## **COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY**

## **BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION**

In the Matter of: )	
Constellation NewEnergy-Gas Division, LLC	
Complainant	
v. )	Case No. 2005-00184
Columbia Gas of Kentucky, Inc. ) ) Defendant )	
,	JUL 0 1 2005
MOTION TO DISM OF COLUMBIA GAS OF KEN	

On June 10, 2005, Constellation NewEnergy-Gas Division, LLC ("Constellation") filed in this docket a Complaint against Columbia Gas of Kentucky, Inc. ("Columbia"). In the Complaint, Constellation takes exception with certain penalties billed by Columbia to Columbia's transportation customers for failure to comply with Daily Delivery Interruptions ("DDI"). These customers, who pay Columbia to deliver gas to them, have made arrangements with Constellation for the purchase of the gas delivered by Columbia. As stated in paragraph 4 of the Complaint, Constellation filed the Complaint "on its behalf and on behalf of its CKY customers."

Constellation clearly lacks standing to prosecute its complaint. In order to have standing in a lawsuit or an adjudicative proceeding "a party must have a judicially recognizable interest in the subject matter of the suit." *Healthamerica Corp. v. Humana Health Plan,* 697 S.W.2d 946 (1985). The interest of a plaintiff must be a present or substantial interest as distinguished from a mere expectancy. *Winn v. First Bank of Irvington,* 581 S.W.2d 21, 23 (Ky.App. 1979) (holding that a "party plaintiff must have a real, direct, present and substantial right or interest in the subject matter of the controversy").

Furthermore, the assertion of one's *own* legal rights and interests must be demonstrated and the claim to relief will not rest upon the legal rights of third persons. *Warth v. Seldin*, 422 U.S. 490, 95 S. Ct. 2197, 45 L. Ed. 2d 343 (1975). Constellation has not demonstrated that it has any present interests or legal rights at stake in this proceeding. The Columbia penalties at issue were billed to end use customers. None of the Columbia penalties were billed to Constellation. Constellation is attempting to rest upon the legal rights of end use customers who are not parties to this proceeding. Constellation fails to demonstrate its own interest and relies solely on the claims of third parties to assert an interest.

Constellation purports to act on behalf of Columbia's end use customers who are also Constellation customers. However, even if it is possible that Constellation could make such an assertion that it is acting in a representational capacity, each injured party (end use customer) would be indispensable to the proceeding for its proper resolution, and Constellation's involvement would then be moot.

The Commission has similar requirements for standing as that of the Kentucky Supreme Court. The Commission requires that "every action shall be prosecuted in the name of the real party in interest...." *In the Matter of: McGinnis v. GTE South, Inc.*, PSC Case No. 99-495, Order (February 14, 2000). *See also, In the Matter of the Adjustment of Gas Rates of the Union Light, Heat and Power Company*, PSC Case No. 2001-092, Order (September 13, 2001); C.R. 17.01. In the present proceeding, the real parties in interest are the end use customers to whom penalties were billed; Constellation has no real interest in the present proceeding and therefore lacks standing. Because Constellation does not have standing its Complaint should be dismissed.

Respectfully submitted,

<u>Stephen B. Sciple (gmc)</u> Stephen B. Sciple, Lead Counsel

Stanley J. Sagun, Assistant General Counsel Stephen B. Seiple, Lead Counsel 200 Civic Center Drive P.O. Box 117 Columbus, Ohio 43216-0117 Telephone: (614) 460-4648 Fax: (614) 460-6986 Email: sseiple@nisource.com

Richard S. Taylor, Esq. 225 Capital Avenue Frankfort, Kentucky 40601 Telephone: (502) 223-8967 Fax: (502) 226-6383

Attorneys for COLUMBIA GAS OF KENTUCKY, INC.

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing Motion to Dismiss of Columbia Gas of Kentucky, Inc. was served upon the parties on the attached Service List by regular U.S. Mail this 1st day of July, 2005.

<u>Atiphin B. Suple (9mc)</u> Stephen B. Seiple

Stephen B. Seiple Attorney for COLUMBIA GAS OF KENTUCKY, INC.

## **SERVICE LIST**

Hon. Richard S. Taylor Attorney at Law 225 Capital Avenue Frankfort, KY 40601 Hon. Frederick D. Ochenshirt Constellation NewEnergy-Gas Division, LLC 996- Corporate Campus Drive Suite 200 Louisville, KY 40223

Hon. Bruce F. Clark Stites & Harbison, PLLC 421 West Main Street P.O. Box 634 Frankfort, KY 40602-0634