#### COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

### BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

In the Matter of:		received
MOUNTAIN RURAL TELEPHONE COOPERATIVE CORPORATION	)	SEP 2 8 2006
COMPLAINANT	)	PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION
V.	) CASE NO. 2006-00198	
KENTUCKY ALLTEL, INC.	)	
RESPONDENT	)	

# WINDSTREAM KENTUCKY EAST, INC.'S RESPONSES TO THE DATA REQUESTS BY MOUNTAIN RURAL TELEPHONE COOPERATIVE CORPORATION

Comes now Windstream Kentucky East, Inc. f/k/a Kentucky Alltel, Inc. ("Windstream") and submits the following Responses to the Data Requests served by Mountain Rural Telephone Cooperative Corporation ("Mountain Rural") dated September 14, 2006. Windstream objects to all of Mountain Rural's data requests that seek information regarding Windstream's "legal basis" for its positions in this proceeding. Legal theories and conclusions are not discoverable items and are properly the subjects of parties' legal briefs and reply briefs. Windstream also states that as all of Mountain Rural's data requests seek generally "each and every factual" basis for a variety of items, such requests are vague and overly broad. Without waiving any objection to the requests, Windstream provides the following responses.

1. MOUNTAIN RURAL REQUEST NO. 1: State each and every factual and legal basis for Windstream's refusal to pay the traffic sensitive portion of Mountain Rural's switched access service charges.

WINDSTREAM RESPONSE NO. 1: This question is inappropriate as Windstream has not refused to pay and in fact has paid traffic sensitive charges to Mountain Rural. Please see Attachment A. See also Paragraph 2 of Windstream's Motion to Dismiss, for Discovery, and for Injunctive Relief and Answer which states explicitly that "Kentucky Alltel does not dispute the [traffic sensitive] charges."

2. MOUNTAIN RURAL REQUEST NO. 2: State each and every factual and legal basis for Windstream's refusal to pay the facilities charges portion of Mountain Rural's switched access service charges.

WINDSTREAM RESPONSE NO. 2: Windstream has not refused to pay all facilities charges to Mountain Rural. Subject to verification and Mountain Rural's proper invoicing, Windstream has paid facilities charges that are appropriately billed to Windstream. Specifically, Windstream has remitted payment to Mountain Rural with respect to circuits billed beginning January 2006. Windstream disputes circuit billings prior to December 2005 as those trunks were jointly provisioned two-way facilities provided in accordance with a Meet Point arrangement. In a Meet Point arrangement, each party is responsible for providing facilities to the meet point, and neither party is responsible for facilities beyond its meet point. Finally, Windstream disputes the amount of the circuits billed for December 2005 due to the fact that Mountain Rural had not provided Windstream at that time sufficient notice of the network change (i.e., removal of non-Windstream traffic from the Meet Point Jointly Provisioned trunk groups) enabling Windstream to reduce the size of the trunks to the appropriate levels.

3. MOUNTAIN RURAL REQUEST NO. 3: State each and every factual and legal basis for Windstream's refusal to pay the Non-Traffic Sensitive ("NTSR") portion of Mountain Rural's switched access service charges.

WINDSTREAM RESPONSE NO. 3: Please refer to Windstream's Motion to Dismiss, for Discovery, and for Injunctive Relief and Answer and all other pleadings filed by Windstream in the instant proceeding which set forth Windstream's position with respect to Mountain Rural's NTS charges. Windstream states further that Response No. 3 is subject to the data requests served by Windstream on Mountain Rural in this proceeding, Mountain Rural's responses thereto, and further discovery that may be had by the parties.

4. MOUNTAIN RURAL REQUEST NO. 4: If you contend that Windstream's ACS minutes are not subject to all three components of Mountain Rural's switched access service charges as identified in the previous three data requests, state each and every factual and legal basis for that contention. Your explanation should separately address each component of Mountain Rural's switched access service charges.

WINDSTREAM RESPONSE NO. 4: As this request seeks the same information as that sought in Requests No. 1 through 3, please see Responses No. 1 through 3 above.

