Dinsmôre

Legal Counsel.

DINSMORE & SHOHL LLP
101 South Fifth Street ^ Suite 2500 ^ Louisville, KY 40202
www.dinsmore.com

RECEIVED

OCT 28 2011

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

Edward T. Depp 502-540-2347 tip.depp@dinsmore.com

October 28, 2011

VIA HAND-DELIVERY

Hon. Jeff R. Derouen Executive Director Public Service Commission 211 Sower Blvd. P. O. Box 615 Frankfort, KY 40602-0615

Re: In the Matter of: An investigation into the traffic dispute between Windstream Kentucky East, LLC, Brandenburg Telephone Company and MCIMetro Access Transmission Services, LLC d/b/a Verizon Access, Commonwealth of Kentucky, Case No. 2008-00203

Dear Mr. Derouen:

Enclosed for filing in the above-referenced case, please find one original and eleven (11) copies each of Brandenburg Telephone Company's Petition for Confidentiality.

Please file-stamp one copy and return them to our delivery person.

Thank you, and if you have any questions, please call me.

•

Sincerely,

DINSMORE & SHOHL LLP

Edward T. Depp

ETD/kwi Enclosures

cc: All parties of record

RECEIVED

OCT 28 2011

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

In the Matter of:

AN INVESTIGATION INTO THE TRAFFIC)	
DISPUTE BETWEEN WINDSTREAM)	Case No. 2008-00203
KENTUCKY EAST, LLC, BRANDENBURG)	
TELEPHONE COMPANY AND MCIMETRO)	
ACCESS TRANSMISSION SERVICES, LLC)	
D/B/A VERIZON ACCESS		

BRANDENBURG TELEPHONE COMPANY'S RESPONSES TO WINDSTREAM KENTUCKY EAST, LLC'S DATA REQUESTS

Brandenburg Telephone Company ("Brandenburg"), by counsel, and pursuant to the Public Service Commission of the Commonwealth of Kentucky's (the "Commission") September 15, 2011 order in this matter, hereby files its responses to Windstream Kentucky East, LLC's Data Requests. In response to those requests for information, Brandenburg states as follows.

DATA REQUESTS

- 1. Reference: Second Supplemental Direct Testimony of Allison T. Willoughby at p. 6, lines 16-19. Please describe the "Point of Connection" ("POC") as such term is used in the Brandenburg-Verizon Agreement and defined in Section 1.12 of such agreement. Specifically:
 - a. What are the V&H coordinates, as such term is commonly used in the telecommunications industry, of the POC?

Responsible Witness: Allison T. Willoughby

RESPONSE: This information has already been provided to Windstream as Appendix 1 to the Agreement for Facilities-Based Network Interconnection for Exchange of Information Service Provider Traffic Between MCI Access Transmission Services, LLC and Brandenburg Telephone Company.

b. If there is a Common Language Location Identifier ("CLLI") code for the POC,

please provide it. To the extent that there is no CLLI code for such POC but there is a CLLI

code associated with the same physical location as the POC, please provide such CLLI code.

Responsible Witness: Allison T. Willoughby

RESPONSE: This information has already been provided to Windstream as Appendix 1 to the Agreement for Facilities-Based Network Interconnection for Exchange of Information Service Provider Traffic Between MCI Access Transmission Services, LLC and

Brandenburg Telephone Company.

c. Is the POC at the same physical location as the meet point between Brandenburg and

Windstream for the Windstream-Brandenburg EAS Facilities?

Responsible Witness: None.

RESPONSE: No.

2. Reference: Second Supplemental Direct Testimony of Allison T. Willoughby at p. 6, lines

16-19.

a. As of the date of your response to this data request, has the "traffic in question" as

such term is used on p. 7, line 5, been moved off of the Brandenburg-Windstream EAS

Facilities?

Responsible Witness:

Allison T. Willoughby

RESPONSE: No.

b. If your answer to subpart a is anything other than an unqualified answer in the

affirmative, please provide:

2

2005846v9

i. An explanation for why the traffic has not yet been moved; and

Responsible Witness: Allison T. Willoughby

RESPONSE: To date, MCImetro has not established the trunking required to move this traffic pursuant to the terms of our interconnection agreement filed July 27, 2011.

ii. The date by which you expect such traffic to be moved and the basis for such expectation.

