Steven L. Beshear Governor

Robert D. Vance, Secretary Environmental and Public Protection Cabinet

Larry R. Bond Commissioner Department of Public Protection

Kyle Jones South Central Telcom, LLC 1399 Happy Valley Road P. O. Drawer 159 Glasgow, KY 42142-0159



Commonwealth of Kentucky

Public Service Commission
211 Sower Blvd.
P.O. Box 615

Frankfort, Kentucky 40602-0615

Telephone: (502) 564-3940
Fax: (502) 564-3460

April 17, 2008

psc.ky.gov

Mark David Goss Chairman

John W. Clay Vice Chairman

Caroline Pitt Clark Commissioner

RE: Case No. 2008-00126

We enclose one attested copy of the Commission's Order in the above case.

Sincerely,

Stephanie Stumbo Executive Director

SS/tw Enclosure



Steven L. Beshear Governor

Robert D. Vance, Secretary Environmental and Public Protection Cabinet

Larry R. Bond Commissioner Department of Public Protection

Daniel Logsdon Windstream Kentucky East, LLC 130 West New Circle Road Suite 170 Lexington, KY 40505



Commonwealth of Kentucky

Public Service Commission
211 Sower Blvd.
P.O. Box 615

Frankfort, Kentucky 40602-0615

Telephone: (502) 564-3940
Fax: (502) 564-3460

April 17, 2008

psc.ky.gov

Mark David Goss Chairman

John W. Clay Vice Chairman

Caroline Pitt Clark Commissioner

RE: Case No. 2008-00126

We enclose one attested copy of the Commission's Order in the above case.

Sincerely,

Stephanie Stumbo Executive Director

SS/tw Enclosure



Steven L. Beshear Governor

Robert D. Vance, Secretary Environmental and Public Protection Cabinet

Larry R. Bond Commissioner Department of Public Protection

Honorable John E. Selent Attorney at Law Dinsmore & Shohl, LLP 1400 PNC Plaza 500 West Jefferson Street Louisville, KY 40202



Commonwealth of Kentucky

Public Service Commission
211 Sower Blvd.
P.O. Box 615

Frankfort, Kentucky 40602-0615

Frankfort, Kentucky 40602-061 Telephone: (502) 564-3940 Fax: (502) 564-3460 psc.ky.gov

April 17, 2008

Mark David Goss Chairman

John W. Clay Vice Chairman

Caroline Pitt Clark Commissioner

RE: Case No. 2008-00126

We enclose one attested copy of the Commission's Order in the above case.

Sincerely,

Stephanie Stumbo Executive Director

SS/tw Enclosure



COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

In	the	Ma	atter	of:
,,,		1410	46601	V1.

SOUTH CENTRAL TELCOM, LLC)
COMPLAINANT) CASE NO. 2008-00126
V.)
WINDSTREAM KENTUCKY EAST, INC.))
DEFENDANT)

ORDER

On April 4, 2008, South Central Telcom, LLC ("South Central") filed with the Commission a complaint against Windstream Kentucky East, Inc. ("Windstream"). In the complaint, South Central states that, on December 5, 2007, Windstream issued a notice to South Central stating that it would be disconnected unless it paid an outstanding balance of \$22,667.20 within 30 days.¹

South Central stated that the disconnection notice from Windstream included charges belonging to South Central's incumbent counterpart, South Central Rural Telephone Cooperative.² South Central also states that after subsequent discussions with Windstream disputing the alleged balance, Windstream later claimed that the company owed \$4,071.84 for switched access service and \$13,163.33 for usage

¹ See Complaint at ¶ 9.

² <u>Id.</u> at ¶ 10.

service.³ South Central states that, on January 16, 2008, by letter, Windstream stated that it would not terminate service to South Central and also provided the name of a Windstream employee who could assist in addressing the billing dispute. South Central states that after initial conversations with that employee, no resolution was reached. South Central states that it has formally requested a meeting with Windstream management, but Windstream has failed to respond to the request and has not "otherwise worked with South Central to resolve the dispute." South Central requests that the Commission order Windstream not to terminate service to South Central while the dispute is pending, to identify and compel particular personnel to work with South Central to resolve the billing dispute, and to schedule an informal conference to resolve the allegations regarding Windstream's billing practices.⁵

Pursuant to 807 KAR 5:001, Section 12(4)(a), upon receipt of a formal complaint, the Commission must determine whether the complaint states a <u>prima facie</u> case. A complaint establishes a <u>prima facie</u> case when it sets forth on its face sufficient allegations that, if not contradicted by other evidence, would entitle the complainant to the relief requested. If a complaint fails to establish a <u>prima facie</u> case, the Commission must notify the complainant and provide a reasonable opportunity to amend the complaint. Having reviewed the complaint and the allegations contained therein, the Commission finds that South Central has not met the standard for the establishment of a <u>prima facie</u> case.

³ <u>Id.</u> at ¶ 13.

⁴ <u>Id.</u> at ¶ 19.

⁵ <u>Id.</u> at 5.

When reviewing complaints, the Commission seeks both substantive argument and evidence supporting the complaining party's allegations. In this complaint, South Central provides no references to specific portions of Windstream's tariffs, special contracts, or interconnection agreements to support the allegation that South Central is being billed inaccurately. South Central has not provided copies of any billing statements, the December 5, 2007 disconnection notice, or e-mail documentation between South Central and Windstream wherein the billing dispute is addressed. Most notably, within paragraph 16 of the complaint, South Central states that Windstream acknowledged receipt of a letter from South Central's counsel disputing the balance owed and acknowledged that "Windstream would not terminate service to South Central." Based on this statement, Windstream's threat of disconnection has been voluntarily withdrawn, although the dispute over the accuracy of the billing remains. Given the withdrawal of impending service termination, the Commission finds South Central's request for relief, in part, is moot.

The Commission also notes that South Central has outlined several allegations but has provided neither a concrete understanding nor supporting evidence to demonstrate why it believes it is being inaccurately billed. Without directing the Commission to specific documentation sufficient to support its claims, South Central has submitted a mixture of statements and claims without necessary evidence or appropriate references and, therefore, has failed to establish a <u>prima facie</u> case. For these reasons, South Central's complaint is rejected for filing.

⁶ The Commission references those particular documents only as examples. South Central did not indicate the basis for its belief that it is being incorrectly billed (i.e., Windstream agreed to bill South Central in a different manner, as provided in an interconnection agreement, a special contract, or within published tariffs).

IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that:

- 1. The complaint is rejected for filing for failing to state a <u>prima facie</u> case.
- 2. Within 20 days of the date of this Order, South Central may file an amended complaint with the Commission that states a <u>prima facie</u> case.
- 3. In the event South Central fails to file within the allotted time, or submits an amended complaint that does not state a <u>prima facie</u> case, this case shall be closed and removed from the Commission's docket by separate Order.

Done at Frankfort, Kentucky, this 17th day of April, 2008.

By the Commission

ATTEST:

Almanu Humho
Executive Director