### Respectfully submitted,

Mark R. Overstreet

R. Benjamin Grittenden

STITES & HARBISON, PLLC

421 West Main Street

P.O. Box 634

Frankfort, Kentucky 40602-0634

Telephone: 502-223-3477

COUNSEL FOR:

WINDSTREAM KENTUCKY EAST, INC.

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a true and accurate copy of Windstream Kentucky East, Inc.'s Responses to the Data Requests by Mountain Rural Telephone Cooperative Corporation was served via United States Postal Service, First Class Mail, postage prepaid, upon:

John E. Selent
Edward T. Depp
Holly C. Wallace
Dinsmore & Shohl, LLP
1400 PNC Plaza
500 West Jefferson Street
Louisville, Kentucky 40202

on this the 28th day of September, 2006.

R. Benjamin Crittenden

# ATTACHMENT A



ALLTEL Communications Wireline Revenue Accounting One Allied Drive 1269-B4F03-NC Little Rock, AR 72202-2099

Mountain Rural Telephone COOP, Inc. 405 Main Street West Liberty, KY 41472

May 17, 2006

Enclosed are checks in the total amount of \$60,403.49, with respect to the intrastate/intralata traffic sensitive portion of the Mountain Rural CABS invoices for usage periods 11/26/05-4/24/06. Additionally, Angie Pennington forwarded information to me today regarding the facility circuits, and payment with respect to the facility invoices will follow upon verification of the circuit charges.

As documented in an email from John Bratton to Eileen Bodamer on 11.18.05 and in communications between the parties, Kentucky Alltel disputes the CCL charges on ACS traffic. Until the parties resolve the CCL dispute, which is currently subject to a complaint pending before the Kentucky Public Service Commission. Kentucky Alltel will remit payment to Mountain Rural only with respect to the traffic sensitive portion of the CABS invoices.

Please let me know if you have questions.

Sincerely,

January Hafter Day



### Mountain Rural Telephone

Date of Claim: 9/22/2006

Claim #: 35

Contact Name: Tracie Johnson Contact Phone: 501-748-6918

Contact Email: Tracie.L.Johnson@Windstream.com

InvoiceNumber: 002

BAN: 666

Bill Date: 2/1/2006

State: KY (9690)

Dispute Reason Invalid Usage Dispute Amount:

Dispute Amt W/Held: \$49,308.77

Payment Amount: \$32,788.88

Winstream disputes the CCL charges on ACS traffic. Until the parties **Dispute Description:** 

resolve the CCL dispute which is currently subject to a complaint pending before the Kentucky Public Service Commission.

Windstream will remit payment to Mountain Rural only with respect to

\$49,308.77



### Mountain Rural Telephone

Date of Claim: 9/22/2006

Claim #: 34

Contact Name: Tracie Johnson
Contact Phone: 501-748-6918

Contact Email: Tracie.L.Johnson@Windstream.com

Bill Date: 2/1/2006

State: KY (9690)

Dispute Reason Invalid Usage

Dispute Amount: \$91.94

Dispute Amt W/Held: \$91.94

Payment Amount: \$32,788 88

Dispute Description: Windstream is an ILEC and, therefore, cannot cross state

boundaries. Interstate usage should be billed to the applicable long

distance carrier.



#### Mountain Rural Telephone

Date of Claim: 9/22/2006

Claim #: 545

Contact Name: Tracie Johnson Contact Phone: 501-748-6918

Contact Email: Tracie.L.Johnson@Windstream.com

InvoiceNumber: **D.ALT.1.6** 

BAN: 0414FGD0666

Bill Date: 8/1/2006

State: KY (9690)

Dispute Reason Late Payment Charge Invalid

Dispute Amount: \$4,222.10

Dispute Amt W/Held: \$4,222.10

Payment Amount: \$7,039.02

Paying \$80.75 for July invoice. Remainder of late charges are under dispute because they apply to carrier common line, Interstate, and **Dispute Description:** 

Interlata charges.