Responsible Witness: Allison T. Willoughby

RESPONSE: Brandenburg Telephone has received an ASR to establish the facility portion of the interconnection arrangement that currently carries a due date of October 31, 2011. However, subsequent communications from MCImetro indicated that date would likely be in jeopardy.

3. <u>Reference: Second Supplemental Direct Testimony of Allison T. Willoughby at p. 6, lines 16-19</u>. As part of its efforts to implement the Brandenburg-Verizon Agreement, is Brandenburg in any way seeking for traffic to which such agreement pertains to continue to be routed over the Windstream-Brandenburg EAS Facilities? If so, please explain.

Responsible Witness: Allison T. Willoughby

RESPONSE: No.

4. Reference: Second Supplemental Direct Testimony of Allison T. Willoughby at p. 3, lines 5-6; p. 3, line 21 through p. 4, line 23 through p. 5, line 1, p. 7, lines 16-17. Please provide all documents, including e-mails and other electronic documents, that form the basis for the referenced claims. To the extent that such documents are readily publicly available, you may merely provide specific reference to such documents, including the section or page number.

Responsible Witness: Allison T. Willoughby

RESPONSE: All documents that form the basis for such claims have already been produced. The factual and legal claims have been set forth in Brandenburg's briefs to the Commission, its prefiled testimony, and its previous discovery responses.

5. Reference: Second Supplemental Direct Testimony of Allison T. Willoughby at p. 6, lines 16-19. Section 3.1 of the referenced agreement (Brandenburg-Verizon Agreement) states as follows: "The Agreement sets forth the terms and conditions under which the Parties agree to interconnect their networks and exchange ISP Traffic." "ISP Traffic" is defined in Section 1.12.

a. Does Brandenburg intend to enter into an agreement with Verizon pertaining to traffic that is <u>not</u> "dial-up modem traffic terminated to Verizon customers that are commercial providers of internet access," <u>but nevertheless is</u> traffic for which: "(i) the call originates and terminates from and to, respectively, NPA NXXs assigned to rate centers in the same Local Service Exchange Area; or (ii) originates and terminates from and to, respectively, NPA NXXs assigned to rate centers within different Exchanges that share a common mandatory local calling area, e.g., mandatory Extended Area Service (EAS) or mandatory Extended Local Calling Service (ELCS) as approved by the Commission and defined by Brandenburg's tariffs" (Brandenburg-Verizon Agreement at § 1.12)

Responsible Witness: Allison T. Willoughby

RESPONSE: If MCImetro requests it, Brandenburg Telephone will negotiate an agreement for the exchange of additional traffic.

b. If your answer to subpart a is in any way in the affirmative, please state when Brandenburg intends to enter into such an agreement and the steps that Brandenburg is

taking to do so. If your answer to subpart a is anything other than an unqualified affirmative

response, please explain.

Responsible Witness: Allison T. Willoughby

RESPONSE: See answer to Data Request 5.a above. Brandenburg Telephone will negotiate with MCImetro in good faith upon receipt of a written request to exchange additional traffic.

Reference: Updated Direct Testimony at p. 6, lines 13-19. 6.

> Please produce all documents in your possession, including e-mails and other a.

> electronic files, that discuss or relate to the "traffic in question" as such term is used on p. 5,

line 7 of your Second Supplemental Direct Testimony. You need not produce any

documents that are known to have been created before August 29, 2009.

Responsible Witness:

Allison T. Willoughby

RESPONSE: Brandenburg Telephone cannot properly answer this request because no such quote exists on p. 5, line 7 of Allison Willoughby's Second Supplemental Direct Testimony.

b. To the extent not provided in response to subpart a of this data request or any other

Windstream data request, please produce all documents in your possession, including e-mails

and other electronic files, that discuss or relate to any other type of traffic originated by

Brandenburg end users and bound for Verizon that was traversing the Brandenburg-

Windstream EAS Facilities as of August 29, 2009. You need not produce any documents

that are known to have been created before August 29, 2009.

Responsible Witness:

Allison T. Willoughby

RESPONSE: *See* Response to Data Request 6.a above.

