nov. 23, 2015) at 1.

2. MWD is a utility and is subject to the provisions of KRS Chapter 278.

A five-member board of commissioners controls and manages MWD's affairs.

4. Former members of MWD's Board of Commissioners include Rhonda James, Lester "John" Collins, Toni Akers, and Mike Litafik.

5. Minutes of the MWD Board of Commissioners Special Meeting held on April 3, 2009 and April 6, 2009 are attached hereto, in addition to minutes of the MWD Board of Commissioners Regular Meeting held on April 29, 2009.

6. Rhonda James, Lester "John" Collins, Toni Akers, and Mike Litafik approved the "forgivable loan" with UMG in their capacity as commissioners of MWD and in furtherance of their duties as commissioners, as reflected by the Board minutes attached hereto.

7. Should Rhonda James, Lester "John" Collins, Toni Akers, and Mike Litafik assume the role as commissioner of MWD in the future, they shall attend the mandatory new commissioner training required pursuant to KRS 74.020(8)(a), and they shall, in addition to the mandatory training, attend an extra five hours of Commission accredited training within twelve months of his or her appointment.

8. MWD shall pay a fine of \$500, pursuant to KRS 278.990, which allows for the imposition of a fine for a violation of KRS 278.300.

9. The Commission's acceptance of this Stipulation will satisfy and resolve any and all claims against the Respondents, individually or collectively, and MWD for any violation of KRS Chapter 278 or for any penalty under KRS 278.990 arising out of MWD's execution of the "forgivable loan" at issue. 10. This Stipulation is not an admission of any Respondent that any Respondent aided or abetted any violation of KRS 278.300 or of any other provision of KRS Chapter 278 or that MWD violated KRS 278.300. The Commission's acceptance of this Stipulation shall not be construed as a finding that MWD violated any statute or that any of the Respondents aided or abetted any violation of KRS Chapter 278.

11. In the event the Commission does not accept this Stipulation in its entirety, Respondents reserve the right to withdraw therefrom and require that a hearing be held on any and all issues herein, and that none of the provisions contained herein shall be used as an admission by Respondents of any liability in any legal proceeding or lawsuit arising out of the facts set forth in this Stipulation.

12. This Stipulation is for use in PSC Case No. 2015-00353. None of its provisions establishes any precedent for any other case. Neither Respondents nor Commission Staff shall be bound by any part of this Stipulation in any other proceeding, except that it may be used in any proceeding by the Commission to investigate or enforce the terms of this Stipulation. Respondents shall not be precluded or estopped from raising any issue, claim, or defense, therein by reason of the execution of this Stipulation.

13. If the Commission accepts and adopts this Stipulation, any Respondent failing to comply with Paragraphs 7 or 8 of this Stipulation shall have failed to obey a Commission Order and may be subject to civil penalties under KRS 278.990(1) for his or her failure.

14. The Commission's acceptance and adoption of this Stipulation does not result in any change or alteration to the forfeiture provision of KRS 74.020(8)(b) for a

failure of any Respondent to complete the program of instruction described in KRS 74.020(8)(a).

15. Respondents and Commission Staff agree that the foregoing Stipulation is reasonable, is in the public interest, and should be adopted in its entirety by the Commission. If adopted by the Commission, Respondents waive their right to a hearing in this matter and will not petition for rehearing or bring an action for review in Franklin Circuit Court.

(Print name) MIKE LITAFIK By: (Sign name) Muhe Ritafah Former commissioner 1/14/16 Title Date

By:	(Print name)	TONI AKERS
	(Sign name)	Joni akers
Title		Former Commissioner
Date		1-13-15



By:	(Print name)	Rhonda James
	(Sign name)	Rhenda James
Title	and .	Former Commissioner
Date		1/15/2016



Achu" Collins (Print name) By: ester (Sign name) _ ammissioner Former Title Date

MOUNTAIN WATER DISTRICT

By:	(Print name)	
	(Sign name)	
Title		
Date		
STAF	F OF THE PU	BLIC SERVICE COMMISSION
		BLIC SERVICE COMMISSION
	(Print name)	
	(Print name)	

Toni Akers PO Box 392 Pikeville, KENTUCKY 41501

Toni Akers 192 Bowles Park Drive, A-4 Pikeville, KENTUCKY 41501

*Lester "John" Collins 4005 Raccoon Road Raccoon, KENTUCKY 41557 *Douglas McSwain Wyatt, Tarrant & Combs, LLP 250 West Main Street Suite 1600 Lexington, KENTUCKY 40507-1746

*Mountain Water District 6332 Zebulon Highway P. O. Box 3157 Pikeville, KY 41502-3157

*Roy Sawyers District Administrator Mountain Water District P. O. Box 3157 Pikeville, KY 41502

*Honorable John N Hughes Attorney at Law 124 West Todd Street Frankfort, KENTUCKY 40601

Rhonda James Chairperson 146 Main Street Pikeville, KENTUCKY 41501

Rhonda James Chairperson Mountain Water District P. O. Box 3157 Pikeville, KY 41502

Mike Litafik 7617 Upper Johns Creek Road Phelps, KENTUCKY 41553 *Mickey T Webster Wyatt, Tarrant & Combs, LLP 250 West Main Street Suite 1600 Lexington, KENTUCKY 40507-1746