#### Mountain Rural Telephone

Date of Claim: 9/22/2006

Claim #: 544

Contact Name: Tracie Johnson Contact Phone: 501-748-6918

Contact Email: Tracie.L.Johnson@Windstream.com

Bill Date: 8/1/2006

State: KY (9690)

Dispute Reason Invalid Factors

Dispute Amount: \$11,225.65

Dispute Amt W/Held: \$11,225.65

Payment Amount: \$7,039.02

Dispute Description: Windstream disputes the CCL charges on ACS traffic. Until the parties

resolve the CCL dispute, which is currently subject to a complaint pending before the Kentucky Public Service commission, Windstream will remit the payment to Mountain Rural only with respect to the



### Mountain Rural Telephone

Date of Claim: 9/22/2006

Claim #: 543

Contact Name: Tracie Johnson Contact Phone: 501-748-6918

Contact Email: Tracie.L.Johnson@Windstream.com

Bill Date: 8/1/2006

State: KY (9690)

Dispute Reason Incorrect Customer Being Billed

\$1.74 Dispute Amount:

Dispute Amt W/Held: \$174

Payment Amount: \$7,039.02

Windstream is an ILEC and therefores can not cross the LATA Dispute Description:

boundaries. Interlata usage should be billed to the applicable long

distance carrier.



### Mountain Rural Telephone

Date of Claim: 9/22/2006

Claim #: 542

Contact Name: Tracie Johnson
Contact Phone: 501-748-6918

Contact Email: Tracie.L.Johnson@Windstream.com

Bill Date: 8/1/2006

**State:** KY (9690)

Dispute Reason Incorrect Customer Being Billed

Dispute Amount: \$18.74

Dispute Amt W/Held: \$18.74

Payment Amount: \$7,039.02

Dispute Description: Windstream is an ILEC and therfore cannot cross state boundnes

interstate usage should be billied to the applicable long distance

carrier



### Mountain Rural Telephone

Date of Claim:

9/22/2006

Claim #:

549

Contact Name: Tracie Johnson

Contact Phone: 501-748-6918

Contact Email: Tracie.L.Johnson@Windstream.com

InvoiceNumber:

D.ALT.1.7

BAN:

0414FGD0666

Bill Date:

9/1/2006

State:

KY (9690)

Dispute Reason

Late Payment Charge Invalid

**Dispute Amount:** 

\$4,344.52

Dispute Amt W/Held:

\$4,344.52

Payment Amount:

\$7,115.33

**Dispute Description:** 

Late charges are under dispute because they apply to carrier

common line. Interstate, and Interlata charges



### Mountain Rural Telephone

Date of Claim: 9/22/2006

Claim #: 548

Contact Name: Tracie Johnson Contact Phone: 501-748-6918

Contact Email: Tracie.L.Johnson@Windstream.com

Bill Date: 9/1/2006

State: KY (9690)

Dispute Reason Invalid Factors

Dispute Amount: \$11,276.57

Dispute Amt W/Held: \$11,276.57

Payment Amount: \$7,115 33

Dispute Description: Winstream disputes the CCL charges on ACS traffic. Until the parties resolve the CCL dispute, which is currently subject to a complaint

pending before the Kentucky Public Service Commission,

Windstream will remit payment to Mountain Rural only with respect to



### Mountain Rural Telephone

Date of Claim: 9/22/2006

Claim #: 547

Contact Name: Tracie Johnson Contact Phone: 501-748-6918

Contact Email: Tracie.L.Johnson@Windstream.com

9/1/2006 Bill Date:

KY (9690) State:

Incorrect Customer Being Billed Dispute Reason

\$0.35 Dispute Amount:

\$0.35 Dispute Amt W/Held:

Payment Amount: \$7,115.33

Windstream is an ILEC and therfore cannot cross LATA boundaries **Dispute Description:** 

Interlata usage should be billed to the applicable long distance carrier



### Mountain Rural Telephone

Date of Claim: 9/22/2006

Claim #: 546

Contact Name: Tracie Johnson Contact Phone: 501-748-6918

Contact Email: Tracie.L.Johnson@Windstream.com

Bill Date: 9/1/2006

State: KY (9690)

