## COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

## BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

In the Matter of:

AN INVESTIGATION OF NATURAL GAS ) ADMINISTRATIVE RETAIL COMPETITION PROGRAMS ) CASE NO. 2010-00146

## ORDER

This matter arises upon Stand Energy Corporation's ("Stand") motion to compel Delta Natural Gas Company, Inc. ("Delta") to provide complete responses to Stand's data requests issued on July 15, 2010.

Pursuant to the procedural schedule established for this proceeding, Stand issued data requests to Delta on July 15, 2010 and Delta submitted its responses on July 29, 2010. Stand subsequently filed a motion asserting that Delta's data responses were not complete and requesting that the Commission order Delta to file complete responses to Request 1-6 C and Request 1-9 A, B, D, F-1, G, H and I. On September 7, 2010, Delta submitted its response to this motion. The Commission, having reviewed the motion and the response thereto, hereby grants Stand's motion in part and denies in part.

Stand requests, in Request 1-6 C, that Delta identify the total revenues that were paid to and received from Delta's asset manager for 2008 and 2009; identify how the revenues are allocated to the recipients; and identify the nature of the transaction that generated the revenues. In its data response, Delta objects to the request stating that it is not relevant to the subject matter to this proceeding and that disclosure of the requested information would cause competitive harm to Delta, its subsidiaries and its

asset manager. Stand asserts in its motion to compel that Delta has failed to demonstrate how disclosure would harm Delta and that Delta lacks standing to argue harm to its subsidiary. Stand further argues that the requested information is relevant because it will help the Commission and the parties evaluate the lack of competition in Delta's service area and the stranglehold that Delta and its affiliates have on the market share in that area. In its response to the motion to compel, Delta reiterated its argument that the request is irrelevant to this proceeding. The Commission, having considered the arguments of both parties, agrees with Delta that the information is not relevant. The Kentucky General Assembly directed this Commission to investigate whether benefits could be derived from natural gas retail competition programs and how those programs could be designed to derive those benefits. We do not interpret that mandate to include an evaluation on whether there is a current lack of competition. Since we have determined that the information is irrelevant, we do not address Delta's confidentiality arguments.

Stand asserts that Delta should be required to respond to Request 1-9 B, D, F.1, G, H, and I. Since Delta and Stand make the same respective arguments with regard to Request 1-9 B, D and H, we address them together. Delta argues that the information sought in these requests is not relevant to this proceeding and that disclosure could cause Delta and its affiliates competitive harm. Stand asserts that the information requested will not result in competitive harm and that the information is relevant for the purpose of showing that Delta's subsidiaries have a stranglehold on competition in Delta's service area. Having reviewed these requests and the arguments presented, we are not persuaded that competitive harm will result from disclosure nor,

as we explained previously, are we persuaded that the information is relevant for the reason Stand put forth. We do find that the information may assist us in our determination of whether Kentucky's natural gas consumers could benefit from retail competition and, therefore, we direct Delta to provide the information.

With regard to Stand's Request 1-9 F.1, we agree that Delta should provide the requested information. The Commission does not believe that Delta will be harmed by stating whether its gas purchases are made under the same contract with others. We deny Stand's Request 1.9 G that Delta state the percentage of its non-regulated gas supplies that are produced in Kentucky. Stand asserts that this information is relevant to the requirement contained in KRS 278.507. The Commission finds that the information requested is not relevant to this proceeding. Delta's non-regulated affiliate is not subject to the Commission's jurisdiction and is not subject to KRS 278.507.

The Commission finds Stand's request in 1-9 I regarding whether Delta's non-regulated marketing affiliate utilizes Delta's reserved pipeline capacity to deliver gas to its transportation customers is relevant to our investigation herein and we require Delta to respond but deny the remainder of the request as irrelevant. We find that information regarding the availability of Delta's reserved pipeline capacity for the purpose of moving a competitor's gas is relevant, but find also that protective measures regarding codes of conduct can be structured and implemented in any program without expanding the scope of these proceedings.

## IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that:

1. Stand's motion to compel is granted in part and denied in part as set forth herein.

2. Delta shall provide the responses to Stand's Request 1.9 B, D, H, F.1, and the first part of I within five days of the date of this Order.

By the Commission

ENTERED

OCT - 1 2010

KENTUCKY PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

ATTEST

Executive Directo

Lonnie E Bellar VP - State Regulation an Louisville Gas and Electric Company 220 W. Main Street P. O. Box 32010 Louisville, KY 40202 Mark David Goss Frost, Brown, Todd, LLC 250 West Main Street Suite 2700 Lexington, KY 40507 John B Park Kathernine K. Yunker Yunker & Park, PLC P.O. Box 21784 Lexington, KY 40522-1784

John B Brown Chief Financial Officer, Treasurer Delta Natural Gas Company, Inc. 3617 Lexington Road Winchester, KY 40391 Michael T Griffith ProLiance's 111 Monument Circle Suite 2200 Indianapolis, IN 46204 Carroll M Redford III Miller, Griffin & Marks, PSC 271 W Short Street, Suite 600 Lexington, KY 40507

Judy Cooper Manager, Regulatory Services Columbia Gas of Kentucky, Inc. 2001 Mercer Road P. O. Box 14241 Lexington, KY 40512-4241 Honorable Lisa Kilkelly Attorney at Law Legal Aid Society 416 West Muhammad Ali Boulevard Suite 300 Louisville, KY 40202 Iris G Skidmore 415 W. Main Street, Suite 2 Frankfort, KY 40601

Rocco D'Ascenzo Senior Counsel Duke Energy Kentucky, Inc. 139 East 4th Street, R. 25 At II P. O. Box 960 Cincinnati, OH 45201 Jeanne Kingery Duke Energy Business Services, Inc. 155 East Broad Street, 21st Floor Columbus, OH 43215

Holly Rachel Smith Hitt Business Center 3803 Rectortown Road Marshall, VA 20115

Honorable John M Dosker General Counsel Stand Energy Corporation 1077 Celestial Street Building 3, Suite 110 Cincinnati, OH 45202-1629

Brooke E Leslie Columbia Gas of Kentucky, Inc. 200 Civic Center Drive P.O. Box 117 Columbus, OH 43216-0117 Honorable Robert M Watt, III Attorney At Law STOLL KEENON OGDEN PLLC 300 West Vine Street Suite 2100 Lexington, KY 40507-1801

Trevor L Earl Reed Weitkamp Schell & Vice PLLC 500 West Jefferson Street Suite 2400 Louisville, KY 40202-2812 Honorable Matthew R Malone Attorney at Law Hurt, Crosbie & May PLLC The Equus Building 127 West Main Street Lexington, KY 40507 Katherine K Yunker John B. Park Yunker & Park, PLC P.O. Box 21784 Lexington, KY 40522-1784

Thomas J FitzGerald Counsel & Director Kentucky Resources Council, Inc. Post Office Box 1070 Frankfort, KY 40602 Mark Martin VP Rates & Regulatory Affairs Atmos Energy Corporation 3275 Highland Pointe Drive Owensboro, KY 42303