5

2005846v9

c. To the extent not provided in response to subparts a or b of this data request or any other Windstream data request, please also produce all other documents in your possession, including e-mails and other electronic files, relating to implementation of the Kentucky Public Service Commission's August 29, 2009 order in this docket. This request includes but is not limited to negotiation of a traffic exchange agreement (or attempts at such negotiation) and implementation of the Brandenburg-Verizon Agreement.

Responsible Witness: Allison T. Willoughby

RESPONSE: This request seeks confidential information. The parties are exchanging all responsive documents pursuant to their confidentiality agreement. Because of the volume of documentation involved, the documents are not attached to this filing, pending the Commission's resolution of Brandenburg Telephone's petition for confidentiality filed simultaneously herewith.

Respectfully submitted,

John E. Selent

Holly C. Wallace Edward T. Depp

DINSMORE & SHOHL LLP

1400 PNC Plaza

500 W. Jefferson Street

Louisville, Kentucky 40202

(502) 540-2300

(502) 585-2207 (fax)

CERTIFICATION

I hereby certify that I have supervised the preparation of Brandenburg Telephone Company's responses to Windstream Kentucky East, LLC's Data Requests based on the supplemental testimony and that the factual responses contained therein (and for which I am designated the responsible witness) are true and accurate to the best of my knowledge, information, and belief formed after reasonable inquiry. (Legal counsel is responsible for any legal objections.)

Allison T. Willoughby Assistant General Manager of Brandenburg Telephone Company	-
Date:	

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify a true and accurate copy of the foregoing was served, by first-class United States mail, sufficient postage prepaid, on the following individuals this 28th day of October, 2011.

Mark Overstreet, Esq.
R. Benjamin Crittenden, Esq.
STITES & HARBISON, PLLC
421 West Main Street
P.O. Box 634
Frankfort, KY 40602-0634
Counsel to Windstream Kentucky East, LLC

C. Kent Hatfield, Esq.
Douglas F. Brent, Esq.
Stoll Keenon Ogden, PLLC
2000 PNC Plaza
500 West Jefferson Street
Louisville, Kentucky 40202
Counsel to MCImetro



OCT 28 2011

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

In the Matter of:

AN INVESTIGATION INTO THE TRAFFIC)	
DISPUTE BETWEEN WINDSTREAM)	Case No. 2008-00203
KENTUCKY EAST, LLC, BRANDENBURG)	
TELEPHONE COMPANY AND MCIMETRO)	
ACCESS TRANSMISSION SERVICES, LLC)	
D/B/A VERIZON ACCESS		

BRANDENBURG TELEPHONE COMPANY'S RESPONSES TO MCIMETRO'S THIRD SET OF REQUESTS FOR INFORMATION

Brandenburg Telephone Company ("Brandenburg"), by counsel, and pursuant to the Public Service Commission of the Commonwealth of Kentucky's (the "Commission") September 15, 2011 order in this matter, hereby files its responses to MCImetro's Third Set of Requests for Information to Brandenburg Telephone Company. In response to those requests for information, Brandenburg states as follows.

INTERROGATORIES

- 22. On page 2 of her Oct. 4, 2011 Direct Testimony, Ms. Willoughby states that "Any compensation owed should be paid by MCImetro Access Transmission Services, LLC ("MCImetro").
 - a. To the extent not previously provided in prefiled testimony or discovery, please provide the complete factual and legal basis for this statement.
 - b. To the extent not previously provided in discovery, please provide all documents or other evidence that supports, relates to, or was relied upon by Ms. Willoughby in making this statement.

Responsible Witness: Allison T. Willoughby

RESPONSE: The complete factual and legal basis for the quoted testimony has been set forth in Brandenburg's briefs before the Commission, its prefiled testimony, and previous

discovery responses. All documents on which this factual and legal basis rely have been produced or are otherwise in the possession of MCImetro.

- 23. On page 3 of her testimony, Ms. Willoughby states that "Windstream and MCImetro agreed to serve, at no cost, as the intermediary for non-toll traffic originated by a third-party carrier like Brandenburg Telephone."
 - a. To the extent not previously provided in prefiled testimony or discovery, please provide the complete factual and legal basis for this statement.
 - b. To the extent not previously provided in discovery, please provide all documents or other evidence that supports, relates to, or was relied upon by Ms. Willoughby in making this statement.