Incorrect Customer Being Billed Dispute Reason

Dispute Amount: \$17.80

Dispute Amt W/Held: \$17.80

Payment Amount: \$7,115.33

Windstream is an ILEC and therefore cannot cross state boundaries **Dispute Description:** 

interstate usage should be billed to applicable long distance carrier



### Mountain Rural Telephone

Date of Claim: 9/22/2006

Claim #: 535

Contact Name: Tracie Johnson Contact Phone: 501-748-6918

Contact Email: Tracie.L.Johnson@Windstream.com

InvoiceNumber: 12

BAN: 0414FGS0666

Bill Date: 12/1/2005

State: KY (9690)

Dispute Reason Overbilling

Dispute Amount: \$321.05

Dispute Amt W/Held: \$321.05

Payment Amount: \$2,062 56

Dispute Description: Portion of sales tax attributable to over-billing of circuit



### Mountain Rural Telephone

Date of Claim: 9/22/2006

Claim #: 534

Contact Name: Tracie Johnson Contact Phone: 501-748-6918

Contact Email: Tracie.L.Johnson@Windstream.com

Bill Date: 12/1/2005

State: KY (9690)

Dispute Reason Overbilling

Dispute Amount: \$5,350 99

Dispute Amt W/Held: \$5,350.99

Payment Amount: \$2,062.56

Dispute Description: Windstream disputes the amounts listed above on the Dec-05 bill for

circuits due to the fact that MRTC did not provide Windstream sufficient Notice of the network change (removal of non-Windstream traffic from the Meet Point Jointly Provisioned trunk groups) enabling Windstream to reduce the size of the trunks to the appropriate levels.



### Mountain Rural Telephone

Date of Claim: 9/22/2006

Claim #: 552

Contact Name: Tracie Johnson Contact Phone: 501-748-6918

Contact Email: Tracie.L.Johnson@Windstream.com

InvoiceNumber: D.ALT.1.5

BAN: 0414FGD0666

Bill Date: 7/1/2006

**State:** KY (9690)

Dispute Reason Late Payment Charge Invalid

Dispute Amount: \$4,169.74

Dispute Amt W/Held: \$4,169.74

Payment Amount: \$7,572.19

Dispute Description: Late payments charges are associated with disputed (CCL) invoice

items



### Mountain Rural Telephone

Date of Claim: 9/22/2006

Claim #: 551

Contact Name: Tracie Johnson Contact Phone: 501-748-6918

Contact Email: Tracie.L.Johnson@Windstream.com

Bill Date: 7/1/2006

State: KY (9690)

Dispute Reason incorrect Customer Being Billed

Dispute Amount: \$0.95

Dispute Amt W/Held: \$0.95

Payment Amount: \$7.572.19

Dispute Description: Windstream is an ILEC, and therefore, cannot cross LATA

boundaries. All InterLATA usage should be billed to the applicable

long distance carrier



### Mountain Rural Telephone

Date of Claim: 9/22/2006

Claim #: 550

Contact Name: Tracie Johnson Contact Phone: 501-748-6918

Contact Email: Tracie.L.Johnson@Windstream.com

Bill Date: 7/1/2006

State: KY (9690)

Dispute Reason Incorrect Customer Being Billed

Dispute Amount: \$11.12

Dispute Amt W/Held: \$11.12

Payment Amount: \$7,572.19

Dispute Description: Windstream is an ILEC and, therefore, cannot cross state

boundaries. All interstate usage should be billed to the applicable

long distance carrier.



### Mountain Rural Telephone

Date of Claim: 9/22/2006

Claim #: 541

Contact Name: Tracie Johnson Contact Phone: 501-748-6918

Contact Email: Tracie.L.Johnson@Windstream.com

7/1/2006 Bill Date:

KY (9690) State:

Invalid Factors Dispute Reason

Dispute Amount: \$12,219.99

Dispute Amt W/Held: \$12.219.99

Payment Amount: \$7,572.19

Windstream disputes the CCL charges on ACS traffic Until the parties **Dispute Description:** 

resolve the CCL dispute, which is currently subject to a complaint pending before the Kentucky Public Service commission, Windstream will remit the payment to Mountain Rural only with respect to the traffic sensitive portion of the CABS invoices.



