COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

In the Matter of:

ESTABLISHMENT OF DUAL PARTY RELAY TELECOMMUNICATIONS SERVICES FOR HEARING-IMPAIRED OR SPEECH-IMPAIRED PERSONS IN KENTUCKY

ADMINISTRATIVE CASE NO. 333

ORDER

This matter arising upon a petition of Cincinnati Bell Telephone Company ("Cincinnati Bell") received May 20, 1991 for confidential treatment of certain data submitted by Cincinnati Bell in its bid proposal for the provision of dual party relay service, and it appearing to this Commission as follows:

Cincinnati Bell has reviewed the information for which it originally sought protection and now seeks reconsideration for portions of the information. Cincinnati Bell claims that it will be competing with carriers to provide dual party relay service in other jurisdictions in the near future. Thus, Cincinnati Bell contends that disclosure of the information would result in an unfair and unreasonable competitive advantage for its competitors by providing information not otherwise available about costs and pricing, network configuration, personnel training and wages, and advertising and publicity.

The Commission, after carefully reviewing the material for which Cincinnati Bell petitions reconsideration of the denial of confidential protection, finds that, except for those items

specifically delineated below, the material is not in sufficient detail such that its disclosure would cause competitive injury and is not of such a nature as to be likely to cause competitive injury. The Commission further finds that public disclosure of the following information would likely result in competitive injury to Cincinnati Bell and should be protected as confidential:

- (a) The descriptions under the captions "MAINTENANCE,"
 "INSTALLATION," "SWITCHING EQUIPMENT," and "OTHER EQUIPMENT"
 contained in Cost Support Schedule in Appendix A.
- (b) The amount under the headings "SUBTOTAL (EXPENSES)," and "TOTAL (INVESTMENTS)" from the Schedule of Start-Up Costs in Appendix A.
- (c) All information concerning all amounts under the columns "1ST YEAR," "2ND YEAR," "3RD YEAR," "4TH YEAR," "5TH YEAR," and the dollar figures in the notes on the fourth and fifth sheets of Appendix A.
- (d) The amounts listed under the categories "WAGES AND SALARIES," "BENEFITS," "NETWORK," "TELCO SERVICES," "MAINTENANCE," "3B2," "PC'S," "PBX," "RENT," "ADVERT & PROMO," "B & C," "ADMINISTRATION," "OFFICE EXPENSE," "CONFERENCE & TRAVEL," "SUBTOTAL," "DEPRECIATION," "TAXES," "SUBTOTAL," "ROI," "ANNUAL MINUTES," "COST PER MINUTE," "ANNUITY FCTR," and "ANNUALIZED NRC" from the column headed "AVERAGE" on the fourth and fifth sheets of Appendix A.

The Commission, being otherwise sufficiently advised, HEREBY ORDERS that:

- (1) Cincinnati Bell's petition for reconsideration of the denial of its petition for confidential treatment is hereby denied except as specifically set forth in paragraphs (a) (d) herein.
- (2) The information sought to be protected from disclosure by Cincinnati Bell's petition and for which the Commission denies reconsideration shall be held as confidential and proprietary for five working days from the date of this Order, at the expiration of which time it shall be placed in the public record.
- (3) The information set forth in paragraphs (a) (d) herein for which Cincinnati Bell has petitioned for reconsideration of the Commission's denial of confidential treatment shall be withheld from public disclosure and retained by this Commission as confidential and shall not be open for public inspection.
- (4) Cincinnati Bell shall, within five working days of the date of this Order, file an edited copy of the information with only those portions which the Commission has granted confidential treatment obscured for inclusion in the public record.
 - (5) This is a final and appealable Order.

 Done at Frankfort, Kentucky, this 10th day of June, 1991.

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION.

Chairman

I co Chairman

VILL NE NUCLES

ATTEST:

Commissioner