Responsible Witness: Allison T. Willoughby

RESPONSE: The complete factual and legal basis for the quoted testimony has been set forth in Brandenburg's briefs before the Commission, its prefiled testimony, and previous discovery responses. All documents on which this factual and legal basis rely have been produced or are otherwise in the possession of MCImetro.

- On page 5 of her testimony, Ms. Willoughby states "MCImetro could have averted this entire problem, but it instead deliberately decided to ignore its responsibilities, to enter the Elizabethtown market without investigation, and to repeatedly refuse the necessary arrangements to exchange traffic.
 - a. To the extent not previously provided in prefiled testimony or discovery, please provide the complete factual and legal basis for this statement.
 - b. To the extent not previously provided in discovery, please provide all documents or other evidence that supports, relates to, or was relied upon by Ms. Willoughby in making this statement.

Responsible Witness: Allison T. Willoughby

RESPONSE: The complete factual and legal basis for the quoted testimony has been set forth in Brandenburg's briefs before the Commission, its prefiled testimony, and previous discovery responses. All documents on which this factual and legal basis rely have been produced or are otherwise in the possession of MCImetro.

- 25. On page 5 of her direct testimony, Ms. Willoughby states that MCImetro "started this entire problem by intentionally disregarding its obligations to investigate the traffic exchange arrangements it would need before entering the Elizabethtown market."
 - a. Please explain in detail the legal basis for the obligation referenced in this statement.
 - b. To the extent not previously provided in discovery, please provide all documents or other evidence that supports, relates to, or was relied upon by Ms. Willoughby in making this statement.

Responsible Witness: Allison T. Willoughby

RESPONSE: The complete factual and legal basis for the quoted testimony has been set forth in Brandenburg's briefs before the Commission, its prefiled testimony, and previous discovery responses. All documents on which this factual and legal basis rely have been produced or are otherwise in the possession of MCImetro.

26. To the extent not already provided in discovery, please provide all documents that evidence, relate to, support, or were relied upon by Ms. Willoughby in making the claim on page 6 of her direct testimony that MCImetro "became aware of the problem it had created."

Responsible Witness: Allison T. Willoughby

RESPONSE: All such documents have already been produced or are otherwise in the possession of MCImetro.

27. To the extent not already provided in discovery, please provide all documents that evidence, relate to, support, or were relied upon by Ms. Willoughby in making the claim on page 6 of her direct testimony that MCImetro "continued to refuse to enter an appropriate traffic exchange agreement or to move the traffic onto dedicated facilities."

Responsible Witness: Allison T. Willoughby

RESPONSE: All such documents have already been produced or are otherwise in the possession of MCImetro.

28. To the extent not already provided in discovery, please provide all documents that evidence, relate to, support, or were relied upon by Ms. Willoughby in making the claim on page 6 of her direct testimony that "MCImetro refused to negotiate in good faith."

Responsible Witness: Allison T. Willoughby

<u>RESPONSE:</u> All such documents have already been produced or are otherwise in the possession of MCImetro.

Respectfully submitted,

John E. Selent Holly C. Wallace

Edward T. Depp

DINSMORE & SHOHL LLP

1400 PNC Plaza 500 W. Jefferson Street

Louisville, Kentucky 40202

(502) 540-2300

(502) 585-2207 (fax)

CERTIFICATION

I hereby certify that I have supervised the preparation of Brandenburg Telephone Company's responses to the MCImetro's Third Set of Requests for Information based on the supplemental testimony and that the factual responses contained therein (and for which I am designated the responsible witness) are true and accurate to the best of my knowledge, information, and belief formed after reasonable inquiry. (Legal counsel is responsible for any legal objections.)

Allison T. Willoughby Assistant General Manager of Brandenburg Telephone Company
Date:

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify a true and accurate copy of the foregoing was served, by first-class United States mail, sufficient postage prepaid, on the following individuals this 28th day of October, 2011.

C. Kent Hatfield, Esq. Douglas F. Brent, Esq. Stoll Keenon Ogden, PLLC 2000 PNC Plaza 500 West Jefferson Street Louisville, Kentucky 40202 Counsel to MCImetro

Bruce F. Clark, Esq. Stites & Harbison, PLLC 421 West Main Street P.O. Box 634 Frankfort, KY 40602-0634 Counsel to Windstream