### Mountain Rural Telephone

Date of Claim: 9/22/2006

Claim #:

Contact Name: Tracie Johnson

Contact Phone: 501-748-6918

Contact Email: Tracie.L.Johnson@Windstream.com

003

InvoiceNumber:

BAN: 666

Bill Date: 3/1/2006

State: KY (9690)

Dispute Reason Invalid Usage

Dispute Amount: \$15,832.50

Dispute Amt W/Held: \$15,832.50

Payment Amount: \$12.006.26

Winstream disputes the CCL charges on ACS traffic. Until the parties resolve the CCL dispute, which is currently subject to a complaint Dispute Description:

pending before the Kentucky Public Service Commission,

Windstream will remit payment to Mountain Rural only with respect to



#### Mountain Rural Telephone

Date of Claim: 9/22/2006

Claim #: 3

36

Contact Name: Tracie Johnson
Contact Phone: 501-748-6918

Contact Email: Tracie.L.Johnson@Windstream.com

Bill Date: 3/1/2006

State: KY (9690)

Dispute Reason Invalid Usage

Dispute Amount: \$25.32

Dispute Amt W/Held: \$25.32

Payment Amount: \$12,006.26

Dispute Description: Windstream is an ILEC and, therefore, cannot cross state

boundaries. Usage should be billed to applicable long distance

carrier



### Mountain Rural Telephone

Date of Claim: 9/22/2006

Claim #: 40

Contact Name: Tracie Johnson Contact Phone: 501-748-6918

Contact Email: Tracie.L.Johnson@Windstream.com

InvoiceNumber: 004

666 BAN:

4/1/2006 Bill Date:

KY (9690) State:

Invalid Usage Dispute Reason

\$17,221.40 Dispute Amount:

\$17,221.40 Dispute Amt W/Held:

\$13,076.85 Payment Amount:

Winstream disputes the CCL charges on ACS traffic. Until the parties resolve the CCL dispute, which is currently subject to a complaint Dispute Description:

pending before the Kentucky Public Service Commission, Windstream will remit payment to Mountain Rural only with respect to



### Mountain Rural Telephone

Date of Claim: 9/22/2006

Claim #: 39

Contact Name: Tracie Johnson Contact Phone: 501-748-6918

Contact Email: Tracie.L.Johnson@Windstream.com

Bill Date: 4/1/2006

State: KY (9690)

Dispute Reason Invalid Usage

Dispute Amount: \$38.78

Dispute Amt W/Held: \$38.78

Payment Amount: \$13,076.85

Dispute Description: Windstream is an ILEC and, therefore, cannot cross state

boundaries. Usage should be billed to applicable long distance

carrier



### Mountain Rural Telephone

Date of Claim: 9/22/2006

Claim #: 38

Contact Name: Tracie Johnson Contact Phone: 501-748-6918

Contact Email: Tracie.L.Johnson@Windstream.com

Bill Date: 4/1/2006

State: KY (9690)

Dispute Reason Late Payment Charge Invalid

Dispute Amount: \$6,071.11

Dispute Amt W/Held: \$6,071.11

Payment Amount: \$13,076.85

Dispute Description: Winstream disputes the CCL charges on ACS traffic. Until the parties

resolve the CCL dispute, which is currently subject to a complaint pending before the Kentucky Public Service Commission,

Windstream will remit payment to Mountain Rural only with respect to



#### Mountain Rural Telephone

Date of Claim: 9/22/2006

Claim #: 43

Contact Name: Tracie Johnson
Contact Phone: 501-748-6918

Contact Email: Tracie.L.Johnson@Windstream.com

InvoiceNumber: 005

BAN: 666

Bill Date: 5/1/2006

**State:** KY (9690)

Dispute Reason Invalid Usage

Dispute Amount: \$31.87

Dispute Amt W/Held: \$31.87

Payment Amount: \$11,213.76

Dispute Description: Windstream is an ILEC and, therefore, cannot cross state

boundaries. Usage should be billed to applicable long distance

carrier



#### Mountain Rural Telephone

Date of Claim: 9/22/2006

Claim #: 42

Contact Name: Tracie Johnson Contact Phone: 501-748-6918

Contact Email: Tracie.L..Johnson@Windstream.com

Bill Date: 5/1/2006

State: KY (9690)

Dispute Reason Invalid Usage

Dispute Amount: \$13,634.43

Dispute Amt W/Held: \$13,634.43

Payment Amount: \$11,213.76

Dispute Description: Winstream disputes the CCL charges on ACS traffic Until the parties

resolve the CCL dispute, which is currently subject to a complaint pending before the Kentucky Public Service Commission,

Windstream will remit payment to Mountain Rural only with respect to



### Mountain Rural Telephone

9/22/2006 Date of Claim:

Claim #: 41

Contact Name: Tracie Johnson

Contact Phone: 501-748-6918

Contact Email: Tracie.L.Johnson@Windstream.com

5/1/2006 Bill Date:

KY (9690) State:

Late Payment Charge Invalid Dispute Reason

\$9,461.17 Dispute Amount:

\$9,461.17 Dispute Amt W/Held:

\$11,213.76 Payment Amount:

Dispute Description:

Winstream disputes the CCL charges on ACS traffic. Until the parties resolve the CCL dispute, which is currently subject to a complaint pending before the Kentucky Public Service Commission, Windstream will remit payment to Mountain Rural only with respect to



#### Mountain Rural Telephone

Date of Claim: 9/22/2006

Claim #: 199

Contact Name: Tracie Johnson Contact Phone: 501-748-6918

Contact Email: Tracie.L.Johnson@Windstream.com

InvoiceNumber: 006

666 BAN:

6/1/2006 Bill Date:

KY (9690) State:

Invalid Usage Dispute Reason

\$13,965.56 Dispute Amount:

\$13,965.56 Dispute Amt W/Held:

Payment Amount: \$10,789.03

Winstream disputes the CCL charges on ACS traffic. Until the parties resolve the CCL dispute. which is currently subject to a complaint pending before the Kentucky Public Service Commission, Windstream will remit payment to Mountain Rural only with respect to Dispute Description:



### Mountain Rural Telephone

Date of Claim: 9/22/2006

Claim #: 198

Contact Name: Tracie Johnson Contact Phone: 501-748-6918

Contact Email: Tracie.L.Johnson@Windstream.com

Bill Date: 6/1/2006

State: KY (9690)

Dispute Reason Late Payment Charge Invalid

Dispute Amount: \$16,690.80

Dispute Amt W/Held: \$16,690.80

Payment Amount: \$10,789.03

Dispute Description: Winstream disputes the CCL charges on ACS traffic. Until the parties

resolve the CCL dispute, which is currently subject to a complaint pending before the Kentucky Public Service Commission, Windstream will remit payment to Mountain Rural only with respect to



### Mountain Rural Telephone

9/22/2006 Date of Claim:

Claim #: 197

Contact Name: Tracie Johnson Contact Phone: 501-748-6918

Contact Email: Tracie.L.Johnson@Windstream.com

Bill Date: 6/1/2006

State: KY (9690)

Invalid Usage Dispute Reason

\$16.13 Dispute Amount:

\$16.13 Dispute Amt W/Held:

Payment Amount: \$10,789 03

Windstream is an ILEC and, therefore, cannot cross state **Dispute Description:** 

boundaries. Usage should be billed to applicable long distance



Date of Claim	7/31/06	
Contact Name	Tracie L. Johnson	
Contact Phone	501.748.6918	
Contact Email	Tracie.L.Johnson@Windstream.com	
DISPUTE INFORMATION		
BAN	666	
State	KY	
Dispute Reason	Overbilling	
Dispute Amount	Amount \$18,016.38	
Dispute Amt W/Held	\$18,016.38	
Payment Amount	\$0.00	
	Windstream disputes the facility bills for June 2004 through November 2005 usage on	
	the basis that during the billed period trunks were jointly provisioned two-way facilities	
Dispute Description	provided in accordance with a Meet Point arrangement. In a Meet Point arrangement,	
	each party is responsible for providing facilities to the meet point. Neither party is	
	responsible for facilities beyond its meet point.	